One of the greatest challenges in fundamental physics is to reconcile quantum mechanics and general relativity in a theory of quantum gravity. A successful theory would have profound consequences for our understanding of space, time, and matter. This collection of essays written by eminent physicists and philosophers discusses these consequences and examines the most important conceptual questions among philosophers and physicists in their search for a quantum theory of gravity. Comprised of three parts, the book explores the emergence of classical spacetime; the nature of time; and important questions of the interpretation, metaphysics, and epistemology of quantum gravity. These essays will appeal to both physicists and philosophers of science working on problems in foundational physics, specifically that of quantum gravity.

Nick Huggett is LAS Distinguished Professor at the University of Illinois at Chicago. He has worked in the field of the philosophy of quantum gravity for over 20 years. He is coeditor of Physics Meets Philosophy at the Planck Scale (Cambridge University Press, 2001) and is Co-Director of the Beyond Spacetime research project, funded by the National Science Foundation, Foundational Questions Institute, John Templeton Foundation, and American Council of Learned Societies.

Keizo Matsubara is an affiliated researcher at Uppsala University. His philosophical work primarily addresses string theory. He has held postdoctoral positions at the Rotman Institute of Philosophy at Western University and at the University of Illinois at Chicago.

Christian Wüthrich is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Geneva. He works in philosophy of physics, philosophy of science, and metaphysics. Starting with his doctoral research, the primary focus of his research has long been the philosophy of quantum gravity. He is Co-Director of the Beyond Spacetime research project, funded by the National Science Foundation, Foundational Questions Institute, John Templeton Foundation, and American Council of Learned Societies.
BEYOND SPACETIME
The Foundations of Quantum Gravity

Edited by

NICK HUGGETT
University of Illinois at Chicago

KEIZO MATSUBARA
Uppsala University

CHRISTIAN WÜTHRICH
University of Geneva
# Contents

## List of Contributors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 1 Introduction

**Nick Huggett, Keizo Matsubara, and Christian Wüthrich**

### Part I Spacetime Emergence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 2 The Bronstein Hypercube of Quantum Gravity

**Daniele Oriti**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3 Emergence of Time in Loop Quantum Gravity

**Suddhasattwa Brahma**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 4 Beyond Standard Inflationary Cosmology

**Robert H. Brandenberger**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 5 What Black Holes Have Taught Us about Quantum Gravity

**Daniel Harlow**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Part II Time in Quantum Theories of Gravity

### 6 Space and Time in Loop Quantum Gravity

**Carlo Rovelli**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 7 Being and Becoming on the Road to Quantum Gravity; or, the Birth of a Baby Is Not a Baby

**Fay Dowker**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 8 Temporal Relationalism

**Lee Smolin**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contents

9  Back to Parmenides  
**HENRIQUE GOMES**  
176

**Part III  Issues of Interpretation**  
207

10  Why Black Hole Information Loss Is Paradoxical  
**DAVID WALLACE**  
209

11  Chronic Incompleteness, Final Theory Claims, and the Lack of Free Parameters in String Theory  
**RICHARD DAWID**  
237

12  Spacetime and Physical Equivalence  
**SEBASTIAN DE HARO**  
257

13  On the Empirical Consequences of the AdS/CFT Duality  
**RADIN DARDASHI, RICHARD DAWID, SEAN GRYB, AND KARIM THÉBAULT**  
284

14  Extending Lewisian Modal Metaphysics from a Specific Quantum Gravity Perspective  
**TIZIANA VISTARINI**  
304

15  What Can (Mathematical) Categories Tell Us about Spacetime?  
**KO SANDERS**  
338

*Index*  
358
Contributors

Suddhasattwa Brahma
Department of Physics, McGill University, Montreal, Canada

Robert H. Brandenberger
Department of Physics, McGill University, Montreal, Canada

Radin Dardashti
Interdisciplinary Centre for Science and Technology Studies, University of Wuppertal, Wuppertal, Germany

Richard Dawid
Department of Philosophy, Stockholm University, Sweden

Sebastian De Haro
Trinity College, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, UK

Fay Dowker
Department of Physics, Imperial College London, London, UK

Henrique Gomes
Department of History and Philosophy of Science, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, UK; Perimeter Institute for Theoretical Physics, Waterloo, Canada

Sean Gryb
Faculty of Philosophy, University of Groningen, Groningen, Netherlands

Daniel Harlow
Department of Physics, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, USA
List of Contributors

Nick Huggett
Department of Philosophy, University of Illinois at Chicago, Chicago, Illinois, USA

Keizo Matsubara
Department of Philosophy, Uppsala University, Uppsala, Sweden

Daniele Oriti
Arnold Sommerfeld Center for Theoretical Physics and Munich Center for Mathematical Philosophy, Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich, Munich, Germany

Carlo Rovelli
Centre de Physique Théorique de Luminy, Marseille, France

Ko Sanders
School of Mathematical Sciences and Centre for Astrophysics and Relativity, Dublin City University, Dublin, Ireland

Lee Smolin
Perimeter Institute for Theoretical Physics, Waterloo, Canada

Karim Thébault
Department of Philosophy, University of Bristol, Bristol, UK

Tiziana Vistarini
Department of Philosophy, Communication and Performing Arts, Roma Tre University, Rome, Italy

David Wallace
Department of History and Philosophy of Science and Department of Philosophy, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, USA

Christian Wüthrich
Department of Philosophy, University of Geneva, Geneva, Switzerland