

COMPARING LAW

The enterprise of comparative law is familiar, yet its conceptual whereabouts remain somewhat obscure. *Comparing Law: Comparative Law as Reconstruction of Collective Commitments* reconstructs comparative law scholarship into a systematic account of comparative law as an autonomous academic discipline. The point of that discipline is neither to harmonize world law, nor to emphasize its cultural diversity, but rather to understand each legal system on its own terms. As the proposed reconstruction exercise involves bridging comparative law and contemporary legal theory, it shows how comparative law and legal theory both stand to benefit from being exposed to the other. At a time when many courses are adding a transnational perspective, Valcke offers a more theoretical, broadened and refreshed view of comparative law.

Professor Valcke is Full Professor, Faculty of Law at the University of Toronto. She has taught, lectured and published on comparative law, comparative law theory and legal theory worldwide, including in such journals as *Nomos*, *The American Journal of Comparative Law*, *Harvard Journal of Law and Public Policy*, *Yale Journal of International Law*, *European Review of Private Law* and *Canadian Journal of Law and Jurisprudence*. Her work on English and French contract law, in particular, was recently cited as ‘illuminating’ by the British House of Lords. An elected member of the International Academy of Comparative Law, she has acted as National Reporter for Canada to the Congress of the Academy.

ASCL STUDIES IN COMPARATIVE LAW

ASCL Studies in Comparative Law is designed to broaden theoretical and practical knowledge of the world's many legal systems. With more than sixty years' experience, the American Society of Comparative Law have been leaders in the study and analysis of comparative law. By promoting the investigation of legal problems in a comparative light, whether theoretical or empirical, as essential to the advancement of legal science, they provide an essential service to legal practitioners and those seeking reform of the law. This book series will extend these aims to the publication of monographs and comparative studies of specific legal problems.

The series has two general editors. Mortimer Sellers is Regents Professor of the University System of Maryland and Director of the Baltimore Center for International and Comparative Law. He is an Associate Member of the International Academy of Comparative Law. Vivian Curran is Distinguished Professor of Law at the University of Pittsburgh School of Law.

Series Editors

Vivian Curran, *University of Pittsburgh*

David Gerber, *Chicago-Kent College of Law*

Mortimer Sellers, *University of Baltimore*

Editorial Board

Richard Albert, *University of Texas*

David Clark, *Willamette University*

Helge Dedek, *McGill University*

James Feinerman, *Georgetown University*

Richard Kay, *University of Connecticut*

Maximo Langer, *University of California Los Angeles*

Ralf Michaels, *Duke University*

Fernanda Nicola, *American University*

Jacqueline Ross, *University of Illinois*

Kim Lane Scheppele, *Princeton University*

Franz Werro, *Georgetown University*

External Advisory Board

Josef Drexler, *University of Munich*

Diego Fernandez Arroyo, *Institut d'études politiques de Paris*

Hongjun Gao, *Tsinghua University*

Michele Grazidei, *University of Turin*

Ko Hasegawa, *University of Hokkaido*

Hisashi Harata, *University of Tokyo*

Andreas Heinemann, *University of Zurich*

Christophe Jamin, *Institut d'études politiques de Paris*

Yong-Sun Kang, *Yonsei University*

Claudia Lima Marques, *Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul*

Bertil Emrah, *Oder Koc University*

Amr Shalakany, *American University of Cairo*

Comparing Law

COMPARATIVE LAW AS RECONSTRUCTION OF
COLLECTIVE COMMITMENTS

CATHERINE VALCKE

University of Toronto



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47006-3 — Comparing Law
Catherine Valcke
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108470063
DOI: 10.1017/9781108555852
© Catherine Valcke 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Valcke, Catherine, author.
TITLE: Comparing law : comparative law as reconstruction of collective
commitments / Catherine Valcke, University of Toronto.
DESCRIPTION: Cambridge [UK] ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press,
[2018] | Includes bibliographical references and index.
IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018012841 | ISBN 9781108470063 (hardback : alk. paper) |
ISBN 9781108455176 (pbk. : alk. paper)
SUBJECTS: LCSH: Comparative law.
CLASSIFICATION: LCC K583 .V35 2018 | DDC 340/.2—dc23 LC record available at
<https://lcn.loc.gov/2018012841>

ISBN 978-1-108-47006-3 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-108-45517-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or
third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on
such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47006-3 — Comparing Law
Catherine Valcke
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Pour Charlotte, Matthew, Benjamin et Arthur

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page xiii</i>
Prologue: The ‘Malaise’ of Comparative Law	1
Detailed Description of Chapter Contents	13
1 Law	18
Introduction	18
I ‘Law as Collective Commitment’	19
i Effectiveness	20
ii Argumentativeness	22
iii Coherence	27
iv Publicness	30
v Formality	34
vi Normativity	38
II An Idealist/Materialist Conception	44
i Natural Law as Idealist Ideal-Type	44
ii Positivism as Materialist Ideal-Type	48
iii Law as Collective Commitment as Natural Law/Positivism Hybrid	52
Conclusion	59
2 Legal Systems	60
Introduction	60
I Comparison Requires Distinctness and Connectedness	61
i ‘Distinctness’	62
ii ‘Connectedness’	63

iii	From Comparability to Meaningful Comparison	65
iv	Meaningful Comparison in Law	66
II	Legal Systems Under Natural Law	70
III	Legal Systems Under Positivism	77
IV	Legal Systems Under Law as Collective Commitment	86
	Conclusion	89
3	Engaging with Legal Systems: Epistemology	90
	Introduction	90
I	Internal and External Perspectives in the Social Sciences	90
II	Internal and External Perspectives in Law	95
i	An External Perspective Under the Natural Law and Positivist Ideal-Types	96
ii	An Internal Perspective Under Law as Collective Commitment	97
iii	A Midway Position?	99
iv	The Heterogeneity Objection	101
v	The Subjectivity Objection	105
III	Internal and External Perspectives in Comparative Law	109
i	The Outsider's Internal Perspective	110
ii	The Outsider's Home Bias	112
iii	The Outsider's Internal/External Process	121
iv	The Outsider's Comparative Contribution	126
v	The Outsider's Many Legal Games	129
	Conclusion	132
4	Delineating Legal Systems: Geography	133
	Introduction	133
I	Internal and External Legal System Delineation	135
i	Internal Delineation	135
ii	External Delineation	143
II	Legal Systems as Bee Swarms	144
i	A Well-Defined (Material) Centre of Gravity	144
ii	Fluid (Intellectual) Edges	149
III	Bee Swarms in Global Law	159
i	Monism Versus Pluralism	160
ii	'Strong' Versus 'Weak' Legal Pluralism	164
iii	'Subnational' Versus 'Supranational' Weak Legal Pluralism	171
	Conclusion	186
5	Comparing Legal Systems: Methodology	189
	Introduction	189
I	Gathering the Relevant Legal Data	190

<i>Contents</i>	xi
i Choosing a Topic and Target Legal Systems	192
ii Identifying Potentially Relevant Legal Data: Functionalism	194
iii Sorting Relevant Legal Data: Expressivism	200
II Reconstructing the Data into Systems	205
III Comparing the Systems	211
Conclusion	216
<i>Epilogue: The Academic Discipline of Comparative Law</i>	219
<i>Index</i>	225

Acknowledgements

This book is the product of long years of reflection fuelled by the insightful work of many fellow comparative lawyers. Prominent among them are Léontin-Jean Constantinesco, Helge Dedek, William Ewald, Patrick Glenn, Jacco Huisa, Mitchel Lasser, Robert Leckey, Pierre Legrand, Ralf Michaels, Étienne Picard, Adrian Popovici, Geoffrey Samuel, William Twining, Mark Van Hoecke and James Whitman.

Several sections began as journal articles or chapters in edited collections. Chapters 1 and 2 rework and expand on material from *Comparative Law as Comparative Jurisprudence: The Comparability of Legal Systems*, which appeared in 52 *American Journal of Comparative Law* (2004). Chapter 3 draws on *Le système de droit en droit comparé : Réflexions sur l'épistémologie d'une définition*, published in *Comparer les droits, résolument* (Pierre Legrand, ed., 2009). Some of the ideas advanced in *Comparative Law and Legal Diversity: Theorising about the Edges of Law* V *Transnational Legal Theory* (2014), coauthored with Matthew Grellette, are revisited in Chapter 4, the second section of which substantially reprints *Legal Traditions or Legal Systems?* in *Sustainable Diversity in Law. Essays in Memory of H. Patrick Glenn* (Helge Dedek and William Twining, eds., forthcoming 2018). Finally, Chapter 5 reworks material that appeared in both *Three Functions of Function in Comparative Law* (*The Method and Culture of Comparative Law: Essays in Honour of Mark Van Hoecke* (Maurice Adams and Dirk Heirbaut, eds., 2014)), coauthored with Matthew Grellette, and *Reflections on Comparative Law Methodology: Getting Inside Contract Law* (*Practice and Theory in Comparative Law* (Maurice Adams and Jacco Bomhoff, eds., 2012)).

Heartfelt thanks go to the many friends and colleagues who kindly reviewed preliminary chapter drafts – Jacco Bomhoff, Alan Brudner, Bruce Chapman, Abraham

Drassinower, David Dyzenhaus, Pierre Gorisse, Matthew Grellette, Karen Knop, Charlotte Lemieux, Ralf Michaels, Arthur Ripstein, Fred Schauer, Arnold Weinrib and the two anonymous Cambridge University Press external reviewers – as well as to my University of Toronto colleagues who attended the Faculty Workshops at which I presented some of this work. Their comments proved invaluable for polishing, adjusting, revisiting or altogether scrapping some of my thoughts; their generosity, exacting intellectual standards and all around sage advice testified yet again to the exceptionally collegial and invigorating quality of the professional environment in which I have had the privilege to evolve since my first days as an academic.

I am also grateful to Maurice Adams, Jacco Bomhoff, Dirk Heirbaut, Jorge Fabra and Maksymillian Del Mar for giving me the opportunity to present preliminary work at conferences and workshops skillfully organized by them in exotic venues. I also owe a debt of gratitude to Haley Goldfarb, Stefan Jovic, Maryam Shahid and Sinziana Tugulea for their diligent research assistance, and to Sergey Lobachev for his highly professional indexing. The research and writing of this book were greatly facilitated by the collegial and highly effective institutional support of the University of Toronto Faculty of Law. The unrelenting support of my past and present deans Robert Sharpe, Ron Daniels, Mayo Moran and Edward Iacobucci, the quiet responsiveness and sustained efficiency of Sufei Xu and the other members of our library personnel, and the patient technical assistance of May Seto, were invaluable; as was the financial assistance of the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. My thanks also to the owners and staff of the EM Café and Starbucks Monkland in Montreal, who cheerfully welcomed my laptopping presence for months on end for little more than just one teabag sale daily. Finally, I want to thank John Berger and the members of the CUP boards for believing in the project, and Danielle Menz, Catherine Smith and Llinos Edwards for seeing it through.

My biggest of all debts however are to Charlotte, Matthew, Benjamin and Arthur, who made it so hard yet also profoundly worth it.