

CHINA AND INTERNATIONAL DISPUTE RESOLUTION IN THE CONTEXT OF THE 'BELT AND ROAD INITIATIVE'

Written by eminent international judges, scholars and practitioners, this book offers a timely study of China's role in international dispute resolution in the context of the construction of the 'Belt and Road Initiative' (BRI). It is the first comprehensive assessment of China's policy and practice in international dispute resolution, providing in-depth analysis of the law and practice in the fields of international trade, commerce, investment and international law of the sea, as they relate to BRI dispute resolution. This book will be an indispensable reading for scholars and practitioners with an interest in China and international dispute resolution. It also constitutes an invaluable reference for anyone interested in the changing international law and order, in which China is playing an increasingly significant role, particularly through the BRI construction.

WENHUA SHAN (PhD, Trinity College, Cambridge) is Ministry of Education Yangtze River Chair Professor of International Economic Law and the founding Dean of the School of Law at Xi'an Jiaotong University, PR China. He is also the founding Director of the Silk Road Institute for Interactional and Comparative Law (SRIICL). He has taught as Professor of International Law at Oxford Brookes University and UNSW Sydney, and has been a Senior Fellow of the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law at the University of Cambridge, Assistant President, Xi'an Jiaotong University, and Deputy Director-General of the Judicial Case Academy at the Supreme People's Court, PR China. He has published over a dozen books in international and comparative law with leading English and Chinese publishers, including CUP and OUP, and numerous articles in journals such as the *European Journal of International Law* and *American Journal of Comparative Law*. He is the founding Editor-in-Chief of *The Chinese Journal of Comparative Law* and founding General Editor of the "China and International Economic Law Series" and "Silk Road Studies in International Economic Law". As Conciliator of the International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID), Expert Member of the International Commercial Expert Committee of the Supreme People's Court of China, Executive President of the China International Investment Arbitration Forum (CIIAF) and Arbitrator of the China International

Economic and Trade Arbitration Commission (CIETAC) among others, Shan has practised international and Chinese laws since 1992.

SHENG ZHANG is Associate Professor at Xi'an Jiaotong University School of Law. He is Deputy Secretary-General of the China International Investment Arbitration Forum and an editor of *The Chinese Journal of Comparative Law*. He mainly focuses on international investment law and comparative law. He was a visiting scholar at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law and the Max-Planck Institute for Comparative and International Private Law. He has published articles in the *European Journal of International Law*, *Journal of International Dispute Settlement*, *The Chinese Journal of Comparative Law* and *Columbia FDI Perspectives*.

JINYUAN SU is Professor of International Law at Xi'an Jiaotong University School of Law. He was an Erin J. C. Arsenault Fellow (2014--2015) at the McGill Institute of Air and Space Law and a visiting research fellow (2009--2010) at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge. Dr Su's research interests lie in outer space law, the law of the sea and international aviation law. His articles are published in international peer-reviewed journals such as *Chinese Journal of International Law*, *International & Comparative Law Quarterly*, *Asian Journal of International Law*, *Ocean Development & International Law* and *The International Journal of Marine and Coastal Law*.

CHINA AND
INTERNATIONAL
DISPUTE RESOLUTION IN
THE CONTEXT OF THE
'BELT AND ROAD
INITIATIVE'

Edited by

WENHUA SHAN

Xi'an Jiaotong University

SHENG ZHANG

Xi'an Jiaotong University

JINYUAN SU

Xi'an Jiaotong University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108473392

DOI: 10.1017/9781108561976

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-47339-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

| | |
|------------------------------|----------|
| <i>List of Figures</i> | page vii |
| <i>List of Tables</i> | viii |
| <i>List of Contributors</i> | ix |
| <i>List of Abbreviations</i> | xv |

Introduction 1

WENHUA SHAN, JINYUAN SU AND SHENG ZHANG

PART I **China, BRI and International Dispute Resolution** 9

- 1 China and the Development of an International Dispute Resolution Mechanism for the Belt and Road Construction 11

JAMES CRAWFORD AC

- 2 One Belt, One Road, One Clause for Dispute Resolution? 23

MICHAEL HWANG, DAVID HOLLOWAY AND LIM SI CHENG

PART II **China, BRI and International Trade Dispute Resolution** 49

- 3 Trade and Investment Adjudication Involving 'Silk Road Projects': Legal Methodology Challenges 51

ERNST-ULRICH PETERSMANN

- 4 Why Don't We Have a WITO? G20, TPP and WTO 78

GUOHUA YANG

- PART III China, BRI and Investment Dispute Resolution** 97
- 5 ICSID and the Evolution of ISDS 99
MEG KINNEAR
- 6 Tackling Political Risks through Treatization along the Belt and Road: A Minilateral Solution 113
WEI SHEN
- 7 Multilateral Reform of Investor–State Dispute Resolution Mechanism: A Balance between Public Legitimacy Management and Private Efficiency Refinement 149
PENG WANG
- 8 Energy Dispute Resolution along the Belt and Road: Should China Accede to the Energy Charter Treaty? 185
ANATOLE BOUTE
- PART IV China, BRI and Resolution of Maritime Disputes** 207
- 9 The Belt and Road Initiative and the Potential for Dispute Settlement under the UN Convention on the Law of the Sea 209
NATALIE KLEIN
- 10 Peaceful Resolution of Maritime Disputes and the UN Convention on the Law of the Sea 233
KEYUAN ZOU
- 11 Unsaid Rules of UNCLOS: Essential Elements for Its Proper Interpretation? 251
BINGBING JIA
- 12 China and International Dispute Settlement: Implications of the South China Sea Arbitration 280
JIANGYU WANG
- Index* 317

FIGURES

| | |
|--|-----------------|
| 5.1 ICSID caseload – cases registered – 31 December 2018 | <i>page</i> 106 |
| 6.1 Growth of China's outbound investment (1990–2017) | 121 |
| 6.2 Rule of Law Index (WJP) | 124 |
| 6.3 Regulatory Quality | 124 |
| 6.4 Doing Business Index | 125 |
| 6.5 Respondent States (Regions) in ICSID Cases by 2017 | 125 |

TABLES

| | | |
|------|--|----------------|
| 2.1 | Hurdles of enforcement in selective civil law countries in the BRI | <i>page 34</i> |
| 7.1 | Proposals for changes to the ISDS mechanism | 162 |
| 7.2 | The structure of MIDR | 170 |
| 7.3 | Selected aspects of reform proposals | 172 |
| 10.1 | Contracting parties to the LOSC in east Asia and their maritime claims | 247 |
| 10.2 | Bilateral maritime agreements in east Asia | 248 |

CONTRIBUTORS

JUDGE JAMES RICHARD CRAWFORD is currently a member of the International Court of Justice. Prior to his election to the Court, he acted as counsel in numerous cases before the International Court of Justice and other international tribunals, and as an arbitrator in twenty-six international arbitrations. He was Whewell Professor of International Law at the University of Cambridge and has published widely in the fields of statehood, collective rights, investment law and international responsibility. Recent works include *The International Law of Responsibility* (co-edited, OUP, 2010), *The Cambridge Companion to International Law* (co-edited, CUP, 2012) and *Brownlie's Principles of Public International Law* (9th edition, OUP, 2019). He was the first Australian member of the United Nations International Law Commission and in that capacity was responsible for the ILC's work on the International Criminal Court (1994) and for the second reading of the ILC Articles on State Responsibility (2001). He has been Yangtze River Chair Professor of International Law (by Ministry of Education) and the Honorary Director of the Silk Road Institute for International and Comparative Law of XJTU.

MICHAEL HWANG currently practises as a barrister, primarily servicing lawyers as independent counsel and arbitrator. He has received specialist training in both domestic and international arbitration (as well as mediation), and has lectured and written extensively on international arbitration and mediation. He is active in domestic and international disputes (under ICC, CIETAC, UNCITRAL, LCIA, ICSID, AAA, BANI and SIAC Rules) as counsel and arbitrator as well as mediator. His arbitrations and mediations have involved disputes in a host of countries all over the world. He is an accredited arbitrator to sixteen national arbitration centres as well as the Permanent Court of Arbitration and ICSID. Dr Hwang received his legal education at Oxford University (both at undergraduate and post-graduate levels) where he was a College Scholar and prizewinner. He then took up a teaching appointment at the Faculty of Law at the University of

Sydney before returning to Singapore to commence private practice in 1968. In 1991, Dr Hwang was appointed a Judicial Commissioner of the Supreme Court (a full time post equivalent to the office of an acting High Court Judge) for a fixed term which expired at the end of 1992. He returned to private practice at the beginning of 1993, and was Head of the Litigation Department of the law firm of Allen & Gledhill, Singapore (currently Singapore's largest law firm). He retired from the firm at the end of 2002 to establish an independent practice as a barrister and chartered arbitrator. In 1997, Dr Hwang was appointed one of the first twelve Senior Counsel of the Supreme Court of Singapore (an appointment equivalent to that of Queen's Counsel in England). He has (at different times) acted as Visiting Professor as well as Adjunct Professor at the National University of Singapore, and has been conferred with an Honorary LL.D Degree by the University of Sydney.

LIM SI CHENG is an Associate in the International Arbitration practice of Mayer Brown's Singapore office. He is a former Associate at Michael Hwang Chambers, and an LLB (Hons) graduate from Durham University.

DAVID HOLLOWAY is a barrister practicing from Outer Temple Chambers, London, Dubai and Abu Dhabi. He has acted as counsel in cases before the English courts at all levels and before international tribunals. He is additionally admitted as an advocate at the DIFC Courts in Dubai and as a registered foreign lawyer (Hong Kong). In addition to professional practice, he is an academic, teaching and researching in the areas of international commercial law. He is currently Senior Lecturer at the Law School of the University Of Birmingham and Director of the LL.M in International Commercial Law offered at the University's Dubai Campus. He has previously held faculty appointments at the University of Edinburgh, City University of Hong Kong and Xi'an Jiaotong University. He has published widely in the areas of international trade and international arbitration. He is General Editor of International Arbitration Law Review and co-author of Schmitthoff, the law and practice of International Trade. He sits as an arbitrator and is a panel arbitrator with many leading arbitral institutions and is also a part time Tribunal Member of the Hong Kong Board of Review (Tax Appeals Tribunal).

E. U. PETERSMANN is a professor of the European University Institute. He has combined legal practice (e.g., as legal advisor in German, EU, GATT, WTO and UN institutions) with academic teaching at universities in Germany, Switzerland, Italy, the United States, China and India for

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

xi

more than thirty-five years. He has been a secretary, member or chairman of GATT/WTO dispute settlement panels and chaired the International Trade Law Committee of the International Law Association from 1999 to 2014. He has published 30 books and more than 300 contributions to books and journals on international law. He is Emeritus Professor of international and European law and former head of the Law Department at the European University Institute, Florence (Italy).

GUOHUA YANG is a professor at Tsinghua University Law School. He worked in the Chinese Ministry of Commerce from 1996 to 2014; he was the first Director and later Deputy Director General for WTO Legal Affairs within the Ministry responsible for WTO cases related to China. He also has a rich background on trade policy making and international cooperation. For example, he was the head of Chinese delegations for intellectual property rights dialogues with the United States, the EU, Japan, Russia, Switzerland and Brazil, and for international conferences at Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) and United Nations Commission on International Trade Law (UNCITRAL), etc. He is Executive Vice Chairman, WTO Law Research Society of China Law Society (China WTO Law Society); Arbitrator, International Economic and Trade Arbitration Commission (CIETAC, China) and South China International Economic and Trade Arbitration Commission/Shenzhen Court of International Arbitration (SCIA, China); Member, Expert Group for Commercial and Maritime Trials, Supreme Court, China; Member, Indicative List for dispute settlement panels, WTO Secretariat; Associate Editor, *Journal of World Trade*; Distinguished Legal Scholar Award, Beijing Law Society (1999). He was also IP attaché at the Chinese Embassy in the United States, Washington, DC (January 2006–September 2008). He graduated from Peking University Law School in 1996 (PhD) and Wuhan University Law School in 1994 (LLM).

MEG KINNEAR is currently the Secretary-General of the International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID) at the World Bank. She was formerly the Senior General Counsel and Director General of the Trade Law Bureau of Canada, where she was responsible for the conduct of all international investment and trade litigations involving Canada, and participated in the negotiations of bilateral investment agreements. In November 2002, Ms Kinnear was also named Chair of the Negotiating Group on Dispute Settlement for the Free Trade of the Americas Agreement. From October 1996 to April 1999, Ms Kinnear was Executive Assistant to the Deputy

Minister of Justice of Canada. Prior to this, Ms Kinnear was Counsel at the Civil Litigation Section of the Canadian Department of Justice (from June 1984 to October 1996) where she appeared before federal and provincial courts as well as domestic arbitration panels. Ms Kinnear was called to the Bar of Ontario in 1984 and the Bar of the District of Columbia in 1982. She received a Bachelor of Arts (BA) from Queen's University in 1978, a Bachelor of Laws (LLB) from McGill University in 1981, and a Master of Laws (LLM) from the University of Virginia in 1982. Ms Kinnear has published numerous articles on international investment law and procedure and is a frequent speaker on these topics. She is a co-author of *Investment Disputes under NAFTA* (published in 2006 and updated in 2008 and 2009). She also co-authored texts on Canadian legal procedure including *Federal Court Practice* (1988–90, 1991–92, and 1993–2009 annually) and 1995 Crown Liability and Proceedings Act Annotated (1994).

WEI SHEN is KoGuan Distinguished Professor of Law, Shanghai Jiao Tong University Law School; PhD (London School of Economics and Political Science), LLM (University of Cambridge), LLM (University of Michigan), LLM and LLB (East China University of Political Science and Law); attorney-at-law, New York. Professor Shen is the former Dean of Shandong University Law School, China. Professor Shen is also Global Professor of Law, New York University School of Law, BFLC Adjunct Professor of Law, National University of Singapore, and has been included in Marquis *Who's Who* (2011 onwards). Professor Shen is an arbitrator with Shanghai Arbitration Commission, Hong Kong International Arbitration Centre, Shanghai International Arbitration Centre and Shenzhen International Court of Arbitration. He is an associate member of the International Academy of Comparative Law (*Académie internationale de droit comparé*). He is a member of Moody's China Academic Advisory Panel and Honorary Fellow of Asian Institute of International Financial Law, University of Hong Kong.

PENG WANG is an associate professor at the School of Law of Xi'an Jiaotong University, China, and was a visiting scholar at the University of Cambridge Lauterpacht Centre for International Law. Dr Wang teaches courses on international economic law, international investment law and arbitration, international law and international relations, and has contributed to academic journals such as *ICSID Review*, *The Journal of World Investment & Trade*, *Polish Yearbook of*

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

xiii

International Law, Chinese Journal of Comparative Law and Transnational Dispute Management, among others.

ANATOLE BOUTE is a professor at the Chinese University of Hong Kong, specializing in the fields of energy, environmental and investment law. His research focuses on the legal aspects of the transition of energy systems towards sustainability, with a special interest for energy market reforms in emerging economies. He graduated in political sciences (2003) and law (2004) from the University of Leuven and holds an advanced master (LLM) in energy and environmental law (2005) from the same university. In 2005, he was called to the Brussels Bar where he practiced until 2009 with the energy law team of Janson Baugniet. He advised on and was involved in litigation concerning the promotion of renewable energy sources, energy efficiency, greenhouse gas emissions trading, the liberalization of energy markets and nuclear energy. He is the author of *Russian Electricity and Energy Investment Law* (Brill Nijhoff, 2015) and of articles in several internationally peer reviewed journals, including the *Fordham International Law Journal*, *ICSID Review*, *Common Market Law Review*, *Transnational Environmental Law*, *Journal of Environmental Law*, *European Law Review*, *Europe-Asia Studies*, and *Energy Policy*. In 2009, he received the Willoughby Prize for his articles published in the *Journal of Energy & Natural Resources Law*.

NATALIE KLEIN is a professor at UNSW Sydney's Faculty of Law, Australia. She was previously at Macquarie University where she served as Dean of Macquarie Law School (2011–17), as well as Acting Head of the Department for Policing, Intelligence and Counter-Terrorism at Macquarie (2013–14). Professor Klein has been a visiting fellow at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law at the University of Cambridge and MacCormick Fellow at the University of Edinburgh. She is currently a non-resident fellow at the Lakshman Kadirgamar Institute in Sri Lanka. Prior to joining Macquarie, Professor Klein worked in the international litigation and arbitration practice of Debevoise & Plimpton LLP, served as counsel to the government of Eritrea (1998–2002) and was a consultant in the Office of Legal Affairs at the United Nations. Her masters and doctorate in law were earned at Yale Law School, and she is a fellow of the Australian Academy of Law.

KEYUAN ZOU is Harris Professor of International Law at the Lancashire Law School of the University of Central Lancashire (UCLan), UK. He specializes in international law, in particular law of the sea and

international environmental law. Before joining UCLan, he worked at Dalhousie University (Canada), Peking University (China), University of Hannover (Germany) and National University of Singapore. He has published over sixty refereed English papers in over thirty international journals including *Asian Yearbook of International Law*, *Asia-Pacific Journal of Environmental Law*, *Chinese Journal of International Law*, *Columbia Journal of International Affairs*, *Criminal Law Forum*, *German Yearbook of International Law*, *International Journal of Marine and Coastal Law*, *International Lawyer*, *Journal of Environmental Law*, *Journal of International Maritime Law*, *Journal of International Wildlife Law and Policy*, *Journal of Maritime Law and Commerce*, *Lloyd's Maritime and Commercial Law Quarterly*, *Marine Policy*, *Maritime Policy and Management*, *Netherlands International Law Review*, *Ocean Development and International Law*, *Ocean Yearbook*, *Singapore Journal of International and Comparative Law*, *Ocean and Coastal Management* and *Yearbook of Law and Legal Practice in East Asia*.

BINGBING JIA is Professor of International Law at the Tsinghua University Law School, Beijing, China. He studied law at Peking University and obtained his PhD in 1995 at the University of Oxford. Previously he was a legal officer at the UN ICTY. He is a member of the Curatorium of The Hague Academy of International Law. He is a member of the board of editors of the *Chinese Journal of International Law*, *Journal of International Criminal Justice*, *American Journal of International Law* and the *Chinese Yearbook of International Law*. His research interests include the law of peace, international humanitarian and criminal law.

JIANGYU WANG (SJD & LLM, University of Pennsylvania; MJur, Oxford; MPhil in Laws, Peking University; LLB, China University of Political Science and Law) is Professor of Law and Director of the Centre for Chinese and Comparative Law at the School of Law of City University of Hong Kong. He is also a joint Editor-in-Chief of *The Chinese Journal of Comparative Law* (Oxford University Press) and subject editor of the *Asian Journal of Comparative Law* (Cambridge University Press). Before coming to Hong Kong, he held a tenured appointment at the National University of Singapore Faculty of Law while he served as the Director of the Asian Law Institute (ASLI). His teaching and research interests include international economic law, international law and international relations, Chinese and comparative corporate and securities law, law and development, and the Chinese legal system.

ABBREVIATIONS

| | |
|--------|--|
| APEC | Asia–Pacific Economic Cooperation |
| ASEAN | Association of Southeast Asian Nations |
| BIT | Bilateral investment treaty |
| BRI | Belt and Road Initiative |
| CAFTA | China–ASEAN Free Trade Agreement |
| CETA | Comprehensive Economic and Trade Agreement |
| CICC | China's International Commercial Court |
| CIETAC | China International Economic and Trade Arbitration Commission |
| CJEU | Court of Justice of the European Union |
| CPC | Communist Party of China |
| DIFC | Dubai International Financial Centre |
| ECT | Energy Charter Treaty |
| ECtHR | European Court of Human Rights |
| EEZ | Exclusive economic zone |
| EU | European Union |
| FCNs | Treaties of friendship, commerce and navigation |
| FDI | Foreign direct investment |
| FTAs | Free trade agreements |
| GATT | General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade |
| GDP | Gross domestic product |
| GVCs | Global value chains |
| G20 | Group of 20 |
| HKIAC | Hong Kong International Arbitration Centre |
| ICJ | International Court of Justice |
| ICSID | International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes |
| ICTR | International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda |
| IDSM | Investment dispute settlement mechanisms |
| IMO | International Maritime Organization |
| ISDS | Investor–State dispute settlement |
| ITA | Information technology agreement |
| ITLOS | International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea |
| ITO | International Trade Organization |
| LICs | Low-income countries |

| | |
|----------|--|
| MAI | Multilateral agreement on investment |
| MIDR | Multilateral investment dispute resolution |
| MOU | Memorandum of understanding |
| NAFTA | North American Free Trade Agreement |
| NYC | New York Convention |
| OECD | Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development |
| PCA | Permanent Court of Arbitration |
| RCEP | Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership Agreement |
| RTAs | Regional trade agreements |
| SIAC | Singapore International Arbitration Centre |
| SMEs | Small and medium-sized enterprises |
| SOEs | State-owned enterprises |
| TIWG | Trade and Investment Working Group |
| TPP | Trans-Pacific Partnership Agreement |
| TTIP | Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership Agreement |
| UDHR | Universal Declaration of Human Rights |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNCITRAL | United Nations Commission on International Trade Law |
| UNCLOS | United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea |
| UNCTAD | United Nations Conference on Trade and Development |
| VCLT | Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties |
| WHO | World Health Organization |
| WTO | World Trade Organization |
| WITO | World Investment and Trade Organization |
| WIPO | World Intellectual Property Organization |