### The Political Economy of Health and Healthcare

The healthcare sector is one of the fastest growing areas of social and public spending worldwide, and it is expected to increase its government shares of GDP in the near future. Truly global in its scope, this book presents a unified, structured understanding of how the design of a country's health institutions influence its healthcare activities and outcomes. Building on the 'public choice' tradition in political economy, the authors explore how patient-citizens interact with their country's political institutions to determine the organisation of the health system. The book discusses a number of institutional influences of a health system, such as federalism, the nature of collective action, electoral competition, constitutional designs, political ideologies, the welfare effects of corruption and lobbying and, more generally, the dynamics of change. Whilst drawing on the theoretical concepts of political economy, this book describes an institutiongrounded analysis of health systems in an accessible way. We hope it will appeal to both undergraduate and graduate students studying health economics, health policy and public policy. More generally, it can help health policy community to structure ideas about policy and institutional reform.

JOAN COSTA-FONT is an associate professor of the Department of Health Policy, at the London School of Economics and Political Science. He is a research fellow of IZA and CESIfo and has been Harkness Fellow at Harvard University and Visiting Fellow at Paris Dauphine University, UCL, Boston College, Oxford University, amongst other universities.

GILBERTO TURATI is a professor of Public Finance at the Department of Economics and Finance at the Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore. He was Board Member of the European Public Choice Society (2012-2015) and is currently a Board Member of the Italian Society of Public Economics.

> ALBERTO BATINTI is an associate professor of Economics at the International Business School Suzhou – Xi'an Jiaotong-Liverpool University and External Fellow at the Center for Health Economics at the University of Nottingham Ningbo China. He has published research papers in peer-reviewed academic journals as *Public Choice, The European Journal of Political Economy, Kyklos,* and *Health Economics.*

# The Political Economy of Health and Healthcare

The Rise of the Patient Citizen

JOAN COSTA-FONT London School of Economics and Political Science

GILBERTO TURATI Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore

ALBERTO BATINTI Xi'an Jiaotong-Liverpool University





### **CAMBRIDGE** UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108474979 DOI: 10.1017/9781108653015

© Joan Costa-Font, Gilberto Turati and Alberto Batinti 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Costa-Font, Joan, author. | Turati, Gilberto, 1971– author. | Batinti, Alberto, 1978– author.

Title: The political economy of health and healthcare : the rise of the patient citizen / Joan Costa-Font, Gilberto Turati, Alberto Batinti.

Description: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019045595 (print) | LCCN 2019045596 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108474979 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108468251 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108653015 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Medical policy. | Health systems agencies–Political aspects. | Health services administration–Political aspects. | Medical economics.

Classification: LCC RA393 .C682 2020 (print) | LCC RA393 (ebook) | DDC 362.1–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019045595

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019045596

ISBN 978-1-108-47497-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-46825-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

	List of Figures	page viii
	List of Tables	x
	Preface	xi
	PART I POLITICAL INCENTIVES IN	
	HEALTHCARE SYSTEMS	1
1	The Political Design of Health Systems	3
	Government and Healthcare	3
	Government Intervention and the Health System	9
	From Market Failure to Government Failure in Healthcare	21
	The Rise of the 'Patient Citizen'	22
	The Motivation of Political Decisions	24
	The Book's Road Map	26
	PART II THE POLITICAL CONTEXTS OF	
	HEALTHCARE POLICIES	33
2	The Multilevel Nature of Healthcare Governance	35
	The Purpose of Healthcare Governance	35
	Why Do Countries Decentralise Their Health System?	37
	The Fiscal and Political Space	39
	Institutional Imbalances	42
	Challenges	47
	Summary	51
3	'Collective Action' and Global Healthcare	53
	Global Collective Action	53
	Globalisation as a New Challenge	57
	Global Public Health Needs	62

v

vi contents

	Global Health Governance	66
	Professional and Patient Mobility	68
	Does the Patient Citizen Gain from Globalisation?	71
	Summary	73
	PART III POLITICAL INSTITUTIONS	
	AND HEALTH	75
4	Constitutional Health System Design	77
	Constitutions and Healthcare	77
	The Constitutional Right to Health	78
	Constitutional Trade-offs and Veto Points	81
	The Allocation of Power-Sharing	84
	Electoral Competition	85
	Veto Players and Agenda-Setting	89
	Summary	90
5	Democracy and the Patient Citizen	91
	Why Does Democracy Matter?	91
	Is There a Health Dividend of Democracies?	93
	Mechanisms and Mediating Factors	97
	What Does the Evidence Tell Us?	101
	Effects on Health Inequality	105
	Summary	106
6	Theory of Political Markets in Healthcare	108
	Political Markets	108
	The Political Demand for Healthcare	111
	The Median Voter Explanation	112
	Extensions Involving Healthcare Supply	117
	The 'Ends against the Middle' Explanation	119
	Recent Contributions and Extensions	121
	Gerotocracy and Middle-Class Capture	124
	Summary	124

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-47497-9 — The Political Economy of Health and Healthcare Joan Costa-Font , Gilberto Turati , Alberto Batinti Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

		CONTENTS	vii
7	Ideology and Healthcare	126	
	Do Healthcare Ideas Matter?	126	
	'Left' and 'Right' Health Policy	127	
	Beliefs and the Demand Side	129	
	The Role of the Media	133	
	The Political Cycle and Healthcare	136	
	Summary	138	
	PART IV POLITICAL ALLOCATION IN		
	HEALTHCARE	139	
8	Healthcare Waste and Corruption	141	
	Waste and Its Sources	141	
	Explaining 'Red Tape'	143	
	Sources of Inefficiencies and Measurement	151	
	Characterising Corruption	153	
	What Are the Consequences of Corruption?	158	
	Summary	159	
9	Interest Groups and Health Policy	161	
	Interest Groups in Healthcare	161	
	Regulatory Capture	164	
	Lobbying and Rent-Seeking in Healthcare	172	
	Summary	173	
10	Political Sustainability of Health Innovation	176	
	The Political Value of Innovation	176	
	Political Drivers of Health Technology	182	
	Summary	188	
	Bibliography	190	
	Index	216	

# Figures

1.1	Health expenditure to GDP (HExpToGDP) correlated	
	with per capita GDP (GdpPc) (average 1995–2015)	page 4
1.2	Public health expenditure to total health expenditures	
	(PubHExpToHExp) correlated with per capita GDP	
	(GdpPc) (average 1995–2015)	5
1.3	Public health expenditure (PubHExpToHExp) to total	
	government expenditures correlated with per capita	
	GDP (GdpPc) (average 1995–2015)	6
1.4	Defining healthcare systems	10
1.5	Public funding and universal health coverage (UHC)	14
1.6	Public funding and out-of-pocket expenditures	16
1.7	Percentage of adults without insurance (1960–2015)	19
1.8	The questions the book attempts to address	27
2.1	Decentralisation and total health spending per capita	43
3.1	Globalisation index and health expenditures	59
4.1	Total (right) and public (left) health spending and the	
	electoral system: proportional representation versus	
	plurality	86
4.2	Total (right) and public (left) health spending and the	
	political system: presidential versus parliamentary	87
4.3	Total (right) and public (left) health spending and 'high	l'
	versus 'low' veto power	89
5.1	Spread of democracy (% of countries) across the world	
	(1960–2015)	95
5.2	Dynamics of health differentials between democracies	
	and non-democracies	96
6.1	Responsibility for health insurance – government	
	responsibility role	109
8.1	The net of corruption in healthcare systems	154

viii

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-47497-9 — The Political Economy of Health and Healthcare Joan Costa-Font , Gilberto Turati , Alberto Batinti Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

#### list of figures ix

8.2	How corruption emerges	158
10.1	Correlations between health spending (total and public)	
	and health technology diffusion: Computed Tomography	
	Scan (CTS, top panels), and Magnetic Resonance	
	Imaging (MRI, bottom panels)	179
10.2	'Excess' total health spending	180

# Tables

1.1	Healthcare financing in some sub-Saharan	
	countries	page 11
1.2	The demand and supply of health policies and	
	institutions	29
3.1	Categorisation of incentive structures depending on	
	the types of healthcare and disease	54
3.2	Share (%) of foreign doctors and nurses in selected	
	OECD countries	70
6.1	Shares of government spending by function of	
	government (COFOG classification)	113
6.2	Composition of public healthcare spending	118
6.3	Composition of household health spending	120
8.1	Estimates of annual US healthcare waste	145

# Preface

With the proliferation of academic journals and the increased importance attributed to research papers for academic careers, the tradition of writing book manuscripts has become less popular in social sciences. However, there still is a point in writing a book. Namely, to provide an 'unified overview' of a specific field of research. This is especially the case when the research produced in several disciplines, has set the foundations of an independent field of study which can be labelled as the 'political economy of health and healthcare'. Increasingly, scholars of different disciplines such as economics, politics, sociology and health sciences, among others, have produced a wealth of knowledge on how political institutions and processes influence the dynamics and performance of health systems. Most of these contributions, however, tend to be scattered, and often fail to communicate with each other when they probably should, for the discipline to continue advancing. The purpose of this book is to build a bridge between disciplines and help contribute to a unified perspective.

Our point of departure and cornerstone is that of designing a health system that attempts to improve the welfare of a 'patient citizen' (PC), which is the agent we focus our attention on. The PC is subject to at least two agency relationships which constrain its behaviour. First, as is typically acknowledged by health economists, citizens are (either current or potential) patients who engage in an agency relationship where a doctor acts as their advisor helping them navigate the health system and identify their healthcare demands. Second, in democratic states, with some statutory health insurance citizens have typically a constitutionally defined right to healthcare, pay mandatory taxes and other insurance contributions to help fund the health system. However, they also contribute with their votes to elect the representatives who will decide on their behalf with regards to

xi

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-47497-9 — The Political Economy of Health and Healthcare Joan Costa-Font , Gilberto Turati , Alberto Batinti Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

### XII PREFACE

health policy matters, including the organisation, financing and regulation of public and private health services. Government actions influence how much households pay for healthcare, whether they vaccinate their children at the right time and how many barriers they face in having access to healthcare services.

Although the health sector is one of the most dynamic areas of institutional reform, we still lack a 'unified' approach to examine health reforms that explicitly considers the role of political motivations in changing behaviour. To date, barely any book provides such a comprehensive overview of the role of political incentives in the functioning of health systems, that engages with wider and heterogeneous audiences. Although all the authors of this book are economists by training, we attempt to reach out beyond our discipline, and have done our best to avoid the use of equations and jargon. To that purpose, we have focused on describing general principles and empirical regularities rather than exploring in depth modelling and econometric applications. Intentionally, some of the evidence presented is descriptive, but we hope it can stimulate discussion on the matters examined, such as the role of democracies on health systems development, or the influence of a median voter, or whether a coalition of the 'ends against the middle' influences policy choices. It is worth mentioning that the book contains numerous citations for anyone interested in delving more deeply into each aspect discussed.

Much of the developments in the field of health economics has traditionally ignored the developments in political economy, and instead takes institutions as exogeneous, and has centred around the principles of welfare economics or policy analysis. In contrast, here we are interested in the endogenous nature of policies and institutions, and we do not necessarily assume the existence of a planner, or a social welfare function. On the other hand, political science and sociological research in health does not attempt to engage with economists either, and the litertaure, to date tends to be very United States (US) centred. Finally, health research adopts a

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-47497-9 — The Political Economy of Health and Healthcare Joan Costa-Font , Gilberto Turati , Alberto Batinti Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

preface xiii

more pragmatic and empirical perspective, and often lacks the theoretical grounding that is typically developed by social science disciplines. This book can help to lay out some conceptual understanding of how to examine health reforms. For instance, we will attempt to identify under which circumstances lobbying benefits the patient citizen, and hence is welfare improving; or how different types of regulatory 'capture' lead to government failure; or the extent to which a country that engages with corruption will end up wasting important resources in the health system.

Inevitably, in writing a book with such a vast remit, we had to make some tough choices. First, we decided to employ rational choice institutionalism as a framework, that is, we ground most of our analysis with the public choice tradition of institutional study. However, we do not disregard the study of processes let alone the role of the historical evolution of institutions, nor the rules of the game in a society. When possible, we acknowledge that strategies and behaviours are context specific. Similarly, we explicitly consider explicitly the role of ideas and ideologies in framing health policy decisions. Second, we have mainly focused on those questions where there is already some research, often opting out of aspects that are not yet well researched or venturing to answer some questions tentatively. This has allowed us to identify areas for further research, which we plan to contribute ourselves in the future, and we encourage others to join us in the endeavour. Third, there have been important aspects such as the study of 'bureaucracies in healthcare' or the 'interactions of public and private healthcare' that could have deserved a full chapter, but this would have made the project 'never-ending'.

In deciding which matters to focus on, we have chosen what in our view are the most critical contributions in the field, and hence the book structure choosen is inevitably biased. However, this book is written to be a 'first edition', and we hope that soon we will write a new one that addresses some of the aspects on which we could not devote more space to this time around. In some circumstances we had the feeling of trying to hit a moving target, which just signals the great

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-47497-9 — The Political Economy of Health and Healthcare Joan Costa-Font , Gilberto Turati , Alberto Batinti Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

### XIV PREFACE

interest and attention that researchers in growing numbers around the world are paying to these topics.

The authors' order reflects their leading role in steering the book project, as well as historical additions to the project. While we consider this work a joint effort, Costa-Font took the lead on a first draft of Chapters 2, 3, 4 and 9, Turati on Chapters 1, 7 and 8, Batinti on Chapters 5, 6 and 10. All chapters have been co-written, and discussed at length.

This book could not have been possible without the encouragement of Roger Congleton, Adam Oliver, Alistair McGuire and the support of the Department of Health policy at the London School of Economics (LSE). We are very grateful to Jacob Lang for the enormous effort devoted to helping us with editing, putting it together and turning it into a coherent piece, as well as friends at the Cambridge University Press office, especially Phil Good and Tobias Ginsberg. We also thank three anonymous external reviewers for very valuable comments which helped us improve the book. We are indebted to the participants to the European Public Choice Society (EPCS) meeting in Cambridge, back in 2014, where we had the chance to discuss a number of matters around the political economy of health. To our knowledge, this was one of the very first dedicated sessions on the topic, and surely the place where the seed of this book was planted. Since then, almost every year, EPCS and American Public Choice Society (PCS) meetings have progressively included parallel sessions on health and healthcare. We see the interest in the political economy of health and healthcare as an upward trend as public health budgets are becoming increasing shares of government activities around the world, and not only in high income countries.

We hope you, the reader, enjoy the content of the book, which only attempts to make a first step towards the development of a fruitful area of interdisciplinary analysis of health policy and healthcare institutions. After all, all of us really are patient citizens looking for the best organisation of the healthcare systems in our countries.