

## Iustitia Dei

Fourth Edition

The Christian doctrine of justification is of immense interest to historians and theologians and continues to be of major importance in modern ecumenical discussions. The present work appeared in its first edition in 1986, and rapidly became the leading reference work on the subject. Its many acclaimed features include a detailed assessment of the semantic background of the concept in the ancient Near East, a thorough examination of the doctrine of the medieval period, and an especially careful analysis of its development during the critical years of the sixteenth century. The substantially rewritten fourth edition thoroughly updates the work, responding to the latest developments in scholarly literature and user feedback. It will remain an essential resource for all concerned with the development of Christian doctrine, the history of the Reformation debates on the identity of Christianity, and modern discussions between Protestants and Roman Catholics over the nature of salvation.

ALISTER E. MCGRATH is a prominent academic writer on religious and theological topics. His publications include the international bestseller *The Dawkins Delusion?* (2007), the award-winning biography *C. S. Lewis – A Life* (2013), and the market-leading textbook *Christian Theology: An Introduction, Sixth Edition* (2016). He has also written some acclaimed monographs dealing with the history of Christian thought.

# Iustitia Dei

## *A History of the Christian Doctrine of Justification*

---

Fourth Edition

Alister E. McGrath  
University of Oxford



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-47256-2 — Iustitia Dei  
4th Edition  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108472562](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108472562)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108560702

First and Fourth editions © Cambridge University Press 1989, 2020

Second and Third editions © Alister E. McGrath 1998, 2005

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published in two volumes in 1986

### Volume I

First paperback edition 1989

Reprinted 1993, 1997

### Volume II

Reprinted 1991

First paperback edition 1993

Reprinted 1994, 1996

Second edition in one volume 1998, 2002

Third edition in one volume 2005

Fourth edition in one volume 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

### *Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: McGrath, Alister E., 1953– author.

Title: Iustitia Dei : a history of the Christian doctrine of justification / Alister E. McGrath.

Description: 4. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019038323 (print) | LCCN 2019038324 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108472562

(hardback) | ISBN 9781108459990 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108560702 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Justification (Christian theology)—History of doctrines.

Classification: LCC BT764.3 .M43 2019 (print) | LCC BT764.3 (ebook) | DDC 234/.709—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2019038323>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2019038324>

ISBN 978-1-108-47256-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-45999-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

---

<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>Preface to the Fourth Edition</i>	ix
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xi
Introduction	1
<b>Part I Justification: The Emergence of a Concept</b>	<b>7</b>
1 The Hebraic Context: Semantic Aspects of the Concept of Justification	11
2 Paul and the Shaping of the Christian Tradition	26
3 The Fountainhead: Augustine of Hippo	42
<b>Part II The Middle Ages: The Consolidation of the Doctrine</b>	<b>59</b>
4 The Nature of Justification	67
5 The Righteousness of God	82
6 The Concept of Grace	103
7 The Human Appropriation of Justification	118
8 Justification and the Two Powers of God	146
9 The Concept of Merit	156
10 Justification and the Sacraments	169

<b>Part III Protestantism: The Reformation Debates on Justification</b>	183
11 Is There a ‘Reformation’ Doctrine of Justification?	187
12 Luther’s Early Approach to Justification	193
13 Justification in Lutheranism, 1516–1580	204
14 Reformed Theology, 1519–1560	214
15 The English Reformation: From Tyndale to Hooker	227
16 Protestant Orthodoxy	237
17 Anglicanism: The Caroline Divines	252
18 Puritanism: From the Old World to the New	258
19 Pietism: Justification and the ‘New Birth’	268
<b>Part IV Catholicism: The Council of Trent on Justification</b>	277
20 Developments within Catholicism, 1490–1545	281
21 Catholic Responses to Early Protestant Doctrines of Justification	287
22 An Attempt at Rapprochement: The Regensburg Colloquy (1541)	293
23 Catholic Theological Schools during the Tridentine Debates on Justification	301
24 The Tridentine Debates on Justification	307
25 The Tridentine Decree on Justification	322
26 Post-Tridentine Discussions of Justification	333
<b>Part V The Modern Period</b>	341
27 The Enlightenment: Justification, Moralism and Rationalism	343

Contents	vii
28 The Long Nineteenth Century: Retrieval and Reconfiguration	356
29 Contemporary Renewal: Justification and Theological Reconstruction	377
Conclusion: Reflections on a Study of Doctrinal History	414
<i>A Brief Glossary of Medieval Soteriological Terms</i>	417
<i>Works Consulted</i>	420
<i>Index</i>	495

## Tables

---

23.1 The allegiances of theologians involved in the Tridentine proceedings on justification	<i>page</i> 304
25.1 Trent on the five causes of justification	325

## Preface to the Fourth Edition

---

In a recent review of the burgeoning scholarship relating to the English Reformation, the historian Peter Marshall noted the challenge to ‘maintain order and coherence in a large and untidy garden, alive with luxuriant foliage, periodic colorful blooms, and a smattering of undesirable weeds’.<sup>1</sup> This image comes to mind in contemplating the expanding body of scholarly literature on the doctrine of justification which has appeared in the last twenty years, often focussing on specific individuals or historical periods. The challenge is to integrate these studies into an overall narrative, allowing them to be located within a larger picture, and thus positioning them within a grander story of reflection and development. *Iustitia Dei* aims to distil, correlate and render coherent the findings of recent scholarship, and impose some order on what might otherwise seem chaotic and episodic. Some may feel that there is no overall coherence within this history. Perhaps this may prove to be true; it nevertheless remains useful to locate individual episodes within a larger narrative framework.

*Iustitia Dei* was published in two volumes in 1986, and rapidly established itself as a benchmark for discussion of the doctrine, especially in the ecumenical dialogues of that era. In 1998, it was reissued in a new format, merging the two original volumes without substantial revisions, while adding some new material relating to developments in the twentieth century. Although designated a ‘second edition’, its new format did not allow for a thorough and detailed revision of the work. It was, however, clear that such a review was needed. A third edition followed in 2005, offering a limited revision of the original work in the light of some scholarly developments since the publication of the first edition in 1986.

By this stage intense scholarly interest in the field at every level was leading to significant reappraisals of the overall trajectory of the development of the doctrine, which would require more substantial revision of the work once something of a consensus had emerged. By 2014, it

<sup>1</sup> Marshall, ‘(Re)Defining the English Reformation’, 564.



x Preface to the Fourth Edition

seemed to me that sufficient scholarly stability had been established to enable a major reworking of this volume, including substantial updating of the material, and a review of the structure of the work to ensure that the issues were presented as helpfully as possible, including streamlining some more arcane discussions that slowed down the pace of the narrative. I am grateful to Cambridge University Press for their generosity in allowing such a substantial revision of this work over an extended period of time.

This fourth edition thus represents a complete reappraisal of every aspect of previous editions, including their structure and format. Those using this work for teaching purposes should thus ensure that they familiarise themselves with these structural and scholarly changes. My continuing engagement with both primary and secondary sources in this field convinced me of the need to rewrite the book, retaining what was clearly sound, reliable and useful to its readers, while correcting or modifying whatever was open to justified criticism.

The rapid pace of scholarly development in many areas – such as the nature of Pelagianism, or the extent of early Christian engagement with the Pauline corpus – means that earlier editions of this work can no longer be considered to be reliable in their judgements at points of importance, precisely because of such significant shifts in the scholarly consensus. Scholarship is moving at an accelerating speed, and it is doubtful whether any study of a theological theme or motif can now ever hope to be described as definitive.

Finally, I must again disappoint those who are hoping for a definitive pronouncement on what the word ‘justification’ really means. This is a work of historical analysis, not of theological prescription. It does not attempt to define the concept of justification, but rather documents the various ways in which justification has been understood within the western theological tradition over two thousand years. That definitional task I gladly leave to others.

It is my pleasure to thank all those who have made this new edition possible, especially those who have read and commented on earlier versions of the work, but also those who have discussed its general themes with me. In particular, I wish to thank Henry Chadwick, M. D. Chenu OP, A. G. Dickens, Fergus Kerr OP, Anthony N. S. Lane, Oliver O’Donovan, Cassian Reel OFMCap, E. G. Rupp, Beryl Smalley, Peter Southwell, Matthew J. Thomas, N. T. Wright, E. J. Yarnold SJ and Adolar Zumkeller OESA for their comments and reflections over nearly forty years of reflection on these themes. I owe particular thanks to Cambridge University Press for being all that a good publisher should be. As always, I take full responsibility for any errors of fact or judgement that remain.

## Abbreviations

---

Bibliographical abbreviations generally follow the guidelines provided by S. Schwertner, *Internationales Abkürzungsverzeichnis für Theologie und Grenzgebiete*. 3rd edn. Berlin: de Gruyter, 2016.

AEH	Anglican and Episcopal History
AHC	Annuaire Historiae Conciliorum
AHR	American Historical Review
AJPS	American Journal of Political Science
AKG	Archiv für Kulturgeschichte
AnAug	Analecta Augustiniana
ARG	Archiv für Reformationsgeschichte
ARS	Annual Review of Sociology
ATG	Archivo teológico granadino
AThA	Année théologique augustinienne
AThR	Anglican Theological Review
AuA	Antike und Abendland
AugSt	Augustinian Studies
Augustinus	Augustinus: Revista trimestral publicada por los Padres Agustinos recoletos
BHR	Bibliothèque d'humanisme et Renaissance
BIOSCS	Bulletin of the International Organization for Septuagint and Cognate Studies
BJRL	Bulletin of the John Rylands Library
BSHPF	Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire de Protestantisme Français
BSLK	Bekennnisschriften der evangelisch-lutherischen Kirche
BSRK	Bekennnisschriften der reformierten Kirche
BSSV	Bollettino della Società di Studi Valdesi
CBQ	Catholic Biblical Quarterly
CChr	Corpus Christianorum Series Latina

xii List of Abbreviations

CFr	Collectanea Franciscana
ChH	Church History
CHRC	Church History and Religious Culture
ConJ	Concordia Journal
CR	Corpus Reformatorum
CSEL	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum
CSQ	Cistercian Studies Quarterly
CT	Concilium Tridentinum: diariorum, actorum, epistolarum, tractatum nova collection
CThJ	Calvin Theological Journal
CTQ	Concordia Theological Quarterly
D	Enchiridion Symbolorum Definitionum et Declarationum de Rebus Fidei et Morum
DR	Downside Review
DRChH	Dutch Review of Church History
EE	Estudios eclesiásticos
EETS	Early English Text Society
EHR	English Historical Review
ER	Ecclesia Reformanda
ERSY	Erasmus of Rotterdam Society Yearbook
EThL	Ephemerides Theologicae Lovanienses
ETR	Études théologiques et religieuses
EvQ	Evangelical Quarterly
EvTh	Evangelische Theologie
FrHist	French History
FrS	Franciscan Studies
FS	Franziskanische Studien
GGA	Göttingische Gelehrte Anzeigen
GOTR	Greek Orthodox Theological Review
GRBSt	Greek, Roman, and Byzantine Studies
HBTh	Horizons in Biblical Theology
HeyJ	Heythrop Journal
HJ	Historical Journal
HR	Historical Research
HThR	Harvard Theological Review
IJSTh	International Journal of Systematic Theology
JAC	Journal of Ancient Christianity
JbAC	Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum
JBL	Journal of Biblical Literature
JBS	Journal of British Studies
JECS	Journal of Early Christian Studies
JEH	Journal of Ecclesiastical History

## List of Abbreviations

xiii

JEMH	Journal of Early Modern History
JES	Journal of Ecumenical Studies
JETS	Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society
JFSR	Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion
JHI	Journal of the History of Ideas
JHMTh	Journal for the History of Modern Theology
JIH	Journal of Interdisciplinary History
JLARC	Journal for Late Antique Religion and Culture
JLTh	Journal of Literature and Theology
JMRS	Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies
JR	Journal of Religion
JRE	Journal of Religious Ethics
JRefTh	Journal of Reformed Theology
JRH	Journal of Religious History
JSNT	Journal for the Study of the New Testament
JSPL	Journal for the Study of Paul and His Letters
JThS	Journal of Theological Studies
KuD	Kerygma und Dogma
KuI	Kirche und Israel
KZG	Kirchliche Zeitgeschichte
LuJ	Luther-Jahrbuch
LuQ	Lutheran Quarterly
LuThK	Lutherische Theologie und Kirche
MF	Miscellanea Franciscana
MJT	Mid-America Journal of Theology
MoTh	Modern Theology
MQR	Mennonite Quarterly Review
MSR	Mélanges de Science Religieuse
MThZ	Münchener Theologische Zeitschrift
NRTh	Nouvelle revue théologique
NT	Novum Testamentum
NTS	New Testament Studies
NZStHR	Neue Zeitschrift für systematische Theologie und Religionsphilosophie
ÖR	Ökumenische Rundschau
OS	Calvini opera selecta
PG	Patrologiae cursus completus, Series Graeca
PL	Patrologiae cursus completus, Series Latina
PP	Past and Present
RdT	Rassegna di Teologia
REAug	Revue des études augustinienes

xiv List of Abbreviations

RechAug	Recherches augustiniennes
RHE	Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique
RelSt	Religious Studies
RenQ	Renaissance Quarterly
ResSR	Recherches de Science Religieuse
RET	Revista española de teología
RhM	Rheinische Museum für Philologie
RHR	Revue de l'histoire des religions
RMAL	Revue du moyen âge latin
RpB	Religionspädagogische Beiträge
RRR	Reformation and Renaissance Review
RSLR	Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa
RSPhTh	Revue des sciences philosophiques et théologiques
RSR	Revue des sciences religieuses
RThAM	Recherches de théologie ancienne et médiévale
RThom	Revue thomiste
RTP	Review of Theology and Philosophy
SBJTh	The Southern Baptist Journal of Theology
SCH	Studies in Church History
SCJ	Sixteenth Century Journal
SJTh	Scottish Journal of Theology
SSS	Social Studies of Science
StA	Melanchthons Werke in Auswahl: Studienausgabe
StB	Studia Biblica
StChHist	Studies in Church History
StPatr	Studia Patristica
StPh	Studies in Philology
StTh	Studia Theologica
SVThQ	St Vladimir's Theological Quarterly
ThGl	Theologie und Glaube
ThLZ	Theologische Literaturzeitung
ThPh	Theologie und Philosophie
ThQ	Theologische Quartalschrift
ThSt	Theological Studies
ThStKr	Theologische Studien und Kritiken
ThZ	Theologische Zeitschrift
TJTh	Toronto Journal of Theology
TRHS	Transactions of the Royal Historical Society
TThZ	Trierer Theologische Zeitschrift
VCaro	Verbum Caro
VigChr	Vigiliae Christianae

## List of Abbreviations

xv

VT	Vetus Testamentum
VyV	Verdad y Vida
WA	D. Martin Luthers Werke: Kritische Gesamtausgabe
WTJ	Westminster Theological Journal
WuW	Wissenschaft und Weisheit
Z	Huldreich Zwinglis sämtliche Werke
ZABRG	Zeitschrift für Altorientalische und Biblische Rechtsgeschichte
ZAC	Zeitschrift für Antikes Christentum
ZAW	Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft
ZfP	Zeitschrift für Politik
ZHF	Zeitschrift für Historische Forschung
ZKG	Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte
ZKTh	Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie
ZNW	Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft
ZRGG	Zeitschrift für Religions- und Geistesgeschichte
ZSTh	Zeitschrift für Systematische Theologie
ZThK	Zeitschrift für Theologie und Kirche
ZZ	Zwischen den Zeiten