Social Mobility and Education in Britain

Building upon extensive research into modern British society, this book traces out trends in social mobility and their relation to educational inequalities, with surprising results. Contrary to what is widely supposed, Bukodi and Goldthorpe’s findings show there has been no overall decline in social mobility – though downward mobility is tending to rise and upward mobility to fall – and Britain is not a distinctively low mobility society. However, the inequalities of mobility chances among individuals, in relation to their social origins, have not been reduced and remain in some respects extreme. Exposing the widespread misconceptions that prevail in political and policy circles, this book shows that educational policy alone cannot break the link between inequality of condition and inequality of opportunity. It will appeal to students, researchers, policy makers, and anyone interested in the issues surrounding social inequality, social mobility and education.

Erzsébet Bukodi is an Associate Professor in Quantitative Social Policy and Professorial Fellow of Nuffield College, Oxford. She is also a Senior Research Fellow at the Institute for New Economic Thinking, The Oxford Martin School.

John H. Goldthorpe is an Emeritus Fellow of Nuffield College Oxford, a Fellow of the British Academy, a Member of the Royal Swedish Academy of Sciences, and an Honorary Fellow of the Royal Statistical Society. He has written extensively on social class and social mobility since the 1960s.
Social Mobility and Education in Britain

Research, Politics and Policy

ERZSÉBET BUKODI
University of Oxford

JOHN H. GOLDSWORTHY
University of Oxford
Contents

List of Figures
List of Tables
Acknowledgements

Introduction 1

1 Social Class as the Context of Social Mobility 13
2 Class Mobility in Absolute Terms: The End of the Golden Age 34
3 Class Mobility in Relative Terms: Resistance to Change 52
4 The Pattern of Social Fluidity within the Class Structure: Hierarchy, Inheritance and Status Effects 71
5 Education and Social Mobility: The OED Triangle 90
7 Education and the Labour Market: Is Education Now Class Destiny? 128
8 Origins versus Education: Are there ‘Glass Floors’ and ‘Glass Ceilings’? 152
9 Lifelong Learning: Compensation or Cumulative Advantage? 169
10 Social Mobility in Britain in Comparative Perspective: Is Britain a Low Mobility Society? 188

Conclusions 207

References 225
Index 240
Figures

1.1 Derivation of NS-SEC, 7-class version  page 21
1.2 Relative risk of being unemployed by class position of last employment, Class 1 as reference, with 95% confidence intervals  25
1.3 Variable components of average gross weekly earnings, men in full-time employment  27
1.4 Median gross weekly earnings by social class and age, full-time male employees  28
1.5 Median gross weekly earnings by social class and age, full-time female employees  29
1.6 Household median net financial wealth by social class and age of head of household  30
1.7 Age-standardised mortality rates per 100,000 population aged 25 to 64 by social class, England and Wales, 2008–10  32
2.1 Class distributions (%) of economically active population, 1951–2011  36
2.2 Total mobility rates and upward and downward components, men born 1908–1947, interviewed in 1972  38
2.3 Total mobility rate and upward and downward components, men born in 1946, 1958 and 1970 at ages 27 and 38, and born 1980–4 at age 27  40
2.4 Total mobility rate and upward and downward components, women born in 1946, 1958 and 1970 at ages 27 and 38, and born 1980–4 at age 27  42
3.1 UNIDIFF parameters for 1946, 1958 and 1970 cohorts, men at age 38, with 95% confidence intervals  59
3.2 UNIDIFF parameters for 1946, 1958 and 1970 cohorts, women at age 38, with 95% confidence intervals  60
List of Figures

4.1 Hierarchy, inheritance and status affinity effects, men and women ‘full-timers’ 79
4.2 Symmetrical odds ratios under the topological model for men and women ‘full-timers’ 81
5.1 The OED triangle: requirements for education to create greater social fluidity 91
5.2 The OED triangle: typical results from sociological research 93
5.3 Association between class of origin and level of qualification by cohort: UNIDIFF parameters with 95% confidence intervals 99
5.4 Association between level of qualification and class of destination by cohort: UNIDIFF parameters with 95% confidence intervals 100
6.1 Estimated probabilities (%) of attaining upper secondary or higher level of qualification by parental group, cognitive ability quintile and cohort 117
6.2 Estimated probabilities (%) of attaining degree-level qualification by parental group, cognitive ability quintile and cohort 120
7.1 Illustrative cases of costs of matching class sequences 132
7.2 Distribution (%) of class trajectory types across cohorts, men 140
7.3 Distribution (%) of class trajectory types across cohorts, women 141
8.1 Estimated probabilities of men working full-time being found in different class positions at age 38 by parental class (left panel) and parental groups defined by class, status and education (right panel), by level of qualification at labour market entry (%) 158
9.1 Estimated probability of attaining further qualifications by class of origin and age, men 174
9.2 Estimated probability of attaining further qualifications by class of origin and age, women 175
9.3 Estimated probability of men moving up to Class 1 in the course of their working lives by class of origin and age, for men obtaining or not obtaining new academic qualifications in past three years 181
List of Figures

9.4 Estimated probability of women moving up to Classes 1 and 2 in the course of their working lives by class of origin and age, for women obtaining or not obtaining new academic qualifications in past three years 182

10.1 Total mobility rate (%), with 95% confidence interval, by country, men aged 25–64 194

10.2 Total mobility rate (%), with 95% confidence interval, by country, women aged 25–64, in full-time employment 195

10.3 Ratio of upward mobility to downward mobility by country, men aged 25–64 197

10.4 Ratio of upward mobility to downward mobility by country, women aged 25–64, in full-time employment 198

10.5 Country differences in relative rates of social mobility, men aged 25–64 201

10.6 Country differences in relative rates of social mobility, women aged 25–64, in full-time employment 202
Tables

1.1 NS-SEC 7-class version and representative occupations page 22
3.1 The odds ratio for Omega 53
3.2 Class mobility in Omega; results from three successive surveys 54
4.1 Hierarchy effects for the 7 x 7 mobility table 73
4.2 Inheritance effects for the 7 x 7 mobility table 75
4.3 Status affinity effects for the 7 x 7 mobility table 76
5.1 Distribution (%) of male cohort members by highest level of educational qualification (absolute measure) 96
5.2 Collapses of eight categories of educational qualifications to produce relative levels 97
6.1 Effects of cognitive ability and of parental class, status and education on the probability of attaining two educational thresholds 112
6.2 Composition of parental groups and distribution across cohorts 116
7.1 Typology of class trajectories, men 136
7.2 Typology of class trajectories, women 138
7.3 Effects of relative level of qualification at labour market entry, class of origin and cognitive ability on probability of following different types of class trajectory, men 144
7.4 Effects of relative level of qualification at labour market entry, class of origin and cognitive ability on probability of following different types of class trajectory, women 145
8.1 Effects of social origins and of change in relative level of qualification on class position at age 38, by relative level of qualification at labour market entry 155
8.2 Effects of cognitive ability, locus of control, parental help, change in relative level of qualification and social origins on class position at age 38, by relative level of qualification at labour market entry  162

9.1 Effect of class of origin on the probability of obtaining further qualifications  172

9.2 Effect of further qualifications on the probability of upward and downward worklife mobility, men  178

9.3 Effect of further qualifications on the probability of upward and downward worklife mobility, women  179
Acknowledgements

The research on which our book is primarily based derives from the following projects, for each of which Erzsébet Bukodi was principal investigator: ‘The Role of Education in Intergenerational Social Mobility’, supported by the Economic and Social Research Council, grant ES/1038187/1; ‘Social Origins, Cognitive Ability and Educational Attainment: A Life-Course Perspective’, supported by the Nuffield Foundation, grant EDU/42195; and ‘Social Inequalities in Education in Historical and Comparative Perspective: The Changing Effects of Different Components of Social Origins’, supported by the Oxford University Press John Fell Research Fund, grant 122/673. We are duly grateful to the funding bodies that made our research possible. The projects were based in the Department of Social Policy and Intervention, University of Oxford, and we wish to acknowledge the support of the Department and, especially, the help of the Finance and Research Administration in ensuring that the projects ran smoothly.

In addition, the research reported on in Chapter 10 resulted from Erzsébet Bukodi’s participation in the Employment, Equity and Growth Programme at the Oxford Martin School Institute for New Economic Thinking, supported by the Resolution Foundation and directed by Professor Brian Nolan, whom we wish to thank for his valuable co-operation.

We are both fortunate to be Fellows of Nuffield College, Oxford, and we have benefited greatly from the research allowances made to us by the College, from the excellent services of its library and IT staff, and from the enriching intellectual and social environment that the College provides.

Finally, we would wish to acknowledge, with our warmest thanks, the contributions of the following colleagues who at various times were members of the research teams working on the several projects: Bastian Betthäuser, Mollie Bourne, Ferdinand Eibl, Heather Joshi, Magda Karyda, Jouni Kuha, Marii Paskov, Nhat An Trinh and Lorraine
Acknowledgements

Waller. Other colleagues who significantly contributed to the research and in co-authoring papers were Robert Erikson, Alexi Gugushvili and Brendan Halpin. And we also received helpful information, advice and commentary from – among others whom we may have regretfully forgotten – Richard Breen, Tak-Wing Chan, David Cox, Geoff Evans, Duncan Gallie, Colin Mills, Madeline Nightingale and Brian Nolan.