

Musicology and Dance

Long treated as peripheral to music history, dance has become prominent within musicological research, a prime and popular subject for an increasing number of books, articles, conference papers and special symposiums. Despite this growing interest, there remains no thorough-going critical examination of the ways in which musicologists might engage with dance, thinking not only about specific repertoires or genres, but about fundamental commonalities between the two, including issues of embodiment, agency, subjectivity and consciousness. This volume begins to fill this gap. Ten chapters illustrate a range of conceptual, historical and interpretive approaches that advance the interdisciplinary study of music and dance. This methodological eclecticism is a defining feature of the volume, integrating insights from critical theory, film and cultural studies, the visual arts, phenomenology, cultural anthropology and literary criticism into the study of music and dance.

DAVINIA CADDY writes about the interrelations between music, the visual arts and gesture. She is the author of *The Ballets Russes and Beyond* (Cambridge University Press, 2012), and is currently working on projects related to contemporary musical culture, archival theory and practice.

MARIBETH CLARK is Associate Professor of Music at New College of Florida. Her articles on theatrical and social dance in mid-nineteenth-century Paris have appeared in *Journal of Musicology*, *19th-Century Music*, *Musical Quarterly* and several edited volumes. She is currently writing a monograph on the cultural history of whistling.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-46995-1 — Musicology and Dance
Edited by Davinia Caddy , Maribeth Clark
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Musicology and Dance

Historical and Critical Perspectives

Edited by DAVINIA CADDY
MARIBETH CLARK



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-46995-1 — Musicology and Dance
Edited by Davinia Caddy, Maribeth Clark
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108469951

DOI: 10.1017/9781108567947

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Caddy, Davinia, 1980– editor author. | Clark, Maribeth, editor author.

Title: Musicology and dance : historical and critical perspectives / edited by Davinia Caddy and Maribeth Clark.

Description: [1.] | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019059935 (print) | LCCN 2019059936 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781108476188 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108567947 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Dance music – History and criticism. | Music and dance – History. | Ballet – History.

Classification: LCC ML3400 .M87 2020 (print) | LCC ML3400 (ebook) |

DDC 781.5/5409–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019059935>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019059936>

ISBN 978-1-108-47618-8 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-46995-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of Figures [page vii]
List of Tables [viii]
List of Music Examples [ix]
List of Contributors [xi]
Acknowledgements [xiv]

Introduction [1]
DAVINIA CADDY AND MARIBETH CLARK

PART I CONCEPTUAL STUDIES

1 Bach and the Dance of Humankind [19]
JOHN BUTT

2 Dance as ‘Other’: Contrasting Modes of Musical
Representation [49]
SUZANNE ASPDEN

3 Thinking on Our Feet: A Somatic Enquiry into a Haydn
Minuet [71]
JOSEPH FORT

4 Making Moves in Reception Studies: Music, Listening and Loie
Fuller [91]
DAVINIA CADDY

PART II CASE HISTORIES

5 The ‘Splendid and Shameful Art’: Dancing in and around the
Wagnerian *Gesamtkunstwerk* [121]
THOMAS GREY

6 Hymnody, Dance and the Sacred in the Illustrated Song [151]
MARIAN WILSON KIMBER

7 Pavanes and Passepieds in the Age of the Cancan [172]
CARLO CABALLERO

PART III CRITICAL READINGS

8 Nijinsky, Modernism, Repression: The Faun Ballet – Once Again –
Under Analysis [207]
DAVID J. CODE

9 Choreographing Mahler Songs at the Centenary [231]
WAYNE HEISLER JR

10 Embodied Heritage: English Country Dance in Austen Screen
Adaptations [259]
MARIBETH CLARK

Select Bibliography [280]
Index [302]

Figures

- 0.1 Jules Chéret, 'La pantomime' (1891); courtesy of the Getty Images Historical Picture Archive [page 2]
- 3.1 Z-figure (Feldtenstein, 1772, Fig. 67) [78]
- 3.2 Hasty's diagram showing projection from the standpoint of durational products C and C'; courtesy of Oxford University Press [85]
- 3.3 Bass rhythm and step rhythm [87]
- 4.1 Frederick W. Glasier, *Loie Fuller*, c. 1902; courtesy of the Library of Congress, Washington DC [96]
- 4.2 R. Moreau, *Loie Fuller dansant (à la Carrière)*, c. 1904; courtesy of the Musée Rodin, Paris [99]
- 4.3 Anonymous, *Loie Fuller as Blurred Figure in Room*, c. 1900; courtesy of the New York Public Library [106]
- 4.4 Anonymous, *La Loie*, c. 1893; courtesy of the Musée des Arts Décoratifs, Paris [112]
- 6.1 Pose for 'Still, all my song shall be / Nearer, my God, to Thee', in 'Nearer, My God, to Thee'; Grace B. Faxon, *Favorite Pantomimed Songs and Poses* (Danville, NY: F. A. Owen, 1917), 69 [153]
- 6.2 Pose for 'Religious Devotion', in R. Anna Morris, *Physical Education in the Public Schools: An Eclectic System of Exercises, Including the Delsartean Principles of Execution and Expression* (New York: American Book Company, 1892), 98 [169]
- 9.1 Lawrence Rhodes as the 'lonely boy' in Eliot Feld's *At Midnight*; photo by Martha Swope [238]
- 9.2 Christine Sarry and John Sowinski's *pas de deux* in Feld's *At Midnight*; photo by Martha Swope [241]
- 10.1 'Mr Beveridge's Maggot' from *The Dancing Master* (1695) [272]

Tables

- 3.1 Minuet step distribution [page 80]
- 3.2 Executing the Z-figure to Haydn’s minuet [81]
- 7.1 The pavane returns, 1878–1910 [173]
- 7.2 So-called passepieds [174]
- 10.1 English country dances performed in *Pride and Prejudice* (dir. Langton, BBC 1, 1995) [270]
- 10.2 English country dances performed in *Emma* (dir. Lawrence, ITV, 1996) [270]
- 10.3 English country dances in *Pride and Prejudice* (dir. Wright, 2005) [275]

Music Examples

- 1.1 J. S. Bach, Cantata 57, no. 3, Aria, 'Ich wünschte mir den Tod',
bars 1–20 [page 32]
- 1.2 J. S. Bach, Cantata 57, no. 3, Aria, 'Ich wünschte mir den Tod',
bars 21–60 [33]
- 1.3 J. S. Bach, Cantata 63, no. 5, Duet, 'Ruft und fleht den Himmel an',
bars 1–20 [36]
- 1.4 J. S. Bach, Cantata 63, no. 5, Duet, 'Ruft und fleht den Himmel an',
bars 23–40 [37]
- 1.5 J. S. Bach, Cantata 63, no. 5, Duet, 'Ruft und fleht den Himmel an',
bars 104–32 [39]
- 1.6 J. S. Bach, Brandenburg Concerto no. 1 in F, BWV1046, movement 3,
bars 1–17 [41]
- 1.7 J. S. Bach, Brandenburg Concerto no. 1 in F, BWV1046, movement 3,
bars 80–4 [45]
- 3.1 Joseph Haydn, Minuet Hob. IX: 11, no. 1, keyboard version
(minuet only) [81]
- 5.1a–b Main 'Allegro theme' (a) and chromaticized transition theme (b) from
overture to *Tannhäuser* (1845 Dresden version) [132]
- 5.2 Presto 6/8 variant of 'Allegro theme' from Venusberg Bacchanal,
Tannhäuser, Act 1, scene 1 (1845 Dresden version) [133]
- 5.3 'Aural dissolve' and transition from conclusion of Venusberg
Bacchanal, *Tannhäuser*, Act 1, scene 1 (1845 Dresden version) [134]
- 5.4 Flower Maidens scene, main (slow, waltz-like) theme,
Parsifal, Act 2 [138]
- 7.1 Paladilhe, Pavane from *Patrie*, bars 1–9 [178]
- 7.2 Fauré, Pavane in F♯ minor, op. 50, bars 27–30 [179]
- 7.3 Ravel, 'Pavane pour une infante défunte', bars 1–6 [184]
- 7.4 Chabrier, 'Idylle' from *Dix pièces pittoresques*, bars 1–5 [184]
- 7.5 Debussy, Passepied from *Suite bergamasque*, bars 1–6,
with harmonic analysis [185]
- 7.6 Delibes, Pavane from *Le roi s'amuse*, arr. piano, bars 1–8 [188]
- 7.7 Delibes, Lesquercarde from *Le roi s'amuse*, arr. piano, bars 1–4 [188]
- 7.8 Delibes, Passepied from *Le roi s'amuse*, arr. piano, bars 1–5 [190]

- 7.9 Ravel, 'Pavane de la Belle au bois dormant', no. 1 from *Ma mère l'oye*, bars 1–4 [197]
- 7.10 The descending tetrachord (a) and its contrapuntal realizations by (b) Paladilhe, (c) Fauré and (d) Messager in their pavaues [198]
- 7.11 Messager, Pavane from *Isoline*, bars 1–5 [199]
- 7.12 Ravel, 'Pavane pour une infante défunte' comparing bars 3–6 and bars 62–5 [200]
- 7.13 (a) Saint-Saëns, Pavane from *Etienne Marcel*, arr. piano, bars 1–4 and (b) its contrapuntal modelling, showing the combination of the descending tetrachord (alto) and the minor-mode *romanesca* [201]
- 8.1 Reduced short score of Claude Debussy, *Prélude à l'après-midi d'un faune* [216]

Contributors

SUZANNE ASPDEN is Associate Professor at the Faculty of Music, University of Oxford, and Fellow of Jesus College, Oxford. She specializes in eighteenth-century opera and dramatic music, identity politics, performance aesthetics and performativity. Publications include *The Rival Sirens: Performance and Identity on Handel's Operatic Stage* (Cambridge University Press, 2013) and the edited volume, *Operatic Geographies* (Chicago, 2019), as well as a co-edited volume on word–music interrelationships. Her current book projects concern music and national identity in eighteenth-century Britain and the culture of country-house opera in twentieth- and twenty-first century Britain.

JOHN BUTT is Gardener Professor of Music at Glasgow University and Music Director of Edinburgh's Dunedin Consort. He has published widely in the field of Bach, seventeenth- and eighteenth-century music, the culture of historically informed performance and musical modernity. He also has a large discography as both organist (Harmonia Mundi) and conductor (Linn). His recordings have received two Gramophone awards: Handel's *Messiah* in 2007 and Mozart's *Requiem* in 2014 (which also received a Grammy nomination); four further discs have received Gramophone award nominations. Recent discs include Bach's *Magnificat*, *Brandenburg Concertos* and *Christmas Oratorio*, together with the complete *Well-Tempered Clavier* (on harpsichord).

CARLO CABALLERO is Associate Professor of Music at the University of Colorado, Boulder. He is the author of *Fauré and French Musical Aesthetics* and has published essays in *Victorian Studies*, *19th-Century Music*, *The Journal of the American Musicological Society* and many edited collections. His current projects include studies of social continuities in French music from the eighteenth to twentieth centuries, the historiography of nineteenth-century ballet, and a second monograph on Fauré. His new critical edition of Fauré's two piano quintets for *The Complete Works of Gabriel Fauré* is in press at Bärenreiter-Verlag.

DAVINIA CADDY has taught at the universities of Oxford, Oxford Brookes and Auckland. She is the author of *The Ballets Russes and Beyond: Music and Dance in Belle-Époque Paris* (Cambridge University Press, 2012), articles in *Cambridge Opera Journal*, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, *19th-Century Music* and *The Opera Quarterly*, as well as the general-interest guide *How to Hear Classical Music* (Awa Press, 2013). She is currently working on projects related to contemporary musical culture, archival theory and practice.

MARIBETH CLARK is Associate Professor of Music at New College of Florida in Sarasota. Her articles on theatrical and social dance in mid-nineteenth-century Paris have appeared in *Journal of Musicology*, *19th-Century Music* and *Musical Quarterly*. She is currently writing a monograph on the cultural history of whistling in the United States.

DAVID J. CODE is Reader in Music at the School of Culture and Creative Arts, University of Glasgow. Previously, he taught at Stanford University, on a Mellon Postdoctoral Fellowship, and at Bishop's University in Québec. He has published on Debussy, Stravinsky, Mallarmé and Kubrick in leading journals including *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* and *Representations*, and he has contributed a Debussy biography to the Reaktion Press 'Critical Lives' of key modern figures.

JOSEPH FORT is the College Organist and Director of the Chapel Choir, and Lecturer in Music at King's College London. He completed a PhD at Harvard University in 2015, with a thesis on dance-music relationships in Joseph Haydn's minuets, and has published in the *Eighteenth-Century Music* journal. As a conductor, he has broadcast on BBC Radio 3, and records for the Delphian label.

THOMAS GREY is Professor of Music at Stanford University. He is the author of *Wagner's Musical Prose: Texts and Contexts* (Cambridge University Press, 1995), as well as editor and co-author of the Cambridge Opera Handbook on Wagner's *Flying Dutchman* (2000), the *Cambridge Companion to Wagner* (2008) and *Wagner and his World* (Princeton University Press, 2009). He has also written on Beethoven, Mendelssohn and the history of nineteenth-century opera. Recent projects include a study of the paintings of Hans Makart in relation to Wagner reception in the late nineteenth century, essays on the idea of 'absolute music', eco-critical perspectives on landscape and nature in nineteenth-century music, and the entry on

Richard Wagner for Oxford Bibliographies Online. New fields of interest include American musical theatre and relations between music and the 'Gothic' in theatre and fiction.

WAYNE HEISLER JR is Professor of Historical and Cultural Studies in Music at The College of New Jersey. His publications include *The Ballet Collaborations of Richard Strauss* (University of Rochester Press, 2009), an article on 'Antony Tudor's *Dark Elegies* and the Affirmation of Mahler's Body, 1937–1947' in *Dance Chronicle* (2013), an essay 'Dancing Lieder Singing' for a 2014 colloquy in the *Journal of the American Musicological Society* ('Studying the Lied: Hermeneutic Traditions and the Challenge of Performance'), as well as an essay on choreographies of Strauss's *Vier letzte Lieder* as 'total art' (Berghahn, 2016). He guest-edited a recent issue of *Opera Quarterly* focusing on Strauss; he is also Reviews Editor of *Opera Quarterly* and serves on its Editorial Board.

MARIAN WILSON KIMBER is Professor of Musicology at the University of Iowa. She has published widely on Felix Mendelssohn and Fanny Hensel, investigating issues of biography, gender and musical reception. Her book, *The Elocutionists: Women, Music, and the Spoken Word* (University of Illinois Press, 2017) explores the combination of elocution and music by women in American musical life. As a reciter, she has revived the performance of women's spoken-word compositions, appearing with pianist Natalie Landowski.

Acknowledgements

With a keen interest in dance, we both chose early in our careers to inhabit the margins of our discipline – a treacherous place, it appeared initially, where loneliness and frustration danced hand in hand with opportunity, excitement and a certain intensity of feeling. In recent years, our company on the periphery has grown substantially – in size, status and critical clout. Rather than being overlooked or else rejected entirely, the body in motion is nowadays considered a pivotal and productive thematic across many of musicology's subfields, from theory and analysis to history, anthropology and aesthetics. To further explore this idea, we enlisted contributors to this volume who, for the most part, examine well-known works in the European tradition with a view to how dance engages the music, and an ear to how music engages the body. This volume, then, recognizes the centrality of both dance and the body to the multiple processes and mediating factors intertwined with music-making, even in Europe. Indeed, this may be the volume's strongest and most enduring outcome: the promotion of the visceral, the fleshy and the ephemeral alongside a musical corpus with which many of us are deeply familiar – at times, perhaps, unthinkingly at ease.

Another outcome is of the human kind. Volumes like this one – featuring multiple authors of different disciplinary backgrounds and from different international institutions – tend to function as a kind of preservative; that is, they record and result from scholarship first presented at conferences, annual meetings, roundtables or special symposiums. Ours emerged differently. Working at opposite ends of the globe, one of us some fourteen hours ahead of the other, we had to start from scratch, with no institutional backing, no funds, no planned get-together, no fixed deadlines, no promises and no pre-existing papers to tweak or expand. We say this not to congratulate ourselves, but to acknowledge and applaud whole-heartedly those contributors with whom we have worked, steadily and with shared determination, over these past six or seven years. Without their generosity of spirit and kindness of heart, their intellectual curiosity and acuity of perception, their enthusiasm, commitment and super-human patience (especially when faced with a battery of emails from us both), this

volume would simply not exist. To us, they represent the good in musicology: John, a genius in prose as in performance; Suzanne, our initial and lasting stimulus; Joe, a daring to do something different; Carlo, an unsurpassed level of professionalism; Tom, a colossal intellect; Marian, an archival gold-standard; David, a lyric poeticism; and Wayne, a rare capacity to show, interpretively speaking, just how far open the door can be flung. Our thanks must also extend to those colleagues who shared conversations, perspectives and/or paragraphs in the early stages of this project; in particular, Vicki Cooper, Arnie Cox, Jamie Currie, Sarah Hibberd, Yvonne Kendall, Roger Parker, Marian Smith, Helena Kopchick Spencer and Lawrence Zbikowski.

On a practical note, we would like to express our gratitude to all those involved in bringing this volume to its current form, particularly Kate Brett, Eilidh Burrett and the crew at Cambridge University Press. Kate took a punt on this project quite early on in the proceedings: she has proved remarkably understanding and patient, despite our several false starts, somehow knowing when to give us time to think and write, and when to hurry us along. Eilidh has been a pleasure to work alongside over the last year or so: her efforts in relation to the front cover of the volume, in particular, are very much appreciated. This is not to mention our anonymous reviewers, who read first our proposal and then various portions of the manuscript, offering crucial advice and alternative angles to consider. Simon Morrison, our not-so-anonymous clearance reader, deserves special mention: the warmth and understanding that shone through his comments, when reporting on our final draft of the manuscript, could not have been more thankfully received.

A few words, in turn:

I owe a debt of gratitude to many colleagues, friends, and family members who have made my contributions to this volume possible. My mother, Barbara Hosterman Clark, an artist and an illustrator, helped me see the motion of the crossing diagonal lines in 'La pantomime', the Chéret poster that introduces the volume. Katherine Brion, my colleague in art history at New College, shared her essay on Jules Chéret with me, coincidentally illustrated with that same poster. Danielle Fosler-Lussier and Marian Wilson Kimber have provided invaluable friendship and mentoring at critical moments. Numerous colleagues at New College, past and present, continue to develop my sense of what it means to be an embodied intellectual, including Michelle Barton, Mark Dancigers, K. E. Goldschmidt, Heidi Harley, Sarah Hernandez, Sonia Labrador-Rodríguez, Susan Marks, Steve Miles, Julie Morris, Hugo Viera-Vargas, Alina Wyman and Queen Meccasia Zabriskie. My sister, Crissi, supported me with swimming pools

and fishing trips. Sonja Jaffee and the O’Jaffens provided escape in New York City and southwestern Vermont. I owe my husband, Andrew Jaffee, more than I can express, while our children, Esther and Toby, continue to reveal life’s richness to me in unexpected ways. (Maribeth Clark, Sarasota, Florida)

As ever, I owe thanks to Roger Parker, who taught me so much about how to think and how to write, even when jogging along the cobbled streets of Cambridge. To Suzanne Aspden, I am also grateful: it was while sitting in on Suzanne’s undergraduate lectures on music and dance, soon after the two of us had started new positions within the Faculty at Oxford, that I first entertained the possibility of an edited volume such as this. My friends here in New Zealand have also proven instructive, showing me how to walk tall, along the sands of our seaside suburb, even when dark clouds gather. Chris and Hazel have weathered all storms besides me: it is difficult to put into words what their love and devotion has meant. (Davinia Caddy, Mission Bay, Auckland)