

Index

- accountability. *See* executives, responsibility to the legislature; political responsibility
- Act of Settlement (1701), 49–50
- Adams, John, 35, 89
- After Virtue* (MacIntyre), 1
- Albert, Prince, 167
- The American Commonwealth* (Bryce), 195
- American Revolution, 73, 109
- appointment of ministers, 122, 126
- appointment of the chief executive, 183–185
- Burke and, 78, 80
- Constant and, 122, 125, 127
- de Staël and, 97, 102
- and Grand Elector, 90
- Greg and, 187
- Jeffrey and, 109–110
- legislature's approval of monarch's appointments, 68–69
- Louis XVI and, 88
- Mill and, 182–185, 188–189
- ministers appointed by the legislature (not the monarch) in practice, 181, 183–185, 187
- Montesquieu and, 68–69
- Mounier and, 91
- Necker and, 94–95
- and parliamentary republicanism, 97, 125, 194
- Sieyès and, 90
- Arendt, Hannah, 204–205
- aristocracy
- appointment of peers in France, 130, 133–134
- Burke and, 71
- Constant and, 121, 125–127, 133
- de Lolme and, 41–42
- de Staël and, 92
- and Edinburgh Whigs, 111–112
- and the English monarchy, 41–42
- and the French Revolution, 118
- Jeffrey and, 108
- Mill and, 190
- Montesquieu and, 18–20, 34–35
- natural aristocracy vs. hereditary aristocracy in France, 92
- Necker and, 97
- and patronage, 71
- representation of, 85, 111–112, 121. *See also* Chamber of Peers; House of Lords
- Austria-Hungary, 4–5
- Bagehot, Walter, 4, 10–11, 105, 164–165, 175–181
- account of English parliamentarism, 175–181
- career, 175
- criticisms of American constitutional model, 177–181
- and culture of political deliberation, 177, 179–181
- The English Constitution*, 175
- and harmony between legislature and executive, 177–178
- and liberty, 176–177, 181
- and ministers' lack of accountability, 176, 181
- and monarch as barrier to usurpation by faction or ambitious individual, 168
- and patronage, 104, 190–192
- and political parties, 174
- and selection of executives, 180, 187
- and supremacy of the House of Commons, 167, 175
- Victoria and, 166
- Vile and, 175
- Baranger, Denis, 38
- Barante, Prosper de, 99
- Barrot, Odillon, 134, 156
- Belgium, 4–5, 135
- Bentham, Jeremy, 109
- Blackstone, William, 32, 35, 54
- Bolingbroke, Lord, 36–39, 48, 57–58, 67
- Bourbon Restoration (1814–1830), 116–117, 136, 138–139
- Bourke, Richard, 26, 31–32
- Britain
- Act of Settlement (1701), 49–50

Britain (cont.)

- Civil List, 35, 62, 72–74
- civil service, 189, 196
- de Lolme's historical account, 41–42
- democracy and plebiscitary executive, 195–197
- electoral system, 49, 101–102, 112–114, 165–166, 181, 185–186, 195–196
- English Civil War, 24, 32
- Great Reform Act (1832), 114, 165–166, 190–191
- Norman Conquest, 41–42
- power struggles in the 17th century, 20–21
- and proposals for American colonial assemblies, 35–36
- public's engagement with political affairs, 29–30, 40–47, 72–74, 179–180
- Revolution of 1688, 20–21, 49–50, 60, 63–65, 78, 156, 168–169
- suffrage in, 6–7, 28–29, 173, 185–186
- See also* English constitution; House of Commons; House of Lords; monarch, British; parliamentary government (Britain); *specific monarchs and prime ministers*
- Brougham, Henry, 4, 84, 105, 112–113, 172
- Bryce, James, 4, 17, 194–195
- budgets. *See* revenue, control over
- Burdett, Francis, 109
- Burgh, James, 25–26, 46
- Burke, Edmund, 3–4, 9–11, 59–82
 - and active constitutional monarch, 65–66, 123–124
 - and checks and balances, 8–9, 60–61, 64–65, 68–69
 - and the Civil List, 72–74
 - and control over revenue, 62–64
 - and corruption, 65, 72–73
 - criticisms of French Constitution of 1791 and the National Assembly, 60–61, 75–82
 - and Crown's veto power, 64
 - de Lolme and, 65–66
 - de Staël and, 102–103, 105
 - and Doctrinaires, 136
 - and East India Reform Bill, 70–71
 - and the French Revolution, 60–61, 75–79
 - and George III, 66–67, 69, 77–78, 98, 134
 - and harmony between legislature and executive, 54
 - and House of Commons as representative body, 62
 - and House of Commons' right to veto ministers selected by the monarch, 62–63
 - and instability of the 1760s, 66–67, 69
 - and legislative deliberation, 61, 63–64

- and ministers in the legislature, 8–9, 64–65, 69
- and ministers' responsibility to the legislature, 38, 62–63, 88, 127
- Montesquieu and, 18, 68–69
- Necker and, 105
- North and, 73–74
- and patronage, 64–65, 68–75, 102
- political career, 4, 66–67
- and political parties, 61, 71–72, 74–75, 142
- and popular elections, 63
- and power of the House of Commons, 23, 60, 62–64
- Reflections on the Revolution in France*, 75–79
- and role of the public, 72–74
- Schmitt and, 59–60
- theory of parliamentary politics, 59–68
- Thoughts on the Cause of the Present Discontents*, 38, 60–62, 67, 69–70, 88
- and veto power of the monarch, 63–64
- Walpole and, 71–72
- Bute, Earl of, 67
- cabinet instability, 4
 - in Britain, 66–67, 69, 191
 - and dissolution of the legislature, 134
 - in France, 117, 134, 140–141, 149–150
 - and patronage, 12, 52–53, 55–56, 69, 140–141, 160, 191–192
 - and political parties, 12–13
 - and public opinion, 104
- Caesarism, 14, 176–177, 194–195, 199, 202–203
- Cato's Letters* (Gordon and Trenchard), 44–45, 123–124
- censorship, 138–139, 176
 - parallels with patronage as means of limiting dissent, 140
- Chamber of Deputies, 121
 - Charles X and, 143
 - Constant's career in, 117, 138
 - Constant's proposals for prohibiting functionaries from serving in, 141, 158–159
 - and control over revenue, 156
 - and corruption and patronage, 139–141, 156–157
 - Tocqueville's career in, 145, 154–155
 - Tocqueville's proposals for prohibiting functionaries from serving in, 158–159
- Chamber of Peers, 121, 127, 133
- Chambord, Comte de, 163
- Charles I, 20
- Charles II, 20
- Charles X, 127–128, 143
- Charter of 1814 (France), 116
- Chateaubriand, François-René de, 84, 134

- checks and balances
 in American constitutional model, 146–147, 182–183
 Bolingbroke and, 36–39
 Burke and, 8–9, 60–61, 64–65, 68–69
 Constant and, 116, 127–134
 and control over revenue, 8, 18, 31–34.
See also revenue, control over
 de Lolme and, 8–9, 42–44, 110
 de Staël and, 99, 103–104
 and dissolution of the legislature/dismissal of ministers. *See* dismissal of ministers; dissolution of the legislature
 and House of Commons, 8–9, 18–19, 25–26, 30–39, 47–58, 72–73, 107, 110–111, 167.
See also House of Commons
 and House of Lords, 8, 18, 167
 impeachment power, 18, 31, 36–37
 and independent source of revenue for the monarch (Civil List), 35
 and ministers in the legislature, 8–9, 19, 47–58, 132, 148–149. *See also* executives in the legislature
 monarch as barrier to usurpation by faction or ambitious individual, 8–9, 13, 42–43, 111, 132–134, 167–169, 202
 Montesquieu and, 8, 18, 30–32, 34–35, 39, 68–69, 91, 128
 Mounier and, 90–91
 and National Assembly, 86–91
 Necker and, 95–96
 and patronage. *See* patronage
 and political parties, 61, 71–72
 popular support for the monarch, 35–36
 and proposals for neutral constitutional power, 124–125
 and risks of legislative usurpation/tyranny, 8–9, 19, 39, 42–43, 58, 85–86, 92, 111, 128–131, 133–134, 145–146, 151
 Russell and, 113–114
 Stewart and, 107, 110
 Tocqueville and, 146–149, 151
 and veto power of the monarch, 8, 32–34, 68–69, 86. *See also* veto power of the monarch
 Walpole and, 36–38
- chief executives
 governance by independent chief executives, 2, 126, 178, 182
 independent monarchs, 35–36, 39–40, 67–69, 91, 110
 selection by the legislature, 181, 183–185
 selection by the people, 180, 183–184
See also presidency, American; presidency, French; presidency, German; prime ministers
- Des circonstances actuelles qui peuvent terminer la Révolution* (de Staël), 98–99, 105
 Civil List, 35, 62, 72–74
 civil service
 in Britain, 189, 196
 bureaucracy and patronage in France, 139–141
 modernization in France, 158–159
 prohibition of government functionaries in the Chamber of Deputies, 141, 158–159
 Clark, J. C. D., 66
 Clermont-Tonnerre, Stanislas de, 85
 Cobbett, William, 109
 Condorcet, Marquis de, 89
 Congress, U.S.
 and checks and balances, 146–147
 executive's lack of entry into, 145
 Grey and, 174
 and legislative deliberation, 174, 178–179
 and stalemates between the executive and the legislature, 177–178, 183
 Tocqueville and, 145–146
 and tyranny of the majority, 146
Considerations on Representative Government (Mill), 164, 184–185, 189, 193
 Constant, Benjamin, 3–4, 9–11, 84, 89–90, 115–143
 and appointment of ministers, 122, 127, 130
 background, 118
 and cabinet instability, 140–141
 and checks and balances, 116, 128–134
 Constant and, 125
 contrast to Doctrinaires, 135–143
 and control over revenue, 127–128, 156
 and corruption, 117, 134
 criticisms of Constitutions of 1791 and 1795, 130–133
De la liberté des brochures, des pamphlets et des journaux, 131
De la possibilité d'une constitution républicaine dans un grand pays, 126–127
 de Lolme and, 129, 131
 de Staël and, 118
 death of, 143
 and debate over who may introduce legislation, 186–187
 and dilemmas of French parliamentarism, 133–143
 and dismissal of ministers, 13, 125–127, 130, 133–134
 and dissolution of the legislature, 13, 125–128, 130–131
 at Edinburgh University, 106
 and electoral systems, 119
 and freedom of the press, 138–139

- Constant, Benjamin (cont.)
 and the French Revolution, 118
 Guizot and, 137
 influence of, 133, 155–156
 and legislative deliberation, 116, 119–120, 133, 141
 and liberal opposition party, 141–142
 Mackintosh and, 106
 Mill and, 185–186
 and ministers in the legislature, 132–133
 and ministers' responsibility to the legislature, 39, 116, 120–124, 126
 Montesquieu and, 18, 124–128
 and neutral constitutional power, 11–13, 115–116, 122–126, 131, 133–135, 137–139, 182
 and parallels between censorship and patronage as means of limiting dissent, 140
 and patronage, 13, 104, 115–116, 139–143, 160, 192
 political career, 4, 116–117, 138
 and political parties, 13, 162
Principes de politique applicables à tous les gouvernements représentatifs, 125
 promotion of constitutional monarchy, 120–128, 132–135
 promotion of parliamentarism, 9, 116, 118–120, 125–126, 132–133
 promotion of republicanism, 118, 124–127, 132
 proposed French constitution of 1815, 116, 125–126
 and public opinion, 126–128, 134
Réflexions sur les constitutions, la distribution des pouvoirs, et les garanties, dans une monarchie constitutionnelle, 125
 and social equality, 118
 and suffrage, 117, 129, 185–186
 Tocqueville and, 162–163
 and veto power of the executive, 126, 127
 and Victorian parliamentarism, 165, 167–168
 Weber and, 115
- Constitution of 1791 (France), 60, 76–82
 Burke and, 60–61, 75–82
 collapse of, 9, 81–82, 88, 95–96, 109, 130–131, 147
 Constant and, 130–133
 de Staël and, 98
 Duguit and, 100
 Jeffrey and, 109
 and Louix XVI's use of veto, 81–82, 88, 147
 Mounier and, 86, 88
 Necker and, 105
 provisions of, 76–80, 88, 130–131
 responses to collapse, 88–104
 Sieyès and, 86–88
- Constitution of 1795 (France), 89, 95–96, 98, 118, 130–133, 150
 Constitution of 1848 (France), 150–151, 184–185
 constitution of England. *See* English constitution
The Constitution of England (de Lolme), 40, 45
- Constitution, U.S.
 Bagehot's criticisms, 177–181
 Bryce's observations, 194–195
 and checks and balances, 146–147, 182–183
 contrast between parliamentarism and American constitutional model, 144–163, 172, 174, 177–181
 and failure to secure the supremacy of the legislature over the executive, 144, 172, 177–178, 182–183
 Grey and, 172
 Laboulaye's preference for American-style system, 151–152
 and legislative deliberation, 174, 178–179
 Mill's criticisms, 182–183
 Necker and, 96
 Tocqueville's analysis, 144–147, 151
 Victorian theorists' critiques, 165, 172, 177–183 *see also specific theorists*
See also Congress, U.S.; presidency, American
- constitutional monarchy, 1–3
 active monarchs, 11, 44, 65–66, 123–124, 135–137, 143, 148, 157–158, 185
 advantages over American political system, 172, 177–183. *See also* parliamentary government: contrast to American constitutional model
 advantages over republics, 131, 148, 151, 182
 and appointment or dismissal of ministers. *See* appointment of ministers; dismissal of ministers
 as barrier to demagoguery, 201–202
 as barrier to usurpation by faction or ambitious individual, 8–9, 13, 42–43, 111, 132–134, 167–169, 182, 202
 Bolingbroke and, 36–39
 Burke and, 60–68, 80
 Constant and, 11–13, 115–116, 120–128, 132–135, 138–139
 de Lolme and, 40–47
 de Staël and, 101–104
 dignity of hereditary monarch, 96–97, 100–101, 111–112
 and dilemmas of parliamentarism, 11–13, 133–143

- and dissolution of the legislature/dismissal of ministers. *See* dismissal of ministers; dissolution of the legislature
- and Doctrinaires, 135–143, 162
- and elections, 49, 101
- Gordon and Trenchard and, 44–45
- Guizot and, 137
- and harmony between legislature and executive, 51, 53–55, 65, 149–150
- independence of executive officials from the monarch, 122–124, 155
- and “inviolability” vs. “infallibility” of the monarch, 137, 139
- “the king reigns but does not govern,” 12, 115, 135, 155, 182
- Laboulaye and, 151–152
- and logic of parliamentary systems, 3, 8–9, 11, 13, 18–20, 64–65, 83, 111–112, 122–126, 133–134, 150–151
- Mill and, 12, 181–189
- Millar and, 111
- Montesquieu and, 54
- Necker and, 96–97, 100–101
- neutral monarchs, 11–12, 44–45, 122–127, 131, 133–135, 137–139, 143, 155, 166, 168, 181–182, 185, 202–203
- and patronage. *See* patronage
- Prévost-Paradol and, 194
- and public opinion. *See* public opinion
- Royer-Collard and, 136–137
- Stewart and, 110–111
- and subordination of the monarch to the legislature, 148, 151. *See also* House of Commons: supremacy of; legislative assemblies: supremacy of
- Thiers and, 155–157
- Tocqueville and, 12, 147–154, 158, 162–163
- and veto power of the monarch. *See* veto power of the monarch
- Weber and, 12, 201–203
- See also* checks and balances; monarch, British; monarch, French; parliamentary government; parliamentary government (Britain); parliamentary government (France)
- Conti, Gregory, 173
- Coppet Circle, 84, 91, 100, 104–105
 and Edinburgh Whigs, 105–106, 111–112
See also Constant, Benjamin; de Staël, Germaine; Necker, Jacques
- Corn Laws, 173
- corruption, 3–4, 12–13, 19–20, 50
- Bolingbroke and, 57–58
- Brougham and, 112–113
- Burke and, 64, 65, 68–75
 and Chamber of Deputies, 156–157
- Constant and, 117, 134
- de Staël and, 100–104
 and Edinburgh Whigs, 112–113
 and elections, 101–102, 112–114
- George III and, 67–68, 73
 and Great Reform Act of 1832, 114, 165–166
- Guizot and, 157–158, 162–163
- and House of Commons, 49–50, 52, 57–58, 64
 and July Monarchy, 116–117, 192–193
- Mill and, 189–190, 192–193
- Montesquieu and, 34, 52
 and National Assembly, 79–80, 99–100
- Necker and, 100–101
 and patronage, 49–50, 57–58, 68–75, 102–103, 139–140, 156–157, 191–193
 and political parties, 12–13, 61, 71, 102–103, 112–113
 and public opinion, 72–73
 and public spirit, 192–193
- Tocqueville and, 158–162
 and Victorian parliamentarism, 189–193
- Walpole and, 50, 57–58, 71–72, 134
See also checks and balances; patronage
- Cortes* (Spanish constitution of 1812), 16–17
- Craiuu, Aurelian, 104–105
- Croly, Herbert, 197
- Crown, the. *See* monarch, British
- de Hauranne, Duvergier, 4, 99, 134, 156–157
- De la liberté des brochures, des pamphlets et des journaux* (Constant), 131
- De la possibilité d'une constitution républicaine dans un grand pays* (Constant), 126–127
- de Lolme, Jean Louis, 11, 20, 31–32, 39–47
 and active constitutional monarch, 44, 65–66, 123–124
 and advantages of representative assemblies over popular assemblies, 46–47
- background, 40
- Burke and, 65–66
 and checks and balances, 8–9, 42–43, 110
- Constant and, 129, 131
The Constitution of England, 40, 45
- de Staël and, 105
 historical account of England, 41–42
 and House of Lords, 43–44
 and the legislature as a threat to liberty, 42–44, 129
 and liberty and the theory of constitutional monarchy, 40–47
 and the “magic of dignity,” 43–44, 96–97

- de Lolme, Jean Louis (cont.)
 and ministers in the legislature, 8–9, 48
 and monarch as barrier to usurpation by
 individual or faction, 42–43
 Montesquieu and, 45–46
 Necker and, 105
 and power of the House of Commons, 23,
 40–46
 Stewart and, 110
 and veto power of the monarch, 33
- de Mille, James, 172–173
- de Ruggiero, Guido, 14–15
- de Serre, Hercule, 136
- de Staël, Auguste, 112
- de Staël, Germaine, 3–4, 11, 84, 89–104
 Burke and, 102–103, 105
 and checks and balances, 99, 103–104
*Des circonstances actuelles qui peuvent terminer
 la Révolution*, 98–99, 105
 Constant and, 118, 126
 and corruption, 100–104
 Craiutu and, 104
 de Lolme and, 105
 Jeffrey and, 106
 and legislative deliberation, 98–99
 and ministers' responsibility to the legislature,
 39, 97
 Montesquieu and, 18, 104
 and patronage, 102–103
 Pitt and, 103–104
 and political parties, 102–104, 142
 promotion of parliamentarism, 9, 91–97,
 101–104
 promotion of parliamentary republicanism,
 92–93, 97–99
 and relation between parliament and public
 opinion, 84, 92–93, 97–98, 103–104, 128
 shift in views on republicanism, 101–102
- de Tracy, Destutt, 84
- Declaration of the Rights of Man and Citizen
 (1789), 76
- Defoe, Daniel, 25
- deliberation, 4, 28–29
 and American constitutional model, 174,
 178–179
 Bagehot and, 177, 181
 Burke and, 61, 76
 Constant and, 116, 119–120, 133, 141
 de Lolme and, 47
 de Staël and, 98–99
 and debate over electoral mandates, 26–27, 61
 deliberation without direct control by the
 electorate, 61, 63–64
 and diverse social and geographic makeup of
 elected assembly, 27–29
 and education of public opinion, 29–30,
 46–47, 179–180
 Ellys and, 26–27
 and French National Assembly, 76
 and the House of Commons in the 18th
 century, 23–30
 Jeffrey and, 108
 Manin and, 24
 Mill and, 188–189
 Milton and, 24
 and ministers in the legislature, 8–9, 48–58,
 94–95, 133, 169–170
 Necker and, 94–95
 Parker and, 24
 and parliamentary procedure, 27, 47, 120,
 173
 and parliamentary systems in France, 117, 177
 and patronage, 49–50, 56–57, 141, 159
 and representatives' loss of independence
 following rise of party machines, 196
 role of the press, 46–47, 120
 and sharing information, 26
 Sidney and, 24
 Spelman and, 29–30
 Tocqueville and, 159
 and value of multiple viewpoints, 26–29,
 173–174
 and Victorian parliamentarism, 172–174
 Weber and, 201
- democracy
 and American constitutional model, 144–147,
 194–195, 197
 Bryce and, 194–195
 Croly and, 197
 mass democracy and the rise of executive
 power, 17, 189, 194–203
 Mill and, 185–186, 188–189
 and parliamentarism, 5–7, 17, 199–206
 parliamentarism not equivalent to
 constitutional democracy, 5–7
 and political parties, 196
 Schumpeter and, 205–206
 and tyranny of the legislature, 151
 Weber and, 199–203
Democracy in America (Tocqueville), 144–147,
 149–151, 160
Dernières vues de politique et de finance (Necker),
 101
 Derby, Lord, 167
 despotism, 58, 60, 93, 137, 145–146, 160–161.
See also legislative assemblies: risks of
 legislative usurpation or tyranny; tyranny
A Dialogue on the Actual State of Parliament
 (anonymous pamphlet), 54–57
 Dicey, A. V., 7, 99–100, 167, 171, 198

- dignity
 dignity of the British monarch, 65–66, 96–97, 175
 dignity of the House of Lords, 175
 French monarch's loss of dignity, 60, 80
 importance of dignity of the monarch, 96–97, 100–101, 111–112
 and relationship between House of Commons and House of Lords, 43–44, 96–97
 Directory, the (France), 89, 96, 98–99, 124
 dismissal of ministers
 Constant and, 13, 125–127, 130, 133–134
 dismissal of ministers by the legislature, 122, 171–172, 180–181, 187
 dismissal of ministers by the monarch, 13, 126, 130, 133–134
 dismissal of ministers by a neutral power, 125–127
 Greg and, 187
 dissolution of the legislature
 Bagehot and, 181
 Constant and, 13, 125–128, 130–131
 in constitutional monarchies, 13, 97–98, 103, 126–128, 130, 133–134
 de Staël and, 97
 and disarming ambitious individuals, 132, 194
 George III and, 98, 103
 Mill and, 183, 188
 in parliamentary republics, 97
 and preventing stalemates, 126–127, 177–178, 194
 and preventing tyranny of the minority, 128–131
 Prévost-Paradol and, 194
 and public opinion, 13, 126–128, 131, 134, 181
 Doctrinaires, 135–143, 155, 162. *See also* de Serre, Hercule; Guizot, François; Lainé, Joseph; Rémusat, Charles de; Royer-Collard, Pierre-Paul
 double cabinet, 67–69, 73, 77–78
 Dufaure, Jules Armand, 161
 Duguit, Léon, 100
 East India Reform Bill, 70–71, 126
Edinburgh Review, 105, 107, 109, 112
 Edinburgh University, 105–106
 Edinburgh Whigs, 84, 104–114
 and Coppet Circle, 106, 111–112
See also Brougham, Henry; Jeffrey, Francis; Mackintosh, James; Millar, John; Stewart, Dugald
 electoral mandates, 24–26, 28, 61, 72
 electoral systems
 in Britain, 49, 101–102, 112–114, 165–166, 173, 181, 185–186, 195–196
 Brougham and, 113
 Burke and, 63, 72, 79
 Constant and, 119, 134
 and corruption, 113, 139–140
 and de Staël's proposals for parliamentary republicanism, 97–99
 and dissolution of the legislature, 127–128, 134, 183. *See also* dissolution of the legislature
 Edinburgh Whigs' defense of traditional English system, 111–112
 in France, 79, 139–140, 152–153
 and Great Reform Act of 1832, 165–166
 Mackintosh and, 113
 Mill and, 183
 Tocqueville and, 152–154
 in the U.S., 152–153, 195
 Ellys, Anthony, 26–27, 47
 English Civil War, 15–16, 24, 32, 42
 English constitution
 Bagehot's account, 175–189
 Burke's account, 61–68
 and corruption, 61
 de Staël's account, 103–104
 France's rejection of English constitutional model during early years of French Revolution, 9–10, 60–61, 85–91, 99–100
 and independent judiciary, 31–32
 Jeffrey's account, 109–110
 Montesquieu's account, 8, 18–19, 54, 99–100, 106–107, 128
 Stewart's account, 106–107
 and supremacy of the House of Commons, 18–19, 56–57
The English Constitution (Bagehot), 175
An Essay on the History of the English Government and Constitution (Russell), 113–114
Essays Moral and Political (Hume), 33–34
 Estates General (France), 75, 85
 Eulau, Heinz, 10
 executive officials, 64–65
 and American constitutional model, 144–147, 172, 183
 appointment and dismissal of. *See* appointment of ministers; dismissal of ministers
 autonomy of, 12, 63, 122–124, 155
 and cabinet unity, 187
 and checks and balances, 8–9, 19, 146–147, 182–183
 debate over patronage, 58. *See also* patronage
 Directory (France), 89, 96, 98–99, 124
 and dissolution of the legislature. *See* dissolution of the legislature
 and Doctrinaires, 137–138

- executive officials (cont.)
 harmony between legislature and executive,
 51, 53–55, 65, 94–95, 99, 113, 137–138,
 149–150, 158, 177–178
 high quality of selected executives, 180
 House of Commons' right to veto ministers
 selected by the monarch, 62–63, 65
 and legislative deliberation, 48–58, 94–95,
 98–99, 133. *See also* deliberation
 in the legislature. *See* executives in the
 legislature
 and parliamentary republicanism, 97–99
 and political responsibility. *See* executives,
 responsibility to the legislature
 rise in executive power in the early 20th
 century, 2, 195–203
 and risks of legislative usurpation or tyranny,
 8–9, 42–44, 58, 110–111, 152, 183. *See
 also* tyranny
 shadow cabinet, 67–68, 73, 77–78
 subordination to the legislature, 9, 24, 30–39,
 60, 78, 113–114, 144, 148, 150–151. *See
 also* House of Commons: supremacy of
 weakness of the executive under French
 Constitution of 1791, 76–78
See also chief executives; presidency, American;
 presidency, French; presidency, German;
 prime ministers
- executives in the legislature, 2–3, 8–9, 19, 47–58
 Bagehot and, 175–176
 as barrier to usurpation, 132, 168–169, 182,
 202
 Burke and, 8–9
 Constant and, 127, 132–133
 de Lolme and, 8–9
 Grey and, 169
 Hearn and, 168–169
 independence of executive officials from the
 monarch, 12, 122–124, 155
 Jeffrey's warnings about consequences of lack
 of ministers in Parliament, 110
 and legislative deliberation, 8–9, 48–58,
 94–95, 133, 169–170
 Macaulay and, 169
 and ministers' lack of accountability
 (Bagehot's views), 176
 and need for supervising and controlling
 the executive, 24, 30–39, 78, 113–114,
 150–151, 170–171, 175–176
 and organization and leadership, 169–170
 prohibition of ministers in the legislature in
 France, 60, 76–78, 83, 86–88, 90, 93–96,
 98
 and rejection of patronage in Victorian
 parliamentarism, 170
- Russell and, 168
 Tocqueville and, 147–151
 and Victorian parliamentarism, 168–170,
 175–176
See also appointment of ministers; corruption;
 dismissal of ministers; executives,
 responsibility to the legislature; patronage
 executives, responsibility to the legislature, 2–3,
 58, 83
- Bagehot and, 175–176, 181
 Bolingbroke and, 36–38
 in Britain, 19–20, 30–31, 36–39, 63, 83,
 112–113, 122, 176
 Brougham and, 112–113
 Burke and, 39, 62–63, 88
 Constant and, 116, 120–124, 126–127,
 134
 de Staël and, 39, 97
 and Doctrinaires, 137–138
 in France, 88, 126–127, 137–138, 148–149,
 155
 Guizot and, 137
 Mill and, 39, 183, 188–189
 ministers' lack of accountability, 176, 181
 Palonen and, 2
 responsibility for mal-administration,
 123–124
 Thiers and, 155
 Tocqueville and, 39, 148–149
 and Victorian parliamentarism, 171–172,
 175–176
 Weber and, 200
- Ferguson, Adam, 57
 Fox, Charles James, 67, 123, 126
 France
 Bourbon Restoration (1814–1830), 116–117,
 136, 138–139
 “Caesarist” regimes, 14, 176–177
 censorship of the press, 117, 138–139, 176
 Charter of 1814, 116
 Constitution of 1791. *See* Constitution of
 1791
 Constitution of 1795, 89, 95–96, 98, 118,
 130–133, 150
 Constitution of 1848, 150–151, 184–185
 Declaration of the Rights of Man, 76
 Doctrinaires, 135–143, 155, 162
 electoral system, 139–140, 152–153
 French Revolution. *See* French Revolution
 Girondin Constitution, 89
 Grand Elector, 90
 July Monarchy. *See* July Monarchy
 and lack of culture of political deliberation in
 Second Empire, 177

- and local self-government, 148, 154
 Mill's recommendations for, 184–185
 political parties not considered legitimate in, 83
 popular referenda in, 89
 public's engagement with political affairs, 153–154, 160–161, 192–193
 Revolution of 1830, 117, 156
 Revolution of 1848, 99, 117, 150–151, 162–163, 184, 193
 Second Empire, 176–177, 194–195
 Second Republic, 117, 145, 150–154, 163, 184–185
 and social equality, 136
 and strict separation of powers, 90, 95–96
 suffrage in, 117, 129, 139, 151, 156, 158
 the Terror, 82, 88–89
 Third Republic, 117, 194
 turn towards liberal parliamentarism following
 French Revolution, 83–104. *See also*
 Constant, Benjamin; de Staël, Germaine;
 Necker, Jacques
 unsuitability of American presidentialism for
 France, 150–151, 155
See also Chamber of Deputies; Chamber of
 Peers; Directory, the; Legislative Assembly;
 monarch, French; National Assembly;
 parliamentary government (France)
- La France nouvelle* (Prévost-Paradol), 194
 Francis, Phillip, 81
 Franklin, Benjamin, 35
 Frederick, Prince of Wales, 36
 free state
 Burke and, 78
 de Lolme and, 40
 defining features of, 1, 4, 8–9, 17, 83
 Montesquieu and, 30–31
 and Skinner's "neo-Roman" or "republican"
 theory of liberty, 15–16
 freedom of the press, 138–139, 161, 163
 French Revolution, 109
 Burke and, 60–61, 75–79
 Constant and, 118
 and Doctrinaires, 136
 Jeffrey and, 108
 and the legislature as a threat to liberty,
 128–129
 Necker and de Staël and, 92
 parliamentarism as dominant constitutional
 paradigm following end of, 9–10,
 83–114
 rejection of English constitutional model
 in the early years, 9–10, 60–61, 85–91,
 99–100
 and social equality, 136
- Garsten, Bryan, 119, 129
 Gauchet, Marcel, 101
 George I, 66, 94
 George II, 66, 79, 94
 George III, 66–67
 Burke and, 60, 66–67, 69, 72–73, 77–78, 98,
 134
 and dissolution of Parliament in 1783,
 98, 103
 and East India Reform Bill, 126
 and independence of executive officials from
 the monarch, 123
 madness and regency, 77
 and double cabinet, 67–69, 73, 77–78
 and veto power, 94
 George IV, 143
 Germany, 4–5, 14, 199, 202–203
 Girondin Constitution, 89
 Gladstone, William, 195–196
 Gordon, Thomas, 44–45
The Governance of England (Low), 196–197
The Government of England (Lowell), 197
 Grand Elector (France), 90
 Grange, Henri, 100, 104–105
 Great Reform Act (1832), 114, 165–166, 190–191
 Greg, William Rathbone, 187
 Grey, Third Earl, 164, 169, 171–172, 174,
 191–192
 gridlock, 3, 177–178, 183, 194, 202. *See also*
 dissolution of the legislature
- Guizot, François, 84
 and active constitutional monarch, 12, 137, 185
 Burke and, 59–60
 Constant and, 137
 and corruption, 157–158, 160, 162–163
 and Doctrinaires, 136, 155
 and freedom of the press, 139
 and harmony between legislature and
 executive, 137–138, 158
 and ministers' responsibility to the legislature,
 137
 opposition to, 155–156, 161–162
 and patronage, 158, 160
 political career, 4, 136
 promotion of parliamentarism, 9
 and Revolution of 1848, 162–163
 Tocqueville and, 158, 160
- Habermas, Jürgen, 205
 Hamilton, Alexander, 35
 Hawkins, Angus, 167, 195–196
 Hearn, William, 166, 168–170, 191–192
 Hegel, G. W. F., 135
Historical View of the English Government
 (Millar), 111, 123–124

- History of England* (Macaulay), 190
 Holmes, Geoffrey, 21
 Hont, Istvan, 31–32
 Hoppit, Julian, 21
 Horner, Francis, 105
 House of Commons, 18–58
 administrative officers in, 49–58
 and appointment of ministers, 181, 187
 Bagehot and, 175–176, 179–180, 187
 Brougham and, 112–113
 Burke and, 23, 60–66
 characteristics of electorate, 28–29, 173
 characteristics of members, 27–29, 173
 and checks and balances, 7–9, 18–19, 25–26,
 30–39, 47–58, 107, 110–111, 167
 contrast to French National Assembly, 85
 and control over revenue, 8, 18, 22–23,
 30–34, 40–41, 56–57, 93, 170–171, 187
 and corruption, 49–50, 52, 57–58, 64. *See also*
 corruption
 Crown's influence over, 47–58, 64–66, 113,
 166
 de Lolme and, 23, 42–46, 110
 and debate over electoral mandates, 24–26, 28
 and debate over patronage, 49–58. *See also*
 patronage
 and deliberation, 23–30, 47, 61. *See also*
 deliberation
 and dismissal of ministers, 122, 171–172,
 180–181, 187
 dissolution of, 126–128, 181. *See also*
 dissolution of the legislature
 Greg and, 187
 and harmony between legislature and
 executive, 53–54, 65, 113
 Hume and, 23, 33–34, 51–52, 110
 impeachment power, 18, 31
 Jeffrey and, 109
 Mill and, 181, 187–189
 Milton and, 24
 ministers in, 47–58. *See also* executives in the
 legislature
 Montesquieu and, 8, 18–20, 34–35, 39
 Mounier and, 88, 91
 Necker and, 92
 Parker and, 24
 and persistence of classical parliamentarism, 198
 as potential threat to liberty, 18–19, 39
 powerful position in the 18th century, 19–30
 and proposals for American colonial
 assemblies, 35–36
 and public opinion, 29–30, 57–58, 92,
 103–104, 126–127, 179–180
 as representative body, 27–28, 61–64,
 111–112, 120, 171–173
 right to veto ministers selected by the
 monarch, 62–63, 65, 88
 and selection of executives, 187
 Sidney and, 24
 Spelman and, 29–30
 Stewart and, 107
 and suffrage, 28–29
 and supervision and control of executive
 officials, 24, 30–39, 60, 78, 113–114,
 170–171, 188–189
 supremacy of, 8, 18–19, 22–23, 30–39,
 45–46, 54–55, 60, 62–64, 93, 109, 167,
 170–171, 175, 181
 See also legislative assemblies; parliamentary
 government (Britain)
- House of Lords
 and checks and balances, 8, 18, 167
 de Lolme and, 43–44
 and deliberation, 27–28
 and dignity, 96–97
 and impeachment power, 36–37
 loss of influence, 34–35, 167
 Montesquieu and, 18–20, 34–35
 power in the 18th century, 22–23
 and power of the monarch, 125–126
 Hume, David, 23, 33–34, 51–52, 110
- Idea of a Patriot King* (Bolingbroke), 36
 impeachment power, 31, 36–37, 73
 Indépendants (French liberal opposition party),
 141–142, 161
 India, 70–71, 165
 individualism, 160–161
 Italy, 4–5, 135
- Jaume, Lucien, 150–151
 Jefferson, Thomas, 146
 Jeffrey, Francis, 84, 105, 107–112
 Jenyns, Soame, 55–56
 Johnson, Andrew, 177–178
 Jones, Emily, 61
 judiciary, 31–32
 July Monarchy (1830–1848), 116–117, 134,
 139
 and Doctrinaires, 136
 and patronage and corruption, 192–193
 and potential for despotism, 160–161
 and Tocqueville's political career, 145, 160
- Kelsen, Hans, 17, 204–205
 “the king reigns but does not govern,” 12, 115,
 135, 155, 182
- Laboulaye, Édouard, 151–152
 Lafayette, Marquis de, 75

- Lainé, Joseph, 136
 Langford, Paul, 50
 Lanjuinais, Jean-Denis, 87–88, 134
 Laquière, Alain, 104, 156
 Laski, Harold, 14–15
 Laveleye, Émile de, 198
 Lebovitz, Adam, 88–89
 Lecky, William, 196, 198
 legislative assemblies
 and American constitutional model, 144–146, 177–178
 and checks and balances. *See* checks and balances
 and control over revenue. *See* revenue, control over
 and debate over who may introduce legislation, 186–187
 and deliberation. *See* deliberation
 disadvantages of popular assemblies in ancient republics, 46–47
 and electoral mandates, 24–26, 28, 61
 executives (ministers) in the legislature. *See* executives in the legislature
 gridlock, 3, 177–178, 183, 194, 202
 harmony between legislature and executive, 51, 53–55, 65, 77, 94–95, 99, 113, 137–138, 149–150, 158, 177–178
 and parallels between censorship and patronage as means of limiting dissent, 140
 and parliamentary republicanism, 97–99. *See also* republics, republicanism
 proposals for American colonial assemblies, 35–36, 42
 and public opinion. *See* public opinion
 and representatives' loss of independence following rise of party machines, 196
 risks of legislative usurpation or tyranny, 8–9, 19, 39, 42–43, 58, 85–86, 92, 111, 128–131, 133–134, 145–146, 151
 selection of the prime minister by the legislature, 183–185
 and Skinner's "neo-Roman" or "republican" theory of liberty, 15–16
 in Spain, 16–17
 supremacy over the executive, 2, 7–9, 24, 30–39, 60, 78, 113–114, 118–119, 144, 148, 150–151. *See also* House of Commons: supremacy of
 tyranny of the majority in American political system, 145–146
See also Congress, U.S.; corruption; House of Commons; Legislative Assembly; National Assembly; parliamentary government; parliamentary government (Britain); parliamentary government (France); patronage; representation; representative assemblies
 Legislative Assembly (France), 86–88, 129–130
 legislative deliberation. *See* deliberation
 Lessart, Claude de, 82
 Lewis, George Cornewall, 164, 169–170, 192
 Liberal Party (Britain), 167, 195–196
Liberales (Spain), 16–17
 liberalism
 connection between liberalism and parliamentarism downplayed in post-WWII scholarship, 15–16
 and focus of scholarship on democracy, 5–7
 and legacy of classical parliamentarism, 203–206
 and Montesquieu's account of the English constitution, 18
 and spread of parliamentarism, 3, 14–15
 term origin, 16
 See also specific theorists
 liberty
 Bagehot and, 176–177, 181
 and control over revenue, 32, 40–41
 and de Lolme's theory of constitutional monarchy, 40–47
 executive as chief source of danger to liberty, 110–111, 152, 183
 and ministers' responsibility to the legislature, 63, 188–189
 and negative effects of patronage, 74
 and parliamentary control over the executive, 8, 30–32, 40–41, 183, 188–189
 Skinner's "neo-Roman" or "republican" theory of, 15–16
 and structure of parliamentary governments, 7–8, 11
 See also free state; tyranny
 Lippmann, Walter, 204–205
 Louis-Philippe, 157, 160, 192
 Louis XVI, 81–82, 88, 93, 147
 Louis XVIII, 116, 149
 Low, Sidney, 196–197
 Lowell, Abbot Lawrence, 197
 Macaulay, Thomas, 105, 164
 History of England, 190
 and leadership by ministers in Parliament, 169
 and ministers in Parliament, 169
 and neutrality of the monarch, 135
 and patronage, 190, 192
 political career, 4
 and public opinion, 173
 and supervision and control of executive officials, 170–171, 176
 MacIntyre, Alasdair, 1

- Mackintosh, James, 81, 84, 106, 113
 Madison, James, 146
 Manin, Bernard, 24
 Massey, William, 168
 May, Thomas Erskine, 32, 170–171
 Meinecke, Friedrich, 15
 Mill, John Stuart, 3–4, 10–11, 181–190
 and appointment of ministers and chief executives, 181, 183–185, 188–189
 Burke and, 59–60
 and civil service, 189
 Considerations on Representative Government, 164, 184–185, 189, 193
 Constant and, 185–186
 and control over revenue, 187
 and corruption, 189–190
 criticisms of American constitutional model, 182–183
 defense of parliamentarism and constitutional monarchy, 164, 181–189
 and democracy, 189
 and dissolution of the legislature, 183, 188
 and July Monarchy, 192–193
 and legislation written by expert committee, 186–187, 189
 and legislative deliberation, 188–189
 and ministers' responsibility to the legislature, 39, 183, 188–189
 and neutral constitutional monarch, 12, 181–182, 185
 and patronage, 190, 192–193
 and plural voting and proportional representation, 186, 188–189
 political career, 4, 189–190
 recommendations for France, 184–185
 and republicanism, 182–185
 and role of the legislature, 186–189
 and selection of the chief executive, 183–185
 and suffrage, 7, 185–186, 189
 and supremacy of the House of Commons, 167, 181
 Tocqueville and, 184–185
 Millar, John, 84, 111, 123–124
 Milton, John, 24
 Miliukov, Paul, 5
 ministers. *See* executive officials; executives in the legislature; executives, responsibility to the legislature
 Mirabeau, Comte de, 75, 90
 mirror theory of representation. *See* representation: legislature as image of the nation
 monarch, British
 and appointment of ministers, 122, 126, 181
 Bolingbroke and, 36–39, 48
 Burke and, 61–62, 65–66
 and checks and balances, 8, 18, 33–34, 68–69.
 See also checks and balances
 and the Civil List, 35, 62, 72–74
 Constant and, 115, 125–126
 de Lolme and, 33, 40–41
 delegation of powers by the Crown, 44–45, 64
 dependence on Parliament for revenue, 22–23, 30–34, 40–41, 62. *See also* revenue, control over
 and dismissal of ministers, 126–128
 and dissolution of the legislature. *See* dissolution of the legislature
 and the English Civil War, 24, 32
 Gordon and Trenchard and, 44–45
 House of Commons' control over, 30–39, 110. *See also* House of Commons: supremacy of
 Hume and, 33–34
 influence over elections, 49, 101–102, 113, 166–167
 influence over the House of Commons, 47–58, 64–66, 113, 166. *See also* executive officials; executives in the legislature; patronage
 Jeffrey and, 109
 Mill and, 181
 and monarch as barrier to usurpation by individual or faction, 42–44, 111, 167–169
 Montesquieu and, 18–20
 neutral monarchs, 115, 125–126, 135, 143
 and the Norman Conquest, 41–42
 Patriot King idea, 36–39, 48, 67
 popular support for the monarch, 35–36
 veto power, 8, 18, 32–34, 63–64, 86, 109
 veto power not used in practice, 33–34, 54–55, 58, 63–64, 93, 107, 109, 181
 See also constitutional monarchy; *specific monarchs*
 monarch, French
 absolute monarchy, 40
 and abuses of power, 78–79
 active monarchs, 44, 65–66, 123–124, 136–137, 148, 157–158, 162–163, 185
 and appointment of ministers, 82
 and Grand Elector, 90
 Mounier and, 86, 90–91, 93
 Necker and, 93–94, 96–97
 overthrow of, 82, 94
 and rejection of Constant's constitutional model, 135
 Sieyès and, 90
 veto power, 81–82, 86, 88, 90–91, 93–94

- weakness of the French monarch under
 Constitution of 1791, 76–78, 80, 83
See also constitutional monarchy; *specific monarchs*
- Monarchien party, 86
- monarchy. *See* constitutional monarchy
- Montesquieu, 31–32
 account of the English constitution, 8, 18–19,
 54, 99–100, 106–107, 128
 Bolingbroke and, 39
 Burke and, 68–69
 and checks and balances, 8, 18, 30–32, 34–35,
 39, 68–69, 91, 128
 compared to Constant, 124–128
 and control over revenue, 31–32
 and corruption, 34, 52
 de Lolme and, 45–46
 de Staël and, 104
 Dicey and, 99–100
 and French National Assembly, 86
 insufficiency of account of English
 constitution, 8, 18–19, 99–100, 106–107
- Mounier and, 86, 91
- Necker and, 104
 and parliamentary control over the executive,
 30–32
 and patronage, 51–52
 and role of the Crown's offices, 51–52
The Spirit of the Laws, 8, 18–19, 30–31, 52,
 86, 91, 107
 Stewart and, 106–107
 and veto power of the monarch, 8, 68–69
 warnings about political imbalance in
 England, 34–35, 39
- Mounier, Jean Joseph, 86, 88–91, 93–94, 104
- Napoleon I, 90, 116, 138
- Napoleon III, 14
- Narbonne, Comte de, 82
- National Assembly (France)
 Burke's criticisms, 60–61, 75–82
 and checks and balances, 86–91
 contrast to House of Commons, 85
 and corruption, 79–80, 99–100
 defenders of, 80–81
 and despotism, 60
 and elections and term limits, 79
 formation of, 75, 85
 initial rejection of parliamentary model,
 9–10
 lack of deliberative capacity, 76
 and lack of harmony between legislature and
 executive, 77
 Lanjuinais and, 87–88
 Necker's criticisms, 93–96
 and patronage, 79–80
 and prohibition of ministers in the assembly,
 60, 76–78, 83, 86–88, 93–96
 as representative body, 85
 Sieyès and, 86
 social composition of, 79–80
 and strict separation of powers, 86–88
 and unicameral system, 79
See also Constitution of 1791
- Necker, Jacques, 9, 11, 84, 89–97
 and American constitutional model, 96
 background and career, 91–92
 Burke and, 105
 and checks and balances, 95–96
 and collapse of Constitutions of 1791 and
 1795, 95–96, 105
 and corruption, 100–101
 Craiutu and, 104–105
 de Lolme and, 105
Dernières vues de politique et de finance, 101
 and Doctrinaires, 136
 Grange and, 104–105
 and harmony between legislature and
 executive, 54, 94–95
 Laquière and, 104
 and legislative deliberation, 94–95
 and ministers in the legislature, 93–96, 101
 Montesquieu and, 104
 Mounier and, 93–94
 and need for hereditary monarchy, 96–97
 and patronage, 100–101
 promotion of parliamentarism, 9, 91–97
 and public opinion, 92
 shift in views on monarchy, corruption, and
 parliamentarism, 100–101
 and veto power of the monarch, 93–94
- Nelson, Eric, 35–36, 62
- Newcastle, Duke of, 66
- Norman Conquest, 41–42
- North, Lord, 38, 66–67, 73–74
- Paine, Thomas, 81, 109
- Paley, William, 56–57
- Palonen, Kari, 2, 5, 27, 172–173
- Parker, Henry, 24, 119
- parliamentarism. *See* chief executives;
 constitutional monarchy; executive officials;
 legislative assemblies; monarch, British;
 monarch, French; parliamentary
 government; parliamentary government
 (Britain); parliamentary government
 (France); parliamentary republicanism;
 representative assemblies
 parliamentary government
 adoption in many nations, 4–5, 198

- parliamentary government (cont.)
 classical theory of, 19, 58, 62–64, 83, 144, 198, 203–206. *See also specific theorists*
 contrast to American constitutional model, 144–163, 172, 174, 177–183
 and democracy, 5–7, 17, 194–198
 dilemmas and pathologies of, 4, 11–13, 19–20, 102. *See also* cabinet instability; corruption; gridlock; patronage; tyranny
 lack of focus on, in contemporary scholarship, 5–7, 17
 parliamentarism as dominant constitutional paradigm following end of the French Revolution, 9–10, 83–114
 rise in executive power in the 20th century, 2, 17, 195–198
 summary of characteristics and logic of, 1–3, 11, 19, 83, 111–112. *See also* constitutional monarchy; executive officials; legislative assemblies
See also appointment of ministers; checks and balances; constitutional monarchy; corruption; deliberation; dismissal of ministers; dissolution of the legislature; executive officials; executives in the legislature; executives, responsibility to the legislature; legislative assemblies; monarch, British; monarch, French; patronage; political parties; public opinion; representation; veto power of the monarch; and *following headings*
- parliamentary government (Britain), 47–75, 85–91, 104–114, 175–189
 advantages over American political system, 172, 177–181
 and appointment of ministers, 68–69, 94–95, 110, 122, 181, 183–185, 187
 Arendt and, 205
 Bagehot's account, 175–181
 British parliamentarism adopted in postcolonial states, 165
 Burke's theory, 59–68
 and cabinet instability, 66–67, 69, 191
 contrast to French system during early years of the French Revolution, 85–91
 and control over revenue, 8, 18, 22–23, 30–34, 40–41, 56–57, 93, 170–171, 187
 and corruption. *See* corruption
 debate over electoral mandates, 24–26
 debate over parliamentary reform in the 1780s, 54–55
 and deliberation, 23–30, 172–174, 179–180. *See also* deliberation
 and democracy, 199–206
 and dismissal of ministers, 122, 126–128, 171–172, 180–181, 187
 dissolution of the legislature, 97, 126–127, 181. *See also* dissolution of the legislature and Edinburgh Whigs, 104–114
 emergence of parliamentarism in the 18th century, 3–5, 7–8
 and Great Reform Act of 1832, 114, 165–166, 190–191
 Habermas and, 205
 and harmony between legislature and executive, 53–54, 65, 94–95, 113, 178
 and high quality of selected executive officials, 180
 increase in parliamentary activity in the 18th century, 20–22
 and leadership and organization, 169–170
 Mill's defense of, 164, 181–189
 and ministers in the legislature, 47–58, 83, 168–170. *See also* executives in the legislature
 and ministers' responsibility to the legislature, 19–20, 30–31, 36–39, 63, 83, 120–124, 176
 neutral monarchs, 135, 143, 164, 166, 168, 181–182
 parliamentary procedures, 27, 47, 120, 173, 197
 and patronage. *See* patronage
 persistence of classical parliamentarism, 198
 power struggles in the 17th century, 20–21
 and public opinion, 103–104, 173–174, 179–180, 190–191
 rise of the House of Commons after 1688, 20–30
 Stewart's account, 106–107
 and strengthened plebiscitary executive, 195–198
 and suffrage, 185–186, 189
 supremacy of the House of Commons. *See* House of Commons: supremacy of
 Victorian parliamentarism, 164–193. *See also specific theorists*
 Weber and, 201–202
See also English constitution; House of Commons; House of Lords; monarch, British; prime ministers; *specific monarchs and prime ministers*
- parliamentary government (France), 88–104, 116–118, 133–143, 147–154
 active monarchs, 44, 65–66, 123–124, 136–137, 148, 157–158, 162–163, 185
 and appointment of ministers, 78, 80, 82, 88, 90–91, 122, 125, 130, 184, 194
 Burke's criticisms, 60–61, 75–82

- and cabinet instability, 117, 134, 140–141, 149–150
- Constant and the dilemmas of French parliamentarism, 133–143
- and corruption. *See* corruption
- and de Staël's proposals for parliamentary republicanism, 97–99
- different conceptions of parliamentarism, 135–143, 154–156
- and dismissal of ministers, 125–127, 130, 133–134
- dominance into the 20th century, 198
- and harmony (or not) between legislature and executive, 77, 99, 137–138, 149–150, 158
- introduction of parliamentarism in 1814, 4–5, 12, 83–84, 116
- Mill's observations of corruption and patronage in the July Monarchy, 192–193
- and ministers' responsibility to the legislature, 88, 126–127, 137–138, 148–149, 155
- parliamentary systems of the 19th century, 116–118, 184–185
- and patronage. *See* patronage
- Prévost-Paradol's promotion of, 194
- prohibition of government functionaries in the legislature, 141, 158–159
- prohibition of ministers in the legislature, 60, 76–78, 83, 86–88, 90, 93–96, 98
- and public opinion. *See* public opinion
- rejection of English constitutional model during early years of French Revolution, 9–10, 60–61, 85–91, 99–100
- responses to collapse of Constitution of 1791, 88–104
- and Second Republic, 150–154
- and Tocqueville's promotion of constitutional monarchy, 147–154
- turn towards liberal parliamentarism following French Revolution, 83–104. *See also* Constant, Benjamin; de Staël, Germaine; Edinburgh Whigs; Necker, Jacques
- See also* Chamber of Deputies; Chamber of Peers; Director, the; Legislative Assembly; monarch, French; National Assembly; presidency, French; *specific monarchs and constitutions*
- parliamentary republicanism
- and appointment of ministers, 97, 125, 194
 - de Staël and, 97–99
 - and functional substitutes for monarchy, 2
 - Mill and, 185
 - See also* republics, republicanism
- Pasquino, Pasquale, 88
- Patriot King, 36–39, 48, 67
- patronage, 58
- administrative officers in the House of Commons, 49–58
 - Bagehot and, 104, 190–192
 - Brougham and, 112–113
 - Burke and, 64–65, 68–75, 102
 - and cabinet instability, 12, 52–53, 55–56, 69, 140–141, 160, 191–192
 - and Chamber of Deputies, 156–157
 - Constant and, 13, 104, 115–116, 139–143, 160, 192
 - and corruption, 12–13, 49–50, 57–58, 68–75, 102–103, 139–140, 156–157, 191–193
 - de Staël and, 102–103
 - debate over, 12–13, 49–58, 189–193 *see also specific theorists*
 - and Doctrinaires, 136, 139–143
 - Ferguson and, 57
 - and French bureaucracy in 1814, 139–140
 - and French National Assembly, 79–80
 - and Great Reform Act of 1832, 166
 - Grey and, 191–192
 - Guizot and, 158, 160
 - and harmony between legislature and executive, 53–55, 65, 158
 - Hearn and, 191–192
 - Hume and, 51–52
 - Jeffrey and, 112
 - Jenyns and, 55–56
 - and July Monarchy, 192–193
 - and legislative deliberation, 49–50, 56–57, 141, 159
 - Lewis and, 192
 - Macaulay and, 190, 192
 - Mill and, 190, 192–193
 - Montesquieu and, 51–52
 - Necker and, 100–101
 - parallels with censorship as means of limiting dissent, 140
 - and political parties, 12–13, 53, 61, 71–72, 74–75, 102–103, 142–143, 158, 162
 - and public opinion, 162
 - and public spirit, 73–74, 160–161, 192–193
 - and restraints on the House of Commons, 51–52
 - Russell and, 113–114
 - Stewart and, 112
 - Tocqueville and, 104, 158–162
 - and Victorian parliamentarism, 164, 170, 189–193
 - Walpole and, 50–58, 140–141
- Peel, Robert, 167
- Pelham, Henry, 66
- Pétion, Jérôme, 82
- Pitt, William, 66–67, 79

- Pitt, William, Jr., 67, 77, 103–104
 Pitts, Jennifer, 16, 154
 plebiscitary executive, 195–203
 Poland, 26
Political Disquisitions (Burgh), 25–26
 political parties, 3, 11, 61, 83, 173–174
 Bagehot and, 174
 Bolingbroke and, 37
 Brougham and, 112–113
 Burke and, 61, 71–72, 74–75, 142
 and cabinet instability, 12
 and choice of presidential candidates, 195
 Constant and, 13, 141–143, 162
 and corruption, 12–13, 61, 71, 102–103, 112–113
 de Staël and, 102–104, 142
 and democracy, 196
 formation of organized parliamentary opposition, 37
 not considered legitimate in France, 83
 and patronage, 12–13, 61, 71–72, 74–75, 102–103, 142–143, 158, 162
 and public opinion, 13, 142–143, 162
 and public political engagement, 153–154
 and representatives' loss of independence, 196
 Tocqueville and, 153–154, 157–159, 161–162
 Walpole and, 37, 53
 political responsibility
 Bagehot and, 176
 Burke and, 38, 62–63, 88
 Constant and, 120–124, 126–127
 and current conditions, 206
 de Staël and, 39, 97
 Mill and, 39, 183, 188–189
 and ministers' lack of accountability, 176
 ministers' responsibility to the legislature.
 See executives, responsibility to the legislature
 and neutral constitutional power, 126
 and separation of the executive power from the monarch, 122–124
 Tocqueville and, 39, 148–149
 Weber and, 200
Politics as a Vocation (Weber), 196
 popular referenda, 89, 198–201
 populism, 17, 206. *See also* plebiscitary executive
 Portugal, 135
 power of the purse. *See* revenue, control over
 presidency, American
 Bagehot and, 177–178, 180
 Bryce and, 194–195
 and checks and balances, 146–147, 182–183
 competence (or not) of the president, 180, 183
 disadvantages of system, 147, 151, 177–178, 180, 182–183
 Laboulaye's preference for American-style system, 151–152
 Mill and, 182–183
 and power of the executive, 197
 president's lack of entry into Congress, 145
 and public opinion, 194–195
 and stalemates between the executive and the legislature, 177–178
 Tocqueville and, 145, 147, 150–151
 unsuitability of American presidentialism for France, 150–151, 155
 veto power, 147
 Weber and, 197
 presidency, French, 150–152, 184, 194
 presidency, German, 202–203
 press, the
 censorship in France, 117, 138–139, 176
 Constant and, 138–139
 de Lolme and, 46–47
 and public opinion, 46–47, 120
 Tocqueville and, 161, 163
 Prévost-Paradol, Lucien Anatole, 135, 194
 prime ministers
 and growing power of the executive, 195–198, 205
 high turnover of, under George III, 66–67
 and popular referenda, 199
 selection by the legislature rather than the people, 183–185
 See also cabinet instability; *specific prime ministers*
Principes de politique applicables à tous les gouvernements représentatifs (Constant), 125
The Principles of Moral and Political Philosophy (Paley), 56–57
 proportional representation, 7, 186, 188–189, 194, 198
 Prussia, 135, 159
 public opinion, 185
 and American constitutional model, 174, 194–195
 Bagehot and, 190–191
 and Chamber of Deputies, 121
 Constant and, 126–128, 134
 and corruption in the legislature, 36, 72–73, 142, 161–162, 190–191
 de Staël and, 84, 92–93, 103–104, 128
 and de Staël's proposals for parliamentary republicanism, 97–99
 and debate over electoral mandates, 24–26, 28
 and dissolution of the legislature, 13, 126–128, 131, 134, 181

- and growing power of the plebiscitary executive, 195–198
- and House of Commons, 29–30, 57–58, 92, 126–127
- and legislative deliberation, 29–30, 47, 179–180
- and the monarch, 35–36, 150
- Necker and, 92
- and North ministry, 73–74
- and patronage, 162
- and political parties, 13, 142–143, 153–154, 161–162
- popular referenda, 89, 198–199
- and the press, 46–47, 120
- public's preference for active monarch in France, 185
- Tocqueville and, 150
- and Victorian parliamentarism, 173–174
- public, the
- apathy of, 73–74, 160–161, 179–180, 192–193
- Burke and, 72–74
- disadvantages of popular assemblies in ancient republics, 46–47
- lack of public opposition to North ministry, 73–74
- and parallels between censorship and patronage as means of limiting dissent, 140
- and patronage and corruption, 57–58, 73–74, 160–161, 192–193
- political engagement in Britain, 29–30, 40, 46–47, 72–74, 179–180
- political engagement in France, 153–154, 160–161, 192–193
- political engagement in the U.S., 174, 179–180
- See also* electoral systems; representation; representative assemblies; republics; republicanism; suffrage
- Reflections on the Revolution in France* (Burke), 75–79
- Réflexions sur les constitutions, la distribution des pouvoirs, et les garanties, dans une monarchie constitutionnelle* (Constant), 125
- Rémusat, Charles de, 4, 136
- representation
- and the aristocracy, 85, 111–112, 121. *See also* Chamber of Peers; House of Lords
- Burke and, 62–64
- and classical theory of parliamentarism, 58, 62–64
- and debate over electoral mandates, 24–26, 28, 61
- diverse viewpoints and legislative deliberation, 26–29, 119–120
- and Edinburgh Whigs, 111–112
- legislature as image of the nation, 7, 27–28, 61–62, 119, 173, 194
- Mill and, 185–186, 188–189
- populism and the current “crisis of representation,” 17. *See also* plebiscitary executive
- proportional representation, 7, 186, 188–189, 194, 198
- and Victorian parliamentarism, 171
- See also* suffrage
- representative assemblies
- Constant and, 118–120
- de Staël and, 92–93
- French National Assembly as representative body, 75–76, 85
- House of Commons as representative body, 27–28, 61–64, 111–112, 120, 171–173
- Necker and, 92
- representation of the people and the aristocracy separated in the English parliamentary system, 85, 111–112
- See also* Chamber of Deputies; Congress, U.S.; House of Commons; legislative assemblies; Legislative Assembly; National Assembly
- republics, republicanism
- and accountability of executive officials, 31
- and advantages of constitutional monarchies, 131, 148, 151, 182
- ancient republics, 31, 42–43, 46–47, 110–111, 187
- Constant and, 118, 124–127, 131
- de Lolme and, 42–43
- de Staël and, 92–93, 97–99
- and electoral mandates, 26–27
- French Second Republic, 145, 150–154, 163, 184–185
- French Third Republic, 194
- Laboulaye and, 151–152
- Mill and, 182–185, 187
- Montesquieu and, 31
- Necker and, 101
- and need for neutral constitutional power, 124–125
- proposed constitutional frameworks for France, 92–93, 97–99, 124–127, 151
- and risks of usurpation/tyranny by ambitious individual, 42–43, 46–47, 110–111, 131
- and selection of the chief executive, 183–185
- and Skinner's “neo-Roman” or “republican” theory of liberty, 15–16
- Tocqueville and, 148, 162–163
- See also* parliamentary republics
- Restoration. *See* Bourbon Restoration

- revenue, control over
 Burke and, 62–64
 and Chamber of Deputies, 127–128, 156
 and checks and balances, 8, 18, 31–34
 Civil List, 35, 62, 72–73
 Constant and, 127–128, 156
 de Lolme and, 40–41
 Mill and, 187
 Montesquieu and, 31–32
 Mounier and, 91
 Paley and, 56–57
 and supremacy of the House of Commons, 8,
 22–23, 31–34, 40–41, 56–57, 62, 93,
 170–171, 187
 Thiers and, 156
 Weber and, 201
 Revolution of 1688 (England), 20–21, 49–50,
 60, 63–65, 78, 156, 168–169
 Revolution of 1830 (France), 117, 156
 Revolution of 1848 (France), 99, 117, 150–151,
 162–163, 184, 193
 Robespierre, Maximilien, 87
 Rockingham, Lord, 67
 Rosanvallon, Pierre, 205
 Rousseau, Jean Jacques, 26
 Royer-Collard, Pierre-Paul, 136–137
 Russell, John, 113–114, 168
 Russia, 4–5
- Sandys, Samuel, 38
 Savile, George (Marquess of Halifax), 21–22
 Schmitt, Carl, 15, 59–60, 199, 203–204
 Schumpeter, Joseph, 17, 204–206
 Second Empire, 176–177, 194–195
 Second Republic, 117, 145, 150–154, 163,
 184–185
 Senate, U.S., 152–153
 Sidney, Algernon, 24
 Sieyès, Emmanuel, 75, 85–87, 90, 123
 Sismondi, Simonde de, 9, 84, 106, 112,
 134
 Skinner, Quentin, 15–17
 Smith, Adam, 8, 31–34
 Smith, Sydney, 105
 Somers, John, 25
 South America, 135
 Spain, 4–5, 16–17, 135
 Spelman, Edward, 29–30
 Spencer, Herbert, 13–14
The Spirit of Patriotism (Bolingbroke), 37–38
The Spirit of the Laws (Montesquieu), 8, 18,
 30–31, 52, 86, 91, 107
 Stewart, Dugald, 84, 105–107, 110–112
The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere
 (Habermas), 205
- Struve, Peter, 5
 suffrage
 in Britain, 6–7, 28–29, 112, 173, 185–186
 Burke and, 72
 Constant and, 117, 129, 185–186
 and Copet Circle, 112
 Dicey and, 7
 in France, 117, 129, 139, 151, 156, 158
 Mill and, 7, 185–186, 189
 Tocqueville and, 7, 158
 Weber and, 7
See also electoral systems
 Switzerland, 198–199
- Terror, the, 82, 88–89
 Thiers, Adolphe, 134, 155–157, 194
 “the king reigns but does not govern” phrase,
 115, 155, 182
 Third Estate, 79–80
 Third Republic, 117, 194
Thoughts on the Cause of the Present Discontents
 (Burke), 38, 60–62, 67, 69–70, 88
 Tocqueville, Alexis de, 3–4, 10–11, 144–165
 and active constitutional monarch, 12, 148,
 157–158, 162–163, 185
 analysis of American political system,
 144–147, 151–152
 and cabinet instability, 149–150
 and checks and balances in American system,
 146–147
 and checks and balances in proposed
 constitutional monarchy, 148–149, 151
 and Comte de Chambord, 163
 Constant and, 162–163
 and corruption, 158–162
 criticisms of Constitution of 1795, 150
 criticisms of the National Assembly after 1848,
 151
 and dangers of elected head of state for
 European countries, 148
Democracy in America, 144–147, 149–151,
 160
 Guizot and, 158, 160
 and indirect electoral systems, 152–154
 Laboulaye and, 151–152
 and legislative deliberation, 159
 and liberal opposition party, 157–159,
 161–162
 and local self-government in France, 148, 154
 Mill and, 184–185
 and ministers in the legislature, 147–149
 and ministers’ responsibility to the legislature,
 39, 148–149
 and modernization of the French
 administrative state, 158–159

- Montesquieu and, 18
 and opposition parties, 153–154
 and patronage, 104, 158–162
 political career, 4, 145, 154–162
 and prohibition of government functionaries
 in the legislature, 158–159
 promotion of constitutional monarchy and
 liberal parliamentarism in France, 147–154,
 157–158, 163
 promotion of parliamentary republicanism,
 162–163
 and public's political engagement in France,
 153–154, 159–160
 recommendations for European political
 systems, 147–154
 and subordination of the monarch to the
 legislature, 148, 151
 and suffrage, 7, 158
 Thiers and, 157
 and veto power of the executive, 147
- Todd, Alpheus, 166, 168
- Tories, 66
- Trenchard, John, 44–45
- Tuck, Richard, 198
- tyranny
 and checks and balances in American system,
 146–147
 and democracy, 151
 risks of legislative usurpation or tyranny, 8–9,
 19, 39, 42–44, 58, 85–86, 92, 128–131,
 133–134, 145–146, 151
 tyranny of the majority in American political
 system, 145–146
See also despotism
- United States
 American Revolution, 73, 109
 Bagehot's criticisms of American system,
 177–181
 Bryce's observations on American democracy,
 194–195
 contrast between parliamentarism and
 American constitutional model, 144–163,
 172, 174, 177–181
 Grey and, 172
 and legislative deliberation, 174, 178–179
 local self-government, 154
 Mill's criticisms of American system,
 182–183
 Necker's views of American constitution, 96
 power of state legislatures, 145–146
 proposals for American colonial assemblies,
 35–36, 42
 public's engagement with political affairs, 174,
 179–180
- Senate, 152–153
 and stalemates between the executive and the
 legislature, 177–178, 183
 Thiers and, 155
 Tocqueville's analysis, 144–147, 152
 and tyranny of the majority, 145–146
 unique conditions of, 148, 152
See also Congress, U.S.; Constitution, U.S.;
 presidency, American
- Urbinati, Nadia, 187
- veto power of the monarch, 32–34
 Burke and, 63–64
 and checks and balances, 8, 68–69, 86
 Constant and, 126, 127
 decline of British monarch's use of veto power,
 33–34, 54–55, 58, 63–64, 93–94, 107,
 109, 167, 181
 and French monarchy, 81–82, 86, 88, 90–91,
 93–94, 147
 Jeffrey and, 109
 last use of, in Britain, 34
 Louis XVI's use of, 81–82, 88, 93, 147
 Mill and, 181
 Montesquieu and, 8, 68–69
 Mounier and, 90–91, 93–94
 Necker and, 93–94
 Stewart and, 107
 veto power of the U.S. president, 147
- Victoria, queen
 Bagehot and, 166
 involvement in political affairs, 166
 popularity of, 168
 reputation as neutral monarch, 135, 143, 164,
 166, 168
- Victorian liberalism and parliamentary theory,
 164–193. *See also* Bagehot, Walter; Grey,
 Third Earl; Lewis, George Cornwall; Macaulay, Thomas; Mill, John Stuart
- Vile, M. J. C., 107, 175
- Vindiciae Gallicae* (Mackintosh), 81
- Vitrolles, Baron de, 134
- von Mises, Ludwig, 15
- voting. *See* electoral systems; representation;
 suffrage
- Waldron, Jeremy, 204
- Walpole, Robert, 20, 36–38, 50, 206
- Bolingbroke and, 36–38
 Burke and, 71–72
 and corruption, 37, 50, 57–58, 71–72,
 134
 and Doctrinaires, 136
 and harmony between legislature and
 executive, 53–54

246

Walpole, Robert (cont.)
Hume and, 51–52
Langford and, 50
and patronage, 50–58, 140–141
and political parties, 37, 53
Weber, Max, 7, 11–12, 17, 115, 196, 199–203
Whig History, 16, 205

Index

Whigs, 66–67, 74–75, 105. *See also* Edinburgh
Whigs
William III, 64–65
William the Conqueror, 41
Wilson, James, 35
Wilson, Woodrow, 204–205
Wollstonecraft, Mary, 81