Colonizing Consent

Elizabeth Thornberry uses historical evidence to shed light on South Africa’s contemporary epidemic of sexual violence. Drawing on over a thousand cases from a diverse set of courts, Thornberry reconstructs the history of rape in South Africa’s Eastern Cape, from the precolonial era to the triumph of legal and sexual segregation, and digs deep into questions of conceptions of sexual consent. Through this process, Thornberry also demonstrates the political stakes of disputes over sexual consent, and the ways in which debates over the regulation of sexuality shaped both white and black politics in this period. From customary authority to missionary Christianity, humanitarian liberalism to segregationism, political claims implied theories of sexual consent and enabled distinctive claims to control female sexuality. The political history of rape illuminates not only South Africa’s contemporary crisis of sexual violence but also on the entangled histories of law, sexuality, and politics across the globe.

Elizabeth Thornberry is Assistant Professor of African History at Johns Hopkins University. She has researched and published widely on the history of gender, sexuality, and law in South Africa. She coedited Domestic Violence and the Law in Colonial and Postcolonial Africa (2010) and is currently writing a book on the intellectual history of customary law in South Africa. She has held fellowships from the American Council of Learned Societies, the Fulbright Institute for International Education, and the Shelby Cullom Davis Center at Princeton University.
African Studies Series

The African Studies series, founded in 1968, is a prestigious series of monographs, general surveys, and textbooks on Africa covering history, political science, anthropology, economics, and ecological and environmental issues. The series seeks to publish work by senior scholars as well as the best new research.

Editorial Board

David Anderson, The University of Warwick
Catherine Boone, The London School of Economics and Political Science
Carolyn Brown, Rutgers University, New Jersey
Christopher Clapham, University of Cambridge
Michael Gomez, New York University
Richard Roberts, Stanford University, California
David Robinson, Michigan State University
Leonardo A. Villalón, University of Florida

Other titles in the series are listed at the back of the book.
Contents

List of Figures vi
Acknowledgments vii
List of Abbreviations x

Introduction: Writing the History of Rape 1
1 Custom and Consent in Xhosaland 36
2 Sex and Spiritual Power 75
3 Liberalism and the Colonial Law of Sexual Violence 133
4 Rape and Racial Boundaries 193
5 Navigating the Politics of Consent 248
   Conclusion: Rape and the Postcolony 300

Bibliography 311
Index 338
Figures

I.1 Southern Africa after the South African War (1903).  page 31
I.2 Colonial Xhosaland (1885–1927).  32
1.1 Payment for seduction, Western Pondoland, ca. 1936. Photograph by Ethel Clarke, used by permission of the Western Cape Provincial Archives and Records Service (CA J 11638).  69
2.1 Two Christian couples, members of the Moravian church in Baziya, near Umtata. Photograph used by permission of the Moravian Archives, Herrnhut (BOX SAO 2–05387).  77
3.1 Staff of the court of the resident magistrate, Tsolo District, 1894. Photograph used by permission of Historical Papers, University of the Witwatersrand (WHP AB 1653 Ee 2.2).  135
4.1 Photograph of an ukuthwala elopement or abduction, probably staged. Western Pondoland, ca. 1936. Photograph by Ethel Clarke, used by permission of the Western Cape Provincial Archives and Records Service (CA J11529).  195
5.1 Group of young men and women, Western Pondoland, ca. 1936. Photograph by Ethel Clarke, used by permission of the Western Cape Provincial Archives and Records Service (CA J11634).  249
This book has been shaped by the generosity of many people and institutions over more than a decade. At Oxford University, Jan-Georg Deutsch nurtured the very beginnings of my research. His presence is sorely missed, but I believe he would be delighted to know that Stacey Hynd has remained a constant interlocutor as this book has developed over the last thirteen years.

At Stanford, Estelle Freedman and Sean Hanretta helped me to understand the political and intellectual stakes of the history of sexual violence, and of African history itself, in new ways. Galen Sibanda patiently taught me the Xhosa I needed to do this research. The Stanford History Department, Clayman Institute for Gender Research, and American Council of Learned Societies all provided financial support at crucial moments. I owe an infinite debt to Richard Roberts, whose mentorship of feminist scholars has shaped not only my own intellectual trajectory but also the field of African history. Many of these have made their own contributions to this book, including Lauren Jarvis, Abosede George, Jessica Powers, Rachel Jean-Baptiste, Thomas McClendon, and Emily Burrill. Benjamin Lawrance took me under his wing in western New York, providing both friendship and intellectual engagement.

The Fort Hare Institute for Social and Economic Research hosted me for the initial research into this book, which was funded by the Fulbright Institute for International Education. I am grateful to Gary Minkley and Leslie Bank for their support, and to Ross Truscott, Phindi Mnyaka, Michelle Smith, Sinazo Mtshemla, Sarah Bologna, and Nolwazi Mkhwanazi for the intellectual companionship and bountiful conversation during my year in East London. In Middledrift, Xoliswa Tunyiswa tutored me in local history. Archivists at the Western Cape Provincial Archives and Records Service, the Historical Papers collections at the University of the
Witwatersrand, the Cory Library, the South African National Archives, and the Howard Pim Library at the University of Fort Hare have been unflaggingly helpful.

In the later stages of writing, the Center for Law and Society at the University of Cape Town provided a stimulating environment as well as an important reminder of the human stakes of this research. I wish to thank Aninka Claasens and Dee Smythe for welcoming me; and Tara Weinburg, Thuto Thipe, Boitumelo Matlala, Monica D’Souza, Nolundi Luwaya, and Frances Eberhard for their friendship as well as their help navigating the complex relationships between nineteenth century history and contemporary politics.

At Hobart and William Smith Colleges, the office of the provost provided financial support for further research, while my colleagues in history, Africana studies, and women’s studies all helped me find my feet as a teacher as well as a scholar. Matt Kadane was the most supportive chair a junior faculty member could hope for. At Johns Hopkins, the intellectual community of the history department has pushed me to think across geographical and chronological boundaries in framing my research. Pier Larson, Sara Berry, Jane Guyer, and Mike Degani have helped create a vibrant African studies community, while Katie Hindmarch-Watson’s comments have helped me to situate this book within the history of the British Empire.

The ideas in this book would not be possible without the dedicated work of many other scholars. The pages that follow should make clear how much my work owes to the research of Jeff Peires and Victoria Collis-Buthelezi, along with Jeff Opland’s lifelong efforts to collect and translate the rich intellectual heritage of Xhosaland. Many other people have helped to sharpen my ideas through their suggestions and critiques. In South Africa, I owe particular thanks to Prinisha Badassy, Nafisa Essop Sheik, Natasha Erlank, Stephen Sparks, Sarah Duff, Catherine Burns, Keith Breckenridge, Ann Mager, Clive Glaser, Julie Parle, Sarah Delius, Julian Brown, Mbongiseni Buthelezi, Maanda Mulaudzi, and the participants in seminars at the University of Cape Town, the University of the Witwatersrand’s Institute for Social and Economic Research, and the University of Johannesburg. In the United States, the community fostered by the New England Workshop on Southern African Studies has provided an intellectual home for more than a decade. I am thankful to Meghan Healy-Clancy, Jill Kelly, Casey Golomski, Wendy Urban-Mead, Diana Jeater, and Robert Gordon for
Acknowledgments

their work sustaining it. Dan Magaziner, T. J. Tallie, and Suzanne Klausen are among the many participants whose engagement has shaped this book. Brett Shadle and Clifton Crais have generously read and commented on earlier iterations of this project. Noah Tamarkin and Sarah Zimmerman have seen this project at every step of its development. Not all of you will agree with the arguments I make here, but our shared conviction in the importance of these questions has provided the intellectual and moral foundation for my research.

I will be forever grateful for the stroke of luck that introduced me to Lydia Barnett, Nick Valvo, Jeff Miner, Katina Miner, Corey Tazzara, Noah Millstone, and Suzanne Sutherland. I learned much from eavesdropping on this circle of early modern Europeanists. More importantly, their friendship has sustained this project over more than a decade. Ria Tabacco Mar has likewise been a constant companion. In their roles as doting grandparents, Robert and Mary Thornberry have made it possible for me to sustain international research over the past five years.

Above all, Joseph Hale has made this book possible by following it, and me, first to East London and then to Palo Alto, Rochester, and Baltimore. The pages of this book contain a relentless recounting of men’s violence against women; our partnership has provided a constant reminder of the alternatives of joy, love, and care.
Abbreviations

BPP British Parliamentary Papers (House of Commons Sessional Papers)
CA Western Cape Provincial Records and Archives Service, Cape Town, South Africa
Includes the following series:
1/ELN Magistrate’s Office, East London
1/IDW Magistrate’s Office, Idutywa
1/MDT Magistrate’s Office, Middledrift
1/NKE Magistrate’s Office, Nqamakwe
1/TAM Magistrate’s Office, Tamacha
BK British Kaffrarian Papers
CMT Office of the Chief Magistrate of the Transkeian Territories
FA Fingo Agent
LG Lieutenant Governor of the Eastern Cape
MDS Special Magistrate, Middledrift
NA Secretary of Native Affairs
SGG Solicitor General’s Office
WCTU Records of the Women’s Christian Temperance Union of the Cape Colony
Cory Cory Library, Rhodes University, Grahamstown, South Africa
Includes the following series:
Lovedale Lovedale Collection
MCSA Records of the Methodist Church of South Africa
ISER Records of the Rhodes Institute for Social and Economic Research
EDC Reports of Cases Decided in the Eastern District Court of the Colony of the Cape of Good Hope (Juta: Cape Town)
SAB South African National Archives, Pretoria, South Africa
List of Abbreviations

SC  Cape Supreme Court Reports (Juta: Cape Town)
TS  Reports of Cases Decided in the Supreme Court of the Transvaal (African Book Company: Grahamstown).
UFH Howard Pim Library, University of Fort Hare, Alice, South Africa
WHP Historical Papers, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa

Includes the following series:

CPSA  Church of the Province of South Africa

WMMS Archives of the (Wesleyan) Methodist Missionary Society, School of Oriental and African Studies, London, United Kingdom