

THE CAMBRIDGE HANDBOOK OF HEALTH RESEARCH REGULATION

The first ever interdisciplinary handbook in the field, this vital resource offers wide-ranging analysis of health research regulation. The chapters confront gaps between documented law and research in practice, and draw on legal, ethical and social theories about what counts as robust research regulation to make recommendations for future directions. The handbook provides an account and analysis of current regulatory tools – such as consent to participation in research and the anonymisation of data to protect participants' privacy – as well as commentary on the roles of the actors and stakeholders who are involved in human health research and its regulation. Drawing on a range of international examples of research using patient data, tissue and other human materials, the collective contribution of the volume is to explore current challenges in delivering good medical research for the public good and to provide insights on how to design better regulatory approaches. This title is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

GRAEME LAURIE is Professorial Fellow and Founding Director of the J. Kenyon Mason Institute, Edinburgh Law School, University of Edinburgh. He was the Principal Investigator on the Liminal Spaces Project (2014–2021).

EDWARD DOVE is Lecturer in Health Law and Regulation and a Deputy Director of the Mason Institute.

AGOMONI GANGULI-MITRA is Lecturer in Bioethics and Global Health Ethics at the Mason Institute.

CATRIONA MCMILLAN is a Senior Research Fellow in Medical Law and Ethics and a Deputy Director of the Mason Institute.

EMILY POSTAN is Senior Research and Teaching Fellow in Bioethics and a Deputy Director of the Mason Institute.

NAYHA SETHI is Chancellor's Fellow in Data Driven Innovation and a Deputy Director of the Mason Institute.

ANNIE SORBIE is Lecturer in Medical Law and Ethics and a Deputy Director of the Mason Institute.

The Cambridge Handbook of Health Research Regulation

Edited by

GRAEME LAURIE

University of Edinburgh

EDWARD DOVE

University of Edinburgh

AGOMONI GANGULI-MITRA

University of Edinburgh

CATRIONA MCMILLAN

University of Edinburgh

EMILY POSTAN

University of Edinburgh

NAYHA SETHI

University of Edinburgh

ANNIE SORBIE

University of Edinburgh



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-47597-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Health Research Regulation

Edited by Graeme Laurie , Edward Dove , Agomoni Ganguli-Mitra , Catriona McMillan , Emily Postan , Nayha Sethi , Annie Sorbie

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108475976

DOI: 10.1017/9781108620024

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781108620024 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given and any changes made are indicated. To view a copy of this license visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0>

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly. When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781108620024
First published 2021

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow, Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-47597-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-47597-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Health Research Regulation

Edited by Graeme Laurie , Edward Dove , Agomoni Ganguli-Mitra , Catriona McMillan , Emily Postan , Nayha Sethi ,
Annie Sorbie

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

For Sam

He left us too soon

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xix
Introduction	1
Graeme Laurie	
PART I CONCEPTS, TOOLS, PROCESSES	
SECTION IA CONCEPTS	
Introduction	13
Annie Sorbie	
1 Vulnerability	17
Wendy A. Rogers	
2 Autonomy: Relational Conceptions	27
Natalie Stoljar	
3 Proportionality in Health Research Regulation	37
Owen Schaefer	
4 Social Value	46
Johannes J. M. van Delden and Rieke van der Graaf	
5 Solidarity in Health Research Regulation	56
Katharina Kieslich and Barbara Prainsack	
6 The Public Interest	65
Annie Sorbie	
7 Privacy	73
David Townend	

8	Trustworthy Institutions in Global Health Research Collaborations Angeliki Kerasidou	81
9	Vulnerabilities and Power: The Political Side of Health Research Iain Brassington	90
	SECTION IB TOOLS, PROCESSES AND ACTORS	
	Introduction Edward Dove and Nayha Sethi	99
10	Consent Jane Kaye and Megan Prictor	103
11	Forms of Engagement Mhairi Aitken and Sarah Cunningham-Burley	112
12	Participatory Governance in Health Research: Patients and Publics as Stewards of Health Research Systems Kim H. Chuong and Kieran C. O'Doherty	121
13	Risk-Benefit Analysis Carl H. Coleman	130
14	The Regulatory Role of Patents in Innovative Health Research and Its Translation from the Laboratory to the Clinic Dianne Nicol and Jane Nielsen	139
15	Benefit Sharing: From Compensation to Collaboration Kadri Simm	148
16	Taking Failure Seriously: Health Research Regulation for Medical Devices, Technological Risk and Preventing Future Harm Mark L. Flear	158
17	Rules, Principles and the Added Value of Best Practice in Health Research Regulation Nayha Sethi	167
18	Research Ethics Review Edward Dove	177
19	Data Access Governance Mahsa Shabani, Adrian Thorogood and Madeleine Murtagh	187
20	Is the Red Queen Sitting on the Throne? Current Trends and Future Developments in Human Health Research Regulation Stuart G. Nicholls	197
21	Regulatory Authorities and Decision-Making in Health Research: The Institutional Dimension Aisling M. McMahon	205

Contents

ix

22	The Once and Future Role of Policy Advice for Health Regulation by Experts and Advisory Committees Eric M. Meslin	215
PART II REIMAGINING HEALTH RESEARCH REGULATION		
SECTION IIA PRIVATE AND PUBLIC DIMENSIONS OF HEALTH RESEARCH REGULATION		
	Introduction Graeme Laurie	227
23	Changing Identities in Disclosure of Research Findings Emily Postan	229
24	Health Research and Privacy through the Lens of Public Interest: A Monocle for the Myopic? Mark Taylor and Tess Whitton	239
25	Mobilising Public Expertise in Health Research Regulation Michael M. Burgess	248
26	Towards Adaptive Governance in Big Data Health Research: Implementing Regulatory Principles Effy Vayena and Alessandro Blasimme	257
27	Regulating Automated Healthcare and Research Technologies: First Do No Harm (to the Commons) Roger Brownsword	266
SECTION IIB WIDENING THE LENS		
	Introduction Agomoni Ganguli-Mitra	275
28	When Learning Is Continuous: Bridging the Research–Therapy Divide in the Regulatory Governance of Artificial Intelligence as Medical Devices Calvin W. L. Ho	277
29	The Oversight of Clinical Innovation in a Medical Marketplace Wendy Lipworth, Miriam Wiersma, Narcyz Ghinea, Tereza Hendl, Ian Kerridge, Tamra Lysaght, Megan Munsie, Chris Rudge, Cameron Stewart and Catherine Waldby	287
30	The Challenge of ‘Evidence’: Research and Regulation of Traditional and Non-Conventional Medicines Nayeli Urquiza Haas and Emilie Cloatre	296
31	Experiences of Ethics, Governance and Scientific Practice in Neuroscience Research Martyn Pickersgill	306

32	Humanitarian Research: Ethical Considerations in Conducting Research during Global Health Emergencies Agomoni Ganguli-Mitra and Matthew Hunt	315
33	A Governance Framework for Advanced Therapies in Argentina: Regenerative Medicine, Advanced Therapies, Foresight, Regulation and Governance Fabiana Arzuaga	324
	SECTION IIC TOWARDS RESPONSIVE REGULATION	
	Introduction Catriona McMillan	333
34	Human Gene Editing: Traversing Normative Systems Rosario Isasi	335
35	Towards a Global Germline Ethics? Human Heritable Genetic Modification and the Future of Health Research Regulation Sarah Chan	344
36	Cells, Animals and Human Subjects: Regulating Interspecies Biomedical Research Amy Hinterberger and Sara Bea	356
37	When Is Human? Rethinking the Fourteen-Day Rule Catriona McMillan	365
38	A Perfect Storm: Non-evidence-Based Medicine in the Fertility Clinic Emily Jackson	373
39	Medical Devices Regulation: New Concepts and Perspectives Needed Shawn H. E. Harmon	382
	Afterword: What Could a Learning Health Research Regulation System Look Like? Graeme Laurie	391
	<i>Index</i>	401

Figures

- 22.1 Colbert presenting the Royal Academy to King Louis XIV at Versailles in 1667 – Henri Testelin. Reprinted with permission from the Réunion des Musées Nationaux Grand Palais.

page 219

Tables

3.1	Matrix of regulations' potential effects on research	<i>page</i> 38
28.1	FDA classification of medical devices by risks	280
28.2	Comparing pharmaceutical trial phases and medical device trial stages	280
28.3	Risk characterisation framework for software as a medical device	283

Contributors

Mhairi Aitken is Senior Research Associate, Newcastle University Business School, Newcastle University, United Kingdom.

Fabiana Arzuaga is Chair of the Interministerial Commission in Advanced Therapies, Ministry of Science, Technology and Innovation, Argentina.

Sara Bea is a Research Associate, Department of Global Health & Social Medicine School of Global Affairs, Faculty of Social Science & Public Policy, King's College London, United Kingdom.

Alessandro Blasimme is Reader in the Department of Health Sciences and Technology, Health Ethics & Policy Lab, Swiss Federal Institute of Technology – ETH Zurich, Switzerland.

Iain Brassington is Senior Lecturer, CSEP/ Law, University of Manchester, United Kingdom.

Roger Brownsword is Professor of Law, King's College London and at Bournemouth University, United Kingdom.

Michael M. Burgess is Chair in Biomedical Ethics at W. Maurice Young Centre for Applied Ethics, School of Population and Public Health. Associate Provost, Strategy, Okanagan campus. University of British Columbia, Canada.

Sarah Chan is Reader in Bioethics, Centre for Biomedicine, Self and Society, Usher Institute, University of Edinburgh, Scotland.

Kim H. Chuong is Research Fellow, Department of Psychology, University of Guelph, Canada.

Emilie Cloatre is Professor of Law, Kent Law School, University of Kent, United Kingdom.

Carl H. Coleman is Professor of Law, Seton Hall University School of Law, United States.

Sarah Cunningham-Burley is Professor of Medical and Family Sociology, Centre for Biomedicine, Self and Society, Usher Institute, University of Edinburgh, Scotland.

Edward Dove is Lecturer in Health Law and Regulation, School of Law, University of Edinburgh, Scotland.

Mark L. Flear is Reader in Law, School of Law, Queen's University Belfast, United Kingdom.

Agomoni Ganguli-Mitra is Lecturer and Chancellor's Fellow in Bioethics and Global Health Ethics, University of Edinburgh, Scotland.

Narczyz Ghinea is Research Fellow, Sydney Health Ethics, School of Public Health, Faculty of Medicine and Health, University of Sydney, Australia.

Shawn H. E. Harmon is a Policy Analyst, Health Law Institute, Dalhousie University, Canada.

Tereza Hendl is Postdoctoral Researcher, Institute of Ethics, History and Theory of Medicine, Ludwig-Maximilians-University in Munich, Germany.

Amy Hinterberger is Associate Professor, Department of Global Health & Social Medicine, School of Global Affairs, Faculty of Social Science and Public Policy, King's College London, United Kingdom.

Calvin W. L. Ho is Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, The University of Hong Kong.

Matthew Hunt is Associate Professor, School of Physical and Occupational Therapy, McGill University, Canada.

Rosario Isasi is Research Associate Professor of Human Genetics at the Dr John T. Macdonald Foundation Department of Human Genetics at the University of Miami Miller School of Medicine, United States.

Emily Jackson is Professor of Law, Law Department, London School of Economics and Political Science, United Kingdom.

Jane Kaye is Professor and the Director of the Centre for Health, Law and Emerging Technologies Faculty of Law, University of Oxford, United Kingdom.

Angeliki Kerasidou is NDPH Senior Fellow, Reuben College Official Fellow, The Ethox Centre, Nuffield Department of Population Health, University of Oxford, United Kingdom.

Ian Kerridge is Professor of Bioethics and Medicine, Sydney Health Ethics, University of Sydney and BMT Physician and Staff Haematologist, Royal North Shore Hospital, Sydney. Director, Praxis Australia.

Katharina Kieslich is Post-doctoral Researcher in Comparative Public Policy, Department of Political Science, University of Vienna, Austria.

Graeme Laurie is Professorial Fellow, Edinburgh Law School, University of Edinburgh, Scotland.

Wendy Lipworth is Associate Professor, Sydney Health Ethics, Faculty of Medicine and Health, University of Sydney, Australia.

Tamra Lysaght is Assistant Professor, Centre for Biomedical Ethics, Yong Loo Lin School of Medicine, Singapore.

Aisling M. McMahon is Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Maynooth University, Ireland.

Catriona McMillan is Senior Research Fellow in Medical Law and Ethics, University of Edinburgh, Scotland.

Eric M. Meslin is President and CEO, Council of Canadian Academies.

Megan Munsie is Professor of Ethics, Education and Policy in Stem Cell Science, School of Biomedical Sciences, The University of Melbourne, Australia.

Madeleine Murtagh is Professor and Chair of Social Data Science, University of Glasgow, Scotland.

Stuart G. Nicholls is Senior Clinical Research Associate, Clinical Epidemiology Program, Ottawa Hospital Research Institute, Canada.

Dianne Nicol is Professor of Law, Director of the Centre for Law and Genetics, University of Tasmania, Australia.

Jane Nielsen is Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Tasmania, Australia.

Kieran C. O'Doherty is Professor, Department of Psychology, University of Guelph, Canada.

Martyn Pickersgill is Professor, Personal Chair in the Sociology of Science and Medicine, Centre for Biomedicine, Self and Society, Usher Institute, Edinburgh Medical School, The University of Edinburgh, Scotland.

Emily Postan is Senior Research and Teaching Fellow, School of Law, University of Edinburgh, Scotland.

Barbara Prainsack is Professor for Comparative Policy Analysis, Department of Political Science, University of Vienna, AT and Department of Global Health & Social Medicine, King's College London, UK.

Megan Prictor is Research Fellow, Melbourne Law School, The University of Melbourne, Australia.

Wendy Rogers is Professor of Clinical Ethics, Department of Philosophy and Department of Clinical Medicine, Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia.

Chris Rudge is Postdoctoral Research Fellow, Department of Anatomy and Neuroscience, University of Melbourne, Australia.

G. Owen Schaefer is Assistant Professor, Centre for Biomedical Ethics, Yong Loo Lin School of Medicine, National University of Singapore.

Nayha Sethi is Chancellor's Fellow in Data Driven Innovation, Centre for Biomedicine, Self and Society, Usher Institute, University of Edinburgh, Scotland.

Mahsa Shabani is Assistant Professor in Privacy Law, Metamedica, Faculty of Law and Criminology, Ghent University, Belgium.

Kadri Simm is Associate Professor of Practical Philosophy, Institute of Philosophy and Semiotics, University of Tartu, Estonia.

Annie Sorbie is Lecturer in Medical Law and Ethics, University of Edinburgh School of Law.

Cameron Stewart is Professor of Health Law and Ethics, Sydney Law School, University of Sydney, Australia.

Natalie Stoljar is Associate Professor, Department of Philosophy and Institute for Health & Social Policy, McGill University, Montreal, Canada.

Mark Taylor is Associate Professor in Health Law and Regulation, Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne, Australia.

Adrian Thorogood's primary affiliation is the Centre of Genomics and Policy, Department of Human Genetics, McGill University. His current position is Research and Development Specialist, Bioinformatics Core and ELIXIR-LU, Luxembourg Centre for Systems Biomedicine, University of Luxembourg.

David Townend is Professor of Health and Life Sciences Jurisprudence, Care and Public Health Research Institute (CAPHRI), Maastricht University, The Netherlands.

Nayeli Urquiza Haas is Research Associate for the Wellcome project 'Law, Knowledges and the Making of "Modern Healthcare"', University of Kent, United Kingdom.

Johannes (Hans) JM van Delden is full professor of medical ethics, University Medical Centre Utrecht, Julius Center for Health Sciences and Primary Care, Department of Medical Humanities, The Netherlands.

Rieke van der Graaf is Associate Professor Bioethics, University Medical Center Utrecht, Julius Center for Health Sciences and Primary Care, Department of Medical Humanities, The Netherlands.

Effy Vayena is Professor of Bioethics and Deputy Head of Institute of Translational Medicine, Department of Health Sciences and Technology, ETH Zurich, Switzerland.

Catherine Waldby is Director, Research School of Social Sciences The Australian National University, Canberra, Australia.

Tess Whitton is a PhD Candidate, HeLEX@Melbourne, Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne, Australia.

Miriam Wiersma is a PhD Candidate and Research Associate at Sydney Health Ethics, The University of Sydney, Australia.

Acknowledgements

This volume represents the culmination of many years of work on the Liminal Spaces project, funded by Wellcome under the official title of *Confronting the Liminal Spaces of Health Research Regulation* (Grant No. WT103360MA). A Senior Investigator Award in Humanities was granted in 2014 to the Principal Investigator, Graeme Laurie, to run a five-year project with the overarching objective to reimagine the human health regulation landscape, building on interdisciplinary perspectives from diverse disciplines such as law, bioethics, anthropology, and sociology. Every member of the editorial team was employed on the project or supported to complete their doctoral studies. Together, we are most grateful to Wellcome for the opportunity to work collaboratively and for the significant capacity building that the project has represented for researchers at various stages of their careers. Our thanks are also due to members of our Advisory Board who deftly steered us on our course – Jonathan Montgomery (Chair), Aidan Courtney, David Porteous, Mark Taylor, Joanna Wardlaw and Heather Widdows.

As to this volume itself, first and foremost, we want to express our gratitude to the contributors who gave of their expertise and time not just to produce their respective chapters but also to engage proactively with us and with each other in a symposium that we were able to host in Edinburgh in April 2019. This event allowed authors to present early versions of their chapters for feedback and discussion; we identified cross-cutting themes through our interactions and collectively co-crafted key messages about how we might reimagine human health research regulation. We are confident that these interactions have helped to make this volume far more than the sum of its parts.

As to the extensive background work that goes into the production of a volume of this kind, special mention must go to Catriona McMillan and Rebecca Richards who have expertly supported the editorial team and all of the authors throughout the writing and production process. Evidence of success in their roles is demonstrated by the fact that this volume was submitted one month ahead of schedule – not a common feat in academia!

Finally, we dedicate this volume to Samuel Taylor-Alexander who was the medical anthropologist on the Liminal Spaces team and held the post of Senior Research Fellow from 2015 to 2017. Sadly, Sam died shortly after taking up a subsequent post at Monash University, but his contributions on liminality and his astute and supportive academic insights were incredibly instrumental in shaping the Liminal Spaces project and all colleagues who have been involved with it. Academia is impoverished by his untimely passing.