

EXPERIMENTS IN INTERNATIONAL ADJUDICATION

The history of international adjudication is all too often presented as a triumphalist narrative of normative and institutional progress that casts aside its uncomfortable memories, its darker legacies and its historical failures. In this narrative, the bulk of 'trials' and 'errors' is left in the dark, confined to oblivion or left for erudition to recall as a curiosity. Written by an interdisciplinary group of lawyers, historians and social scientists, this volume relies on the rich and largely unexplored archive of institutional and legal experimentation since the late nineteenth century to shed new light on the history of international adjudication. It combines contextual accounts of failed, or aborted, as well as of 'successful' experiments to clarify our understanding of the past and present of international adjudication.

IGNACIO DE LA RASILLA is the Han Depei Professor of International Law at the Wuhan University Institute of International Law in China. He was educated in Spain (LLB, U. Complutense, Madrid), Switzerland (MA and PhD, The Graduate Institute, Geneva), the United States of America (LLM, Harvard) and Northern Italy (Max Weber Fellow, EUI, Florence). Previously he served as lecturer and then as senior lecturer in law at Brunel University London and adjunct professor at NYU-La Pietra. He is the author of around 60 journal articles and book chapters, and the author or editor of five books on international law and its history, including *In the Shadow of Vitoria: A History of International Law in Spain, 1770–1953*.

JORGE E. VIÑUALES is the Harold Samuel Professor of Law and Environmental Policy at the University of Cambridge, where he founded the Cambridge Centre for Environment, Energy and Natural Resource Governance (C-EENRG). He is also the chairman of the Compliance Committee of the UN-ECE/WHO-Europe Protocol on Water and Health, a member of the Panel of Arbitrators of the Shanghai International Arbitration Centre, the Director-General of the Latin American Society of International Law, and an Of Counsel with Lalive. Prior to joining Cambridge, he was the Pictet Chair of International Environmental Law at the Graduate Institute, Geneva, where he keeps a limited affiliation as Adjunct Professor of Public International Law.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47494-8 — Experiments in International Adjudication
Edited by Ignacio de la Rasilla , Jorge E. Viñuales
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Experiments in International Adjudication

HISTORICAL ACCOUNTS

Edited by

IGNACIO DE LA RASILLA

Wuhan University, Institute of International Law (China)

JORGE E. VIÑUALES

University of Cambridge



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-47494-8 — Experiments in International Adjudication
 Edited by Ignacio de la Rasilla, Jorge E. Viñuales
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
 It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
 education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108474948
 DOI: 10.1017/9781108565967

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Rasilla, Ignacio de la, editor. | Viñuales, Jorge E., editor.

TITLE: Experiments in international adjudication : historical accounts / edited by
 Ignacio de La Rasilla, Wuhan University, Institute of International Law (China); Jorge E. Viñuales,
 University of Cambridge.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge [UK] ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2019. |
 Includes index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018045885 | ISBN 9781108474948 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108468176 (pbk.)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Arbitration (International law)—History. | International courts—History. |
 Jurisdiction (International law)—History.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KZ6115 .E97 2019 | DDC 341.5/22—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018045885>

ISBN 978-1-108-47494-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy
 of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication
 and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
 accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
Introduction	1
<i>Ignacio de la Rasilla and Jorge E. Viñuales</i>	
PART I INTERNATIONAL ADJUDICATION: AN EVER-PRESENT HISTORY	9
1 Experiments in International Adjudication: Past and Present	11
<i>Jorge E. Viñuales</i>	
2 The Turn to the History of International Adjudication	32
<i>Ignacio de la Rasilla</i>	
PART II EXPERIMENTS IN DISPUTE-SPECIFIC ADJUDICATION	53
3 Imperial Consolidation through Arbitration: Territorial and Boundary Disputes in Africa (1870–1914)	55
<i>Inge van Hulle</i>	
4 How to Prevent a War and Alienate Lawyers: The Peculiar Case of the 1905 North Sea Incident Commission	76
<i>Jan Martin Lemnitzer</i>	
5 The Arbitral Tribunal for Upper Silesia: An Early Success in International Adjudication	98
<i>Gerard Conway</i>	

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
	PART III CONTEXT-SPECIFIC REDRESS MECHANISMS	125
6	Mixed Claim Commissions and the Once Centrality of the Protection of Aliens <i>Frédéric Mégret</i>	127
7	The General Claims Commission (Mexico/US) and the Invention of International Responsibility <i>Jean d'Aspremont</i>	150
8	Mirage in the Desert: Regional Judicialization in the Arab World <i>Cesare P. R. Romano</i>	169
	PART IV THE QUEST FOR A PERMANENT COURT	191
9	Saving Face: The Political Work of the Permanent Court of Arbitration (1902–1914) <i>Andrei Mamolea</i>	193
10	First to Rise and First to Fall: The Court of Cartago (1907–1918) <i>Freya Baetens</i>	211
11	The Failure of the 1930 Tribunal of the British Commonwealth of Nations: A Conflict between International and Constitutional Law <i>Donal K. Coffey</i>	240
	PART V EXPERIMENTS IN SPECIALISED COURTS	261
12	The Intellectual Foundations of the European Court of Human Rights <i>Angelo Jr Golia and Ludovic Hennebel</i>	263
13	From International Law to a Constitutionalist Dream? The History of European Law and the European Court of Justice (1950–1993) <i>Morten Rasmussen</i>	287
	Index	313

Contributors

Freya Baetens (Cand. Jur./Lic. Jur. (Ghent); LLM (Columbia); PhD (Cambridge)) is a professor of public international law at the PluriCourts Centre (Faculty of Law, Oslo University), working on an interdisciplinary research project evaluating the legitimacy of international courts and tribunals. She is also affiliated with the Europa Institute (Faculty of Law, Leiden University). As a member of the Brussels Bar, she acts as counsel or expert in international and European disputes. She is specialised in the law of treaties, responsibility of states and international organisations, law of the sea, WTO and investment law, energy law and sustainable development.

Donal K. Coffey LLB (Dub), PhD (UCD) is a Senior Research Fellow at the Max Planck Institute for European Legal History in Frankfurt am Main. Previously, he was a lecturer in the University of Portsmouth and the University of Surrey. He has published two volumes on Irish constitutional history, *Constitutionalism in Ireland, 1932–1938* (2018) and *Drafting the Irish Constitution, 1935–1937* (2018). His more recent work has looked at the constitutional legal history of the British Empire in the inter-war period, and has been published in, amongst other places, the *Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* and the *Journal of Legal History*.

Gerard Conway (BA (Limerick), BL (King's Inns), M.Juris (Uppsala), PhD (Brunel)), is a senior lecturer in law at Brunel University London. His research is in the areas of legal reasoning, constitutional law of the EU, comparative public law, and European and international criminal law, and he is author of *The Limits of Legal Reasoning and the European Court of Justice* (2012) and of *EU Law* (2015) and of articles in European and international law journals. He is a member of the editorial board of the *New Journal of European Criminal Law* and associate editor of the *Asian Yearbook of Human Rights and Humanitarian Law*, a contact point for Ireland of the European Criminal Law Academic Network (ECLAN), and a member of the Observatory on Local Autonomy (OLA).

Jean d'Aspremont is a professor of international law at Sciences Po School of Law in Paris. He also holds a chair of Public International Law at the University of Manchester where he founded the Manchester International Law Centre (MILC). He is general editor of the Cambridge Studies in International and Comparative Law and Director of Oxford International Organizations (OXIO).

Ignacio de la Rasilla is the Han Depei Professor of International Law at the Wuhan University Institute of International Law in China. He was educated in Spain (LLB, Complutense), Switzerland (MA and PhD, The Graduate Institute), the United States (LLM, Harvard) and Northern Italy (Max Weber Fellow, EUI). Previously, he served as lecturer and, then, as senior lecturer in law at Brunel University London and adjunct professor at NYU-La Pietra. He is the author of about sixty journal articles and book chapters, and the author or editor of five books on international law and its history, including *In the Shadow of Vitoria: A History of International Law in Spain, 1770–1953*.

Angelo Jr Golia (PhD, Naples 2) is currently a post-doctoral researcher of public law at the Faculty of Political Sciences of Salerno University (Italy). He is an executive editor of the *Italian Law Journal*, and over the past five years he has been visiting researcher in Paris, Marseille and Pittsburgh (US). He also served for a year as judicial clerk at the Italian Constitutional Court and collaborates with the International Human Rights Law Clinic of the Aix-Marseille University. His interests and publications mainly focus on issues of legal pluralism, constitutional justice, sociological constitutionalism and the constitutionalisation of international law.

Ludovic Hennebel is a professor of law in the Faculty of Law and Political Science of Aix-en-Provence (Aix-Marseille University), director of the Institute of International Humanitarian Studies, the Master of Humanitarian Action and Law/NOHA and the Legal Clinic Aix Global Justice. Hennebel is an expert member of the Advisory Committee of the United Nations Human Rights Council. He teaches and conducts research in public international law theory, international human rights law and legal argumentation.

Jan Martin Lemnitzer is an assistant professor at the Center for War Studies, University of Southern Denmark, and a research associate at the Changing Character of War Programme at Pembroke College, Oxford University. He completed his PhD thesis on the 1856 Declaration of Paris at the London School of Economics and was awarded the British International History Group's award for the best thesis in 2010. It was published by Palgrave Macmillan under the title 'Power, Law, and the End of Privateering'. He was a lecturer in modern history at Christ Church and Pembroke College, Oxford, and has published on the history of international law in *Diplomacy & Statecraft*, the *International History Review* and the *European Journal of International Law*.

Andrei Mamolea is a visiting fellow at the Max Planck Institute for European Legal History, Frankfurt. He recently defended a doctoral dissertation on “The Myth of Legalism in U.S. Foreign Relations” at the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies and is currently preparing for publication an intellectual biography of Vespasian V. Pella.

Frédéric Mégret is a professor and Dawson scholar in the Faculty of Law, McGill University. From 2006 to 2016 he held the Canada Research Chair on the Law of Human Rights and Legal Pluralism. Before coming to McGill, he was an assistant professor at the University of Toronto, a research associate at the European University Institute, and an attaché at the International Committee of the Red Cross. A graduate of Sciences Po Paris and holder of a doctorate of the University of Paris I and the Graduate Institute of International Studies of the University of Geneva, his interests lie in some of the theoretical and historical dimensions of international law, with a particular interest in how human mobility has affected the constitution of the international legal order.

Morten Rasmussen is an associate professor at the SAXO Institute, University of Copenhagen. He has worked with the history of European integration for most of his academic career, writing about Denmark’s European policy, the economic history of European integration as well as theory and historiography. In the last decade, he has been one of the pioneers establishing a new field of legal history dealing with the development of European Union law on the basis of a systematic use of documentary evidence from private, state and European archives. From 2012 to 2016, he conducted a large collective research project funded by the Danish Agency for Science and Innovation (DASI) on this topic (<https://europeanlaw.saxo.ku.dk>). Most recently, he has launched a new collective project also financed by the DASI on the history of the League of Nations and International law that will run from 2018 to 2020 (<https://internationallaw.ku.dk>).

Cesare P. R. Romano is a professor of law and Joseph W. Fellow at Loyola Law School, Los Angeles. In 1997, he co-founded the Project on International Courts and Tribunals, a joint undertaking of the Center on International Cooperation, New York University, and the Centre for International Courts and Tribunals at University College London, becoming an authority in the field of law and practice of international courts and tribunals. His most relevant publications are: with K. Alter and Y. Shany (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of International Adjudication*, Oxford University Press, 2014; with D. Terris and L. Swigart, *The International Judge: An Introduction to the Men and Women Who Decide the World’s Cases*, 2007; and *The Peaceful Settlement of International Environmental Disputes: A Pragmatic Approach*, 2000.

Inge Van Hulle is an assistant professor of legal history at Tilburg University, where she teaches the history and theory of international law, international legal history

and the history of early modern Empire. She specialises in the history of international law and imperialism in Africa and the history of use of force law. She has published on these issues in several journals, including the *Legal History Review*, *International History Review* and *Grotiana*.

Jorge E. Viñuales is the Harold Samuel Professor of Law and Environmental Policy at the University of Cambridge, where he founded the Cambridge Centre for Environment, Energy and Natural Resource Governance (C-EENRG). He is also the chairman of the Compliance Committee of the UN-ECE/WHO-Europe Protocol on Water and Health, a member of the Panel of Arbitrators of the Shanghai International Arbitration Centre, the director-general of the Latin American Society of International Law, and an Of Counsel with Lalive. Prior to joining Cambridge, he was the Pictet Chair of International Environmental Law at the Graduate Institute, Geneva, where he keeps a limited affiliation as Adjunct Professor of Public International Law.

Acknowledgements

In the course of developing the present research project, the contributors to this volume had the opportunity to meet in person to discuss their works in progress on two separate occasions. First, during the inaugural workshop of the Interest Group of the History of International Law (IGHIL) of the European Society of International Law (ESIL) which was held during the eleventh Annual Conference of ESIL at the University of Oslo in September 2015. The second meeting took place at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law (LCIL) at the University of Cambridge in September 2017.

The editors gratefully acknowledge the financial support from the LCIL and the Department of Land Economy of the University of Cambridge to organise the second meeting, as well as the assistance of Ms Natalie Jones, PhD candidate in international law at Cambridge. Our thanks also go to the Library of the Peace Palace in The Hague for permission to use the drawing that appears on the cover of this volume. Finally, we wish to acknowledge the organisational support of the ESIL and the University of Oslo, and the professional support of Elizabeth Spicer, Tom Randall and Finola O'Sullivan from Cambridge University Press.

Before finding its place in the larger framework of the present volume, an earlier version of Chapter 4 was published as Jan Martin Lemnitzer, 'International Commissions of Inquiry and the North Sea Incident: A Model for a MH17 Tribunal?' (2016) 27/4 *European Journal of International Law* 923–944.

Ignacio de la Rasilla dedicates this book to Yayezi Hao, and to their recently born daughter, Cristina Rya de la Rasilla Hao.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47494-8 — Experiments in International Adjudication
Edited by Ignacio de la Rasilla , Jorge E. Viñuales
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
