

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47526-6 — Duelling for Supremacy
Edited by Fulvio Maria Palombino
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

DUELLING FOR SUPREMACY

It is a settled rule of international law that a state may not rely on the provisions of its 'internal law' as justification for failing to comply with international obligations. However, the judiciaries of most countries, including those with a high record of compliance with international norms, have increasingly felt the need to preserve the area of fundamental principles, where the state's inclination to retain full sovereignty seems to act as an unbreakable 'counter-limit' to the limitations deriving from international law. This volume explores this trend by adopting a comparative perspective, addressing the question of how conflicts between international law and national fundamental principles are dealt with and resolved within a specific legal system. The contributing authors identify common tendencies and fundamental differences in the approaches and evaluate the implications of this practice for the future of the principle of supremacy of international law.

FULVIO MARIA PALOMBINO is Professor of International Law at the Law Department of the University of Naples Federico II and Vice-President of the European Society of International Law.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47526-6 — Duelling for Supremacy
Edited by Fulvio Maria Palombino
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47526-6 — Duelling for Supremacy
Edited by Fulvio Maria Palombino
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Duelling for Supremacy

INTERNATIONAL LAW VS. NATIONAL FUNDAMENTAL
PRINCIPLES

Edited by

FULVIO MARIA PALOMBINO

University of Naples Federico II



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-47526-6 — Duelling for Supremacy
 Edited by Fulvio Maria Palombino
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108475266

DOI: 10.1017/9781108601245

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Palombino, Fulvio Maria, editor.

TITLE: Duelling for supremacy : international law vs. national fundamental principles / edited by Fulvio Maria Palombino, University of Naples Federico II.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019001100 | ISBN 9781108475266 (alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: International and municipal law.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KZ1265 .D84 2019 | DDC 340.9–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019001100>

ISBN 978-1-108-47526-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47526-6 — Duelling for Supremacy
Edited by Fulvio Maria Palombino
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To the memory of Professor Benedetto Conforti

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47526-6 — Duelling for Supremacy
Edited by Fulvio Maria Palombino
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
1 Introduction Fulvio Maria Palombino	1
2 Brazil Paula Wojcikiewicz Almeida	6
3 Canada Stéphane Beaulac	21
4 China Pierfrancesco Rossi	43
5 France Raphaële Rivier	65
6 Germany Niels Petersen	89
7 Greece Mariela Apostolaki and Antonios Tzanakopoulos	106
8 India Vinai Kumar Singh	127
9 Indonesia Simon Butt	147

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
10	Israel Yuval Shany	167
11	Italy Daniele Amoroso	184
12	Japan Hajime Yamamoto and Yota Negishi	210
13	Mexico Francisca Pou Giménez and Alejandro Rodiles	234
14	Netherlands André Nollkaemper and Rosanne van Alebeek	255
15	Nigeria Babafemi Akinrinade	277
16	Russia Maria Smirnova	297
17	South Africa Hannah Woolaver	320
18	Turkey Ikboljon Qoraboyev and Emre Turkut	336
19	United Kingdom Eirik Bjorge and Ewan Smith	355
20	United States David L. Sloss	378
21	Conclusion Fulvio Maria Palombino	401
	<i>List of Cases</i>	406
	<i>Index</i>	430

Contributors

Fulvio Maria Palombino is Professor of International Law at the Law Department of the University of Naples Federico II and Vice-President of the European Society of International Law. He is the author of four books and of numerous contributions to leading Italian and international journals on issues of international litigation and arbitration, international investment law, human rights and international criminal law.

Paula Wojcikiewicz Almeida Professor of International Law and Director of the Jean Monnet Chair, sponsored by the European Commission, at the Getulio Vargas Foundation Law School in Rio de Janeiro. Professor of International Law of the Master in International Relations of the Faculty of Social Sciences, Getulio Vargas Foundation. Associate Researcher at the Institute of International and European Law at the Sorbonne (IREDIES). Doctorate *summa cum laude* in International and European Law from the University of Paris I - Panthéon-Sorbonne. Chair of the Latin American Society (LASIL) Interest Group on International Courts and Tribunals. Brazilian Member of the ILA Committee on the Procedure of ICTs.

Babafemi Akinrinade is Associate Professor of Human Rights at Fairhaven College, Western Washington University. He holds the LLM and JSD degrees from University of Notre Dame Law School. He is the author of *Human Rights and State Collapse in Africa* (Eleven International Publishing, 2009).

Daniele Amoroso (PhD, Istituto di Scienze Umane) is Professor of International Law at the University of Cagliari. He is Chair of the Interest Group on 'Municipal Law and International Law' of the Italian Society of International Law, as well as Associate Editor of the *Italian Yearbook of International Law*. He authored a monograph on Judicial Abdication in Foreign Affairs and International Law (*Insindacabilità del potere estero e diritto internazionale*, Editoriale Scientifica, 2012, in Italian). He has also authored several publications on the relationships between international and domestic legal orders in international journals as well as prominent Italian reviews.

Mariela Apostolaki is a PhD student in the University of Manchester working under the supervision of Professors d'Aspremont and Scobbie. The working title of her research project is 'The Effects of International Organizations' Secondary Law in a Growingly Pluralized International Legal Order'. She is a Teaching Assistant for EU Law and contributes to various projects on public international law. She holds an LLB from the University of Athens and an LLM from the University of Amsterdam.

Stéphane Beaulac PhD (Cantab.) is a full professor at the University of Montreal. He teaches international law and human rights. His background is bijural (civil law, common law); he clerked at the Supreme Court of Canada. He was a visiting professor at EUI, Trento and Padua, as well as research fellow in Edinburgh and Cork. His current projects include the law of independence (self-determination, secession) and the national use of international law. He has published some twenty law books and over a hundred scientific papers and articles. His work won prizes and was cited by the International Court of Justice.

Eirik Bjorge is Professor of Law at Bristol University Law School, where he teaches public international law, international dispute settlement and public law. He is the author of *The Evolutionary Interpretation of Treaties* (OUP, 2014), which won the King of Norway's Gold Medal, and *Domestic Application of the ECHR: Courts as Faithful Trustees* (OUP, 2015). He has edited, with Mads Andenas, *A Farewell to Fragmentation* (CUP, 2015) and, with Cameron Miles, *Landmark Cases in Public International Law* (Hart, 2017). He is a former Shaw Foundation Junior Research Fellow at Jesus College, Oxford.

Simon Butt is Professor of Indonesian Law at the University of Sydney Law School, where he teaches Indonesian Law and Private International Law. He has written widely on Indonesian law, including *The Constitutional Court and Democracy in Indonesia* (Brill, 2015), *Corruption and Law in Indonesia* (Routledge, 2012), *The Constitution of Indonesia: A Contextual Analysis* (Hart, 2012, with co-author Tim Lindsey) and, most recently, *Indonesian Law* (Oxford University Press, 2018, with co-author Tim Lindsey).

Yota Negishi is Assistant Professor at Seinan Gakuin University, Fukuoka, Japan (from 2017). He holds LLM and PhD in international law from Waseda University in Tokyo. He has stayed at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law in Heidelberg, Germany, as an assistant for Professor Anne Peters (2014–2015, 2016–2017). He has also engaged in the research projects as a Research Fellow of the Japan Society for the Promotion of Science (2013–2016, 2016–2018).

André Nollkaemper is Dean and Professor of Public International Law at the Faculty of Law of the University of Amsterdam. He is also external Legal Advisor to the Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands, Member of the Permanent

Court of Arbitration, Member of the Institut de Droit International and Member of the Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences. Between 2014 and 2017 he was President of the European Society of International Law. He is editor-in-chief of *International Law in Domestic Court*.

Niels Petersen is Professor of Law at the University of Münster since 2015. He holds a PhD in law from Goethe University in Frankfurt and an MA in Quantitative Methods from Columbia University. He was a research fellow at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law from 2004 to 2006, and a postdoctoral research fellow at the Max Planck Institute for Research on Collective Goods from 2007 to 2014. He visited at NYU School of Law as doctoral researcher in 2006–2007 and as Hauser Research Scholar in 2012–2013, and was Visiting Professor at the University of Auckland in 2017–2018.

Francisca Pou Giménez is Professor of Law at ITAM Law School in Mexico City, where she teaches Constitutional Law and Comparative Constitutional Law. She holds degrees from Pompeu Fabra University (LLB) and Yale Law School (Master and Doctorate). Before joining ITAM, she clerked for Justice Cossío in the Mexican Supreme Court. Her work focuses on judicial review, the relations between institutional design and performance in the judiciary, Latin American constitutionalism, constitutional change and fundamental rights. In this last domain, she has particularly addressed comparative normative discussions, mechanisms of rights protection and the relations between internal and external sources of rights. She is a member of Mexico's National Research System (Level I) and of several Latin American research networks.

Ikboljon Qoraboyev is Senior Lecturer in International Relations at KAZGUU University in Astana, Kazakhstan, where he teaches undergraduate and graduate courses in the disciplines of International Law and International Relations. Prior to that, he acquired teaching and research experience in Belgium, France and Turkey. He holds a PhD in Public International Law from the University of Toulouse 1 Capitole and obtained his LLM in International Law (2002) and LLM in European Law (2004) degrees from the University of Montpellier I in France. His research interests cover international law, international organizations and comparative regionalism with a particular focus on post-Soviet space, Central Asia and Turkey.

Raphaële Rivier is Professor of Law at the Sorbonne Law School in Paris (France) and a member of the Council of the Sorbonne Law School. She has published in the fields of International General Law, Settlement of International Disputes, International Organizations Law and relationships between International Law and Domestic Systems and Investment Law. She is the author of a treaty of International Law published by the Presses Universitaires de France (PUF). She belongs to the Editing Committee of the *Revue générale de droit international public* and supervises its 'Chronique de jurisprudence étrangère intéressant le droit

international'. She also served as attorney ('chargée de mission') at the Directorate of Legal Affairs of the French Ministry of Foreign Affairs. She is currently a legal adviser before national courts, international tribunals and investment arbitral tribunals.

Alejandro Rodiles is Associate Professor of International Law and Global Governance at ITAM School of Law, in Mexico City. He earned his law degree from UNAM and finished his PhD (*summa cum laude*) at Humboldt University in Berlin. In June 2016, he received the Faculty Prize of Humboldt University Faculty of Law for his dissertation, and he became a member of Mexico's National Research System (Level 1). In 2018, he has been awarded with the Newton Mobility Grant from the British Academy for conducting a joint research project with Kent University School of Law on contemporary counter-terrorism work. He is the author of *Coalitions of the Willing and International Law – The Interplay between Formality and Informality* (CUP, 2018).

Pierfrancesco Rossi is a postdoctoral research fellow at the University of Naples Federico II, from which he holds a Law degree (*cum laude*, 2014) and a PhD (2018). His current research interests include state immunities, the relationship between international law and domestic law and China's approach to international law. On this last topic he published 'Implementation of International Law in the Legal System of the People's Republic of China' (*Rivista di diritto internazionale*, 2016, in Italian).

Yuval Shany Professor Yuval Shany is the Hersch Lauterpacht Chair in International Law and former Dean of the Law Faculty of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. He also currently serves as Vice President for Research at the Israel Democracy Institute, and as a member of the UN Human Rights Committee. He received his LLB *cum laude* from the Hebrew University, LLM from New York University and PhD in international law from the University of London.

Vinai Kumar Singh The author presently is Deputy Director and Senior Assistant Professor at the Indian Society of International Law (ISIL). He is Assistant Editor of the *Indian Journal of International Law* (IJIL) and *ISIL Yearbook of International Humanitarian and Refugee Law*. Presently serving Editorial Board Member of the 'Ius Novum' published by the Lazarski University in Warsaw. He completed his MPhil from Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi, and LLM from Delhi University, Delhi. Also heading the ICRC Centre for IHL established at the ISIL by the ICRC, New Delhi.

David L. Sloss is the John A. and Elizabeth H. Sutro Professor of Law at Santa Clara University School of Law. He is the author of *The Death of Treaty Supremacy: An Invisible Constitutional Change* (2016), co-editor of *International Law in the U.S. Supreme Court: Continuity and Change* (2011) and editor of *The Role of Domestic*

Courts in Treaty Enforcement: A Comparative Study (2009). The two most recent books received book awards from the American Society of International Law. Sloss has published numerous articles on US foreign affairs law and the judicial enforcement of treaties in domestic courts.

Maria Smirnova has a PhD in Russian Constitutional Law from Russian Academy of Jurisprudence and an LLM in International Human Rights Law from the University of Exeter. She is an Honorary Research Fellow at Manchester International Law Centre, where she works on the interaction between international human rights norms and legal and political transformation in Russia. As a member of the European Association for Education Law and Policy, she conducts high-impact research on different aspects of national and comparative educational legislation and policy with subsequent implementation. She is a member of the drafting committee for UN Guiding Principles on state obligations regarding private involvement in education.

Ewan Smith is the Shaw Foundation Junior Research Fellow at Jesus College, Oxford. He is an associate at the Bonavero Institute for Human Rights, the Programme for the Foundations of Law and Constitutional Government and the Oxford University China Centre. He read law at Brasenose College and the University of Paris (BA) and at Harvard Law School (LLM). He has previously worked at SOAS, and at Peking, Tsinghua and Renmin Universities in China. He is admitted to practice in New York, where he worked for Debevoise and Plimpton LLP. Before returning to Oxford, he spent ten years at the Foreign and Commonwealth Office.

Emre Turkut (LLM) is a doctoral researcher at Ghent University, Belgium, and a member of the Ghent Rolin-Jaequemyns International Law Institute (GRILI). He holds an LLM degree in Public International Law from the University of Kent, UK. Before joining Ghent University, he held a teaching/research position in Turkey. Emre's research covers a variety of fields within the domain of public international law and international human rights law, including derogation from human rights, state of emergency, human rights in the fight against terrorism, self-determination and remedial secession doctrine. He is currently a doctoral visiting researcher at Uppsala University funded by the Swedish Institute.

Antonios Tzanakopoulos is Associate Professor of Public International Law at the University of Oxford and Fellow of St Anne's College. He is also the Secretary-General of the International Law Association. He practices from Three Stone Chambers in London.

Rosanne van Alebeek is Assistant Professor of International Law at the University of Amsterdam. She teaches courses on general international law and human rights law. Her main research interests include the law of state immunity, the immunity of state

officials and the role of national courts in the application and development of these rules.

Hannah Woolaver is Senior Lecturer in Public International Law at the Law Faculty of the University of Cape Town. Her research and teaching interests lie in public international law, with a particular research focus on the relationship between international law and domestic law, the law on the use of force and international criminal law. Prior to joining the UCT Law Faculty in 2012, she completed her PhD in international law at the University of Cambridge, her BCL at the University of Oxford and LLB at the University of Durham. Dr Woolaver is currently a Visiting Professor at the Faculty of Law, University of New South Wales, Australia, and has previously been a Visiting Scholar at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.

Hajime Yamamoto is Vice Dean and a full professor at Keio University Law School in Tokyo. He holds an LLD in constitutional law from the University of Tokyo, where he also earned an LLM. He has published a number of books and articles on constitutional law issues such as history and theory of French constitutional law and Japanese constitutional theory. Yamamoto has taught at Niigata University (1992–2002, Japan) and Tohoku University (2002–2008, Japan), and has been a visiting professor at the University of Lyon II (France), University of Montpellier I (France), University of Rennes I (France), University of Nice (France), Sciences-Po Paris and University of Paris II.

Acknowledgements

The original project behind this book was conceived together with Prof. Benedetto Conforti, unquestionably one of the most influential Italian scholars of international law who has ever lived. When he passed away in 2016, he left an unbridgeable gap in all those he directly or indirectly trained over the years, always with an unusual passion and generosity. I had the fortune to be one of them and cannot thank him enough: without his initial encouragement and enthusiasm, this book would never have seen the light of day. I am also much indebted to my friends and colleagues Daniele Amoroso and Pierfrancesco Rossi; in addition to authoring two chapters, they read the whole volume and provided their invaluable expertise on a daily basis. Giulia Ciliberto, Donato Greco, Roberto Ruoppo, Alessandro Stiano and Giovanni Zarra offered precious help during the editing and proofreading of the final version of the volume. I would also like to acknowledge the tremendous support received from the team at Cambridge University Press, in particular Finola O'Sullivan and Tom Randall. Last but not least, I thank all the colleagues who agreed to take part in this project, making its realization feasible.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47526-6 — Duelling for Supremacy
Edited by Fulvio Maria Palombino
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
