

Index

- aboriginal law, 36, 69, 82, 159
- Adler, Emmanuel, 145
- analogical reasoning, 124, 126
- argumentation. *See* collective argumentation process; legal argumentation
- Aristotle, 24
- Austin, John, 47
- authority
 - persuasive vs. binding, 154–5
- background rules of interpretation
 - across legal systems, difference of, 113–14, 115–17
 - apprehension of, 117–21
 - definition of, 113–14
 - in foreign systems, 117, 118
 - formal rules and, 114–15, 117–18
 - internalization through conscious reflection, 117–21
 - local and common, 119–20, 127–8
 - two levels of, 116
- Canadian legal regimes, 82, 141
- Cartesian method, 91
- Cavell, Stanley, 104
- circularity objection concerning mutual promises, 128
- citizens
 - as law-makers, 31, 32, 34
 - vs. officials, 25, 26–7
 - as self-governing agents, 28
- civil law systems, 148, 154–5
- cognitivism/constructivism debate, 91
- coherence
 - in assessment of legal arguments, 30
 - as feature of law, 42
 - in legal documents, 28
- collective argumentation process, 25
- collective enforcement, 38
- Collingwood, R.G., 92
- commensurability, 213
- commitment, notion of, 23, 28, 32, 43, 52
- common law systems, 148, 154–5
- community, self-representation of, 39
- comparative law. *See also* internal and external perspectives in comparative law
 - as academic discipline, 1, 2, 3, 7, 219, 222–23
 - bifurcation overload, 6, 7
 - epistemological dilemma of, 11
 - vs. global law, 212
 - heterogeneity of, 131
 - hybrid conception of, 10
 - at international level, contribution of, 2
 - legal theory and, 9, 12, 223
 - limitations of research projects on, 110–11
 - vs. local law, 130–1
 - malaise of, 1, 6, 7
 - as method, 6
 - models for, 4–5
 - reconstruction of, 11
 - search for scientific value of, 6
 - subjectivity issue, 131
 - theoretical framework, 11
 - theoretical randomness critique of, 5
 - unification of domestic law as goal of, 1
 - weeding of non-meaningful projects, 68

- comparative law scholarship, 1, 3, 130, 186, 187, 221
 analytical framework and methodology, 219
 common core projects, 7, 67–8, 74, 110, 219
 comparative jurisprudence, 4–5, 7
 convergence theorists, 198, 208
 debates on nature of law in, 43
 defense of midway position, 99
 field workers and theorists in, 6, 7
 investigation of foreign law in, 117–18
 legal cultures, 4–5, 7, 38, 119, 208
 legal families, 6, 7, 110, 131, 212, 219
 legal formants, 4–5, 7, 200–201
 legal origins, 6, 7, 212
 as the practice of comparative law, 9
 value of theory for, 11
- comparative lawyers
 contribution to transformation of law, 111
 criticism of, 133, 205
- comparative legal game, 130–1
- comparative process
 explanation of legal data, 205–206
 formal legal arguments, 201
 formulation of *tertium comparationis*, 190–91, 192–93
 functionalism in, 194, 197, 199
 gathering relevant legal data, 190, 199
 identification of relevant legal data, 194, 195–96, 199
 legal labels issue, 193
 micro and macro comparisons, 211
 modification of parameters, 191
 in multi-system studies, dialectics of, 210
 objects for comparison, 173, 191
 overview, 216–17
 patterns of reconstruction, 210
 problem-based formulation, 195, 196–97, 199
 as proportional comparison, 190
 reason and intuition in, 192
 reconstruction stage of, 205
 selection of target legal systems, 191, 192
 in single system studies, dialectics of, 210
 sorting relevant legal data, 200
 stage-setting phase, 191
 stages of, 190
 topic selection, 192
- comparison
 among legal domains, 72
 cardinal vs. proportional, 214
 characteristics of, 8
 definition of legal, 68
 dialectic movement in, 208–10
 differences vs. similarities, 208, 222
 distinctness and connectedness requirements, 60, 61, 62–3, 63–5, 66, 67, 211
 micro- vs. macro-, 222
 notion of meaningful, 60, 65, 66, 68
 of apples and oranges, 61, 63, 64, 65
 pointless, 66
 possibility of, 61
 proportional, 190, 214, 217
 referent-referent, 74, 76
 rule-to-rule, 75, 76
 subsystem-to-subsystem, 72–3
 system-to-system, 74
 top down and bottom up methods of, 11
 vs. translation, 209
 congruence as feature of legality, 42
 consideration, doctrine of, 128
 constructivism in human and natural studies, 93
 contract law in comparative perspective, 193–94, 206, 208, 210–11, 216
 cosmopolitanism, 161–2, 163, 164, 175, 177, 186
- Designing Social Inquiry—Scientific Inference in Qualitative Research* (King et al.), 222
- Dickson, Julie, 175, 179
 dictator as legal official, 37, 36–7
 distinctness vs. difference, 62–3
 Dworkin, Ronald, 10, 104, 138, 139, 219–20
- easy cases vs. hard cases, 56–7, 114
 eigenvalues, 106
 English law, 35–6, 123–4, 169–70, 202
- epistemic community
aires culturelles, 135–42
 as community of practice, 144–5
 components of, 136
 definition of, 135
Gemeinschaft, 135–42
 imagined communities, 135–42
 interpretive communities, 115, 135–42, 220
 legal community as, 137
 self-delineation feature of, 138
- estoppel, 206
- European Court of Justice, 177
- European Union
 27 + 1 model, 175, 177, 179, 180
 citizenship, 177
 cosmopolitanist accounts of, 175
 jurisdiction of national courts, 180, 185
 law enforcement in, 178, 179
 as legal system, 181
 Maastricht Treaty, 177
 national courts and, 179, 180, 183
 One Big Legal System model, 175, 181, 183, 185
 Part of Member States model, 175, 181, 184, 185
 Quebec legal system in comparison to, 182
 sovereigntists account of, 175

- swarm model, 179–80, 183, 185
- universalist view of, 175
- expressivism, 98, 200, 203
- external/internal distinction, 95
- formality
 - definition of, 34–5
 - as manifestation of legal intention, 35, 54
- freedom of expression in comparative perspective, 190–91, 192–93, 195, 206
- French law, 123–4, 149, 202–203, 212
- Fuller, Lon, 10, 42, 215, 219
- functionalism, 197–98, 198, 199, 203
- Gadamer, Hans-Georg, 109, 117
- German idealism, 52, 54
- global law
 - categories of, 159–60
 - vs. comparative law, 212
 - cosmopolitanist account of, 161–2, 163
 - definition of, 212
 - monistic account of, 160, 167
 - pluralist account of, 160
 - scholarly analysis of, 159
 - sovereignism vs. universalism, 163
- Griffiths, John, 164
- Grotius, Hugo, 202
- Haas, Peter, 136, 144
- Hart, H. L. A., 37, 138
- Heidegger, Martin, 109
- hermeneutic circle, 207
- Hesslink, Martijn, 145
- home bias objection, 109, 112, 114–21, 220
- Idea and its material embodiment, 54
- individual agency, 27, 30
- individual self-governance. *See* self-governing agents
- inference
 - logic and goal of, 222
- informational openness, 152, 153, 158
- internal and external perspectives in
 - comparative law
 - outsider's comparative contribution, 126–9
 - outsider's home bias, 112–14
 - outsider's internal/external process, 121–6
 - outsider's internal perspective, 110–12
 - outsider's many legal games, 129–32
 - overview, 109–10
- internal and external perspectives in law
 - external perspective under natural law, 96–7
 - heterogeneity objection, 101, 105
 - internal perspective under law as collective
 - commitment, 97
 - midway position, 99
 - moderate external standpoint, 100
 - overview, 95
 - subjectivity objection, 105
 - internal and external perspectives in social science, 90, 94–5
 - internal structure of legal systems
 - fluid edges, 149
 - well-defined centre of gravity, 144
 - international law, 184
 - interpretation, 39, 95, 104–5, 115
 - interpreter
 - concept of ideal, 104
 - engagement with object of interpretation, 104, 114–15
 - inter-subjective world, 103
 - intimation, notion of, 150
- judges
 - function of, 50
 - legislative role of, 51
- Judicature Act, 170
- judicial decisions
 - finality of, 147, 170
 - judges' prejudices and, 200
 - moral ideals in, 49
 - prohibition of denial of justice, 147
 - ratio decidendi* and *obiter dicta* of, 148
 - vs. written law, 148
- judicial reasoning process, 154–5
- jurisprudence constante* doctrine, 154–5
- Kant, Immanuel, 202
- Kelsen, Hans, 77, 80, 100, 138
- Kerchove, Michael van de, 100
- King, Gary, 222
- Kötz, Hein, 118
- law. *See also* internal and external perspectives in law
 - adjudication-centred, 148
 - argumentative quality of, 19, 22, 26, 114
 - coherence of, 20, 27
 - connection to social problems, 198
 - core features of, 10, 19
 - dialogue between native and foreign, 129
 - difference between botany and, 211–12
 - in different legal systems, 41–2
 - effectiveness of, 19, 20, 21–2, 40
 - enforcement and commitment
 - dimensions of, 41
 - external perspective on, 90

- law (*cont.*)
 features of, 43
 formality of, 20, 34, 35
 hybrid conception of, 10
 ideal-types of, 10
 intentionality of, 21–2
 internal interpretation of, 90, 105
 material and ideal dimensions of, 41
 meaningful acts of, 145, 147
 moral imperatives and, 45, 48
 natural lawyers' conception of, 52
 normativity of, 20, 38, 39
 participants' perspective of, 102
 as product of intellect, 20, 27
 publicness of, 20, 30
 realization through enforcement, 19, 37
 reconstruction of ideal representation of, 103
 vs. rules of etiquette, 20
 theoretical framework, 9
 in tyrannical regimes, 42–3
 understanding of, 102–3, 105, 107
- law as collective commitment
 argumentativeness of, 22, 25
 as basis for building comparative law, 89
 citizen equality under, 23, 28
 comparative method under, 221–22
 conception of, 18–19, 44, 59, 69, 86, 89, 97, 220
 constitutive features of, 69
 enforcement of, 20, 23, 24
 engagement of legal actors, 56
 ideal and material elements of, 52
 ideals inherent in, 88
 institutional facts, 97–8
 internal perspective under, 97
 interplay of actual and ideal under, 55
 key features, 220
 law making under, 56
 legal systems under, 86, 87–8, 88–9, 89
 as natural law/positivism hybrid, 52
 notion of existence of, 154
 participants' perspective of, 101–2
 portrayal of law under, 53, 55, 58–9, 59
 self-regenerative nature of, 86
 status of legal materials under, 57
 thinness of, 89
- law in action vs. law in books, 38, 41
- law making, 33–4
- law of nature. *See* natural law
- legal actors
 law making performed by, 29
 personal interests of, 107, 108
 treatment of theory-practice clashes by, 42
 understanding of law by, 102, 106
- legal analysis, 55–6
- legal argumentation, 67, 106, 107, 145–6, 149, 200
- legal arguments
 binary coding of, 147
 coherence as criterion for, 27, 30
 contradictions in, 29
 determination of valid, 25, 26, 27
 in different legal systems, 201–202, 203
 formal and informal, 36, 201–202
 legal ideals and, 107
 meaningful, 147
 persuasion and, 200–201
 policy arguments, 36
 publicness of, 30–1, 38
 reason and, 27, 31
 understanding of, 99
- legal data. *See* legal materials
- legal domains, 72
- legal enforcement (effectiveness), 21–2, 53, 54
- legal games, 112–13, 132
- legal ideals, 40, 41, 58, 107, 213
- legal institutions, 36
- legal intention, 53, 54–5
- legal intentionality, 20–1, 22
- legal labels, 193
- legal materials
 authority of, 57
 cases of first impression, 51
 conception of gap in, 51
 criticism of, 58
 defective, 58
 embodiment of legal ideals into, 108
 expressive value of, 141–2
 extraction of collective commitments from, 141–2
 identification of functionally relevant, 200
 under law as collective commitment, status of, 57
 legal ideals and, 58
 process of gathering relevant, 190
 reconstruction into legal systems, 207–208
 sorting of, 200
 sources for, 204–205
- legal norms, 35
- legal origin projects, 111–12
- legal pluralism. *See also* strong legal pluralism;
 weak legal pluralism
 definition of, 165
 kinds of, 166–7
 market pluralism, 167, 168
 norm pluralism, 166, 167, 168
 swarm model and, 170
 voice pluralism, 167, 168
- legal practice
 administrative tribunals, 146

- coherence and congruence of, 42
 as combination of argumentation and implementation, 145, 146
 disagreement in, 55
 finality of court decisions, 147–8
 preliminary and substantive legal issues, 139–40, 140
 prohibition of denial justice, 147
 statutes and regulations, 146
- legal rules, 76, 114, 123–4
- legal sanctions, 53, 54
- legal system of positivism, 77, 79, 80, 81, 83, 84
 legal systems. *See also* internal structure of legal systems
 aspiration to internal coherence, 215
 as autopoietic systems, 138, 139, 154
 background rules of interpretation, 113–14, 115–17
 classification into families, 212
 colonial, 151
 comparative knowledge of, 219
 comparative law doctrine and, 75–6
 comparison of, 11, 66, 73, 148–9, 189, 202, 206–207, 216, 220
 conceptualization of, 8, 60, 61
 connectedness of, 67–8, 70, 77, 85, 86
 definitions of, 141, 144
 delineation of contours of, 135–42, 143–4
 disappearance of, 153
 distinction between centre and periphery, 156–7
 emergence of, 151, 153, 159
 as epistemic communities, 11, 134, 135
 external/internal perspectives on, 90, 186–87
 fluid edges of, 149, 156–7
 formation of, 115, 151, 152–3, 153, 156
 fuzzy contours of, 220
 geographic indeterminacy of, 150
 in global context, 159–60, 187
 incommensurable, 213, 216
 interaction between, 135, 163
 internal organization of, 156
 lack of connectedness under positivist ideal-type, 77
 lack of distinctness under natural law ideal-type, 70
 under law as collective commitment, 70, 86, 87–8
 legal/illegal coding, 147
 legal rules and, 74–5, 76
 matrix, 78–9, 84–5
 mixed, 118, 140–1, 143
 mutual exclusivity of, 165, 171, 177
 under natural law, 70–1, 75, 76
 operation and structure of, 139
 plurality of, 119, 163
 question of plurality of, 115
 salient actors and materials, 157–8
 spatial indeterminacy of, 155, 158–9
 state legal systems, 161–2, 163, 171
 structuring process of, 139, 187
 supranational, 187
 swarm model, 144, 159, 170, 187
 synthetic vs. organic, 77
 temporal indeterminacy of, 150, 154, 155
 three stages of formation of, 151–3, 155–6
 value of legal materials for, 141–2
 wicked, 36–7, 69
- legal systems of positivism
 autonomy of, 83
 constant renewal of, 81
 cybernetic nature of, 84, 85–6
 distinctness of, 77, 83, 85
 legal materials in, 80
 peaceful coexistence of, 83
 reaction to extreme stimuli, 81
 self-regenerative process in, 79, 80
 vertical structure of, 84–5
- legal transplants, 111
- legal values, 76, 114, 123–4
- legislation, conception of, 146
- legislative materials, 47–8
- legislators, functions of, 50–1
- lex mercatoria*, 171
- Luhmann, Niklas
 on autopoietic systems, 154
 on eigenvalues, 106
 on formation of the legal system, 155, 187
 on function of law, 169
 on informational openness, 152
 on inherent comparability of the legal system, 138
 on internal organization of the legal system, 156
 on normative closure of mature system, 158
 on operation and structure of the legal system, 139
 on operations of the legal system, 139
 on order of reasoning, 156
 on periphery of the legal system, 156, 157
- McCormick, Neil, 10, 97, 100, 220
- meaningful comparison
 vs. comparability, 65
 in law, 67, 68, 69
- mentalité* (cultural unconscious), 113
- methodological pluralism, 189
- monism, 160
- monistic cosmopolitanism, 161–2, 163
- moral ideals, 45

- national courts
 authority of, 184
 international law and, 184
 jurisdiction of, 185
 as swarm centres, 185
 national systems, 173
 natural law
 adjectival law, 45, 74, 76
 coordination rules, 76
 division into public and private law, 71
 external perspective under, 96–7
 as idealist ideal-type, 44–8
 legal systems under, 70–1, 73–4
 legislators and formulation of, 46, 47
 rules and principles of, 45
 scholars of, 45
 sin and crime in, 48
 neo-Kantians
 constructivist view of knowledge, 91–2
 understanding of human agency, 92
 normative judgement, 156
 normativity
 as feature of law, 10, 20, 38, 43, 69
 legality and, 166–7, 167
 oral legal traditions, 36
 organic systems, 71, 77–9, 83–4
 Ost, Francois, 100
 otherness, 132
 outsider
 acquaintance with background rules of
 interpretation, 113, 127–8
 comparative contribution of, 126–9
 home bias of, 112–14
 internal/external process of, 121–6
 knowledge and external perspective of, 126, 127
 vs. local actors, 125–6
 native rules of interpretation of, 128–9
 as player in many legal games, 125–6, 129–30,
 130, 129–32
 understanding of local law by, 121–3, 123–4,
 126–7, 130, 132
 Parol Evidence rule, 206
 participants in legal system, 103, 104
 Passmore, John, 106
 pluralistic cosmopolitanism, 161–2
 Pollock, Frederick, 128
 Popper, Karl, 103, 109
 positivism
 adjudication under, 50
 on dichotomy between easy and hard cases, 51
 on distinction between making and
 formulating law, 50
Grundnorm, 49, 138, 179
 ideal dimension of law under, 48, 49
 insulation thesis, 114
 on legal materials, 51
 material dimension of law under, 48
 as materialist ideal-type, 48
 meaningful legal comparison in, 86
 penultimate legal norm, 49
 Rule of Recognition, 49, 138, 179
 separability thesis, 49
 substantive and institutional tendencies, 50
 view of law under, 52, 83
 positivist ideal-type, 10, 77, 97, 96–7
 Postema, Gerald, 10, 124, 125, 126, 127
presumptio similitudinis, 198
 public commitments, 33
 publicness, 32–3
 public reason, 31
 Quebec legal system, 142, 143–4, 144
 Rabel, Ernst, 194
 Rawls, John, 31, 32
 Raz, Joseph, 48
 reason
 in collective agreement, 32
 notion of valid legal, 32
 person-specific vs. public, 31
 religious law, 69, 159
 Rousseau, Jean-Jacques, 34
 rule-rationalism, 124–5
 Scelle, Georges, 178
 Schauer, Fred, 21
 scholarly writing in civil law jurisdictions
 treatment of, 36
 self-governing agents, 24–5, 28, 38
 Simmonds, Nigel, 10, 128, 129
 sovereignism, 160, 163
ständige Rechtsprechung (constant case law),
 154–5
 strong legal pluralism
 characteristics of, 165, 167
 compatibility with swarm model, 168
 dismissal of, 187
 logical embarrassment of, 168
 practical embarrassment of, 168–9, 170
 vs. weak legal pluralism, 164
 subjectivity objection
 three versions of, 105, 108
 subnational units
 as autonomous swarms, 174
 formal and informal, 171–2
 internal rulings of, 172–3
 mutual exclusiveness of, 171, 187
 as objects for comparison, 173–4, 174

- substantive functionalism, 198
- synthetic systems
 - approximations of referent in, 73
 - defective and unstable, 74
 - definition of, 61
 - vs. organic systems, 77, 81, 82
 - plurality in, 71, 72
 - as representations of external realities, 71
 - subdivision of, 81
 - system theory, 61
- Taylor, Charles, 98, 100
- tertium comparationis*, 190–91, 192, 214, 215
- truth, correspondence theory of, 91, 94
- understanding
 - of foreign culture, 120–1
 - of foreign legal system, 120–1
 - of human affairs, 93–4
 - of natural events, 93–4
- universalism, 160, 163
- Vorverstandnis*, 113
- Waldron, Jeremy, 10, 220
- weak legal pluralism
 - incompatibility with swarm model, 168
 - vs. strong legal pluralism, 164
 - subnational vs. supranational, 171, 175
- Weber, Max, 20, 104, 145, 198
- Weinrib, Ernest, 106
- Westphalian model of legal system, 160, 167, 168
- Zweigert, Konrad, 118