

Ruling by Other Means

What do states gain by sending citizens into the streets? *Ruling by Other Means* investigates this question through the lens of state-mobilized movements (SMMs), an umbrella concept that includes a range of (often covertly organized) collective actions intended to promote state interests. The SMMs research agenda departs significantly from that of classic social movement and contentious politics theory, focused on threats to the state from seemingly autonomous societal actors. Existing theories assume that the goal of popular protest is to voice societal grievances, represent oppressed groups, and challenge state authorities and other powerholders. The chapters in this volume show, however, that states themselves organize citizens (sometimes surreptitiously and even transnationally) to act collectively to advance state goals. Drawn from different historical periods and diverse geographical regions, these case studies expand and improve our understanding of social movements, civil society, and state-society relations under authoritarian regimes.

Grzegorz Ekiert is Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Government at Harvard University.

Elizabeth J. Perry is Henry Rosovsky Professor of Government at Harvard University.

Yan Xiaojun is Associate Professor of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Hong Kong.

Cambridge Studies in Contentious Politics

General Editor

Doug McAdam *Stanford University and Center for Advanced Study
 in the Behavioral Sciences*

Editors

Mark Beissinger *Princeton University*
 Donatella della Porta *Scuola Normale Superiore*
 Jack A. Goldstone *George Mason University*
 Michael Hanagan *Vassar College*
 Holly J. McCammon *Vanderbilt University*
 David S. Meyer *University of California, Irvine*
 Sarah Soule *Stanford University*
 Suzanne Staggenborg *University of Pittsburgh*
 Sidney Tarrow *Cornell University*
 Charles Tilly (d. 2008) *Columbia University*
 Elisabeth J. Wood *Yale University*
 Deborah Yashar *Princeton University*

Rina Agarwala, *Informal Labor, Formal Politics, and Dignified Discontent in India*
 Ronald Aminzade, *Race, Nation, and Citizenship in Post-Colonial Africa: The Case of
 Tanzania*
 Ronald Aminzade et al., *Silence and Voice in the Study of Contentious Politics*
 Javier Auyero, *Routine Politics and Violence in Argentina: The Gray Zone of State
 Power*
 Phillip M. Ayoub, *When States Come Out: Europe's Sexual Minorities and the Politics
 of Visibility*
 Amrita Basu, *Violent Conjunctions in Democratic India*
 W. Lance Bennett and Alexandra Segerberg, *The Logic of Connective Action: Digital
 Media and the Personalization of Contentious Politics*
 Nancy Bermeo and Deborah J. Yashar, editors, *Parties, Movements, and Democracy in
 the Developing World*
 Clifford Bob, *The Global Right Wing and the Clash of World Politics*
 Clifford Bob, *The Marketing of Rebellion: Insurgents, Media, and International
 Activism*
 Robert Braun, *Protectors of Pluralism: Religious Minorities and the Rescue of Jews in
 the Low Countries during the Holocaust*
 Charles Brockett, *Political Movements and Violence in Central America*
 Marisa von Bülow, *Building Transnational Networks: Civil Society and the Politics of
 Trade in the Americas*
 Valerie Bunce and Sharon Wolchik, *Defeating Authoritarian Leaders in Postcommunist
 Countries*
 Teri L. Caraway and Michele Ford, *Labor and Politics in Indonesia*

(continued after index)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47806-9 — Ruling by Other Means
Edited by Grzegorz Ekiert, Elizabeth J. Perry, Xiaojun Yan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Ruling by Other Means

State-Mobilized Movements

Edited by

GRZEGORZ EKIERT

Harvard University

ELIZABETH J. PERRY

Harvard University

YAN XIAOJUN

University of Hong Kong



Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47806-9 — Ruling by Other Means
Edited by Grzegorz Ekiert, Elizabeth J. Perry, Xiaojun Yan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi - 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108478069

DOI: 10.1017/9781108784146

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-47806-9 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-74561-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>List of Contributors</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xii
1 State-Mobilized Movements: A Research Agenda <i>Grzegorz Ekiert and Elizabeth J. Perry</i>	1
2 Manufactured Ambiguity: Party-State Mobilization Strategy in the March 1968 Crisis in Poland <i>Dominika Kruszevska and Grzegorz Ekiert</i>	24
3 Suppressing Students in the People’s Republic of China: Proletarian State-Mobilized Movements in 1968 and 1989 <i>Elizabeth J. Perry and Yan Xiaojun</i>	57
4 State-Mobilized Community Development: The Case of Rural Taiwan <i>Kristen E. Looney</i>	86
5 Enforcement Networks and Racial Contention in Civil Rights–Era Mississippi <i>David Cunningham and Peter B. Owens</i>	110
6 Social Sources of Counterrevolution: State-Sponsored Contention during Revolutionary Episodes <i>Mark R. Beissinger</i>	140
7 Occupy Youth! State-Mobilized Movements in the Putin Era (or, What Was Nashi and What Comes Next?) <i>Julie Hemment</i>	166
8 State-Mobilized Movements after Annexation of Crimea: The Construction of Novorossiya <i>Samuel A. Greene and Graeme B. Robertson</i>	193

vi		<i>Contents</i>
9	Mirroring Opposition Threats: The Logic of State Mobilization in Bolivarian Venezuela <i>Sam Handlin</i>	217
10	Mobilizing against Change: Veteran Organizations as a Pivotal Political Actor <i>Danijela Dolenec and Daniela Širinić</i>	239
11	The Dynamics of State-Mobilized Movements: Insights from Egypt <i>Ashley Anderson and Melani Cammett</i>	261
12	State-Mobilized Campaign and the Prodemocracy Movement in Hong Kong, 2013–2015 <i>Eliza W. Y. Lee</i>	291
13	The Resurrection of Lei Feng: Rebuilding the Chinese Party-State's Infrastructure of Volunteer Mobilization <i>David A. Palmer and Rundong Ning</i>	314
	<i>Index</i>	345

Figures

2.1	State-mobilized movement: March 8 to June 24, 1968	<i>page</i> 30
2.2	State-mobilized movement by repertoire: March 12 to June 24, 1968	32
2.3	State-mobilized movement across the country: Number of reported rallies and demonstrations	33
3.1	Workers of the Xinhua Printing House and Xinhua Bookstore deliver printing materials with Chairman Mao's latest instructions to the Workers' Propaganda Team setting out to Tsinghua University campus	61
3.2	Workers at Beijing Knitting Mill admire mangoes from Mao Zedong	64
6.1	Political groupings in the Orange Revolution (KIIS survey)	150
6.2	Political groupings in the Orange Revolution (Monitoring survey)	152
6.3	Attitudinal profile plot for three clusters of counterrevolutionaries in the Orange Revolution	161
8.1	Donbas–Russian Spring network activity, 2011–2016	204
8.2	Topics over time	206
8.3	This country can't be beaten!	209
8.4	Republic of Novorossia, June 2014	209
8.5	News front	210
9.1	Arenas of operation and dominant types of mobilization	223
10.1	Share of MP questions on veteran-related issues from 2000 to 2015. Source: Croatian Policy Agendas Dataset (Širinić et al., 2016)	248
10.2	Density of veteran NGOs and HDZ vote share in 2013 local election	250
10.3	Veteran protests between 2000 and 2017. Source: Dolenc et al. (2019)	253

11.1	State-sponsored and contentious mobilization in Egypt, 2011–2013	276
11.2	Kaplan-Meier survival estimates for SMMs by organizational presence	283
11.3	Kaplan-Meier survival estimates for SMM by regime identity	284
13.1	The iconic image of Lei Feng	321
13.2	Propaganda poster for sent-down youth in the Cultural Revolution	335
13.3	Banner for the Go West Programme’s website	335

Tables

4.1	Community development policies in Taiwan, 1955–1981	<i>page</i> 95
4.2	Results of the Community Development Campaign in Taiwan, 1969–1981	100
6.1	The demography of counterrevolution in Ukraine, 2004	155
8.1	Authorities at peak periods of activity	208
8.2	Top ten media – Russian Spring movement	211
9.1	Major elections and referenda during the Fifth Republic, 1999–2017	220
9.2	Opposition threats and state mobilization responses across four phases	224
11.1	Cox proportional hazards model for SMMs, 2011–2013	281
12.1	Public support of the Occupy Movement	306
12.2	Survey on whether the Occupy Movement should continue or stop	306
13.1	Frequency of key terms in the <i>People's Daily</i>	337

Contributors

Ashley Anderson is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill.

Mark R. Beissinger is Henry W. Putnam Professor in the Department of Politics at Princeton University.

Melani Cammett is Clarence Dillon Professor of International Affairs in the Department of Government at Harvard University and Chair of the Harvard Academy of International and Area Studies.

David Cunningham is Professor and Chair of Sociology at Washington University in St. Louis.

Danijela Dolenc is an Associate Professor in the Faculty of Political Science, University of Zagreb.

Grzegorz Ekiert is Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Government and Director of the Minda de Gunzburg Center for European Studies at Harvard University.

Samuel A. Greene is Director of the Russia Institute at King's College London and a Reader in Russian politics.

Sam Handlin is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Swarthmore College.

Julie Hemment is Professor of Anthropology at the University of Massachusetts Amherst.

Dominika Kruszewska is a Postdoctoral Fellow with the Weatherhead Center for International Affairs at Harvard University.

Eliza W.Y. Lee is Professor of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Hong Kong.

Kristen E. Looney is Assistant Professor of Asian Studies and Government at Georgetown University.

List of Contributors

xi

Peter B. Owens is a Research Technician in the Office of Institutional Research at California State University, Chico.

David A. Palmer is a Professor jointly appointed by the Hong Kong Institute for the Humanities and Social Sciences and the Department of Sociology at the University of Hong Kong.

Elizabeth J. Perry is Henry Rosovsky Professor of Government at Harvard University and Director of the Harvard-Yenching Institute.

Graeme B. Robertson is Professor of Political Science at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill.

Rundong Ning is a Ph.D. Candidate in the Department of Anthropology of Yale University.

Daniela Širinić is an Assistant Professor in the Faculty of Political Science, University of Zagreb.

Yan Xiaojun is Associate Professor of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Hong Kong and Director of the Research Hub on Institutions of China, HKU.

Acknowledgments

This was a complex research project, and we could not possibly have completed it without generous support from multiple research institutions at Harvard and the University of Hong Kong (HKU). We are grateful to the Harvard Asia Center, the Harvard-Yenching Institute, the Minda de Gunzburg Center for European Studies, the Radcliffe Institute for Advanced Studies, the Weatherhead Center for International Affairs, and HKU's Faculty of Social Sciences and Research Hub on Institutions of China for their support. Three conferences that were a core part of the project required major organizational efforts. We would like to thank in particular Sarah Banse, Laura Falloon, Tommy Fan, Darren Fung, Elaine Setser, Lindsay Strogatz, and Rebecca Wassarman for their expert assistance in making these events successful.

At our initial conference where the basic ideas for this book emerged, we benefited greatly from the help of an extraordinary group of graduate research assistants. We are grateful to Jared Abbott, Chris Carothers, Jingkai He, Li La, Matt Reichert, Grains Gu, and Zhu Zichen. Throughout the project we were assisted by the input and advice of many colleagues. Our special thanks go to: John P. Burns, Cheris Chan, Jan Kubik, Richard W. X. Hu, William Hurst, Zhan Jinghong, Gary King, Steve Levitsky, Wolfgang Merkel, Joel Migdal, Kacie Miura, Jennifer Pan, Scott Radnitz, Zhao Suisheng, and David Zweig. We are also grateful to the editor and staff of Cambridge University Press for their work on this book.