

## Divine Action and the Human Mind

Is the human mind uniquely nonphysical or even spiritual, such that God can act within human consciousness in a noninterventionist manner? As scholars in science and religion have spent decades attempting to identify a “causal joint” between God and the natural world, human consciousness has been often privileged as just such a locus of divine–human interaction. However, this intuitively dualistic move is both out of step with contemporary science and theologically insufficient. By discarding the God–nature model implied by contemporary noninterventionist divine action theories, one is freed up to explore theological and metaphysical alternatives for understanding divine action in the mind. Sarah Lane Ritchie suggests that a theologically robust theistic naturalism offers a more compelling vision of divine action in the mind. By affirming that to be fully natural is to be involved with God’s active presence, one may affirm divine action not only in the human mind, but throughout the natural world.

SARAH LANE RITCHIE is Lecturer in Theology and Science at the University of Edinburgh.

## CURRENT ISSUES IN THEOLOGY

**General Editor**

Iain Torrance  
*Pro-Chancellor of the University of Aberdeen*

**Editorial Advisory Board**

David Ford *University of Cambridge*  
 Bryan Spinks *Yale University*  
 Kathryn Tanner *Yale Divinity School*

There is a need among upper-undergraduate and graduate students of theology, as well as among Christian teachers and church professionals, for a series of short, focussed studies of particular key topics in theology written by prominent theologians. *Current Issues in Theology* meets this need.

The books in the series are designed to provide a “state-of-the-art” statement on the topic in question, engaging with contemporary thinking as well as providing original insights. The aim is to publish books which stand between the static monograph genre and the more immediate statement of a journal article, by authors who are questioning existing paradigms or rethinking perspectives.

Other titles in the series:

*Holy Scripture* John Webster  
*The Just War Revisited* Oliver O’Donovan  
*Bodies and Souls, or Spirited Bodies?* Nancey Murphy  
*Christ and Horrors* Marilyn McCord Adams  
*Divinity and Humanity* Oliver D. Crisp  
*The Eucharist and Ecumenism* George Hunsinger  
*Christ the Key* Kathryn Tanner  
*Theology without Metaphysics* Kevin W. Hector  
*Reconsidering John Calvin* Randall C. Zachman  
*God’s Presence* Frances Youngman  
*An Incarnational Model of the Eucharist* James M. Arcadi  
*The Providence of God* David Fergusson  
*Reading the Bible Theologically* Darren Sarisky

SARAH LANE RITCHIE  
*University of Edinburgh*

# Divine Action and the Human Mind



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-47651-5 — Divine Action and the Human Mind  
Sarah Ritchie  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India  
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.  
It furthers the University’s mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108476515](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108476515)  
DOI: 10.1017/9781108568609  
© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

NAMES: Ritchie, Sarah Lane, 1985– author.  
TITLE: Divine action and the human mind / Sarah Lane Ritchie, University of Edinburgh.  
OTHER TITLES: With God in mind  
DESCRIPTION: 1 [edition]. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Series: Current issues  
in theology | Originally presented as author’s thesis (PhD)–University of Edinburgh, 2017 entitled:  
With God in mind: divine action and the naturalisation of consciousness. | Includes bibliographical  
references and index.  
IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019006046 | ISBN 9781108476515 (hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9781108700955  
(pbk. : alk. paper)  
SUBJECTS: LCSH: Providence and government of God–Christianity. | Philosophy of mind. |  
Religion and science. | Theism. | Naturalism.  
CLASSIFICATION: LCC BT135 .R57 2019 | DDC 233/.5–dc23  
LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2019006046>

ISBN 978-1-108-47651-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy  
of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication  
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-47651-5 — Divine Action and the Human Mind

Sarah Ritchie

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

---

To my Dad, who gave me wings and has  
made it all possible.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-47651-5 — Divine Action and the Human Mind

Sarah Ritchie

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

---

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page x</i>
PART 1 DIVINE ACTION AND THE HARD PROBLEM OF CONSCIOUSNESS	
1	<b>A Cartography of Crisis</b> 3
	Introduction 3
	Divine Action and the “Standard” Causal Joint Model 6
	Mind, Brain, and Soul 14
	The Theological Turn and Theistic Naturalism 24
	Outline and Methodology 29
2	<b>Contemporary Divine Action Theories and the Causal Joint</b> 32
	Introduction 32
	Standard Approaches to Divine Action: Three Debates 35
	A Final Debate: The Problem of Suffering 59
	Quantum Special Divine Action: A Test Case 66
	Questioning the Binaries 77
3	<b>Divine Action and Mind: Philip Clayton’s Emergentist Thesis</b> 81
	Introduction 81
	Philip Clayton and Emergence Theory 84
	Emergence and Consciousness 97
	Emergent Mind and Divine Action 109
	Emergent Divine Action and Panentheism 118
	vii

CONTENTS

	Evaluating the Emergentist Divine Action Proposal	122
	Conclusion	131
4	<b>The Philosophy and Science of the Mind</b>	133
	Introduction	133
	The Hard Problem of Consciousness	134
	Deflationary Views on the Hard Problem of Consciousness	146
5	<b>Physicalist Approaches to Consciousness</b>	157
	Introduction	157
	Mind-Brain Identity Theory	160
	Functionalism	169
	Nonreductive Physicalism	175
	Conclusion	183
PART 2 THE THEOLOGICAL TURN: DIVINE ACTION IN THE NATURALISED MIND		187
6	<b>Naturalism(s) and the Theological Turn</b>	189
	Introduction	189
	Questioning the Binaries	191
	Naturalism(s)	201
	Nonphysicalist Naturalisms	216
	Conclusion	225
7	<b>Theistic Naturalism Part 1: Thomistic Divine Action</b>	227
	Introduction	227
	The Theological Turn and Theistic Naturalism	228
	Thomistic Divine Action	235
	Challenges to Thomistic Divine Action	246
	Participatory Ontology and Thomism as Theistic Naturalism	253



CONTENTS

<b>8</b>	<b>Theistic Naturalism Part 2: Panentheistic Naturalism</b>	261
	Introduction	261
	Divine Action in the Context of Theistic Naturalism	263
	Panentheism	267
	Panentheism, General Divine Action, and the Causal Joint	276
	Higher Laws, Time, and Fixed Instructions	282
	Discussion	287
	Conclusion	296
<b>9</b>	<b>Theistic Naturalism Part 3: A Pneumatological Assist</b>	298
	Introduction	298
	Pneumatology and James K. A. Smith’s “Enchanted Naturalism”	301
	Amos Yong and a Pneumatological Assist	316
	Pneumatological Divine Action and the Mind	325
	Discussion	332
	Conclusion	338
<b>10</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>	342
	<i>Bibliography</i>	351
	<i>Index</i>	370

## Acknowledgements

Though this book is the product of years of academic research, the subject matter is as personal to me as it could possibly be. As such, I owe a huge debt of gratitude to every friend, mentor, and loved one who has engaged with me as I've wrestled over the years with theological and metaphysical questions. What is contained in these pages is, sadly, far more dry and prosaic than the lively and integrated debates, late-night email conversations, and even intense experiences that have driven me in the directions pursued here. I am thus particularly grateful, in no particular order, to my dear friends Jacqueline Naperola Johnson (forever "my person"), Sarah Rugheimer (a true fellow quester), Antonia Thora (the queen of connection), and Cherith Prince (a truly lifelong friend).

I am absurdly fortunate to have had extraordinary teachers and mentors, including Leonard Bromund, who taught me to think and to write, and Ken Brewer, who has taught me more than I could express here, and without whom I never would have pursued the path I have (thanks for poaching me into theology from pre-med!). I am inexpressibly thankful for Iain Torrance, whose kindness and guidance have spanned continents, academic institutions, and stages of life and career. And finally, I owe so much to Mark Harris, without whom this project would never have been possible. Anything of value here is due to his overall brilliance, challenging critiques, and encouragement.

My academic community more widely is a rich and varied one, indeed. Chris Knight has been vital for the development of my theological thinking, and his friendship and encouragement are

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

invaluable to me. John Perry has shaped the way I approach the academic life, challenging me and giving me the sorts of opportunities that have been truly life altering; I am grateful for his friendship. New College, at the University of Edinburgh, has been more than an educational institution or place of employment: the community here has become an ever-evolving family. Thanks in particular to Paul Foster, Elizabeth Corsar, Anja Pogacnik, Susan Hardman Moore, Joanna Leidenhag, and Paul and Teresa McCaskill. Last, but certainly not least, I am grateful to David Fergusson, whose ongoing guidance, constructive criticism, and encouragement have shaped not only my recent academic work but much else besides. This project would have been far worse without his insight and wisdom at several key junctures.

More than anything, I am grateful for my husband Martin, who is, without a doubt, the best human being I have ever met. I am so thankful for that very first School of Divinity ceilidh, when I spotted that kilt-clad historian and trainee minister across the room. His kindness, love, patience, integrity, and good humour have kept me sane and allowed me to thrive.

This book is dedicated to my father, Charlie Lane, who has been both a father and a mother, as well as a kindred spirit, co-adventurer, and fellow dreamer.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-47651-5 — Divine Action and the Human Mind

Sarah Ritchie

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

---