

Index

Acharya, A., 298 advising on constitutions. See transnational constitutional advice giving; Jennings, Sir Afghanistan, participatory constitution-making and, 301-3 African Charter on Democracy, Elections, and Governance, 247 African Charter on Human and People's Rights of 1981, 291 democracy clauses in, 247 Agenda for Democratization (Boutros-Ghali), 283 Agenda for Peace (Boutros-Ghali), 283 Alberdi, Juan Bautista, 266 Argentinean constitution-making, 266 Asia, 57-59 Venice Commission best practices in Central, 183 Asia Foundation, 40 Asian Charter of Rights of 1998, 291 authoritarian constitutions, 65, 275, See also legalist autocratic TLOs; legalistic autocrats and autocracies automated content analysis (ACA), 15, 112-14, See also topic modeling Bell, David, 189 Bolivia, 8, 13, 39, 238, 245 replacement clauses and constituent power

and, 300-1 Carruthers, Bruce, 2 Ceylon, 57-59 Chávez, Hugo (President of Venezuela), 204, 234, 238–39, 240, See also Venezuela as legalistic autocrat, 206-9 Chile, 237 limits of constitutional TLOs in, 267, 268, 273-81 China Goodnow as constitutional reform advisor to, 30-32, 39 lack of constitutionalism in, 203 Cold War, 12, 27, 193, 201, 202, 272 constitutionalist TLO origins and, 191 Colombia, 238-39 constituent power theory and, 240 constitution-making in, 251 participatory constitution-making in, 296 Commonwealths Harare Declaration of 1991, 291 Comparative Constitutions Project. See human rights in constitutions Considerations on the Government of Poland (essay, Rousseau), 29 constituent power theory, 239-44, 248 Bolivian constitution-making and, 242-43 Egyptian constitution-making in 2012 and, 243 Russian constitution-making under Yeltsin and, 243 constitutional advisors. See transnational

constitutional advice giving; Jennings, Sir

capabilities, participatory constitution-making

Ivor

theory, 242–43

129-35

Boutros-Ghali, Boutros, 283

British colonialism, 110, 112, 123, 124,



Index 313

	1.1 1 6
constitutional coups, 202, 205–6	high stakes of, 14, 273
in Honduras, 6	in ancient Greece, 3
Pakistani constitutional coup (1954), 56–57	in Colombia, 251
constitutional democracies	in India, 60
country exceptions to, 203	international norms for constitutional text
end of history narrative and, 188–89	content, 254
Freedom House measures of democratic	international organizations and, 47, 256–57
performance and, 189, 190	international public participation norms
legalistic autocrats maintenance of and	and, 252–54
subversion of, 203–6	lack of international norms for, 235
constitutional dialects, 110, See also British	lack of law in process of, 49
colonialism; French colonialism; Spanish	legal autocrats undermining of democracy
colonialism; socialist dialects; topic	via, 234
modeling	major geopolitical events triggering of, 4
empirical study limits and, 111	national identity and, 3, 265
topic modeling advantages and drawbacks	norm diffusion and, 5
and, 114–16	post-conflict, 4, 289
topic modeling data and methodology, 116–18	problems caused by lack of democratic
	constraint, 244–46
topic modeling keywords and labels and results, 118–22	regime change and crisis and, 235–39,
topic modeling of constitutional dialects	² 43 timing of, 4
explained, 122–23	TLO theory and framework for, 6–9
constitutional justice	Venice Commission and, 172–76
Venice Commission and, 160	worst practices, 197, 199–200, 207, 220
Constitutional Problems in Pakistan	Copenhagen criteria, 181–82
(Jennings), 68	Correa, Rafael (President of Ecuador), 204,
constitutional reform	234, 238–39
Venice Commission and, 160	as legalistic autocrat, 209–11
constitutional rights provisions, 4, 6	Corsica, 29
international treaties and, 5	Council for Democratic Elections (CDE)
constitutionalism	Venice Commission and, 161, 162
countries lacking, 203	Council of Europe (CoE)
constitution-making. See also liberal demo-	complementary function of with Venice
cratic constitution-making TLOs;	Commission, 169–70
participatory constitution-making;	coups, 201, 202, See also constitutional coups
transnational constitutional advice giving;	in Pakistan in 1999, 202
transnational constitution-making;	promissory coups, 201
Westminster constitutional model	r · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
advisory bodies and, 257-59	de Silva, Meryvn, 58
American from 1776–89, 3	democracy. See constitutional democracies;
as site of TLO theory making, 2, 17-22, 50	democratic erosion; liberal democratic
as TLO, 49–50, 90	constitution-making TLOs
authoritarian constitutions, 65, 275	democracy clauses, 247–52
contesting actors and norms of rival TLOs	Honduras and, 248–50
in, 27	in Africa, 247
democracy clauses and, 247–52	in Latin America, 247
diverse contexts of, 26	Democracy Reporting International (German
extraterritorial constitutional interpretation	NGO), 41
and, 248, 250	democratic erosion, 16, 189–90, 202, 255
French, 4	constitutional coups and, 205–6



314 Index

democratic erosion (cont.) lack of democratic constraint in constitution-making and, 244-46 legalistic autocrats maintenance of and subversion of constitutional democracy and, 203-6, 246 Westminster constitutional model and, 55-56 Desai, Deval, 192 Destruction of Pakistan's Democracy (McGrath), 68 East Timor, 13 participatory constitution making and, 301-3 Eastern Europe, 13, 188 Ecuador, 39, 204, 238-39 constituent power theory and, 240 democratic erosion from constitutionmaking in, 234 maintenance and subversion of constitutional democracy in, 209-11 Egypt, 205, 237, 246 constituent power theory and, 243 rejection of transnational constitutionaladvice giving by, 41 elections, 171, 205 German election law and unequal district sizes, 198-99 Elkins, Zachary, 4, 5, 11 Elster, Jon, 3, 4, 237 end of history narrative, 11, 188-89, 200, 205 nationalists and nationalism as departure from, 205 opposition to neoliberalism as departure from, 204 religious reasons as departure from, 204 Erdoğan, Recep Tayyib (President of Turkey), 205, See also Turkey as legalistic autocrat, 215-18 Eritrea, participatory constitution-making and, ethics

need for in transnational constitution-advice

Protection of National Minorities Rights,

European Framework Convention for the

constraints on and legitimacy of, 181

constraints on constitution-making by, 46

post-accession Copenhagen criteria and,

giving, 46

2QO-Q1

181-82

European Union (EU), 13

Venice Commission and, 179-80 expert ignorance, 192 extraterritorial constitutional interpretation, 248, 250 Feldman, Noah, 44 Fidesz party (Hungary) replacement clauses in constitution-making of, 243-44 Forum on Federations (Canada), 47 Foti, Nick, 5 Frankenstate problem, 223, 225, 255, 257 Freedom House measures of democratic performance, 189, 190 French colonialism, 110, 112, 123, 124, 128-29 French Declaration of the Rights of Man, Fukuyama, Francis, 188 Galbraith, Peter, 46 Galli, G., 293 Germany election law and unequal district sizes in, Ghai, Professor Yash, 36-38, 293 Ginsburg, Tom, 5, 167, 293 Gledhill, Alan, 59 Goodnow, Frank, 30-32, 39 Goonetilleke, O.E., 57 Greece constitutional advisors in ancient, 3, Halliday, Terence, 2, 14, 49, 56, 167, 285 Hans Siedel Foundation, 41 Harding, Andrew, 61 Hoffmann-Riem, Wolfgang, 176-78

Hoffmann-Riem, Wolfgang, 176–78
Holmes, Oliver Wendell, 3
Honduras, 13
constitutional coups in, 6
democracy clauses and extraterritorial
constitutional interpretation in, 248–50
horizontal diffusion, 14
human rights in constitutions, 15
cross-national data analysis results, 99–104
cross-national data on countries and
constitutions in 2005, 97–98
global-transnational processes in, 99
international human rights treaties and, 11
measurement of, 90–95
world society theory and, 85–90, 104–5



Index 315

Hungary, 171, 189, 198, 205, 245
democratic erosion from constitutionmaking in, 234
Hungarian constitution as a
Frankenstate, 255
maintenance and subversion of
constitutional democracy in, 214, 252
replacement clauses in constitution-making
of, 243–44

India, constitution-making in, 60 Inter-American Democratic Charter, 247 Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD), 41 International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 290-91 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 5, 290-91 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 5 International Development Law Organization, 41 International IDEA, 5, 41, 47, 189, 193, 208, 270 as transnational constitutional advice givers, international organizations, 11 constitution-making and, 5, 47, 256-57

international organizations, 11 constitution-making and, 5, 47, 256–57 international treaties constitutional rights provisions and, 5 Interpeace (Swedish NGO), 47, 193 Iran lack of constitutionalism in, 203

Iraq, 44, 46, 48 Jennings, Sir Ivor, 15, 32–33

as transnational constitutional advisor in Asia/Ceylon, 57–59 Constitutional Problems in Pakistan of, 68

Pakistani constitutional coup of 1954 and, 56–57, 61–65, 68–76 Jinnah, M.A. (Governor-General of Pakistan),

59, 60
Joint Council on Constitutional Justice,
(JCCJ). See also Venice Commission
Judging the State, Courts and Constitutional

Politics in Pakistan (Newberg), 68

Kaczyński, Jaroslav (President of Poland), 205, See also Poland as legalistic autocrat, 218–19 Kenya participatory constitution-making in, 295 Koh, Harold, 296 Konrad Adenaeur Foundation, 41 Kyrgyzstan, 183

Latin America, 13, 188, 238–39
democracy clauses in, 247
divergences in organization of state power
in, 271
emergence of liberal democratic
constitution-making TLOs and advice
giving in, 267–70, 272–73
influence of U.S. Constitution in nineteenth
century, 267
term limit norms in, 255
Venice Commission best practices and,
184
law and development movement, 48
Law, David, 4
legalist autocratic TLOs, 8, 196–200, 201–5,

egalist autocratic TLOs, 8, 196–200, 201–5, 244–46, 272–73, *See also* authoritarian constitutions; legalistic autocrats and autocracies in Chile, 273–81

legalistic autocrats and autocracies, 196
Chávez of Venezuela as, 206–9
constitutional worst practices and, 197–200
Correa of Ecuador as, 209–11
Erdoğan of Turkey as, 215–18
Kaczyński of Poland as, 218–19
maintenance of and subversion of
constitutional democracy and, 203–6,
235, 246
Orbán of Hungary as, 211–14

Putin of Russia as, 204, 214–15 Lenin, Vladimir, 189 liberal democratic constitution-making TLOs, 7, 16, 246, 259–60 approaches for strengthening of, 247 core norms of, 235 emergence of in Latin America, 267–70,

legalistic autocrats maintenance of and subversion of, 203–6 limits of, 273 limits of in Chilean constitution-making,

267, 268, 273–81 localization of state power and, 270–72 origins of from Cold War era, 191



> 316 Index

liberal democratic constitution-making (cont.) problems caused by lack of democratic constraint in, 244-46 Llewellyn, Karl, 220

Madison, James, 4 Malaysia, 35-36, 40 Max Planck Institute for Comparative and Foreign Law, 41 Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law, 41 McGrath, Allen, 68 Mill, John Stuart, 288 Mohamed, Morsi (President of Egypt), 243 Mongolia, 45 Montesquieu, 265-66 Morales, Evo (President of Bolivia), 242 Morocco, 184 Morsi, Mohamed, 204

Muhammad, Ghulam, 66-68 Munir Muhammad (Chief Justice of Pakistan, Muhammad Munir), 56

Musharraf, Pervez, 202

National Democratic Institute (U.S.), 41 National Endowment for Democracy, 40 national identity, constitution-making and, 3, 265 neo-colonial theory, 6 neoliberal economic policy

countries opposing, 204 Newberg, Paula R., 68

norms

constitutional advice giving and, 193 international public participation norms in constitution-making, 252-54

lack of international in constitutionmaking, 235

norm diffusion in transnational constitutionmaking, 4, 5

participatory constitution-making as transnational legal norm, 283-88, 290, 292 participatory constitution-making capabilities and norm internalization of

participation, 300-1 participatory constitution-making norm diffusion, 284-85

participatory constitution-making norm localization, 298-300

recursivity in transnational constitutional norm making, 12, 21, 22, 105, 168, 171, 175

term limit norms in Latin America and Africa, 255 transnational legal norms defined, Norway, 46

Orbán, Viktor (President of Hungary), 198, as legalistic autocrat, 211-14 Organization of American States, 6, 13, 249

Pakistan

constitutional coup (1954), 66-68 constitutional coup (1954) and Jennings as constitutional advisor, 56-57, 61-65,

constitutional coup (1954) and Westminster constitutional model, 60, 63-65

military coup in 1999, 202

participatory constitution-making, 252-54 as transnational legal norm, 283-88, 290, 292, 295-98

as transnational political norm, 290

capabilities and norm internalization of participation, 300-1

empirical gaps about benefits of, 292-93 in Afghanistan, 301-3

in East Timor, 301-3

in Eritrea, 302-3

in South Africa, 303-5

legal justifications and instruments supporting, 290-92

norm diffusion and, 284-85

norm localization and, 298-300

risks of, 293–95

United Nations and, 5, 290-91

peacebuilding, 283

public participation and, 288-90

Poland, 29, 171, 205, See also Kaczyński, Jaroslav (President of Poland)

maintenance and subversion of

constitutional democracy in, 218-19 populism, 182, 189

post-conflict constitutions, 289

preambles

transnational construction of, 5 Public Interest Law and Policy Group (PILPG), 41

Putin, Vladimir

as legalistic autocrat, 204, 214-15



Index 317

recursivity, 2	transnational constitution-making in, 1–2,
in transnational constitutional norm	6, 41
making, 12, 21, 22, 105, 168, 171, 175	Spanish colonialism, 110, 112, 123, 124, 135–38
of Venice Commission, 171	Sri Lanka, 32–33
over longue durée, 22	state power, in constitution-making, 270-72
religious orders, 14	in Latin America, 271
as reason for departure from end of history	, ,
narrative, 204	term limits, 13, 255
replacement clauses, 242-43	constitutional amendments for in
in Hungarian constitution-making, 243–44	Venezuela, 209
problems with during political context	topic modeling, 110, See also automated con-
changes, 244	tent analysis (ACA)
Risse, T., 299	advantages and drawbacks of, 114–16
Robeyns, I., 300	British colonialism high-frequency words
Rockmore, Daniel, 5	and constitutional prevalence, 129–35
Rousseau, Jean-Jacques, 3, 29, 288	constitutional dialect concept explained,
rule of law movement, 40, 48	122–23
transnational constitutional advice giving	constitutional dialect keywords and labels
and, 191–93	and results, 118–22
Venice Commission and, 171	constitutional dialects as language of
Russia, 245	geopolitical hegemony and TLO
constituent power theory and, 243	influence, 123–27, 140–45, 148
maintenance and subversion of	constitutional dialects data and
constitutional democracy in, 204, 214-15	methodology, 116–18
Venice Commission election investigation,	French colonialism high-frequency words
174, 175	and constitutional prevalence, 128–29
Venice Commission membership and,	socialism high-frequency words and
170	constitutional prevalence, 138–42
1/0	Spanish colonialism high-frequency words
Saati A =	and constitutional prevalence, 135–38
Saati, A., 5	
sanctions, 202 Saudi Arabia	topic prevalence predictors, 145–47
	transnational constitutional advice giving, 11,
lack of constitutionalism in, 203	26, 85, 190, See also Jennings, Sir Ivor
Sen, Amartya, 300	competition in, 46–49
Senanayake, D.S., 57	constitutional worst practices and legalistic
Shaffer, Gregory, 2, 14, 49, 56, 167, 285–86,	autocrats, 197–200
292, 299	Egyptian shutting out of foreign
Sikkink, K., 299	organizations and, 41
socialism, 112, 123, 124	emergence of in Latin America, 272–73
socialist constitutional TLOs, 8, 123-27, 201-5	expert ignorance and, 192
as dialect, 110, 112, 113, 138-42, 148	history of and case studies, 29-40
socialist dialects, 123-27	in ancient Greece, 3
in TLOs, 110, 112, 113, 138–42, 148	in modern period, 29
soft law, 11, 13, 87, 292	International IDEA and, 195
UN constitutional advice giving and, 43	local context and international advisors,
Venice Commission utilization of, 171	44–46
South Africa, participatory constitution-	localism and universalism in Malaysia and,
making and, 303–5	
South Sudan	35–36
	need for professional ethics in, 46
transnational constitutional-advice giving of	of American organizations to South
American organizations to, 41	Sudan, 41



318 Index

transnational constitutional (cont.) of Americans to various countries (post-WWII), 33–35 of foreign organizations to Libya, Tunisia and Yemen post-Arab Spring, 41 of Goodnow to China, 30-32 of Jennings to Sri Lanka, 32-33 of Professor Yash Ghai, 36-38 of Rousseau to Corsica and Poland, 29 of United Nations (UN), 42-44 of Viciano Pastor to Bolivia, Ecuador, and Venezuela, 39 origins and establishment of, 191-93 role of structure in selection and empowerment of advisors, 39, 40 TLO sustainability via actors and norms, United Nations and, 193-95 transnational constitution-making, 85, See also human rights in constitutions advisory bodies and, 257-59 constitutional implementation and, 5 contesting actors and norms of rival TLOs in, 10, 13, 14 core institutions of, 28 EU constraints on, 46 in South Sudan, 1-2, 6, 41 intensification of since 1990, 40 international human rights treaties and, 11 international organizations and, 5, 47, law and other forms of ordering interaction, 14 law and political and religious order interaction, 14 myth of exclusively national content and processes in, 2-6 norm diffusion and, 4 norm settlement and, 11-12 overview of, 2-6, 27 preambles and, 5 public participation norms and, 252-54 recursivity in norm making, 12, 21, 22, 105, 168, 171, 175 TLO theory and framework overview, 6-9 United Nations and, 193-95 Venice Commission and, 172-76, 257-59 Westminster model prevalence after 1945, 55 transnational legal norms defined, 286 TLO framework for study of, 2

transnational legal orders (TLOs). See also constitutional dialects; liberal democratic constitution-making TLOs; transnational constitutional advice-giving; transnational constitution-making; Venice Commission; Westminster constitutional as framework for study of transnational legal norms, 2 as transnational sociolegal theory, coercive enforcement and, 176 colonial dialects topic modeling and, 123-27, 148 constitutional dialects in TLOs, 140-45 constitutional language as language of TLOs, 123-27, 148-49 constitutional orders rise and fall in theory constitutionalism as a TLO, 190-96 constitution-making and TLO theory, constitution-making as site of TLO theory making, 2, 17-22, 50 constitution-making as TLO, 49-50, 90 creation of, 168 defined, 27, 56, 167, 168, 179, 285-86 human rights as, 86 Jennings as constitutional advisor in Pakistan and, 56, 80 legalist autocratic TLOs, 8, 196-200, 201-5, 244-46, 272-81 liberal democratic TLOs, 7, 203-6, 244-46, 267-70, 272-81 mechanisms of, 13 norms and actors for TLO sustainability and, 193 recursivity in TLO dynamics, 2, 7-9, 12, 22, 105, 168, 169, 171, 175 rival TLOs, contesting actors, dialects and norms, 12–13, 27 settling and unsettling of TLO norms, 6-8, 11-14, 20-22 socialist constitutional TLOs, 8, 123-27, socialist dialects in socialist constitutional TLOs, 110, 112, 113, 138-42, 148 sustainability of, 193 Venice Commission TLO framework, 156, 167-69



Index 319

worst practices in constitutional TLOs, 197, 199–200, 207, 220
Tunisia, 44, 184
Turkey, 189, 205, *See also* Erdoğan, Recep
Tayyib (President of Turkey)
maintenance and subversion of
constitutional democracy in, 215–18
United Nations (UN), 27, 46

United Nations (UN), 27, 46
constitutional advice giving by, 42–44,
193–95
participatory constitution-making and, 5,
290–91, 295
UN Declaration of Human Rights
(UNDHR) of, 5, 86, 290–91

United States, 46

Constitution of 1787 as model for newly independent states of nineteenth century Latin America, 267

constitution-making from 1776 to 89, 3 Montesquieu's influence on Constitution of 1787, 266

transnational constitutional advice giving of post-WWII, 33-35, 41

Venice Commission membership and, 170

Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UNDHR). See human rights in constitutions; under United Nations US Institute of Peace, 41 USAID, 40

Venezuela, 39, 204, 238–39, 245, 255 constituent power theory, 240 constitutional amendments for term limits in, 209

democratic erosion from constitutionmaking in, 234

maintenance and subversion of constitutional democracy in, 206–9

Venice Commission, 6, 13, 16, 47, 156–57, 185, 193, 257–59

best practices and cooperation and, 183–84 Central Asia region activities of, 183 compilations of extracts from opinions adopted by, 162

complementary function of with CoE, 169–70

compliance by addressee (TLOs and interlocking organizations), 178–81

compliance by addressees, 176-78 compliance TLOs and challenge to global values, 182-83 constitutional justice and, 160 constitutional reform and, 160 constitution-making and, 172-76 constraints on and competence of, cooperation with OSCE/ODIHR, 171 Council for Democratic Elections (CDE) and, 161, 162 democratic institutions and fundamental rights and, 150, 160 elections, referendums and political parties and, 161 Joint Council on Constitutional Justice (JCCJ), 160, 161 Latin America region activities of, 184 legal norm diffusion on democracy, human rights and rule of law, 169, 171-72 membership and, 170-71 organizational foundations of, 157-59 post-accession Copenhagen criteria and, 181-82 remit and role of, 159 rule of law and human rights in Hungary, Poland and Romania, 179-80 Russian election investigation, 174, 175 Russian membership and, 170 Southern Mediterranean region activities of, 184 TLO framework for study of, 156, 167-69 triggering of, 163-64 U.S. membership and, 170 working methodology of, 164-67 Versteeg, Mila, 4, 90 Viciano Pastor, Professor Roberto, 39

West Africa, 13
Westminster constitutional model, 15,
59
dangers of democratic erosion from, 55–56
Pakistan constitutional crisis and, 60, 63–65
prevalence of after 1945, 55
world society theory, 5, 6, 85
human rights and, 85–90, 104–5
worst practices, constitution-making
concept of, 196–97
in German and Hungarian election laws,
198–99



320 Index

worst practices, constitution-making (cont.) in legalistic autocratic TLOs, 199–200, 220 toolkit of, 197, 207

Yeltsin, Boris (President of Russia), 243

Zelaya, Manuel (President of Honduras), 6, 13, 248–50 Zimbabwe participatory constitution-making in, 296