

INTERPRETING MACH

This volume presents new essays on the work and thought of physicist, psychologist, and philosopher Ernst Mach. Moving away from previous estimations of Mach as a pre-logical positivist, the essays reflect his rehabilitation as a thinker of direct relevance to debates in the contemporary philosophies of natural science, psychology, metaphysics, and mind. Topics covered include Mach's work on acoustical psychophysics and physics; his ideas on analogy and the principle of conservation of energy; the correct interpretation of his scheme of 'elements' and its relationship to his 'historical-critical' method; the relationship of his thought to movements such as American pragmatism, realism, and neutral monism, as well as to contemporary figures such as Friedrich Nietzsche; and the reception and influence of his works in Germany and Austria, particularly by the Vienna Circle.

JOHN PRESTON is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Reading. He is the author of Feyerabend: Philosophy, Science and Society (1997) and Kuhn's The Structure of Scientific Revolutions: A Reader's Guide (2008). He edited the third volume of Feyerabend's Philosophical Papers (1999) and co-edited The Worst Enemy of Science?: Essays in Memory of Paul Feyerabend (with Gonzalo Munévar and David Lamb, 2000).



INTERPRETING MACH

Critical Essays

Edited by

JOHN PRESTON

University of Reading







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

 $www. cambridge. org \\ Information on this title: www. cambridge. org/9781108463287$

DOI: 10.1017/9781108564311

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2021 First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data Names: Preston, John, 1957– editor.

Title: Interpreting Mach: critical essays / edited by John Preston, University of Reading.

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2020041974 (print) | LCCN 2020041975 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108474016 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108463287 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108564311 (epub) Subjects: LCSH: Mach, Ernst, 1838-1916.

Classification: LCC B3303 .I58 2021 (print) | LCC B3303 (ebook) | DDC 193-dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020041974 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020041975

ISBN 978-1-108-47401-6 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-46328-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Erik C. Banks (1970–2017)



CONTENTS

List of Figures	ix
List of Tables	X
List of Contributor	s xi

Introduction: A New Mach for a New Millennium
JOHN PRESTON

- 1 Ernst Mach's Piano and the Making of a Psychophysical Imaginarium 10 ALEXANDRA HUI
- 2 Mother's Milk and More: On the Role of Ernst Mach's Relational Physics in the Development of Einstein's Theory of Relativity 28
 RICHARD STALEY
- 3 Meaningful Work: Ernst Mach on Energy Conservation 48
 DAAN WEGENER
- 4 Mach on Analogy in Science 67 s. g. sterrett
- 5 Ernst Mach's Enlightenment Pragmatism: History and Economy in Scientific Cognition 84

 THOMAS UEBEL
- On the Philosophical and Scientific Relationship between Ernst Mach and William James 103
 ALEXANDER KLEIN
- 7 Ernst Mach and Friedrich Nietzsche: On the Prejudices of Scientists 123
 PIETRO GORI

vii



viii CONTENTS

- 8 Abstraction, Pragmatism, and History in Mach's Economy of Science 142

 LYDIA PATTON
- 9 Holding the Hand of History: Mach on the History of Science, the Analysis of Sensations, and the Economy of Thought 164 LUCA GUZZARDI
- 10 Ernst Mach and the Vienna Circle: A Re-evaluation of the Reception and Influence of His Work 184FRIEDRICH STADLER
- 11 Narratives Divided: The Austrian and the German Mach
 MICHAEL STÖLTZNER
 208
- Phenomenalism, or Neutral Monism, in Mach's *Analysis of Sensations*? 235

 JOHN PRESTON
- 13 The Case for Mach's Neutral Monism 258

Index 280



FIGURES

- $1.1\,$ Mach reclined on his sofa with his right eye closed, observing himself observing (Mach 1886, p. 14) $\,$ 15
- 1.2 Ernst Mach, undated letter to Eduard Kulke 22
- 4.1 Foci of an ellipse 73
- 4.2 Conic sections 74
- 8.1 Left: Stevin's inclined plane with endless chain (Mach 1919, pp. 24–25). Right: Stevin's plane with the symmetrical portion of the chain removed (Mach 1919, pp. 24–25) 148



TABLES

8.1 Typology of the economy of science 152



CONTRIBUTORS

[†]Erik C. Banks was a professor of philosophy at Wright State University, Ohio, the United States.

Pietro Gori is a researcher and invited professor in the Institute of Philosophy / Faculty of Social and Human Sciences at the New University of Lisbon, Portugal.

Luca Guzzardi is an assistant professor of philosophy of science in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Milan, Italy.

Alexandra Hui is an associate professor in the Department of History at Mississippi State University, the United States.

Alexander Klein is Canada Research Chair and associate professor of philosophy at McMaster University, Canada.

Lydia Patton is a professor in the Department of Philosophy at Virginia Tech, the United States.

John Preston is a professor in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Reading, the United Kingdom.

Friedrich Stadler is a professor emeritus of history and philosophy of science at the University of Vienna, Austria.

Richard Staley is a reader in the Department of History and Philosophy of Science at the University of Cambridge, the United Kingdom.

S. G. Sterrett is the Curtis D. Gridley Distinguished Professor of History and Philosophy of Science in the Department of Philosophy at Wichita State University, Kansas, the United States.



xii

CONTRIBUTORS

Michael Stöltzner is a professor in the Department of Philosophy at the University of South Carolina, the United States.

Thomas Uebel is Professor Emeritus in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Manchester, United Kingdom.

Daan Wegener is a lecturer in history of science at Utrecht University, the Netherlands.