Transparency is a concept that is becoming increasingly lauded as a solution to a host of problems in the American health care system. Transparency initiatives show great promise, including empowering patients and other stakeholders to make more efficient decisions, improve resource allocation, and better regulate the health care industry. Nevertheless, transparency is not a cure-all for the problems facing the modern health care system. The authors of this volume present a nuanced view of transparency, exploring ways in which transparency has succeeded and ways in which transparency initiatives have room for improvement. Working at the intersection of law, medicine, ethics, and business, the book goes beyond the buzzwords to the heart of transparency’s transformative potential, while interrogating its obstacles and downsides. It should be read by anyone looking for a better understanding of transparency in the health care context.

Holly Fernandez Lynch, JD, MBE, is the John Russell Dickson, MD Presidential Assistant Professor of Medical Ethics at the University of Pennsylvania’s Perelman School of Medicine. She focuses her scholarly research on issues at the intersection of law, bioethics, and health policy, in particular the ethics and regulation of research with human subjects and conflicts of conscience in health care.

I. Glenn Cohen, JD, is the James A. Attwood and Leslie Williams Professor of Law and Faculty Director of Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law, Biotechnology & Bioethics at Harvard Law School. He is one of the world’s leading experts on the intersection of bioethics and the law, as well as health law. He is the author of more than 110 articles in venues like the New England Journal of Medicine, JAMA, Nature, and the Harvard Law Review, and the author, editor, or co-editor of 12 books.

Carmel Shachar, JD, MPH, is the Executive Director of the Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics at Harvard Law School. Carmel’s scholarship focuses on law and health policy, in particular the regulation of access to care for vulnerable individuals, health care anti-discrimination law and policy, and the use of all-payer claims databases in health care research. Carmel is also a Lecturer at Law on Harvard Law School, where she co-teaches a course on “Health Care Rights in the Twenty-First Century.”

Barbara J. Evans, PhD, JD, LLM, is the Mary Ann and Lawrence E. Faust Professor of Law, Professor of Electrical and Computer Engineering, and Director of the Center for Biotechnology & Law at the University of Houston. Her research interests include data privacy and access, regulation of emerging biotechnologies and machine-learning software, and genomic civil rights.
Transparency in Health and Health Care in the United States

LAW AND ETHICS

Edited by

HOLLY FERNANDEZ LYNCH
University of Pennsylvania, Perelman School of Medicine

I. GLENN COHEN
Petrie-Flom Center, Harvard Law School

CARMEL SHACHAR
Petrie-Flom Center, Harvard Law School

BARBARA J. EVANS
University of Houston Law Center
I. Glenn Cohen – To Daniel Segal, bright light and dark matter; To Vik Joshi, a subway ride and trips not taken

Holly Fernandez Lynch – To Cristine Hutchison-Jones, my Type-A comrade

Carmel Shachar – To I. Glenn Cohen and Holly Fernandez Lynch for drawing me back into the PFC family
Contents

List of Contributors  xi
Acknowledgments xv

Introduction
Carmel Shachar, I. Glenn Cohen, Holly Fernandez Lynch, and Barbara J. Evans  1

PART I: TRANSPARENCY IN HEALTH AND HEALTH CARE: THEMATIC ISSUES  13

Introduction to Part I  15
Abigail R. Moncrieff

1 Smashing into Windows: The Limits of Consumer Sovereignty in Health Care  17
Barry R. Furrow

2 The Interplay of Privacy and Transparency in Health Care: The HIPAA Privacy Rule as a Case Study  30
Barbara J. Evans

3 Transparency Trade-offs: Priority Setting, Scarcity, and Health Fairness  44
Govind Persad

4 Slightly Hazy: Transparency and the Costs of Too Much Information  58
Oliver J. Kim
## Contents

### Part II: Transparency and Informed Consent

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Transparency versus Informed Consent: The Patient/Consumer Paradigms</td>
<td>Craig J. Konnoth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Transparency and Financial Conflicts: The Uncertain Case for Sunshine</td>
<td>Richard S. Saver</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Making Religion Transparent: The Substance, Process, and Efficacy of Disclosing Religious Restrictions on Care</td>
<td>Elizabeth Sepper</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Part III: Transparency and Economics: Health Care Costs and Billing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Transparency on Prescription Drug Research Expenditures: A Lever for Restraining Pricing?</td>
<td>Ameet Sarpatwari, Jerry Avorn, and Aaron S. Kesselheim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Is Pharmaceutical Price Transparency an Effective Means to Reduce High Prices and Wide Variations?</td>
<td>Marc A. Rodwin</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Part IV: Transparency and Innovation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Increasing the Transparency of FDA Review to Enhance the Innovation Process</td>
<td>Rachel E. Sachs and Thomas J. Hwang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Promoting IRB Transparency: About What, To Whom, Why, and How?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Holly Fernandez Lynch</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>329</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Using Disclosure to Regulate PBMs: The Dark Side of Transparency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>David A. Hyman and William E. Kovacic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>343</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contributors

Jerry Avorn, MD Chief, Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Brigham and Women’s Hospital; Professor of Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Mark Barnes, JD, LLM Partner, Ropes & Gray, LLP, Boston, MA, USA; Visiting Lecturer in Law, Yale Law School, New Haven, CT, USA

Barbara E. Bierer, MD Senior Physician, Brigham and Women’s Hospital; Faculty Director, the Multi-Regional Clinical Trials Center of Brigham and Women’s Hospital and Harvard; Professor of Medicine (Pediatrics), Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Erin C. Fuse Brown, JD, MPH Associate Professor of Law and Faculty Member of the Center for Law, Health and Society, Georgia State University College of Law, Atlanta, GA, USA

I. Glenn Cohen, JD James A. Attwood and Leslie Williams Professor of Law; Faculty Director, Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics, Harvard Law School, Cambridge, MA, USA

Gregory Curfman, M.D. Deputy Editor, JAMA, Chicago, IL, USA

Spyridon Drosos, LLM Legal Adviser at the European Medicines Agency, London, UK; Visiting Lecturer at the Catholic University of Lille, Paris, France

Wendy Netter Epstein, JD Professor of Law and Faculty Director of the Mary and Michael Jaharis Health Law Institute, DePaul University College of Law, Chicago, IL, USA

Barbara J. Evans, PhD, JD, LLM Mary Ann and Lawrence E. Faust Professor of Law, Director of the Center for Biotechnology & Law; Professor of Electrical and Computer Engineering, the University of Houston, Houston, TX, USA
List of Contributors

Dov Fox, LLM, JD, DPhil
Professor of Law and Director of the Center for Health Law, Policy & Bioethics, University of San Diego School of Law, San Diego, CA, USA

Barry R. Furrow, JD
Professor of Law and Director of the Health Law Program, Kline School of Law, Drexel University, Philadelphia, PA, USA

Luke Gelinas, PhD
Chairperson, Advarra IRB, Columbia, MD, USA

Mark A. Hall, JD
Fred & Elizabeth Turnage Professor of Law and Public Health; Director, the Health Law and Policy Program, Wake Forest University School of Law, Winston-Salem, NC, USA

Jim Hawkins, JD
Professor of Law and George Butler Research Professor of Law, University of Houston Law Center, Houston, TX, USA

Sharona Hoffman, JD, LLM, SJD
Edgar A. Hahn Professor of Law, Professor of Bioethics, and Co-Director of the Law-Medicine Center, Case Western Reserve University School of Law, Cleveland, OH, USA

Thomas J. Hwang, AB
Associate Researcher, Program on Regulation, Therapeutics, and Law (PORTAL), Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Brigham and Women’s Hospital and Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

David A. Hyman MD, JD
Professor of Law, Georgetown Law Center, Washington, DC, USA

Allen Kachalia, MD, JD
Associate Professor of Medicine, Harvard Medical School; Chief Quality Officer, Brigham Health, Boston, MA, USA

Aaron S. Kesselheim, MD, JD, MPH
Director, Program on Regulation, Therapeutics, And Law (PORTAL), Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Brigham and Women’s Hospital and Harvard Medical School; Associate Professor of Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Oliver J. Kim, JD, LLM
President, Mousetrap Consulting, Washington, DC, USA; Adjunct Professor of Law, University of Pittsburgh Law School, Pittsburgh, PA, USA

Jaime S. King, JD, PhD
Associate Dean and Faculty Director of the UCSF/UC Hastings Consortium on Science, Law and Health Policy, Professor of Law, and Bion M. Gregory Chair in Business Law, University of California, Hastings College of the Law, San Francisco, CA

Craig J. Konnoth, MPhil, JD
Associate Professor of Law, University of Colorado School of Law, Denver, CO, USA
List of Contributors

Harlan M. Krumholz, MD, SM Harold H. Hines, Jr. Professor of Medicine (Cardiology); Professor in the Institute for Social and Policy Studies, of Investigative Medicine and of Public Health (Health Policy); Director, Center for Outcomes Research and Evaluation, Yale-New Haven Hospital; Co-Director, Robert Wood Johnson Foundation Clinical Scholars Program, Yale University, New Haven, CT, USA

Rebecca Li, PhD Executive Director, Vivli; Senior Advisor, the Multi-Regional Clinical Trials Center of Brigham and Women’s Hospital and Harvard; Instructor, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Holly Fernandez Lynch, JD, MBe John Russell Dickson, MD Presidential Assistant Professor of Medical Ethics, Perelman School of Medicine, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA, USA

Kristin M. Madison, JD, PhD Professor of Law and Health Sciences, School of Law and the Bouvé College of Health Sciences, Northeastern University, Boston, MA, USA

Stefano Marino, Head of Legal Department at the European Medicines Agency, London, UK

Michelle M. Mello, JD, PhD, MPhil Professor of Law, Stanford Law School; Professor of Health Research and Policy, Stanford University School of Medicine, Stanford, CA, USA

Jennifer E. Miller, PhD Assistant Professor, Yale University School of Medicine, New Haven, CT, USA; Founder, Bioethics International, USA

Abigail R. Moncrieff, JD Visiting Scholar in the Law School and Graduate Student in Government at University of Texas, Austin

Brahmajee K. Nallamothu, MD, MPH Professor of Internal Medicine, University of Michigan Cardiovascular Center, Ann Arbor, MI, USA

Anthony W. Orlando, MSc, MPW, PhD Assistant Professor, Finance, Real Estate, and Law Department, California State Polytechnic University, Pomona, College of Business Administration, Pomona, CA, USA

Govind Persad, JD, PhD Assistant Professor, University of Denver Sturm College of Law, Denver, CO, USA

Marc A. Rodwin, JD, PhD Professor of Law, Suffolk University Law School, Boston, MA, USA

Arnold J. Rosoff, JD Professor Emeritus of Legal Studies and Health Care Management, Wharton School; Senior Fellow, Leonard Davis Institute of Health
List of Contributors

Economics and Center for Public Health Initiatives, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA, USA

Rachel E. Sachs, JD, MPH Associate Professor of Law, Washington University in St. Louis, St. Louis, MO, USA

Ameet Sarpatwari, JD, PhD Assistant Director, Program on Regulation, Therapeutics, And Law (PORTAL), Division of Pharmacoepidemiology and Pharmacoeconomics, Brigham and Women’s Hospital and Harvard Medical School; Instructor in Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Richard S. Saver, JD Arch. T. Allen Distinguished Professor of Law, University of North Carolina School of Law; Professor (secondary appointment), University of North Carolina School of Medicine; Adjunct Professor, University of North Carolina Gillings School of Global Public Health, Chapel Hill, NC, USA

Elizabeth Sepper, JD, LLM Professor of Law, Washington University School of Law, St. Louis, MO, USA

Carmel Shachar, JD, MPH Executive Director, Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics, and Lecturer on Law, Harvard Law School, Cambridge, MA, USA

David M. Studdert, LLB, ScD, MPH Professor of Law, Stanford Law School; Professor of Medicine, Stanford University School of Medicine, Stanford, CA, USA
Acknowledgments

A book like this is the result of the hard work of many. We thank our student line editors Joseph Ruckert (lead line editor), John Hylton, Cali Katzenelson, Rohit Rajan, Nate Szyman, and Grace Wallack for their meticulous work. We are also grateful to Cristine Hutchison-Jones and Justin Leahey for their administrative support in putting on the conference that gave rise to this book, and Cristine in particular for her hard work shepherding all the many pieces of this manuscript. We also thankfully acknowledge the Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics at Harvard Law School, with support from the Oswald DeN. Cammann Fund, for conference sponsorship. Finally, of course, we thank the contributors for their thoughtful and important scholarly contributions.