

Oliver Wendell Holmes

Oliver Wendell Holmes was one of the most influential figures in American law. As a Supreme Court justice, he wrote foundational opinions about such important constitutional issues as freedom of speech and the limits of state regulatory power. As a scholar and Massachusetts High Court judge, he helped to reshape the common law for the modern industrial era. And yet, despite the many accounts of his career, Holmes himself remains an enigma. This book is the first to explore the nineteenth-century New England influences so crucial to the formation of his character. Inspired by Ralph Waldo Emerson's Transcendentalism, Holmes belonged to a group of men who formulated a philosophy known as American pragmatism that stood as an alternative to English empiricism and German rationalism.

This innovative study places Holmes within the Transcendentalist, pragmatist tradition and thereby unlocks his unique identity and contribution to American law. Wells's nuanced analysis will appeal to legal scholars, historians, philosophers, and general readers alike.

Catharine Pierce Wells is a professor of law at Boston College Law School. Wells has published more than thirty articles, with a focus in the fields of tort law and American jurisprudence.

Cambridge Historical Studies in American Law and Society

Recognizing legal history's growing importance and influence, the goal of this series is to chart legal history's continuing development by publishing innovative scholarship across the discipline's broadening range of perspectives and subjects. It encourages empirically creative works that take legal history into unexplored subject areas, or that fundamentally revise our thinking about familiar topics; it also encourages methodologically innovative works that bring new disciplinary perspectives and techniques to the historical analysis of legal subjects.

Series Editor

Christopher Tomlins, *University of California, Berkeley*

Previously Published in the Series

- William Kuby, *Conjugal Misconduct: Defying Marriage Law in the Twentieth-Century United States*
- Justin Desautels-Stein, *The Jurisprudence of Style: A Structuralist History of American Pragmatism and Liberal Legal Thought*
- Angela Fernandez, *Pierson v. Post, the Hunt for the Fox: Law and Professionalization in American Legal Culture*
- Rebecca E. Zietlow, *The Forgotten Emancipator: James Mitchell Ashley and the Ideological Origins of Reconstruction*
- Robert Daniel Rubin, *Judicial Review and American Conservatism: Christianity, Public Education, and the Federal Courts in the Reagan Era*
- Matthew Crow, *Thomas Jefferson, Legal History, and the Art of Recollection*
- Oren Bracha, *Owning Ideas: The Intellectual Origins of American Intellectual Property, 1790–1909*
- Anne Twitty, *Before Dred Scott: Slavery and Legal Culture in the American Confluence, 1787–1857*
- Leia Castañeda Anastacio, *The Foundations of the Modern Philippine State: Imperial Rule and the American Constitutional Tradition in the Philippine Islands, 1898–1935*
- Robert Deal, *The Law of the Whale Hunt: Dispute Resolution, Property Law, and American Whalers, 1780–1880*
- Sandra F. Vanburkleo, *Gender Remade: Citizenship, Suffrage, and Public Power in the New Northwest, 1879–1912*
- Reuel Schiller, *Forging Rivals: Race, Class, Law, and the Collapse of Postwar Liberalism*
- Ely Aaronson, *From Slave Abuse to Hate Crime: The Criminalization of Racial Violence in American History*
- Stuart Chinn, *Recalibrating Reform: The Limits of Political Change*

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47595-2 — Oliver Wendell Holmes
Catharine Pierce Wells
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

- Ajay K. Mehrotra, *Making the Modern American Fiscal State*
Yvonne Pitts, *Family, Law, and Inheritance in America: A Social and Legal History of Nineteenth-Century Kentucky*
David M. Rabban, *Law's History*
Kunal M. Parker, *Common Law, History, and Democracy in America, 1790–1900*
Steven Wilf, *Law's Imagined Republic*
James D. Schmidt, *Industrial Violence and the Legal Origins of Child Labor*
Rebecca M. McLennan, *The Crisis of Imprisonment: Protest, Politics, and the Making of the American Penal State, 1776–1941*
Tony A. Freyer, *Antitrust and Global Capitalism, 1930–2004*
Davison Douglas, *Jim Crow Moves North*
Andrew Wender Cohen, *The Racketeer's Progress*
Michael Willrich, *City of Courts, Socializing Justice in Progressive Era Chicago*
Barbara Young Welke, *Recasting American Liberty: Gender, Law and the Railroad Revolution, 1865–1920*
Michael Vorenberg, *Final Freedom: The Civil War, the Abolition of Slavery, and the Thirteenth Amendment*
Robert J. Steinfeld, *Coercion, Contract, and Free Labor in Nineteenth Century America*
David M. Rabban, *Free Speech in Its Forgotten Years*
Jenny Wahl, *The Bondsman's Burden: An Economic Analysis of the Common Law of Southern Slavery*
Michael Grossberg, *A Judgment for Solomon: The d'Hauteville Case and Legal Experience in the Antebellum South*

Oliver Wendell Holmes

A Willing Servant to an Unknown God

CATHARINE PIERCE WELLS

Boston College



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-47595-2 — Oliver Wendell Holmes
 Catharine Pierce Wells
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108475952

DOI: 10.1017/9781108686839

© Catharine Pierce Wells 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Wells, Catharine Pierce, author.

TITLE: Oliver Wendell Holmes : a willing servant to an unknown God / Catharine Pierce Wells, Boston College, Massachusetts.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Series: Cambridge Historical Studies in American Law and Society | Includes index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019027922 (print) | LCCN 2019027923 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108475952 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108686839 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Holmes, Oliver Wendell, Jr., 1841-1935 – Philosophy. | Pragmatism.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KF8745.H6 W45 2020 (print) | LCC KF8745.H6 (ebook) | DDC 347.73/2634 [B] – dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019027922>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019027923>

ISBN 978-1-108-47595-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47595-2 — Oliver Wendell Holmes
Catharine Pierce Wells
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Ruth Anna Putnam
Teacher and Friend

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i> x
Introduction	i
PART I THE SOLDIER'S FAITH	
Prologue: Memorial Day, 1884	11
1 Our Comfortable Routine	16
2 War Is Horrible and Dull	32
3 The Great Chorus of Life and Joy Begins Again	63
4 For the Puritan Still Lives in New England, Thank God!	83
PART II THE JOURNEY TO THE POLE	
Brown University Commencement, 1897	105
5 A Black and Frozen Night	108
6 The Loneliness of Original Work	138
7 The Master of Himself	162
Epilogue: The Consummation	205
<i>Index</i>	209

Acknowledgments

Many people have helped in the preparation of this book, and I am grateful to them all. Special thanks are due to people who read and commented on earlier drafts. So, thank you to Jim Repetti, Frank Garcia, Thomas Healy, Stephanie Wildman, and Michael Tobriner. Three readers were patient enough to read many iterations, and I owe them a deep debt of gratitude: Leslie Espinoza Garvey, Carole O'Blenes, and Marion Fremont-Smith. My current research assistant, Phillip Popkin, has played a vital role in cite checking and assembling the manuscript. Finally, I am especially grateful to Dean Vincent Rougeau and Boston College Law School for giving me release time to work on the project.

Parts of Chapters 2 and 3 were previously published in the *Journal of Supreme Court History*. These parts are included here with its permission.

The pictures that appear between Part 1 and Part 2 are courtesy of the Massachusetts Historical Society and are reproduced with their permission.