MAKING SOCIAL SPENDING WORK

How does social spending relate to economic growth and which countries have got this right and wrong? Peter Lindert examines the experience of countries across the globe to reveal what has worked, what needs changing and who the winners and losers are under different systems. He traces the development of public education, health care, pensions, and welfare provision, and addresses key questions around inter-generational inequality and fiscal redistribution, the returns to investment in human capital, how to deal with an aging population, whether migration is a cost or a benefit, and how social spending differs in autocracies and democracies. The book shows that what we need to do above all is to invest more in the young from cradle to career, and shift the burden of paying for social insurance away from the workplace and onto society as a whole.

Peter H. Lindert is Distinguished Professor of Economics at the University of California, Davis. His previous publications include the prize-winning book Growing Public: Social Spending and Economic Growth since the Eighteenth Century (2004) and Unequal Gains: American Growth and Inequality since 1700 (2016, with Jeffrey G. Williamson).
To Natasha, Sophie, Izzy, Nadia, Carson, Alex, Kailani, and Kiara
Contents

List of Figures ix
List of Tables xii

PART I. OVERVIEW
1. Enduring Issues ........................................... 3
2. Findings and Lessons ..................................... 11

PART II. THE LONG RISE, AND ITS CAUSES
3. Why Poor Relief Arrived So Late ....................... 25
4. The Dawn of Mass Schooling before 1914 ............... 48
5. Public Education since 1914 ............................... 63
6. More, but Different, Social Spending in Rich Countries since 1914 ........................................ 104
7. Is the Rest of the World Following a Different Path? ........ 122

PART III. WHAT EFFECTS?
8. Effects on Growth, Jobs, and Life .................... 153
10. Do the Rich Pay the Poor for All This? .............. 208

PART IV. CONFRONTING THREATS
11. Do Immigration Tensions Fray the Safety Nets? ........ 235
12. Pensions and the Curse of Long Life .................... 254
13. Approaches to Public Pension Reform ................. 286
CONTENTS

APPENDICES
Available online at www.cambridge.org/Lindert
Appendix A. Sources and Notes for Chapters 3 and 4
Appendix B. Fiscal Redistribution in the Longer Run
Appendix C. Sources and Notes for Chapter 10
Appendix D. Chapter 12's Pension Accounting – Equations and Forecasts

Acknowledgments 356
Notes 358
References 390
Index 419
Figures

3.1. The growth of government social spending, other than for education, 1820–1910 ................................. 39
4.1. Primary-school enrollment rates, continental Europe, 1830–1913 ................................. 57
4.2. Primary-school enrollment rates, Northwest Europe, 1830–1910 ................................. 59
4.3. Primary-school enrollment rates, Pacific and Asia, 1830–1910 ................................. 60
5.1. Average years of schooling attained by adults 15–64, in some leading countries, 1870–2010 ................................. 70
5.2. Average years of schooling attained by adults 15–64, in Russia and Asian countries, 1870–2010 ................................. 71
5.3. Average years of schooling attained by adults 15–64, in some Latin American countries, 1870–2010 ................................. 71
5.4. The inequality of years of schooling attained by adults 15–64, in some leading countries, 1870–2010 ................................. 74
5.5. The inequality of years of schooling attained by adults 15–64, in Russia and Asian countries, 1870–2010 ................................. 74
5.6. The inequality of years of schooling attained by adults 15–64, in Latin American countries, 1870–2010 ................................. 75
5.7. Female/male ratio in adults’ schooling, by world region, 1870–2010 ................................. 76
6.1. The share of GDP spent on social programs, selected countries for 1910–2018 ................................. 105
LIST OF FIGURES

6.2. The share of GDP spent on social programs, thirty-six OECD countries, 1980–2018 ................................. 107
6.3. Types of social expenditures as shares of the total, the average of thirteen OECD countries, 1910–2010 ...................... 111
6.4. Support ratios for target groups, by type of social expenditures, the average of thirteen OECD countries, 1910–2010 ....................... 112
6.5. Where elderly Americans have lived since 1850 ......................... 117
6.6. Who paid for the consumption of the elderly, c. 2005 ..................... 119
7.1. Public social spending c. 2010 in seventy countries, compared with its earlier movements in three leading countries .................. 124
7.2. Public education spending c. 2010 in sixty-three countries, compared with its earlier movements in two leading countries .......... 125
7.3. Public pensions versus public education spending, 106 countries, c. 2010 ................................................................. 131
8.1. Employment of working-age adults versus social spending, 2017 .......... 164
8.2. Gender and jobs in forty-three countries, 2017 ............................. 165
8.3. Life expectancy at birth in 2015 versus government health-care expenditures in 2011–2015 as a share of GDP ....................... 173
9.1. Tax mix by region, 2016 ............................................................ 181
9.2. Cigarette tax rates, thirty-five countries in 2016 ............................ 184
9.3. Gasoline (petrol) tax rates, thirty-five countries in 2017 .................. 185
9.4. Tax-collection costs as a percentage of central government revenue, United Kingdom and United States, 1870 and 1970 ........ 189
9.5. Public investments in paid parental leave and in early education, seven countries in 2016 ......................................................... 192
9.6. Health-care spending on the elderly, relative to those under 65, in the United States, 1953–2012 ................................. 203
10.1. Summarizing the inequality of US market incomes in 2014: the gini coefficient ......................................................... 210
10.2. Recent snapshots of income distributions in fifty-three countries ........ 216
10.3. Social transfers help to deliver fiscal redistribution, fifty-three countries, c. 2013 ........................................................... 217
11.1. The percentage of US residents born outside the United States, 1850–2017 ............................................................. 236

x
LIST OF FIGURES

11.2. Percentage of foreign-born and native-born with post-secondary education, among the population 25 and older, twenty countries in 2015 ................................................. 251
12.1. Elderly persons per 100 working-age adults, 1950–2050 ........................................... 255
12.2. Public pension costs and generosity since 1960: six English-speaking countries ......................................................... 271
12.3. Public pension costs and generosity since 1960: six Mediterranean countries ......................................................... 274
13.1. The conventional “three pillars” of old-age security ......................................................... 287
13.2. Chile’s government pension deficits since the reform, 1981–2010 ........................................... 302
14.1. Public pension generosity and pension costs since 1960: Japan versus other countries ......................................................... 326
14.2. Venezuela’s GDP per capita, versus that in Colombia and Costa Rica, 1950–2017 ......................................................... 331
Tables

3.1. Poor relief from formal institutions, local taxes, and charity, four European countries, 1427–1868 ........................................ 29
3.2. Eurasian central government revenues, c. 1600–1870 .............. 33
3.3. The growth of government social spending, other than for education, 1820–1910 ............................................................... 38
3.4. The exclusiveness of the British franchise, 1688–1918 ................ 41
3.5. Adult male suffrage in twelve countries before 1914 ................... 42
4.1. Public education expenditures, for all levels of education, 1820–1910 ............................................................................. 49
4.2. Internal rates of return on schooling sons of laborers, Victorian England ................................................................. 54
5.1. Total public expenditures on education as a percentage of GDP, twenty-three countries, 1910–2015 .................................... 67
5.2. PISA achievement scores, 2006–2018, versus real income per capita, fifty-nine places in 2010 ............................................. 81
6.1. Public education support versus public pension support, thirteen countries in 1910 and in 2010 ............................................. 113
7.1. Public pensions versus public education spending, 106 countries, c. 2010 ................................................................. 127
7.2. Social spending in Russia/USSR and in China before, during, and after communism .................................................. 137
7.3. Average social rates of return to investment in education 1970s–1990s, by level of education and by national income per capita ........................................................................ 142
7.4. An elitist indicator in public education expenditure, 1985–2017 .................................................................................... 143
7.5. Absenteeism among teachers and health workers, c. 2000 .......... 148
LIST OF TABLES

8.2. How non-education social spending as a share of GDP correlates with growth and prosperity in twenty-one OECD countries, 1880–2014 ...............................157
8.3. Jobs and social spending around the world in 2017 .............................................162
9.1. Tax revenue shares, forty-one countries and six regions in 2016 ..............................179
9.2. Public investments in paid parental leave and in early education, thirty-five countries in 2016 .............................................191
9.3. Eleven countries’ health-care rankings by patients and doctors, 2014–2016 ..............................204
10.1. Snapshots of fiscal redistribution in fifty-three countries, c. 2013 .................................214
11.1. Perceptions versus reality about immigrants in six countries, November 2017 – February 2018 .................................239
11.2. The fiscal effects of extra immigrants depend on the question you ask about them .................................242
12.1. The estimated shares of pension benefits funded by interest on earlier payroll contributions, sixteen countries in 1984–2013 .............................................261
12.2. Which countries are most “reforming” public pensions since the 1990s, and which are least “reforming” .............................................268
12.3. Which countries have the least, or the most, anti-growth age bias in their social-spending mix .............................................282
13.1. Who contributed to Chile’s social security, and to whose benefit, in 1965 .............................................295
13.2. Fees and mandatory contributions in individual pension accounts, Latin American countries as of June 2007 .............................................301
13.3. Countries that emulated Chile’s mandatory defined-contribution reform .............................................303
13.4. Singapore’s real rates of return on forced savings, compared with other real rates in three countries, 1978–2016 .............................................311
14.2. Indicators of social-spending effort and related outcomes: comparing the United States to three commonwealth countries, 2010–2018 .............................................341

© in this web service Cambridge University Press  www.cambridge.org
LIST OF TABLES

APPENDICES

Available online at www.cambridge.org/Lindert
A.1. Government expenditures of Japan’s Tokugawa shogunate in 1730
A.2. Estimated government expenditures for the Mughal Empire, 1595-1596
C.1. Budgetary leeway for raising pensions in fifty-eight countries, 1980-2050