

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-47825-0 — The Right to Science  
Edited by Helle Porsdam , Sebastian Porsdam Mann  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## THE RIGHT TO SCIENCE

That everyone has a human right to enjoy the benefits of the progress of science and its applications comes as a surprise to many. Nevertheless, this right is pertinent to numerous issues at the intersection of science and society: open access; “dual use” science; access to ownership and dissemination of data, knowledge, methods and the affordances and applications thereof; as well as the role of international cooperation, human dignity and other human rights in relation to science and its products. As we advance towards superintelligence, quantum computing, drone swarms and life-extension technology, serious policy decisions will be made at the national and international levels. The human right to science provides an ideal tool to do so, backed up as it is by international law, political heft and normative weight. This book is the first sustained attempt at turning this wonder of foresight into an actionable and justiciable right. This title is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

Helle Porsdam is Professor of Law and Humanities and UNESCO Chair in Cultural Rights at the University of Copenhagen, Denmark. She holds a PhD from Yale University in American Studies, has held fellowships at Harvard Law School; Wolfson College Cambridge; and was a Global Ethics Fellow with the Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs. Her publications include *Legally Speaking: Contemporary American Culture and the Law* (1999), *From Civil to Human Rights: Dialogues in Law and Humanities on the United States and Europe* (2009), and *The Transforming Power of Cultural Rights: A Promising Law and Humanities Approach* (2019).

Sebastian Porsdam Mann is a DPhil researcher at the Faculty of Law at Oxford. He was educated in philosophy, psychology, and neuroscience at the University of Cambridge, where he did his first PhD in neuroethics. Sebastian has held postdoctoral positions in bioethics at Harvard Medical School and, as Carlsberg Foundation Postdoctoral Fellow, at the Universities of Copenhagen and Oxford.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-47825-0 — The Right to Science  
Edited by Helle Porsdam , Sebastian Porsdam Mann  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# The Right to Science

THEN AND NOW

Edited by

**HELLE PORSDAM**

University of Copenhagen

**SEBASTIAN PORSDAM MANN**

University of Oxford



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-47825-0 — The Right to Science  
Edited by Helle Porsdam, Sebastian Porsdam Mann  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108478250](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108478250)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108776301

© Helle Porsdam and Sebastian Porsdam Mann 2022

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at [doi.org/10.1017/9781108776301](https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108776301) under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0>

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly. When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781108776301

First published 2022

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

ISBN 978-1-108-47825-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
<i>Foreword</i>	
<i>Lea Bishop</i>	xi
<b>Introduction</b>	1
Helle Porsdam and Sebastian Porsdam Mann	
<b>PART I THE RIGHT TO SCIENCE, THEN</b>	
<b>1 The Dawning of a Right</b>	
Science and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1941–1948)	17
Mikel Mancisidor	
<b>2 The Origins of the Right to Science</b>	
The American Declaration on the Rights and Duties of Man	33
Cesare P. R. Romano	
<b>3 IP Rights and Human Rights</b>	
What History Tells Us and Why It Matters	54
Aurora Plomer	
<b>4 “Fostering a Love of Truth”</b>	
Conceptions of Science in UNESCO’s Early Years	76
Ivan Lind Christensen	
<b>5 The Right to Science and the Evolution of Scientific Integrity</b>	91
Roberto Andorno	

	<b>PART II THE RIGHT TO SCIENCE, NOW</b>	
6	<b>On the Right to Science As a Cultural Human Right</b> Farida Shaheed and Andrew Mazibrada	107
7	<b>Mainstreaming Science and Human Rights in UNESCO</b> Yvonne Donders and Konstantinos Tararas	124
8	<b>Considering the Right to Enjoy the Benefits of Scientific Progress and Its Applications As a Cultural Right</b> A Change in Perspective Mylène Bidault	140
9	<b>Implications of the Right to Science for People with Disabilities</b> Valerie J. Bradley	150
10	<b>Science in the Times of SARS-CoV-2</b> Stjepan Orešković and Sebastian Porsdam Mann	166
	<b>PART III DISSEMINATING, IMPLEMENTING, AND PUTTING INTO PRACTICE THE RIGHT TO SCIENCE</b>	
11	<b>“Fight the Fear with the Facts!”</b> Ranga Yogeshwar	195
12	<b>The Right to Science</b> <b>From Principle to Practice and the Role of National Science Academies</b> Jessica M. Wyndham, Margaret W. Vitullo, Rebecca Everly, Teresa M. Stoepler and Nathaniel Weisenberg	211
13	<b>The Right to Science in Practice</b> <b>A Proposed Test in Four Stages</b> Sebastian Porsdam Mann, Yvonne Donders and Helle Porsdam	231
14	<b>The Right to Science</b> <b>A Practical Tool for Advancing Global Health Equity and Promoting the Human Rights of People with Tuberculosis</b> Mike Frick and Gisa Dang	246
15	<b>A Proposal for Indicators of the Human Right to Science</b> Andrea Boggio and Brian Gran	268
16	<b>Epilogue</b> <b>Tensions in the Right to Science Then and Now</b> Christine Mitchell	286
	<i>Index</i>	298

## Contributors

**Mikel Mancisor** is a Member of the United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. He holds a Doctorate in International Relations from the Geneva School of Diplomacy and International Relations (DIR GSD), Washington College of Law.

**Cesare P.R. Romano** is a Professor of Law, Loyola Law School, Los Angeles, USA.

**Aurora Plomer** is a Professor of Law, University of Bristol, School of Law, Wills Memorial Building Queen's Road Bristol BS8 1RJ, UK.

**Ivan Lind Christensen** is an Associate Professor, Department of Politics and Society, Aalborg University, Denmark.

**Roberto Andorno** is an Associate Professor of Biomedical Law and Bioethics at the School of Law of the University of Zurich, Switzerland.

**Farida Shaheed** is an Executive Director, Shirkat Gah – Women's Resource Centre, Pakistan.

**Andrew Mazibrada** PhD Fellow, Centre for Interdisciplinary Studies of Law, University of Copenhagen.

**Yvonne Donders** is a Professor, International Human Rights and Cultural Diversity and Head of the Department of International and European Public Law at the Faculty of Law of the University of Amsterdam.

**Konstantinos Tararas** is a Program Specialist, Inclusion and Rights Section, UNESCO.

**Mylène Bidault** is a Member of the Friborg Group, Switzerland and has a doctorate in law, University of Paris X Nanterre, University of Geneva.

**Valerie J. Bradley** is the founder and President Emerita of Human Services Research Institute.

**Stjepan Oreskovic** is a Professor, University of Zagreb School of Medicine, Croatia.

**Sebastian Porsdam Mann** is a Postdoctoral Research Fellow at Harvard Medical School's Center for Bioethics and the University of Copenhagen.

**Ranga Yogeshwar** is a Professor for Ethics and Science Communication, Center for Ethics and Responsibility (ZEV), Hochschule Bonn-Rhein-Sieg, University of Applied Sciences, Germany.

**Jessica Wyndham** is the Director of the Scientific Responsibility, Human Rights and Law Program. She also serves as coordinator of the American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS).

**Margaret W. Vitullo** is the Deputy Director, American Sociological Association, USA.

**Rebecca Everly** is the Executive Director, International Human Rights Network of Academies and Scholarly Societies.

**Teresa M. Stoepler** is executive director of the InterAcademy Partnership for Research (IAP-R), USA.

**Nathaniel Weisenberg** is the Program Associate, American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS), USA.

**Helle Porsdam** is Professor of Law and Humanities at the Centre for Interdisciplinary Studies of Law (CIS), Faculty of Law, University of Copenhagen, Denmark.

**Mike Frick** is Tuberculosis Project Co-director, Treatment Action Group, USA.

**Gisa Dang** is Health and Human Rights Consultant, Treatment Action Group, USA.

**Andrea Boggio** is a professor in the Legal Studies department at Bryant University, USA.

**Brian Gran** is a Professor, Case Western Reserve University, Department of Sociology, Law School, and School of Applied Social Sciences, USA.

**Christine Mitchel** is the Executive Director, Center for Bioethics, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA.



## Acknowledgments

The editors wish to extend special thanks and acknowledgment to Andrew Mazibrada, without whose unfailingly rapid, high-quality editorial support, and language revision this volume would have been much impoverished.

The editors wish to thank Josu Guevara for generously allowing us to use his work, 'ArteRia', for our volume. Originally part of an exhibition titled 'Giza Eskubideei Begira' (Insights into Human Rights) and organized by the Basque Government in 2017 on the occasion of the 70 anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Guevara's work specifically addresses Article 27 of the Universal Declaration.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-47825-0 — The Right to Science  
Edited by Helle Porsdam , Sebastian Porsdam Mann  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## Foreword

*Lea Bishop*

Freedom of scientific enquiry. Integrity of research. Universal access to science education. Sharing knowledge and discoveries as a public good. Open access to academic research. International cooperation through scientific collaboration. Scientifically sound public policy. Broad participation in scientific enquiry. Attention to the needs of vulnerable communities. Widespread access to new technologies. Patent policy as a means to this end. Free and informed participation in experiments and new technologies. These are among the central themes of the internationally recognized human right to participate in the process of scientific discovery and to share in the benefits of technological progress – what has only very recently come to be shorthanded as “the right to science.” As the book now in front of you will make clear in greater detail, the right to science is a philosophical ideal, a legal promise, a political discourse, and – perhaps – a social movement.

Its seed was firmly planted in Article 27 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, now over 80 years ago. Some three decades later, the young shoot was transplanted into Article 15 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. The philosophical ideal thus became a legal promise. Yet, for many decades, this promise had little practical impact. The right to science received too little light and nourishment to grow into its potential. Even human rights experts remained unsure how to interpret and apply these most obscure of all the international human rights treaty provisions. About two decades ago, however, the seedling finally found fertile soil at the American Association for the Advancement of Science, the University of Connecticut Human Rights Institute, and the Information Society Project at Yale Law School. At these institutions, Jessica Wyndham and Professor Audrey Chapman provided the critical care at a tender stage. They inspired and welcomed me to join in the work. When I published *The Right to Science and Culture* in 2010 – then using a different last name – I *hoped* to provide a conceptual trellis to enable the Article 15 rights to one day achieve a firm foothold within the United Nations human rights system.

That dream has now been realized by the collective efforts of a global network of human right scholars and advocates. Each has grasped his or her own conceptual offshoot and carefully cultivated it. “The right to science and culture” is now the subject of an ample and growing body of scholarship, multiple United Nation Special Rapporteur reports, and at least one ICESCR interpretative commentary. I am reminded of the gardener’s adage about planting and caring for vining plants: “First they sleep. Then they creep. Then they leap!” *The Right to Science: Then and Now* represents this third stage of accelerating growth. So much is now being written about Article 15, it has become impossible to do justice to both the scientific and cultural aspects in a single volume! The vine is mature. It now depends upon human rights advocates to seize its fruit. A social movement is needed to lay claim to the right, leveraging these new conceptual and legal tools to continuously promote the right to science and defend it from threats.

If you will permit me a second extended metaphor, let us leave the vineyard for wilder land. For contributing authors, participating in an edited volume is a bit like embarking upon a camping trip with very old friends. Most of the writers have known each other for a long time, formed friendships over many an academic gathering, and drawn inspiration from each other’s writings and constructive feedback. Coming together in such a massive collective effort is exciting – and often exhausting – and always exhilarating. Of course, every camping trip succeeds or fails based on the efforts of its organizers. Until you have had the editorial experience yourself, it is impossible to guess at the enormous investment of time and energy required to bring such a volume together. Ironically, it is vastly easier to write one’s own book than to edit a collection of essays! The editors of *The Right to Science: Then and Now* have been particularly ambitious in including such a diversity of contributors. This scale multiplies the complexity of the conceptual task and organizational labor . . . but also the richness of the final outcome. For the reader seeking a comprehensive introduction, such a thorough survey of the field is a treat indeed. As you enjoy the volume that follows, I hope you will appreciate the labor of love that it represents, and find your own way to pay it forward.