Ruling by Other Means

What do states gain by sending citizens into the streets? *Ruling by Other Means* investigates this question through the lens of state-mobilized movements (SMMs), an umbrella concept that includes a range of (often covertly organized) collective actions intended to promote state interests. The SMMs research agenda departs significantly from that of classic social movement and contentious politics theory, focused on threats to the state from seemingly autonomous societal actors. Existing theories assume that the goal of popular protest is to voice societal grievances, represent oppressed groups, and challenge state authorities and other powerholders. The chapters in this volume show, however, that states themselves organize citizens (sometimes surreptitiously and even transnationally) to act collectively to advance state goals. Drawn from different historical periods and diverse geographical regions, these case studies expand and improve our understanding of social movements, civil society, and state-society relations under authoritarian regimes.

Grzegorz Ekiert is Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Government at Harvard University.

Elizabeth J. Perry is Henry Rosovsky Professor of Government at Harvard University.

Yan Xiaojun is Associate Professor of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Hong Kong.
Cambridge Studies in Contentious Politics

General Editor

Doug McAdam Stanford University and Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences

Editors

Mark Beissinger Princeton University
Donatella della Porta Scuola Normale Superiore
Jack A. Goldstone George Mason University
Michael Hanagan Vassar College
Holly J. McCammon Vanderbilt University
David S. Meyer University of California, Irvine
Sarah Soule Stanford University
Suzanne Staggenborg University of Pittsburgh
Sidney Tarrow Cornell University
Charles Tilly (d. 2008) Columbia University
Elisabeth J. Wood Yale University
Deborah Yashar Princeton University

Rina Agarwala, Informal Labor, Formal Politics, and Dignified Discontent in India
Ronald Aminzade, Race, Nation, and Citizenship in Post-Colonial Africa: The Case of Tanzania
Ronald Aminzade et al., Silence and Voice in the Study of Contentious Politics
Javier Auyero, Routine Politics and Violence in Argentina: The Gray Zone of State Power
Phillip M. Ayoub, When States Come Out: Europe’s Sexual Minorities and the Politics of Visibility
Amrita Basu, Violent Conjunctures in Democratic India
W. Lance Bennett and Alexandra Segerberg, The Logic of Connective Action: Digital Media and the Personalization of Contentious Politics
Nancy Bermeo and Deborah J. Yashar, editors, Parties, Movements, and Democracy in the Developing World
Clifford Bob, The Global Right Wing and the Clash of World Politics
Clifford Bob, The Marketing of Rebellion: Insurgents, Media, and International Activism
Robert Braun, Protectors of Pluralism: Religious Minorities and the Rescue of Jews in the Low Countries during the Holocaust
Charles Brockett, Political Movements and Violence in Central America
Marisa von Bülow, Building Transnational Networks: Civil Society and the Politics of Trade in the Americas
Valerie Bunce and Sharon Wolchik, Defeating Authoritarian Leaders in Postcommunist Countries
Teri L. Caraway and Michele Ford, Labor and Politics in Indonesia

(continued after index)
Ruling by Other Means

State-Mobilized Movements

Edited by

GRZEGORZ EKIERT
Harvard University

ELIZABETH J. PERRY
Harvard University

YAN XIAOJUN
University of Hong Kong
Contents

List of Figures page vii
List of Tables ix
List of Contributors x
Acknowledgments xii

1 State-Mobilized Movements: A Research Agenda 1
Grzegorz Ekiert and Elizabeth J. Perry

2 Manufactured Ambiguity: Party-State Mobilization Strategy in the March 1968 Crisis in Poland 24
Dominika Kruszewska and Grzegorz Ekiert

3 Suppressing Students in the People’s Republic of China: Proletarian State-Mobilized Movements in 1968 and 1989 57
Elizabeth J. Perry and Yan Xiaojun

4 State-Mobilized Community Development: The Case of Rural Taiwan 86
Kristen E. Looney

5 Enforcement Networks and Racial Contention in Civil Rights–Era Mississippi 110
David Cunningham and Peter B. Owens

6 Social Sources of Counterrevolution: State-Sponsored Contention during Revolutionary Episodes 140
Mark R. Beissinger

7 Occupy Youth! State-Mobilized Movements in the Putin Era (or, What Was Nashi and What Comes Next?) 166
Julie Hemment

8 State-Mobilized Movements after Annexation of Crimea: The Construction of Novorossiya 193
Samuel A. Greene and Graeme B. Robertson
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sam Handlin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Danijela Dolenc and Daniela Širinić</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ashley Anderson and Melani Cammett</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliza W. Y. Lee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David A. Palmer and Rundong Ning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figures

2.1 State-mobilized movement: March 8 to June 24, 1968

2.2 State-mobilized movement by repertoire: March 12
   to June 24, 1968

2.3 State-mobilized movement across the country: Number
   of reported rallies and demonstrations

3.1 Workers of the Xinhua Printing House and Xinhua Bookstore
   deliver printing materials with Chairman Mao’s latest instructions
   to the Workers’ Propaganda Team setting out to Tsinghua
   University campus

3.2 Workers at Beijing Knitting Mill admire mangoes from
   Mao Zedong

6.1 Political groupings in the Orange Revolution (KISS survey)

6.2 Political groupings in the Orange Revolution
   (Monitoring survey)

6.3 Attitudinal profile plot for three clusters
   of counterrevolutionaries in the Orange Revolution


8.2 Topics over time

8.3 This country can’t be beaten!

8.4 Republic of Novorossia, June 2014

8.5 News front

9.1 Arenas of operation and dominant types of mobilization

10.1 Share of MP questions on veteran-related issues
    from 2000 to 2015. Source: Croatian Policy Agendas Dataset
    (Širinić et al., 2016)

10.2 Density of veteran NGOs and HDZ vote share in 2013
    local election

10.3 Veteran protests between 2000 and 2017. Source: Dolenec et al. (2019)
List of Figures

11.1 State-sponsored and contentious mobilization in Egypt, 2011–2013 276
11.2 Kaplan-Meier survival estimates for SMMs by organizational presence 283
11.3 Kaplan-Meier survival estimates for SMM by regime identity 284
13.1 The iconic image of Lei Feng 321
13.2 Propaganda poster for sent-down youth in the Cultural Revolution 335
13.3 Banner for the Go West Programme’s website 335
Tables

4.1 Community development policies in Taiwan, 1955–1981  
4.2 Results of the Community Development Campaign in Taiwan, 1969–1981  
6.1 The demography of counterrevolution in Ukraine, 2004  
8.1 Authorities at peak periods of activity  
8.2 Top ten media – Russian Spring movement  
9.1 Major elections and referenda during the Fifth Republic, 1999–2017  
9.2 Opposition threats and state mobilization responses across four phases  
11.1 Cox proportional hazards model for SMMs, 2011–2013  
12.1 Public support of the Occupy Movement  
12.2 Survey on whether the Occupy Movement should continue or stop  
13.1 Frequency of key terms in the People’s Daily
Contributors

Ashley Anderson is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill.

Mark R. Beissinger is Henry W. Putnam Professor in the Department of Politics at Princeton University.

Melani Cammett is Clarence Dillon Professor of International Affairs in the Department of Government at Harvard University and Chair of the Harvard Academy of International and Area Studies.

David Cunningham is Professor and Chair of Sociology at Washington University in St. Louis.

Danijela Dolenec is an Associate Professor in the Faculty of Political Science, University of Zagreb.

Grzegorz Ekiert is Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Government and Director of the Minda de Gunzburg Center for European Studies at Harvard University.

Samuel A. Greene is Director of the Russia Institute at King’s College London and a Reader in Russian politics.

Sam Handlin is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Swarthmore College.

Julie Hemment is Professor of Anthropology at the University of Massachusetts Amherst.

Dominika Kruszewska is a Postdoctoral Fellow with the Weatherhead Center for International Affairs at Harvard University.

Eliza W.Y. Lee is Professor of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Hong Kong.

Kristen E. Looney is Assistant Professor of Asian Studies and Government at Georgetown University.
List of Contributors

Peter B. Owens is a Research Technician in the Office of Institutional Research at California State University, Chico.

David A. Palmer is a Professor jointly appointed by the Hong Kong Institute for the Humanities and Social Sciences and the Department of Sociology at the University of Hong Kong.

Elizabeth J. Perry is Henry Rosovsky Professor of Government at Harvard University and Director of the Harvard-Yenching Institute.

Graeme Robertson is Professor of Political Science at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill.

Rundong Ning is a Ph.D. Candidate in the Department of Anthropology of Yale University.

Daniela Širinić is an Assistant Professor in the Faculty of Political Science, University of Zagreb.

Yan Xiaojun is Associate Professor of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Hong Kong and Director of the Research Hub on Institutions of China, HKU.
Acknowledgments

This was a complex research project, and we could not possibly have completed it without generous support from multiple research institutions at Harvard and the University of Hong Kong (HKU). We are grateful to the Harvard Asia Center, the Harvard-Yenching Institute, the Minda de Gunzburg Center for European Studies, the Radcliffe Institute for Advanced Studies, the Weatherhead Center for International Affairs, and HKU’s Faculty of Social Sciences and Research Hub on Institutions of China for their support. Three conferences that were a core part of the project required major organizational efforts. We would like to thank in particular Sarah Banse, Laura Falloon, Tommy Fan, Darren Fung, Elaine Setser, Lindsay Strogatz, and Rebecca Wassarman for their expert assistance in making these events successful.

At our initial conference where the basic ideas for this book emerged, we benefited greatly from the help of an extraordinary group of graduate research assistants. We are grateful to Jared Abbott, Chris Carothers, Jingkai He, Li La, Matt Reichert, Grains Gu, and Zhu Zichen. Throughout the project we were assisted by the input and advice of many colleagues. Our special thanks go to: John P. Burns, Cheris Chan, Jan Kubik, Richard W. X. Hu, William Hurst, Zhan Jinghong, Gary King, Steve Levitsky, Wolfgang Merkel, Joel Migdal, Kacie Miura, Jennifer Pan, Scott Radnitz, Zhao Suisheng, and David Zweig. We are also grateful to the editor and staff of Cambridge University Press for their work on this book.