

TRANSPARENCY IN HEALTH AND HEALTH CARE IN THE UNITED STATES

Transparency is a concept that is becoming increasingly lauded as a solution to a host of problems in the American health care system. Transparency initiatives show great promise, including empowering patients and other stakeholders to make more efficient decisions, improve resource allocation, and better regulate the health care industry. Nevertheless, transparency is not a cure-all for the problems facing the modern health care system. The authors of this volume present a nuanced view of transparency, exploring ways in which transparency has succeeded and ways in which transparency initiatives have room for improvement. Working at the intersection of law, medicine, ethics, and business, the book goes beyond the buzzwords to the heart of transparency's transformative potential, while interrogating its obstacles and downsides. It should be read by anyone looking for a better understanding of transparency in the health care context.

Holly Fernandez Lynch, JD, MBE, is the John Russell Dickson, MD Presidential Assistant Professor of Medical Ethics at the University of Pennsylvania's Perelman School of Medicine. She focuses her scholarly research on issues at the intersection of law, bioethics, and health policy, in particular the ethics and regulation of research with human subjects and conflicts of conscience in health care.

I. Glenn Cohen, JD, is the James A. Attwood and Leslie Williams Professor of Law and Faculty Director of Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law, Biotechnology & Bioethics at Harvard Law School. He is one of the world's leading experts on the intersection of bioethics and the law, as well as health law. He is the author of more than 110 articles in venues like the *New England Journal of Medicine*, *JAMA*, *Nature*, and the *Harvard Law Review*, and the author, editor, or co-editor of 12 books.

Carmel Shachar, JD, MPH, is the Executive Director of the Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics at Harvard Law School. Carmel's scholarship focuses on law and health policy, in particular the regulation of access to care for vulnerable individuals, health care anti-discrimination law and policy, and the use of all-payer claims databases in health care research. Carmel is also a Lecturer at Law on Harvard Law School, where she co-teaches a course on "Health Care Rights in the Twenty-First Century."

Barbara J. Evans, PhD, JD, LL.M., is the Mary Ann and Lawrence E. Faust Professor of Law, Professor of Electrical and Computer Engineering, and Director of the Center for Biotechnology & Law at the University of Houston. Her research interests include data privacy and access, regulation of emerging biotechnologies and machine-learning software, and genomic civil rights.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-47099-5 — Transparency in Health and Health Care in the United States

Edited by Holly Fernandez Lynch , I. Glenn Cohen , Carmel Shachar , Barbara J. Evans

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

Transparency in Health and Health Care in the United States

LAW AND ETHICS

Edited by

HOLLY FERNANDEZ LYNCH

University of Pennsylvania, Perelman School of Medicine

I. GLENN COHEN

Petrie-Flom Center, Harvard Law School

CARMEL SHACHAR

Petrie-Flom Center, Harvard Law School

BARBARA J. EVANS

University of Houston Law Center



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47099-5 — Transparency in Health and Health Care in the United States
Edited by Holly Fernandez Lynch, I. Glenn Cohen, Carmel Shachar, Barbara J. Evans
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108470995

DOI: 10.1017/9781108658867

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-47099-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-45693-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Every effort has been made in preparing this book to provide accurate and up-to-date information which is in accord with accepted standards and practice at the time of publication. Although case histories are drawn from actual cases, every effort has been made to disguise the identities of the individuals involved. Nevertheless, the authors, editors and publishers can make no warranties that the information contained herein is totally free from error, not least because clinical standards are constantly changing through research and regulation. The authors, editors and publishers therefore disclaim all liability for direct or consequential damages resulting from the use of material contained in this book. Readers are strongly advised to pay careful attention to information provided by the manufacturer of any drugs or equipment that they plan to use.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-47099-5 — Transparency in Health and Health Care in the United States

Edited by Holly Fernandez Lynch , I. Glenn Cohen , Carmel Shachar , Barbara J. Evans

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

*I. Glenn Cohen – To Daniel Segal, bright light and dark matter; To Vik Joshi,
a subway ride and trips not taken*

Holly Fernandez Lynch – To Cristine Hutchison-Jones, my Type-A comrade

*Carmel Shachar – To I. Glenn Cohen and Holly Fernandez Lynch for
drawing me back into the PFC family*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-47099-5 — Transparency in Health and Health Care in the United States

Edited by Holly Fernandez Lynch , I. Glenn Cohen , Carmel Shachar , Barbara J. Evans

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
Introduction	
Carmel Shachar, I. Glenn Cohen, Holly Fernandez Lynch, and Barbara J. Evans	1
PART I: TRANSPARENCY IN HEALTH AND HEALTH CARE: THEMATIC ISSUES	13
Introduction to Part I	15
Abigail R. Moncrieff	
1 Smashing into Windows: The Limits of Consumer Sovereignty in Health Care	17
Barry R. Furrow	
2 The Interplay of Privacy and Transparency in Health Care: The HIPAA Privacy Rule as a Case Study	30
Barbara J. Evans	
3 Transparency Trade-offs: Priority Setting, Scarcity, and Health Fairness	44
Govind Persad	
4 Slightly Hazy: Transparency and the Costs of Too Much Information	58
Oliver J. Kim	

	PART II: TRANSPARENCY AND INFORMED CONSENT	69
	Introduction to Part II	71
	Luke Gelinas	
5	Transparency versus Informed Consent: The Patient/Consumer Paradigms	75
	Craig J. Konnoth	
6	Transparency and Financial Conflicts: The Uncertain Case for Sunshine	88
	Richard S. Saver	
7	Making Religion Transparent: The Substance, Process, and Efficacy of Disclosing Religious Restrictions on Care	103
	Elizabeth Sepper	
	PART III: TRANSPARENCY AND ECONOMICS: HEALTH CARE COSTS AND BILLING	115
	Introduction to Part III	117
	Kristin M. Madison	
8	Transparency on Prescription Drug Research Expenditures: A Lever for Restraining Pricing?	121
	Ameet Sarpatwari, Jerry Avorn, and Aaron S. Kesselheim	
9	Is Pharmaceutical Price Transparency an Effective Means to Reduce High Prices and Wide Variations?	132
	Marc A. Rodwin	
10	Price Transparency: A Contracts Solution	153
	Wendy Netter Epstein	
11	Solving Surprise Medical Bills	165
	Mark A. Hall	
	PART IV: TRANSPARENCY AND INNOVATION	179
	Introduction to Part IV	181
	Holly Fernandez Lynch	
12	Increasing the Transparency of FDA Review to Enhance the Innovation Process	185
	Rachel E. Sachs and Thomas J. Hwang	

Contents

ix

- | | | |
|----|---|-----|
| 13 | Transparency and Clinical Trial Data Sharing: Legal and Policy Issues
Barbara E. Bierer, Mark Barnes, and Rebecca Li | 196 |
| 14 | The European Medicines Agency’s Approach to Transparency
Stefano Marino and Spyridon Drosos | 210 |
| | PART V: TRANSPARENCY AND OUTCOMES: PROMOTING HEALTH AND SAFETY | 227 |
| | Introduction to Part V
Gregory Curfman | 229 |
| 15 | The Role of Transparency in Promoting Healthy Behaviors: Pros, Cons, and Perils of Information Sharing to Foster Personal Responsibility in Health Care
Anthony W. Orlando and Arnold J. Rosoff | 233 |
| 16 | The Role of Transparency in Patient Safety Improvement
Michelle M. Mello, David M. Studdert, Brahmajee K. Nallamothu, and Allen Kachalia | 244 |
| 17 | Personal Health Records as a Tool for Transparency in Health Care
Sharona Hoffman | 260 |
| 18 | Nontransparency in Electronic Health Record Systems
Jim Hawkins, Barbara J. Evans, and Harlan M. Krumholz | 273 |
| 19 | Transparency Challenges in Reproductive Health Care
Dov Fox | 286 |
| | PART VI: CHALLENGES IN PROMOTING AND MEASURING TRANSPARENCY IN HEALTH CARE | 297 |
| | Introduction to Part VI
I. Glenn Cohen | 299 |
| 20 | ERISA as a Barrier for State Health Care Transparency Efforts
Erin C. Fuse Brown and Jaime S. King | 301 |
| 21 | Transparency and Data Sharing in Clinical Research and Big Pharma
Jennifer E. Miller | 314 |

- | | | |
|----|--|-----|
| 22 | Promoting IRB Transparency: About What, To Whom, Why, and How?
Holly Fernandez Lynch | 329 |
| 23 | Using Disclosure to Regulate PBMs: The Dark Side of Transparency
David A. Hyman and William E. Kovacic | 343 |

Contributors

Jerry Avorn, MD Chief, Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Brigham and Women's Hospital; Professor of Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Mark Barnes, JD, LLM Partner, Ropes & Gray, LLP, Boston, MA, USA; Visiting Lecturer in Law, Yale Law School, New Haven, CT, USA

Barbara E. Bierer, MD Senior Physician, Brigham and Women's Hospital; Faculty Director, the Multi-Regional Clinical Trials Center of Brigham and Women's Hospital and Harvard; Professor of Medicine (Pediatrics), Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Erin C. Fuse Brown, JD, MPH Associate Professor of Law and Faculty Member of the Center for Law, Health and Society, Georgia State University College of Law, Atlanta, GA, USA

I. Glenn Cohen, JD James A. Attwood and Leslie Williams Professor of Law; Faculty Director, Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics, Harvard Law School, Cambridge, MA, USA

Gregory Curfman, M.D. Deputy Editor, JAMA, Chicago, IL, USA

Spyridon Drosos, LLM Legal Adviser at the European Medicines Agency, London, UK; Visiting Lecturer at the Catholic University of Lille, Paris, France

Wendy Netter Epstein, JD Professor of Law and Faculty Director of the Mary and Michael Jaharis Health Law Institute, DePaul University College of Law, Chicago, IL, USA

Barbara J. Evans, PhD, JD, LLM Mary Ann and Lawrence E. Faust Professor of Law, Director of the Center for Biotechnology & Law; Professor of Electrical and Computer Engineering, the University of Houston, Houston, TX, USA

Dov Fox, LL.M., JD, DPhil Professor of Law and Director of the Center for Health Law, Policy & Bioethics, University of San Diego School of Law, San Diego, CA, USA

Barry R. Furrow, JD Professor of Law and Director of the Health Law Program, Kline School of Law, Drexel University, Philadelphia, PA, USA

Luke Gelinas, PhD Chairperson, Advarra IRB, Columbia, MD, USA

Mark A. Hall, JD Fred & Elizabeth Turnage Professor of Law and Public Health; Director, the Health Law and Policy Program, Wake Forest University School of Law, Winston-Salem, NC, USA

Jim Hawkins, JD Professor of Law and George Butler Research Professor of Law, University of Houston Law Center, Houston, TX, USA

Sharona Hoffman, JD, LL.M., SJD Edgar A. Hahn Professor of Law, Professor of Bioethics, and Co-Director of the Law-Medicine Center, Case Western Reserve University School of Law, Cleveland, OH, USA

Thomas J. Hwang, AB Associate Researcher, Program on Regulation, Therapeutics, and Law (PORTAL), Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Brigham and Women's Hospital and Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

David A. Hyman MD, JD Professor of Law, Georgetown Law Center, Washington, DC, USA

Allen Kachalia, MD, JD Associate Professor of Medicine, Harvard Medical School; Chief Quality Officer, Brigham Health, Boston, MA, USA

Aaron S. Kesselheim, MD, JD, MPH Director, Program on Regulation, Therapeutics, And Law (PORTAL), Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Brigham and Women's Hospital and Harvard Medical School; Associate Professor of Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Oliver J. Kim, JD, LL.M. President, Mousetrap Consulting, Washington, DC, USA; Adjunct Professor of Law, University of Pittsburgh Law School, Pittsburgh, PA, USA

Jaime S. King, JD, PhD Associate Dean and Faculty Director of the UCSF/UC Hastings Consortium on Science, Law and Health Policy, Professor of Law, and Bion M. Gregory Chair in Business Law, University of California, Hastings College of the Law, San Francisco, CA

Craig J. Konnoth, MPhil, JD Associate Professor of Law, University of Colorado School of Law, Denver, CO, USA

List of Contributors

xiii

Harlan M. Krumholz, MD, SM Harold H. Hines, Jr. Professor of Medicine (Cardiology); Professor in the Institute for Social and Policy Studies, of Investigative Medicine and of Public Health (Health Policy); Director, Center for Outcomes Research and Evaluation, Yale-New Haven Hospital; Co-Director, Robert Wood Johnson Foundation Clinical Scholars Program, Yale University, New Haven, CT, USA

Rebecca Li, PhD Executive Director, Vivli; Senior Advisor, the Multi-Regional Clinical Trials Center of Brigham and Women's Hospital and Harvard; Instructor, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Holly Fernandez Lynch, JD, MBe John Russell Dickson, MD Presidential Assistant Professor of Medical Ethics, Perelman School of Medicine, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA, USA

Kristin M. Madison, JD, PhD Professor of Law and Health Sciences, School of Law and the Bouvé College of Health Sciences, Northeastern University, Boston, MA, USA

Stefano Marino, Head of Legal Department at the European Medicines Agency, London, UK

Michelle M. Mello, JD, PhD, MPhil Professor of Law, Stanford Law School; Professor of Health Research and Policy, Stanford University School of Medicine, Stanford, CA, USA

Jennifer E. Miller, PhD Assistant Professor, Yale University School of Medicine, New Haven, CT, USA; Founder, Bioethics International, USA

Abigail R. Moncrieff, JD Visiting Scholar in the Law School and Graduate Student in Government at University of Texas, Austin

Brahmajee K. Nallamothu, MD, MPH Professor of Internal Medicine, University of Michigan Cardiovascular Center, Ann Arbor, MI, USA

Anthony W. Orlando, MSc, MPW, PhD Assistant Professor, Finance, Real Estate, and Law Department, California State Polytechnic University, Pomona, College of Business Administration, Pomona, CA, USA

Govind Persad, JD, PhD Assistant Professor, University of Denver Sturm College of Law, Denver, CO, USA

Marc A. Rodwin, JD, PhD Professor of Law, Suffolk University Law School, Boston, MA, USA

Arnold J. Rosoff, JD Professor Emeritus of Legal Studies and Health Care Management, Wharton School; Senior Fellow, Leonard Davis Institute of Health

Economics and Center for Public Health Initiatives, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA, USA

Rachel E. Sachs, JD, MPH Associate Professor of Law, Washington University in St. Louis, St. Louis, MO, USA

Ameet Sarpatwari, JD, PhD Assistant Director, Program on Regulation, Therapeutics, And Law (PORTAL), Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Brigham and Women's Hospital and Harvard Medical School; Instructor in Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Richard S. Saver, JD Arch. T. Allen Distinguished Professor of Law, University of North Carolina School of Law; Professor (secondary appointment), University of North Carolina School of Medicine; Adjunct Professor, University of North Carolina Gillings School of Global Public Health, Chapel Hill, NC, USA

Elizabeth Sepper, JD, LLM Professor of Law, Washington University School of Law, St. Louis, MO, USA

Carmel Shachar, JD, MPH Executive Director, Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics, and Lecturer on Law, Harvard Law School, Cambridge, MA, USA

David M. Studdert, LLB, ScD, MPH Professor of Law, Stanford Law School; Professor of Medicine, Stanford University School of Medicine, Stanford, CA, USA

Acknowledgments

A book like this is the result of the hard work of many. We thank our student line editors Joseph Ruckert (lead line editor), John Hylton, Gali Katznelson, Rohit Rajan, Nate Szyman, and Grace Wallack for their meticulous work. We are also grateful to Cristine Hutchison-Jones and Justin Leahey for their administrative support in putting on the conference that gave rise to this book, and Cristine in particular for her hard work shepherding all the many pieces of this manuscript. We also thankfully acknowledge the Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics at Harvard Law School, with support from the Oswald DeN. Cammann Fund, for conference sponsorship. Finally, of course, we thank the contributors for their thoughtful and important scholarly contributions.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-47099-5 — Transparency in Health and Health Care in the United States

Edited by Holly Fernandez Lynch , I. Glenn Cohen , Carmel Shachar , Barbara J. Evans

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)
