

"Shelly Kreiczer-Levy's *Destabilized Property: Property Law in the Sharing Economy* is a major work on a timely subject. This is a sophisticated book, combining nuanced conceptual and normative analyses with pragmatic suggestions for law reform. This book is a must read for anyone interested in the sharing economy or in property theory."

Hanoch Dagan, Stewart and Judy Colton Professor of Legal Theory and Innovation, Tel-Aviv University Faculty of Law

"Of all writers about the rise of the sharing economy, Shelly Kreiczer-Levy is recognized internationally as the most keen observer and the leading theorist in the field. Just as the internet forced us to rethink information and access, the sharing economy forces us to rethink what property means and its role in human lives. The sharing economy shakes the very foundations of the idea of property as a small, exclusive, privatized space, and with this challenge comes both great promise and intense social conflict. This book is brilliant and must be read by anyone who wants to understand this movement. It is the classic in the field."

Laura S. Underkuffler, Cornell Law School

"The age-old institution of private property keeps changing, and the sharing economy poses unique challenges to ensure the right mix of fairness and flexibility. We could have no better guide than Shelly Kreiczer-Levy to the ways that property law must adjust to this new environment."

Joseph William Singer, Bussey Professor of Law, Harvard Law School





### **Destabilized Property**

The sharing economy challenges contemporary property law. Does the rise of access render our conception of property obsolete? What are the normative and theoretical implications of choosing casual short-term use of property over stable use? What are the relational and social complications of blurring the line between personal and commercial use of property? The book develops a novel conceptualization of property in the age of the sharing economy. It argues that the sharing economy pushes for a mobile and flexible vision of engaging with possessions and, as a result, with other people. Property's role as a source of permanence and a facilitator of stable, long-term relationships is gradually decreasing in importance. The book offers a broad theoretical and normative framework for understanding the changing landscape of property, provides an institutional analysis of the phenomenon, discusses the social, communal, and relational implications of these changes, and offers guidelines for law reform.

**Shelly Kreiczer-Levy** is a professor of law at the College of Law and Business, in Ramat Gan, Israel. She served as the President of the Israeli Association of Private Law and was the recipient of the Zeltner Award for Young Promising Scholars (2016). She is an expert on property law and the sharing economy.



#### The Law in Context Series

Editors: William Twining (University College London), Maksymilian Del Mar (Queen Mary, University of London) and Bronwen Morgan (University of New South Wales).

Since 1970 the Law in Context series has been at the forefront of the movement to broaden the study of law. It has been a vehicle for the publication of innovative scholarly books that treat law and legal phenomena critically in their social, political and economic contexts from a variety of perspectives. The series particularly aims to publish scholarly legal writing that brings fresh perspectives to bear on new and existing areas of law taught in universities. A contextual approach involves treating legal subjects broadly, using materials from other social sciences, and from any other discipline that helps to explain the operation in practice of the subject under discussion. It is hoped that this orientation is at once more stimulating and more realistic than the bare exposition of legal rules. The series includes original books that have a different emphasis from traditional legal textbooks, while maintaining the same high standards of scholarship. They are written primarily for undergraduate and graduate students of law and of other disciplines, but will also appeal to a wider readership. In the past, most books in the series have focused on English law, but recent publications include books on European law, globalisation, transnational legal processes, and comparative law.

### **Books in the Series**

Acosta: The National versus the Foreigner in South America

Ali: Modern Challenges to Islamic Law

Alyagon Darr: Plausible Crime Stories: The Legal History of Sexual Offences in Mandate Palestine

Anderson, Schum & Twining: Analysis of Evidence

Ashworth: Sentencing and Criminal Justice Barton & Douglas: Law and Parenthood

Beecher-Monas: Evaluating Scientific Evidence: An Interdisciplinary Framework for

Intellectual Due Process
Bell: French Legal Cultures
Bercusson: European Labour Law
Birkinshaw: European Public Law

Birkinshaw: Freedom of Information: The Law, the Practice and the Ideal

Brownsword & Goodwin: Law and the Technologies of the Twenty-First Century: Text and Materials

Cane & Goudkamp: Atiyah's Accidents, Compensation and the Law

Clarke & Kohler: Property Law: Commentary and Materials

Collins: The Law of Contract

Collins, Ewing & McColgan: Labour Law

Cowan: Housing Law and Policy

Cranston: Legal Foundations of the Welfare State

Series list continues after index



# **Destabilized Property**

Property Law in the Sharing Economy

SHELLY KREICZER-LEVY

College of Law and Business, Ramat Gan, Israel





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108475273

DOI: 10.1017/9781108566605

© Shelly Kreiczer-Levy 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Kreiczer-Levy, Shelly, 1979-, author.

Title: Destabilized property : property law in the sharing economy / Shelly Kreiczer-Levy, College of Law and Business, Ramat Gan, Israel.

Description: New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references and index

Identifiers: LCCN 2019019439 | ISBN 9781108475273 (hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9781108466035 (pbk. : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Property. | Cooperative societies–Law and legislation. | Sharing–Economic aspects. | Cooperation–Economic aspects.

Classification: LCC K720 .K74 2019 | DDC 346.04-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019019439

ISBN 978-1-108-47527-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



"To my husband, Omer"





### **Contents**

	Acknowledgments	page x
1	Introduction	1
2	Stability and Property Use	16
3	The Decline of Stability in the New Millennium	38
4	The Rise of the Access Economy	60
5	Access as an Alternative to Ownership	78
6	Fragmentation of Intimate Property	109
7	Evaluating Flexibility in Property Use	134
8	What's Next? The Future of the Access Economy	164
9	Conclusion	176
	Index	182



## **Acknowledgments**

Writing a book is an exciting and challenging journey, and I was incredibly fortunate not to go through it alone. The journey began a little more than two years ago, during my sabbatical semester spent at Cornell Law School, where I developed the idea of the sharing economy as a force that is destabilizing property and property relations. I am grateful to the warm and welcoming Cornell community, in particular to Greg Alexander, Saule Omarova, Eduardo Peñalver, Aziz Rana, Sergio Alberto Gramitto Ricci, Sidney Tarrow, and Gerald Torres who were always ready to discuss my ideas and engage in thought-provoking discussions. Laura Underkuffler was especially generous with her time. She challenged me, providing practical advice and encouragement. I also want to thank Moshe Cohen-Eliya, the president of my home institution, the Ramat Gan College of Law and Business, who encouraged me to write this book from the very early stages.

In later stages, numerous friends and colleagues read chapters and discussed ideas with me. I am grateful to Ayelet Blecher-Prigat, Ronit Donyets-Kedar, Niva Elkin-Koren, Michal Gal, Eldar Haber, Donald Kochan, Ayelet Magen-Buch, Iddo Porat, and Anat Rosenberg. Participants at the progressive property conferences read and reread chapters as I presented new materials, and provided wonderful comments and suggestions. I thank Bernadette Atuahene, Debbie Becher, Nestor Davidson, Anna di Robilant, John Lovett, Hanri Mostret, Chris Odinet, Joseph Singer, and Chris Serkin. I am deeply grateful to Rashmi Dyal-Chand, Hanoch Dagan, and Galia Schneebaum for their careful reading and their fantastic suggestions that significantly improved this book.

I have presented the chapters and some earlier work in numerous conferences and workshops – Property Works in Progress at Boston University, Property Law in the Sharing Economy Workshop at Penn State, the Berkman-Klein Center for Internet and Society, the GIF Young Scientists Meeting, Haifa University Faculty Workshop, Cornell Faculty Workshop, IDC Faculty Workshop, Tel Aviv University Law and Technology, and Private Law workshops – each presentation yielded important new insights for me. I also want to thank the anonymous referees of Cambridge University Press for important and perceptive comments.



xi

### Acknowledgments

Finally, and most importantly, I am indebted to my supportive, warm, and loving family. My parents, Haim and Rivka Kreiczer, continue to support me and have always taken an interest in my work and achievements. The journey did not really begin two years ago, and my parents were there from the start. For his incredible faith in me, his intellectual and emotional support of the project and of me, I am eternally grateful to my husband, Omer Levy. This book is as much his as it is mine. My daughters, Gali and Inbar, share my joy and bring me joy and, most of all, make sure I do not forget what truly matters.

Chapter 6 is a revised and updated version of my article "Consumption Property in the Sharing Economy," 43 Pepperdine Law Review 61 (2016). Chapter 5 is partly based on two articles: "Share, Own, Access," Yale Law & Policy Review 155 (2017), and "Property without Personhood," 47 Seton Hall Law Review 771 (2017). I thank the editors for their permission to use the materials.

