

The Foundation of Norms in Islamic Jurisprudence and Theology

In this book, Omar Farahat presents a new way of understanding the work of classical Islamic theologians and legal theorists who maintained that divine revelation is necessary for the knowledge of the norms and values of human actions. Through a reconstruction of classical Ash‘arī-Mu‘tazilī debates on the nature and implications of divine speech, Farahat argues that, rather than being a purely traditionalist position, the Ash‘arī attachment to revelation was a rational philosophical commitment emerging from debates in epistemology and theology. He further argues that the particularity of this model makes its distinctive features helpful for contemporary scholars who defend a form of divine command theory. Farahat’s volume thus constitutes a new reading of the issue of reason and revelation in Islam and breaks new ground in Islamic theology, law, and ethics.

Omar Farahat is Assistant Professor of Law at McGill University in Montreal.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47676-8 — The Foundation of Norms in Islamic Jurisprudence and Theology
Omar Farahat
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

The Foundation of Norms in Islamic Jurisprudence and Theology

OMAR FARAHAT
McGill University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47676-8 — The Foundation of Norms in Islamic Jurisprudence and Theology
Omar Farahat
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108476768

DOI: 10.1017/9781108614252

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Farahat, Omar, 1982-, author.

TITLE: The foundation of norms in Islamic jurisprudence and theology / Omar Farahat, McGill University, Montreal.

DESCRIPTION: New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018034498 | ISBN 9781108476768 (hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9781108701471 (pbk. : alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Islamic law. | Islam—Theology. | Islam—Doctrines. | Social norms.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KBP144 .F3653 2018 | DDC 297.2/114-dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018034498>

ISBN 978-1-108-47676-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47676-8 — The Foundation of Norms in Islamic Jurisprudence and Theology
Omar Farahat
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To my parents
Hala El-Beyaly and Nour Farahat

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47676-8 — The Foundation of Norms in Islamic Jurisprudence and Theology
Omar Farahat
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page ix</i>
Introduction: Classical Islamic Thought and the Promise of Post-Secularism	I
I.1 Divine Revelation in Legal and Moral Thought	6
I.2 Appropriating Classical Islamic Thought	11
I.3 Scope of Study and Chapter Outline	21
PART I EPISTEMOLOGICAL AND METAPHYSICAL FOUNDATIONS	
1 What Do We Know without Revelation? The Epistemology of Divine Speech	27
1.1 The Mu‘tazilī Model: Knowledge as the Outcome of a Universal Causal Process	34
1.2 The Ash‘arī Response: Knowledge as Contingent Acquisition of Factual Truth	47
1.3 Epistemological Skepticism and the Broader Case for Divine Command Theory	58
1.4 Conclusion	64
2 God in Relation to Us: The Metaphysics of Divine Speech	66
2.1 The Basic Divide between Necessary and Accidental Existence	72
2.2 The Mu‘tazilī Model: God as Similar but Superior	79
2.3 The Ash‘arī Model: God as Utterly Distinct from Created Beings	87
2.4 Conclusion	93

3	The Nature of Divine Speech in Classical Theology	96
3.1	The Natural Law Model: Divine Speech as Action	99
3.2	The Divine-Command Model: Speech as an Eternal Attribute	107
3.3	The Function of Revelation in the Process of Norm-Construction	116
3.4	Conclusion	125
PART II THE CONSTRUCTION OF NORMS IN ISLAMIC JURISPRUDENCE		
4	The Nature of Divine Commands in Classical Legal Theory	131
4.1	Are Divine Command Theories Inherently Contrary to Moral Autonomy?	136
4.2	Divine Commands as Humanlike Expressions of Will	142
4.3	The Ash‘arī Conception of Commands as Divine Attributes	151
4.4	Conclusion	160
5	Divine Commands in the Imperative Mood	164
5.1	Collective Deliberation: Community as the Site of Production of Norms	168
5.2	Faithfulness to Revelation: The Argument for Suspension of Judgment	177
5.3	Normativity as the Jurists’ Domain: Arguments for the Presumption of Obligation	187
5.4	Conclusion	195
6	The Persistence of Natural Law in Islamic Jurisprudence	198
6.1	Al-Bāqillānī: Inner Morality and the Limits of the Divine Command Model	203
6.2	Al-Jaṣṣāṣ: Defending Natural Law in Revelation-Based Jurisprudence	208
6.3	Al-Sam‘ānī: Inner Morality in Mainstream Jurisprudence	215
6.4	Conclusion	221
	Conclusion	223
	<i>Bibliography</i>	228
	<i>Index</i>	238

Acknowledgments

This book started as a doctoral dissertation at Columbia University, and evolved to take its current shape during the year that followed, most of which I spent as a Research Fellow at Yale Law School. Throughout the process, I was very fortunate to receive the generous support of many mentors, colleagues, and friends, without whom this project could not have been completed. I owe much of what I know about the production of sincere and responsible scholarship to Professor Wael Hallaq's incredibly supportive and yet uncompromising mentorship. His advice and example have shaped not only this book, but everything I will write for the rest of my career. From my first days as a doctoral student at Columbia's MESAAS department, I was fortunate to receive the kind support of Professor Sudipta Kaviraj. I am grateful to Professor Kaviraj for the many hours he spent reading and commenting upon my work. Professor Brinkley Messick's insightful comments and advice have pushed me to think and write with more clarity and to reflect upon questions and concepts related to my work that I would not have otherwise considered. Professor Souleymane Bachir Diagne's teaching, writings, and guidance triggered my interest in the philosophical study of classical Islamic disciplines at an early stage of my graduate studies, and I thank him for his continued support. Professor Kevin Reinhart's very detailed and penetrating comments and criticisms had a profound impact on this work.

My path toward completing this study and the shaping of my areas of interest were defined by my encounters with many exceptional scholars. I especially wish to acknowledge Professor Marion Katz, to whom I owe my passion for Islamic legal theories. Khaled Fahmy has always been, and continues to be, ready and willing to offer his insights on all academic and

professional issues that I wished to discuss, and I thank him profusely for that. My exchanges with John Hare of Yale Divinity School were important to my reflections on divine command and natural law theories, and his comparative work informed some of this book's ideas.

My colleagues at MESAAS were an important part of my intellectual growth. I especially wish to thank Nasser Abourahme, Wendell Marsh, Veli Yashin, and Yitzhak Lewis for their excellent comments on my work and for the many stimulating discussions. Andrew Ollett's expertise in Indian philosophy and our comparative conversations have been particularly enlightening. The journey that led to the completion of this book was made possible thanks to the companionship of many exceptionally kind and brilliant individuals. Dominic Longo has been a spectacular friend from the first moments I decided to embark upon this journey. I also wish to thank Sarah El-Kazaz, Ossama Soliman, Omar Cheta, Ahmed Ragab, Sonia Farid, Ibrahim El Houdaiby, Raissa von Doetinchem, and Aina Begim for being wonderful friends and colleagues over the years.

I completed a significant portion of this project as a Mellon Graduate Fellow at the Interdisciplinary Center for Innovative Theory and Empirics (INCITE) at Columbia University. I thank the Center's director, Bill McAllister, for his support and dedication to the Fellows' success. Professor McAllister's detailed comments and genuine interest in every Fellow's progress have greatly contributed to the completion of this project. I thank all the Graduate Fellows for being excellent colleagues and for helping me improve my writing.

The year I spent as a Research Fellow at Yale Law School's Abdallah Kamel Center was critical to the completion of this project in its current form. I wish to thank the Center's directors, Owen Fiss and Anthony Kronman, for their generosity and their genuine care for the Fellows' intellectual growth. I also wish to thank Hedayat Heykal and Waleed Ziad for being excellent colleagues and for their comments on a paper that was partially based on Chapter 4 of this book. I am also very grateful to Frank Griffel for the many enlightening discussions we have had, and for graciously allowing me to attend his enriching seminar on Islamic ethics.

My deepest gratitude goes to my parents, Hala El-Beyaly and Nour Farahat, and my brother Aly Farahat, for their continued support of all my endeavors. And finally, to my wife Dilbar Muradova, who often prioritized my academic achievement at the expense of her own sanity and well-being: I cannot achieve anything without you, and I will remain forever grateful.