Empires of Faith in Late Antiquity

This book reveals the rewards of exploring the relationship between art and religion in the first millennium, and the particular problems of comparing the visual cultures of different emergent and established religions of the period in Eurasia – Buddhism, Hinduism, Zoroastrianism, Islam, Judaism, Christianity and the pagan religions of the Roman world. Most of these became established and remained in play as what are called ‘the world religions’. The chapters in this volume show how the long traditions of studying these topics are caught up in complex local, ancestral, colonial and post-colonial discourses and biases, which have made comparison difficult. The study of late antiquity turns out also to be an examination of the intellectual histories of modernity.

Jaš Elsner is Professor of Late Antique Art at the University of Oxford and Humfry Payne Senior Research Fellow in Classical Archaeology and Art at Corpus Christi College, Oxford. He has been a Visiting Professor in Art History at the University of Chicago since 2003, and also at the Divinity School since 2014, and was Senior Research Keeper in the Empires of Faith project on art and religion in late antiquity at the British Museum from 2013 to 2018. Since 2009 he has been an Honorary Foreign Member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences; in 2017 he was elected a Fellow of the British Academy; in 2019 he was elected to the Max Planck Society as Visiting External Member of the Kunsthistorisches Institut in Florence. He works on art and its many receptions (including ritual, religion, pilgrimage, viewing, description, collecting) in antiquity and Byzantium, including into modernity, with strong interests in comparativism, global art history, and the critical historiography of the discipline.
Empires of Faith in Late Antiquity

Histories of Art and Religion
from India to Ireland

Edited by

JAŚ ELSNER
University of Oxford
Contents

List of Figures [page vii]
List of Contributors [xiii]
Acknowledgements [xv]

1. Introduction [1]
   JAŚ ELSNER

PART I: THE IMPERIAL CONTEXT [25]

2. The Gandharan Problem [27]
   ROBERT BRACEY

3. Writing the Art, Archaeology and Religion of the Roman Mediterranean [51]
   PHILIPPA ADRYCH AND DOMINIC DALGLISH

4. Mystery Cult and Material Culture in the Graeco-Roman World [81]
   PHILIPPA ADRYCH AND DOMINIC DALGLISH

5. The Viennese Invention of Late Antiquity: Between Politics and Religion in the Forms of Late Roman Art [110]
   JAŚ ELSNER

6. The Rise of Byzantine Art and Archaeology in Late Imperial Russia [128]
   MARIA LİDOVA

7. Ferdinand Piper’s Monumentale Theologie (1867) and Schleiermacher’s Legacy: The Attempted Foundation of a Protestant Theology of Art [161]
   STEFANIE LENK
Table of Contents

PART II: AFTER IMPERIALISM: ORIENTALISM AND ITS RESISTANCES [187]

8. The Road from Decadence: Agendas and Personal Histories in the Study of Early Islamic Art [189]
   NADIA ALI

9. Connecting Art and Zoroastrianism in Sasanian Studies [223]
   RACHEL WOOD

10. ‘Hindu’ Art and the Primordial Śiva [260]
    ROBERT BRACEY

PART III: POST-COLONIALIST, OLD COLONIALIST AND NATIONALIST FANTASIES [291]

11. Jewish Art: Before and After the Jewish State (1948) [293]
    JESSE LOCKARD AND JAŚ ELSNER

12. Whose History Is It Anyway? Contests for India’s Past in the Twentieth Century [320]
    ROBERT BRACEY

13. Acculturated Natives Who Rebel: Revivalist, Ottomanist and Pan-Arabist Engagements with Early Islamic Art (1876–1930s) [361]
    NADIA ALI

    KATHERINE CROSS

Bibliography [434]
Index of Names [508]
Index of Subjects [510]

1st plate section: 8 pages can be found between pages 80 and 81
2nd plate section: 16 pages can be found between pages 272 and 273
3rd plate section: 8 pages can be found between pages 400 and 401
Figures

2.1 The Departure from Kapilavastu, from the east gate of stupa no. 1, Sanchi. 1st century BC or AD, stone. Photograph by Anandajoti Bhikkhu (on a Creative Commons Licence through Wikicommons) [page 28]

2.2 Seated Buddha in the teaching posture. On the cushion below him, a seated Bodhisattva with turban and ornaments flanked by a kneeling male and female worshipper. 2nd or 3rd century AD, grey schist. From Jamalgarhi, Pakistan. 95 × 53 cm. British Museum, BM 1895,1026.1. Photograph: Courtesy of the trustees of the British Museum [47]

3.1 Raphael (1483–1520), The Sacrifice at Lystra (Acts 14:8–18, where the Lystrians offer sacrifices to Saints Paul and Barnabas after they have cured a lame man). Bodycolour on paper mounted onto canvas. Cartoon for a tapestry in the Sistine Chapel, commissioned by Pope Leo X and unveiled in 1519. Height: 350 cm, width: 560 cm, made c. 1515–16. Victoria and Albert Museum, on loan from the collection of Her Majesty the Queen. Photograph: Courtesy of the V&A [52]

3.2 Altars in the Senhouse Museum found at Maryport, UK. Dedicated in the 2nd century AD by the ‘I cohors hispanorum’ and their various commanders. Sandstone. All of a square type, but no two altars are the same either in dimension or decoration. Senhouse Museum. Photograph: By kind permission of the Manager and Trustees of Senhouse Roman Museum [53]

3.3 Sandstone altar from Maryport. Dedicated by the tribune Marcus Maenius Agrippa in the 2nd century AD. Senhouse Museum. Photograph: By kind permission of the Manager and Trustees of Senhouse Roman Museum [57]

4.1 Fresco from the Mithraeum at Capua Vetere, Italy. From a series painted on the fronts of the benches which may show initiation rituals. 2nd century AD. Photograph: P. Adrych, per gentile concessione del Polo Museale della Campania [96]

4.2 Detail of the Mainz Cup, terracotta crater with Mithraic imagery. First half of the 2nd century AD. This side shows a scene which has been interpreted as representing initiation. Archaeological Museum Frankfurt. Photograph: P. Adrych by permission of the Archäologisches Museum, Frankfurt [96]
List of Figures

4.3 Bronze statuette of Jupiter Dolichenus. Late 2nd to early 3rd century AD, found at Mauer-an-der-Url, now in the Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna. The statuette displays a common Roman conception of Jupiter Dolichenus in military dress, brandishing a double-axe and lightning bolt. The dedication beneath reads, 'To Jupiter Dolichenus, greatest and best, Marrius Ursinus, a veteran, following a command, freely, gladly, and deservedly set this up'. Photograph: Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna [99]

4.4 Bronze triangle from Austria featuring representations of Jupiter Dolichenus and other gods. Late 2nd to early 3rd century AD, found at Mauer-an-der-Url, now in the Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna. Found in the same hoard as Figure 4.3, this triangle still has its stand attached. From bottom to top the figures have been identified as the Dioscuri; Jupiter Dolichenus and consort; Sol and Luna; an eagle; and finally a winged Victory statuette on top. Photograph: Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna [102]

4.5 Bronze triangle featuring representations of Jupiter Dolichenus and other gods. Late 2nd to early 3rd century AD, unknown findspot, now in the Bayerische Staatsammlung, Munich. The triangle, divided into four planes, features Jupiter Dolichenus with his female consort in the centre, three gods identified as Hercules, Minerva and Dionysus above, and an eagle at the very top. The so-called Dioscuri flank a male figure making an offering at an altar in the lower plane. Photograph: © Archäologische Staatssammlung München (photographer: Manfred Eberlein) [104]


6.3a Al-Qasr, Umayyad Palace in Amman, first half of the 8th century, Jordan. Exterior. From: N. P. Kondakov, Археологическое путешествие по Сирии и Палестине [An Archaeological Journey through Syria and Palestine] (St Petersburg, 1904), 127. Public domain [140]

6.3b Al-Qasr, Umayyad Palace in Amman, first half of the 8th century, Jordan. Interior. From: N. P. Kondakov, Археологическое путешествие по Сирии и Палестине [An Archaeological Journey through Syria and Palestine] (St Petersburg, 1904), 129. Public domain [140]
List of Figures

6.4 Front page of the original copy of Ainalov’s *The Hellenistic Origins of Byzantine Art* (St Petersburg, 1900). Public domain [145]

6.5 *Christ and Disciples*, remains of a sarcophagus from Psamathia, Istanbul. Now in the Bode Museum Berlin. 4th century. This photograph, which is the earliest publication of this artwork, demonstrates how it was originally discovered together with two thirteenth-century marble panels with Virgin Orans and Archangel. From: D. V. Ainalov, Эллинистические основы византийского искусства: исследования в области ранне-византийского искусства [The Hellenistic Origins of Byzantine Art: Studies on Early Byzantine Art] (St Petersburg, 1900), plate IV. Public domain [147]

6.6 Icon of Sts Sergius and Bacchus, encaustic on wooden panel, 6th–7th century, one of the four early icons brought by Porphyry Uspensky from Mount Sinai. Museum of Western and Oriental Art, also known as Bogdan and Varvara Khanenko Museum of Art, Kiev. Photograph: author [151]

6.7 View of the St Catherine’s monastery library and Mount Horeb, Sinai. From: J. X. Raoult and N. P. Kondakov, [Атлас 100 фотографических снимков с видов древностей Синайского монастыря] [An Atlas of 100 Photographic Views of the Antiquities of the Sinai Monastery] (Odessa, 1883), image on page 8. Public domain [154]

6.8 Natalia Goncharova, *The Virgin and Child*, oil on canvas, 1911. State Tretyakov Gallery, Moscow, 150 × 107 cm. Photograph: author [157]


7.2 Ferdinand Piper, plan of the Christliches Museum in the state of 1856, second floor of the right wing of the main university building at Unter den Linden 6, Friedrich Wilhelm University, Berlin. Taken from Ferdinand Piper, *Das Christliche Museum der Universität zu Berlin und die Errichtung christlicher Volksmuseen*. Berlin, 1856. [184]

8.1 Ernst Herzfeld (left) and colleagues at Persepolis (Iran), northern portico of the building known as the Harem of Xerxes. Ernst Herzfeld Papers, Series 2.2, Box 8, Folder 2. Metropolitan Museum of Art (Harris Brisbane Dick Fund, 1943), New York. No known restriction on use [196]
List of Figures

8.2 Mshatta façade, 743–4, detail showing simurgh. Museum für Islamische Kunst, Berlin, Germany. Photograph © José Luiz Bernardes Ribeiro, CC BY-SA 4.0 [197]

8.3 Watercolour depiction of a wall painting with two dancers reconstructed by Herzfeld from fragments found in the main caliphal palace in Samarra (Dar al-Khilafa). Ernst Herzfeld Papers, Series 3.1 (Drawings, Watercolors and Prints: Excavation of Samarra). Metropolitan Museum of Art (Harris Brisbane Dick Fund, 1943), New York. No known restriction on use [201]

8.4 Louis Massignon costumed as a student of al-Azhar, Cairo, 1909. Public domain [213]

9.1 Gilded silver bottle bearing viticulture imagery, 5th–7th century. Height: 18.5 cm. British Museum, BM 1897,1231.189. Photograph: Courtesy of the trustees of the British Museum [226]

9.2 Charging boar relief, stucco wall panel, Ctesiphon, c. 6th century. 29.5 × 38.1 cm. The Metropolitan Museum of Art; Rogers Fund, 1932; 32.150.23. Creative Commons Licence [228]

9.3 Iván of Khosro II (r. 590–627). Tāq-e Bostān, Kermanshāh, Iran. © the author [232]

9.4 Detail of iván of Khosro II, showing the relief of Fath ‘Ali Shāh (r. 1797–1834), Tāq-e Bostān, Kermanshāh, Iran. © the author [238]

9.5 Rock relief of Ardašir I (r. 224–242), Naqš-e Rostam, Iran. © the author [239]

9.6 Details of tiles from Tekieh Mo‘āven al-molk, Kermanshâh, Iran. © the author (a) Ágā Mohammad Khán (founder of the Qajār dynasty, r. 1789–97); (b) Mohammad ‘Ali Shâh (r. 1907–9) (c) Šāpur I (r. 239–70); (d) Bahram V Gür (r. 420–38); (e) Yazdegerd II (r. 438–57) (f) the hero Rostam. [241]

9.7 Detail of tiles from Tekieh Mo‘āven al-molk, Kermanshâh, Iran. © the author [242]

9.8 Rock relief of Šāpur I (r. 239–70), with relief of Kirdir on the right, Naqš-e Rostam, Iran. © the author [246]

10.1 Diagram of the relationships between sects outlined in the Āgamadamba. [267]

10.2 Gold coin of Wima Kadphises from Kushan (modern Afghanistan). c. 110–127 AD. 20 mm diameter. Reverse, with a figure holding trident and animal skin. Photograph: Courtesy of the trustees of the British Museum [273]

10.3 Limestone relief of Śiva and Parvati, his consort from the Amora hills, Northern India. c. 900 AD. Height: 38 cm. Photograph: Courtesy of the trustees of the British Museum [274]

10.4 Copper coin (tetradrachm) of Huvishka from Kushan. c. 155–190 AD. 25 mm diameter. Reverse, with a four-armed figure inscribed
Wesho, in Bactrian but in Greek script, holding diadem, thunderbolt, trident and water flask. The detail is of the hands holding diadem and thunderbolt. Photograph: Courtesy of the trustees of the British Museum [275]

10.5 Detail from a gouache painting on paper from the Punjab. c. 1790–1800 AD. Śiva in the form of Bhairava, clad in an elephant skin and a tiger’s hide, with the goddess Varahi, seated on an elephant. He is pictured with his attributes of a drum, a corpse, a trident, a bowl, a stick and a deer in his six hands. Photograph: Courtesy of the trustees of the British Museum [277]

10.6 Granite statue of Śiva as Bhairava from the South Indian Chola kingdom. 11th century. 108 cm in height. Photograph: Courtesy of the trustees of the British Museum [278]

10.7 The Gudimallam Linga, sandstone, with Śiva standing on the dwarf Apasmara, from the Parasurameswara Temple in Andhra Pradesh, Southeastern India. Perhaps 1st century BC. Photo: Creative Commons Licence on Wikipedia [282]

11.1 Gold glass base probably from Rome. Diameter 10.5 cm. 4th century AD. The upper tier shows a torah shrine, two menorahs and other Jewish symbols (lulab and ethrog to the right, amphora and shofar to the left), the lower tier a banqueting table with a fish platter and cushions for seating. The inscription is a funerary invocation to a family. Skulpturensammlung und Museum für Byzantinische Kunst, Staatliche Museen, Berlin, Germany. Photo: Art Resource, NY (ART191276) [297]


11.3 500 Pruta bill: obverse and reverse, issued by the State of Israel, 1955. [309]

11.4 The mosaic floor, Beth Alpha Synagogue, 6th century AD, excavated 1929. Photo: The Picture Art Collection, Alamy Stock Photo. [316]

12.1 Flag adopted by the Indian National Congress in 1931, with the spinning wheel (charkha). Photograph: Creative Commons Licence, Wikipedia [326]

12.2 Flag adopted at Independence as the national flag of India, 1947, with the wheel (chakra) adapted from Ashoka’s lion capital now in Sarnath Museum. Photograph: Creative Commons Licence, Wikipedia [326]

12.3 Didarganj Yakshi, polished sandstone, Height: c. 163 cm. Third century BC to first century AD. Patna Museum, Bihar, India. Photograph: Shivam Setu on a Creative Commons Licence via Wikipedia [343]
List of Figures

12.4 Babri Masjid, Ayodhya India. Mosque completed 1528–9 AD, supposedly on the site of Rama’s birthplace. Protesters scaling its domes before the building was destroyed in December 1992. Photograph: Pramrod Pushkarma, India Picture / Alamy Stock Photo [346]


13.2 Mshatta. View of the remains of the façade in situ, Jordan, 743–744. Author’s photo [379]

13.3 Dome of the Rock. Interior view with mosaic decoration, Jerusalem 691/692. Author’s photo [386]


14.1 Sam Maguire Cup, Ireland. Made by Matthew J. Staunton in Dublin in 1928. Silver. GAA Museum, Croke Park. [411]

14.2 Shield from the Sutton Hoo Mound 1 ship burial (fittings original, reconstructed). England. 91.4 cm diameter. Early 7th century A.D. British Museum, BM 1939,1010.94, AN35177001. Photograph: Courtesy of the trustees of the British Museum [424]


14.4 Gosforth Cross, Cumbria, 10th century. Photograph © Corpus of Anglo-Saxon Stone Sculpture, photographer T. Middlemass [427]

14.5 Gosforth Cross, Cumbria, 10th century. Drawing by W. G. Collingwood, from his Northumbrian Crosses of the Pre-Norman Age (London, 1927) p. 156, fig. 184. [428]
Contributors

**Philippa Adrych** has recently completed a DPhil in Classics at Oxford, for which she worked on the Roman worship of Mithras and particularly the archaeological and visual evidence of this figure.

**Nadia Ali** is a postdoctoral researcher, based at Silsila: Center for Material Histories at New York University and studies the emergence of early Islamic art in the context of late antiquity.

**Robert Bracey** worked as a numismatist of South Asia at the British Museum, with research projects in both *Empires of Faith* and the *Beyond Boundaries* programme on the Gupta empire in India. He has wide interests in all aspects of the material and visual culture of Asia, but especially its diversity of coinage.

**Katherine Cross** is a Lecturer in History at Sheffield University, working on the early medieval West, particularly the Anglo-Saxon kingdoms in Britain during the sixth to ninth centuries.

**Dominic Dalglish** is a Lecturer in Classical Archaeology and Ancient History at Worcester College Oxford, working on the movement of religious ideas in the ancient world through names and images.

**Jaś Elsner** is Professor of Late Antique Art at Oxford and was the Principal Investigator in the *Empires of Faith* project, while he served simultaneously as Senior Research Keeper in the Middle East Department of the British Museum.

**Stefanie Lenk** is postdoctoral researcher in the Institute of Art History at Bern University, currently working on pre-Christian imagery in baptisteries of the fifth and sixth centuries in the western Mediterranean.

**Maria Lidova** is a Research Fellow at Wolfson College, Oxford, working on Byzantine, late antique and early medieval art, in particularly some of the earliest Christian icons.

**Jesse Lockard** is a doctoral candidate at the University of Chicago in art history, studying twentieth-century art and architecture, with special...
Rachel Wood is a Lecturer in Classical Archaeology at the University of Oxford specializing in the art of pre-Islamic Iran, particularly of the Hellenistic and Sasanian periods.
Acknowledgements

We begin by thanking all those involved in the *Empires of Faith* project: especially the Leverhulme Trust who funded us for six years; the British Museum which was our primary home and support; Wolfson College Oxford which supplied a base in Oxford for the team of postdocs and researchers represented in the authorship of this book; Corpus Christi College Oxford which has sustained the editor in many ways over many years; Michael Sharp and his excellent team at CUP who steered the production of the volume through the Press; and the three acute, critical and thoughtful anonymous readers for the Press whose many suggestions have hugely improved our enterprise. Two colleagues within the project – Belinda Crerar and Georgi Parpulov – were germane to a number of its activities at different times but are not represented within the book, although the latter compiled its bibliography.

A project of this magnitude, with many researchers over many years, acquires many debts. A number of scholars made notable contributions to our thinking during the process of gestation – both in one-off seminars and in small conferences. We are particularly grateful to the following for their academic involvement: Clifford Ando, Hannah Baader, Mary Beard, Umberto Bongianino, Claudia Brittenham, Averil Cameron, Matthew Canepa, Simon Coleman, Paul Copp, Patrick Crowley, Fred Donner, Finnbar Barry Flood, Lars Fogelin, Ivan Foletti, Garth Fowden, Peter Frankopan, Richard Gordon, Zsuzsanna Galácsi, Kevin Hector, Jeremy Johns, Catherine Karkov, Aden Kumler, Agnieszka Lic, Bruce Lincoln, Jesse Lockard, Boris Maslov, Diarmid McCulloh, Katharina Meinecke, Paul Mendes-Flohr, Fergus Millar, Margaret Mitchell, Richard Neer, David Nirenberg, Richard Payne, Verity Platt, Joan Pau Rubiés, Salvatore Settis, Michael Squire, Ben Tilghman, Christoph Uehlinger, Eris Williams-Reed, Gerhard Wolf and Wu Hung. Our colleagues at the Ashmolean Museum have been exceptionally supportive – notably Paul Collins, Mallica Kum-bra Landrus, Paul Roberts, Xa Sturgis and Susan Walker (and not only in the exhibition, which proved to be the project’s grand finale). Above all, we thank those in the British Museum with the imagination, vision and hard graft to get the funding together and steer the ship while remaining
Acknowledgements

sensitive to its many needs as it progressed. We must especially mark our gratitude to Richard Hobbs and Elizabeth O’Connell, who were seconded to the team, each for a year; as well as to Roger Bland and Jonathan Tubb, in whose departments we were looked after, to J. D. Hill (who selflessly enabled so much), Neil McGregor and Jonathan Williams in the higher management, and to so many generous friends in the curatorial team – Vesta Sarkhosh Curtis, Chris Entwistle, Eleanor Ghey, Ian Jenkins, Thorsten Opper and St John Simpson.