

Rashi, Biblical Interpretation, and Latin Learning in Medieval Europe

In this volume, Mordechai Cohen explores the interpretive methods of Rashi of Troyes (1040–1105), the most influential Jewish Bible commentator of all time. By elucidating the "plain sense" (peshat) of Scripture, together with critically selected midrashic interpretations, Rashi created an approach that was revolutionary in the talmudically oriented Ashkenazic milieu. Cohen contextualizes Rashi's commentaries by examining influences from other centers of Jewish learning in Muslim Spain and Byzantine lands. He also opens new scholarly paths by comparing Rashi's methods with trends in Latin learning reflected in the Psalms commentary of his older contemporary, Saint Bruno the Carthusian (1030–1101). Drawing upon the Latin tradition of *enarratio* poetarum ("interpreting the poets"), Bruno applied a grammatical interpretive method and incorporated patristic commentary selectively, a parallel that Cohen uses to illuminate Rashi's exegetical values. Cohen thereby brings to light the novel literary conceptions manifested by Rashi and his key students, Joseph Qara and Rashbam.

Mordechai Z. Cohen is Professor of Bible and Associate Dean of the Bernard Revel Graduate School of Jewish Studies, Yeshiva University. He is the author of *Three Approaches to Biblical Metaphor* (2003), Opening the Gates of Interpretation (2011), and The Rule of Peshat (2020) and a recognized expert on Jewish Bible interpretation in its Muslim and Christian cultural contexts. He has taught at universities in the USA, Israel, Europe, and China.





Rashi, Biblical Interpretation, and Latin Learning in Medieval Europe

A New Perspective on an Exegetical Revolution

MORDECHAI Z. COHEN

Yeshiva University, New York





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108470292
DOI: 10.1017/9781108556538

© Mordechai Z. Cohen 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-47029-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



In memory of Nehama Leibowitz (1905–1997)
Who dedicated her life to the study and teaching of the Bible with Rashi's commentaries





Contents

Acknowledgments		page x	
List of Abbreviations		xiii	
	Introduction	I	
	Key Challenges in Rashi Scholarship	5	
	Understanding Rashi in Light of St. Bruno	19	
	Outline of this Study	22	
Ι	A New Program of <i>Peshat</i> ("Plain Sense" Exegesis)	26	
	Rashi and his Peshat School	28	
	The Text of Rashi's Commentaries	33	
	Three Paradigms that Privilege "the Peshat of Scripture"	36	
	Rashi's Key Exegetical Concepts and Terminology	52	
2	"Settling" the Words of Scripture Using Midrash	5.5	
	Midrashic Rendering of the Biblical Narrative	56	
	Typological Reading	59	
	Halakhic Reading	61	
	Disregarding the Talmudic Peshat Maxim	66	
	Rashi's Dual Interpretive Goal	69	
3	St. Bruno on Psalms: Precedent for Rashi?	79	
_	Grammatical Interpretive Method	80	
	The Historical/Literal Sense	83	
	Continuity and Sequence	84	
	Authorial Intention	87	
	Bruno and Rashi: Assessing Parallels and Possible Influence	90	
4	Comparison to the Andalusian Exegetical School	102	
	Ties to Judeo-Arabic Scholarship	102	
	Samuel ben Hofni's Construction of Peshat	TO4	



viii Contents

	Ibn Janah's Construction of <i>Peshat</i> Further Development of the <i>Peshat</i> Maxim in the Andalusian	113	
	Tradition Andalusian Conceptions of <i>Peshat</i> vs. Christian <i>Sensus</i>	121	
	Litteralis	129	
5	Comparison to the Byzantine Exegetical School	134	
	Reuel and the Scholia on the Pentateuch	136	
	A Possible Source for Rashi?	146	
	"The <i>Peshat</i> of Scripture" in <i>Leqaḥ Ṭov</i>	150	
	Peshat in Tobiah ben Eliezer's Song of Songs Commentary	157	
6	Rashi's Literary Sensibilities and Latin <i>Grammatica</i> Critical Selection of Traditional (Midrashic, Patristic)	164	
	Commentaries	166	
	Prologue Format and "the Holy Spirit"	167	
	Literary Structure: Ordo Artificialis vs. Ordo Naturalis	177	
7	Rashi's Notion of "the Poet" (ha-Meshorer) in the Latin		
	Context	187	
	The "Poet's" Structural Intentions	189	
	Shifts in Perspective, Addressee, and Theme	192	
	The "Poet" vs. the Biblical Editor	196	
	"Writer of the Book (Kotev ha-Sefer)"	198	
	Rashi's Literary Conceptions and Possible Latin Parallels	199	
8	Joseph Qara and Rashbam: Peshat Legacy in Northern		
	France	207	
	Biographic and Bibliographic Background Attitudes toward Contemporary Modes of Bible	210	
	Interpretation	215	
	New Methods of <i>Peshat</i>	221	
9	Literary Sensibilities of <i>Peshat</i> within a Latin Context	238	
	Hermeneutics: Status of Peshat in Relation to Midrash	239	
	Peshat vs. Halakhah	243	
	Conceptions of the Biblical Narrator-Editor Reflections of Rashi's Notion of "the Poet" (ha-Meshorer)	248	
	in Rashbam Innovation in a Traditional Framework: <i>Peshat</i> and Human	256	
	Literary Agency	261	
	"Mosaic" Authorship of the Pentateuch From Rashi to Rashbam: <i>Peshat</i> and the Literary Dimensions	266	
	of Scripture	270	
Ві	Bibliography		
	Manuscripts		
		272	



Contents	ix
Rabbinic Works Cited	273
Primary Sources	273
Secondary Sources	276
General Index	297
Index of Scriptural References	303
Index of Rabbinic Sources	306



Acknowledgments

As with many scholarly endeavors, especially interdisciplinary ones, this study reflects valuable input by colleagues in a variety of fields. The origins of this volume can be traced to fruitful scholarly exchanges in 2010–2011 in the semester-long international research group "Encountering Scripture in Overlapping Cultures: Early Jewish, Christian and Muslim Strategies of Reading and their Contemporary Implications," which I was privileged to direct, together with Meir Bar-Asher, at the Israel Institute for Advanced Studies in Jerusalem. Each of the fourteen group members submitted a chapter to the volume *Interpreting Scriptures in Judaism*, *Christianity and Islam: Overlapping Inquiries* (Cambridge University Press, 2016), which I edited with Adele Berlin, with assistance from Meir Bar-Asher, Rita Copeland, and Jon Whitman. The chapters of that volume, which run from antiquity to the twentieth century, attest to the depth of the underlying comparative project, in the spirit of which this volume was written.

Early in the project I discussed Rashi and his Latin intellectual context with Rita Copeland, Jon Whitman, and Alastair Minnis (who counts the renowned Beryl Smalley among his mentors). Our discussions in Jerusalem turned to the eleventh-century cathedral master Bruno the Carthusian, whose Psalms commentary has been the subject of groundbreaking studies by Andrew Kraebel, then completing his PhD with Alastair Minnis at Yale and who subsequently joined our group in Jerusalem. Andrew and I sat for weeks studying Rashi and Bruno side by side and were struck by the methodological parallels between them, notwithstanding everything that would naturally separate medieval Jewish and Christian readers of the Bible. The initial fruits of that discovery were published in an essay entitled "A New Perspective on Rashi of Troyes in Light of Bruno the Carthusian:



Acknowledgments

хi

Exploring Jewish and Christian Bible Interpretation in Eleventh-Century Northern France" that appeared in *Viator* 48:1 (2017): 39–86.

It soon became clear that the implications of that study for understanding the *peshat* revolution pioneered by Rashi in northern France required further treatment in a full-length monograph – a desideratum fulfilled by the current volume. In its preparation, I benefited from further discussions with learned colleagues. In particular, Rita Copeland continually provided invaluable expert advice on the Western Christian interpretive tradition within the larger context of medieval Latin learning – and the possible parallels within the commentaries of Rashi and his successors in the northern French *peshat* tradition. I am grateful to Lisa Fredman for sharing with me her wisdom regarding the text of Rashi's commentaries in light of the medieval manuscripts and early printed editions.

An earlier draft of Chapter 7 was recently published in the *Internet Journal of Jewish Studies* 18 (2020): 1–42. Special thanks to Baruch Alster, Yitzhak Berger, Jonathan Jacobs, and Eran Viezel for their review of that study of Rashi's conception of the biblical narrator, which is essential not only to Chapter 7, but to this volume as a whole.

My teacher Haym Soloveitchik helped refine the arguments in Chapter 8 regarding the complex Ashkenazic intellectual milieu of Rashi's school as it developed in the twelfth century. The discussion of *piyyut* commentary in that chapter benefited from the wisdom of Elisabeth Hollender.

Deserving special mention is David Berger, (now former) dean of the Bernard Revel Graduate School of Jewish Studies at Yeshiva University, with whom I have been privileged to work closely as associate dean since 2008. David made insightful comments regarding Rashi's possible reactions to Christian interpretation, an issue that permeates this study. David deserves immense credit for ably steering our graduate school through often turbulent waters to uphold its quality and ensure support for faculty research. As anyone who knows him will affirm, David's very intellectual presence inspires awe, matched only by his integrity – both scholarly and personal.

I am grateful to other key administrators at Yeshiva University, my cherished home institution. President Ari Berman has been a close friend for over three decades. Having recently assumed leadership of YU, he has already made clear the importance of quality research and collaborative, interdisciplinary studies in the twenty-first century. These values are skillfully fostered and implemented by our provost, Selma Botman, and her senior advisor Stu Halpern. I am likewise grateful to Karen Bacon, dean of the undergraduate faculty of arts and sciences, and to Ephraim Kanarfogel, now former chairman of the Rebecca Ivry Judaic Studies



xii

Acknowledgments

Department at Stern College for Women, as well as Deena Rabinovich, who recently filled that critical administrative position, for creating an academic atmosphere congenial to genuine scholarship.

Rochel Hirsch deserves a great deal of credit for helping prepare this volume for publication. She reviewed and copyedited the entire manuscript, enhancing its logic and readability. She also composed the indexes, with the assistance of Borong Zhang. Zvi Erenyi, Mary Ann Linahan, and Moshe Schapiro of the Yeshiva University Library helped locate the necessary volumes for my research.

I am grateful to Beatrice Rehl, Publishing Director for Humanities and Social Sciences at Cambridge University Press, for inviting me to submit this work for publication, and to Eilidh Burett, editorial assistant at Cambridge, for patiently guiding it through the manuscript stages. Rebecca Granger, content manager at Cambridge, provided essential guidance in formatting the manuscript clearly. Finally, I owe special thanks to the highly expert copyeditor Mary Starkey, who meticulously reviewed the text, notes, bibliography, and indexes of this volume to ensure their accuracy and consistency. It was a special treat to learn that Mary had once been a student of the late Professor Sarah Kamin of Jerusalem, whose writings are cited throughout this work.

This volume is dedicated to the memory of Nehama Leibowitz (1905–1997), who devoted her life to teaching the Bible and its commentaries, with pride of place given to Rashi. Nehama, as she was affectionately known by thousands of students over the course of a teaching career that spanned nearly seven decades, applied her keen literary sensibilities and masterful pedagogic skills to illuminate the depth and complexity of Rashi's exegesis.

My wife, Suzanne, has provided essential emotional support as I devoted many hours, days, weeks, and months to this project. Herself an ardent student and teacher of the Bible, Suzanne values Rashi's commentaries, which we have discussed together at length over the years. It was an honor to introduce Suzanne to Nehama Leibowitz in 1990 when we were engaged to be married. Nehama's blessing to us – as two young Bible teachers – was that we never grow tired of learning and dedication to our students. In memory of Nahama Leibowitz our third daughter was named Gila Nehama when she was born in 2002. All of our children, Yaffa, Shai, Miri, Gila, and Elisha, deserve honorable mention for their patience with a mom and dad enamored with the study of old books. As they have matured, these magnificent kids offer important perspectives that enrich our scholarship – and our lives, of course.



Abbreviations

AJS Association for Jewish Studies

Ar. Arabic

b. Babylonian Talmud

HBOT Hebrew Bible/Old Testament: The History of its

Interpretation, ed. Magne Sæbø, Menahem Haran, and Chris Brekelmans. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht. Vol. I/1, Antiquity, 1996; vol. I/2, The Middle Ages, 2000.

Heb. Hebrew

HUCA Hebrew Union College Annual

j. Jerusalem Talmud
 JJS Journal of Jewish Studies
 JQR Jewish Quarterly Review
 JSIJ Jewish Studies Internet Journal
 JSO Jewish Studies Quarterly

JTS Jewish Theological Seminary of America

m. MishnahMS manuscriptMT Masoretic Text

PEPP Greene, Roland, and Stephen Cushman, eds. The Princeton

Encyclopedia of Poetry and Poetics. 4th ed. Princeton:

Princeton University Press, 2012.



xiv	List of Abbreviations
PL	Patrologia Latina (Patrologia Cursus Completus: Series Latina), ed. Jaques Paul Migne, 221 vols. Paris: Migne, 1844–1864. (References given by volume and column.)
REJ	Revue des études juives
s.v.	sub verbo
t.	Tosefta