DIALECTIC AFTER PLATO AND ARISTOTLE

Ancient dialectic started as an art of refutation and evolved into a science akin to logic, grammar and linguistics. Scholars of ancient philosophy have traditionally focused on Plato’s and Aristotle’s dialectic without paying much attention to the diverse conceptions and uses of dialectic presented by philosophers after the Classical period. To bridge the gap, this volume aims at a comprehensive understanding of the competing Hellenistic and Imperial definitions of dialectic and their connections with those of the Classical period. It starts from the Megaric school of the fourth century BC and the early Peripatetics, via Epicurus, the Stoics, the Academic sceptics and Cicero, to Sextus Empiricus and Galen in the second century AD. The philosophical foundations and various uses of dialectic are closely analysed and systematically examined, together with the numerous objections that were raised against them.

Thomas Bénatouïl is Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the University of Lille. He has published two books in French on Stoicism and many papers in French and English on Hellenistic and Imperial philosophy and on the contemporary reception of Stoicism. He is currently working on the Academy from Plato to Cicero.

Katerina Ierodiakonou is Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the University of Athens and at the University of Geneva. She has published extensively on ancient and Byzantine philosophy, especially in the areas of epistemology and logic. She is currently working on a monograph about ancient theories of colour, as well as on an edition, translation and commentary of Theophrastus’ De sensibus and of Michael Psellos’ paraphrase of Aristotle’s De interpretatione.
DIALECTIC AFTER PLATO
AND ARISTOTLE

EDITED BY
THOMAS BÉNATOUÏL
Université de Lille

KATERINA IERODIAKONOU
Université de Genève
National and Kapodistrian University of Athens
Contents

List of Contributors page vii
Preface ix
List of Abbreviations x

Introduction: Dialectics in Dialogue

Thomas Bénatouïl

1 Megara and Dialectic

James Allen 17

2 Dialectic in the Early Peripatos

Paolo Crivelli 47

3 Epicurus on Dialectic

David Sedley 82

4 Dialectic as a Subpart of Stoic Philosophy

Katerina Ierodiakonou 114

5 Stoic Dialectic and Its Objects

Jean-Baptiste Gourinat 134

6 Dialectic in the Hellenistic Academy

Luca Castagnoli 168

7 Pithana and probabilia

Tobias Reinhardt 218

8 Terminology and Practice of Dialectic in Cicero’s Letters

Sophie Aubert-Baillot 254

9 The Sceptic’s Modes of Argumentation

Benjamin Morison 283
Contributors

JAMES ALLEN, Professor of Philosophy, University of Toronto

SOPHIE AUBERT-BAILOT, Associate Professor of Latin, Université Grenoble Alpes and UMR 5316 Litt&Arts – ‘Translatio’

THOMAS BÉNATOUIL, Professor of Ancient Philosophy, Université de Lille and UMR 8163 ‘Savoirs, Textes, Langage’

LUCA CASTAGNOLI, Associate Professor of Ancient Greek Philosophy and Fellow of Oriel College, Oxford

RICCARDO CHIARADONNA, Professor of Ancient Philosophy, Università Roma Tre

PAOLO CRIVELLI, Professor of Ancient Philosophy, Université de Genève

JEAN-BAPTISTE GOURINAT, Directeur de recherche CNRS, Centre Léon Robin, Sorbonne Université

KATERINA IERODIAKONOU, Professor of Ancient Philosophy, National and Kapodistrian University of Athens and Associate Professor, Université de Genève

BENJAMIN MORISON, Professor of Philosophy, Princeton University

TOBIAS REINHARDT, Corpus Christi Professor of Latin, Oxford

DAVID SEDLEY, Emeritus Laurence Professor of Ancient Philosophy and Fellow of Christ’s College, Cambridge
Preface

This volume contains the Proceedings of the thirteenth *Symposium Hellenisticum*, which was held in the Abbaye des Prémontrés at Pont-à-Mousson (Lorraine, France) from 15 to 19 July 2013. Thanks are due to the *Institut Universitaire de France*, the *Cornelia L. De Vogel Foundation*, the *Région Lorraine*, the *Laboratoire d'Histoire des Sciences et de Philosophie-Archives Henri Poincaré* (UMR 7117, CNRS–Université de Lorraine) and the UFR *Connaissance de l'homme* (Université de Lorraine) for their very generous financial support; also, to Roger Pouivet, Gerhard Heinzman and Anny Bégard, from the *Archives Poincaré*, for supporting and helping the organisers before and during the *Symposium* in numerous ways; finally, to Anna Ntinti for her help in transforming the various papers into a homogeneous text and for producing the indices.

All the chapters of this book were presented as papers and discussed during the *Symposium*, except Paolo Crivelli’s Chapter 2, which was commissioned afterwards by the organising committee. The participants in the *Symposium* were: James Allen, Keimpe Algra, Sophie Aubert-Baillot, Thomas Bénatouïl, Gábor Betegh, Richard Bett, Mauro Bonazzi, Tad Brennan, Charles Brittain, Luca Castagnoli, Riccardo Chiaradonna, Paolo Crivelli, Dorothea Frede, Jean-Baptiste Gourinat, Katerina Ierodiakonou, Brad Inwood, Anthony Long, Stephen Menn, Benjamin Morison, Tobias Reinhardt, Malcolm Schofield, David Sedley, Gisela Striker, Teun Tieleman, Christelle Veillard and James Warren.
Abbreviations

Acad. Cicero, Academica
Alex. Aphr. Alexander of Aphrodisias
Anon., in Theaet. Anonymous Commentary on Plato’s Theaetetus
APo. Aristotle, Analytica Posteriora
APr. Aristotle, Analytica Priora
Arist. Aristotle
Att. Cicero, Letters to Atticus
Brut. Cicero, Brutus
Cael. Aristotle, De caelo
Cic. Cicero
Clem. Strom. Clement of Alexandria, Stromata
Col. Plutarch, Adversus Colotem
Comm. not. Plutarch, De communibus notitiis adversus Stoicos
De or. Cicero, De oratore
Did. Alcinous, Didaskalikos
DL Diogenes Laertius, Lives of eminent philosophers
EN Aristotle, Ethica Nicomachea
Epict., Diss. Epictetus, Dissertationes
Eus., PE Eusebius, Praeparatio Evangelica
Fam. Cicero, Ad familiares
Fat. Cicero, De fato
FDS Hülser 1987–1988
Fin. Cicero, De finibus bonorum et malorum
Gell., NA Aulus-Gellius, Noctes Atticae
Hom. Od. Homer, Odyssey
Int. Aristotle, De interpretatione
Inv. Cicero, De inventione
List of Abbreviations

Lact., Div. Inst. Lactantius, Divinae Institutiones
Leg. Cicero, De legibus
L. L. Varro, De lingua latina
LS Long and Sedley 1987
LSJ Liddell, Scott, Jones, Greek-English Lexicon
Luc. Cicero, Lucullus
M Sextus Empiricus, Adversus Mathematicos
Met. Aristotle, Metaphysica
Meteor. Aristotle, Meteorologica
ND Cicero, De natura deorum
Off. Cicero, De officiis
OLD Oxford Latin Dictionary
PA Aristotle, De partibus animalium
Part. Cicero, Partitiones oratoriae
PH Sextus Empiricus, Outlines of pyrrhonism
Phld. Philodemus
Phlp., Aet. Mun Philoponus, De aeternitate mundi
Plac. Placita philosophorum
Plut. Plutarch
Proleg. Philos. David/Elias, Prolegomena Philosophiae
Quint., Inst. Quintilian, Institutio oratoria
Resp. Plato, Republic
Rhet. Rhetorica
SE Aristotle, Sophistici Elenchi
Sen., Ep. Seneca, Epistulae morales ad Lucilium
Simpl. Simplicius
Soph. Plato, Sophist
SSR Giannantoni 1990
Stob., Ecl. Stobaeus, Eclogae
Stoic. rep. Plutarch, De Stoicorum repugnantis
SVF Arnim 1903–1924
T Döring 1972
TLL Thesaurus Linguae Latinae
Top. Topica
Tusc. Cicero, Tusculanae disputationes