

Nature, Society, and Justice in the Anthropocene

Are money and technology the core illusions of our time? In this book, Alf Hornborg offers a fresh assessment of the inequalities and environmental degradation of the world. He shows how both mainstream and radical economists are limited by a particular worldview and, as a result, do not grasp that conventional money is at the root of many of the problems that are threatening societies, not to mention the biosphere. Hornborg demonstrates how market prices obscure asymmetric exchanges of resources – human labor, land, energy, materials – under a veil of fictive reciprocity. Such unequal exchange, he claims, underpins the phenomenon of technological development, which is, fundamentally, a redistribution of time and space – human labor and land – in world society. Hornborg deftly illustrates how money and technology have shaped our thinking and our social and ecological relations, with disturbing consequences. He also offers solutions for their redesign in ways that will promote justice and sustainability.

Alf Hornborg is an anthropologist and professor of human ecology at Lund University, Sweden. He is the author of *The Power of the Machine*, *Global Ecology and Unequal Exchange* and *Global Magic*. He has conducted field research in Canada, Peru, and Brazil.



NEW DIRECTIONS IN SUSTAINABILITY AND SOCIETY

Series Editors

JONI ADAMSON Arizona State University SHAUNA BURNSILVER Arizona State University

Editorial Board

CHRISTOPHER BOONE
Arizona State University
KATRINA BROWN
University of Exeter
GIOVANNA DI CHIRO
Swarthmore College
WILLIAM A. GLEASON
Princeton University
DAVID N. PELLOW
University of California,
Santa Barbara
STEPHANIE PINCETL
University of California,
Los Angeles

VERNON SCARBOROUGH
University of Cincinnati
CHRISTINE SZUTER
Amerind Foundation
SANDER VAN DER LEEUW
Arizona State University
KYLE POWYS WHYTE
Michigan State
University
RICHARD WILK
Indiana University
NORMAN YOFFEE
University of Michigan,
Emeritus

Published in conjunction with the School of Sustainability at Arizona State University and the Amerind Museum and Research Center in Dragoon, Arizona, New Directions in Sustainability and Society features a program of books that focus on designing a resilient and sustainable future through a rich understanding of past and present social and ecological dynamics. Collectively, they demonstrate that sustainability research requires engagement with a range of fields spanning the social and natural sciences, humanities, and applied sciences. Books in the series show that a successful transition to a sustainable future will depend on the ability to apply lessons from past societies and link local action to global processes.

For more information about the series, please visit http://newdirections.asu.edu/.

Titles in the Series

Sustainability in the Global City edited by Cindy Isenhour, Gary McDonogh, and Melissa Checker

The Give and Take of Sustainability edited by Michelle Hegmon
Traditional Ecological Knowledge edited by Melissa K. Nelson and Dan Shilling



Nature, Society, and Justice in the Anthropocene

Unraveling the Money-Energy-Technology Complex

ALF HORNBORG

Lund University





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108454193

DOI: 10.1017/9781108554985

© Alf Hornborg 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019 First paperback edition 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data NAMES: Hornborg, Alf, 1954– author.

TITLE: Nature, society, and justice in the anthropocene: unraveling the money-energy-technology complex / Alf Hornborg, Lund University, Sweden.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press,

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press 2019. | Series: New directions in sustainability and society | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018058433 | ISBN 9781108429375 (hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9781108454193 (pbk. : alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Capitalism–Moral and ethical aspects. | Economic development–Moral and ethical aspects. | Environmentalism. | Social justice.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC HB501 .H6425 2019 | DDC 303.44-dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018058433

ISBN 978-1-108-42937-5 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-45419-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



"Have you ever wondered just what is the ultimate driving force behind the Anthropocene, the proposed new epoch in Earth history? It's our love of money. This book unravels the complex, profound force of money, not only to structure a global economy but also to destabilise the climate system and drive the Earth's biosphere towards its sixth great extinction event. Alf Hornborg's latest book is a must-read for anyone who wants to understand not only how a feature of everyday life that we all take for granted has the power to disrupt the functioning of an entire planet, but what we can do about it."

- Will Steffen,

Honorary Professor, Department of Geography and Geology, Copenhagen University; author of Global Change and the Earth System: A Planet under Pressure (2005)

"Alf Hornborg's *Nature, Society and Justice in the Anthropocene* throws down the gauntlet. The Anthropocene, he argues, exposes two of industrial capitalism's founding principles consolidated at the historical zenith of the British Empire: first, that economics is concerned with money and market prices, and need not consider nature; and second, that engineering harnesses natural forces with no need to consider the structure of world society. It is this distinctively modern form of thought that must be challenged, ontologically and politically. Curbing asymmetric global resource flows and climatic catastrophe will require less a tinkering with carbon emissions than a radical rethink and redesign of the artifacts – the money-energy-technology complex – of modernity. A bravura performance and endlessly provocative, *Nature, Society and Justice in the Anthropocene* is a book that commands our attention and a response."

- Michael Watts, Class of 63 Emeritus Professor of Geography and Development Studies, University of California, Berkeley; author of Silent Violence: Food, Famine and Peasantry in Northern Nigeria (2005)

"Alf Hornborg's magnum opus is a bracing challenge to the two main streams of progressive critique of capitalism and the ecological crisis: the Marxist and the posthumanist. Both are going to have to engage seriously with Hornborg's argument, the essence of which is that power resides in the artifacts that rule out lives and that these artifacts – money and technology – are human constructions. Radical social change, including an adequate response to the unfolding catastrophe of the Anthropocene, requires that humans redesign those artifacts. It's a powerful, thought-provoking argument. If it's right, it points to a new direction out of the self-destructive impasse in which humanity finds itself."

- Clive Hamilton, Professor of Public Ethics, Charles Sturt University; author of Growth Fetish (2003)



"Exploding illusions about the neutrality of technology, this innovative work centres on the role of money and technology in obscuring the fundamental inequalities in the flow of ecological resources that underpin capitalism and the global economic order. It should prove essential reading for all those seeking clarity on the injustice and environmental calamities of our times. Defending science and analytic rigour even as it gives an ear to their posthumanist critics and drawing on Marxism and Actor-Network Theory even as it quarrels with them, Hornborg invites us to think beyond conventional political understandings and their familiar categories. In exploring the confusions and evasions of current thinking on the nature–society divide, he opens up questions about value, progress, and the quest for wealth that are never asked by mainstream economists, and seldom even by their critics."

- Kate Soper, Emerita Professor of Philosophy, London Metropolitan University; author of What Is Nature? Culture, Politics and the Non-Human (1995)

"Cutting through the illusions that are blinding humanity to the reasons for our ecologically destructive trajectory while attacking the dithering of those who purport to be environmentalists but offer no real solutions, Alf Hornborg identifies the root cause of this trajectory and offers what is possibly the only practical way of altering it. He builds on, further defends and also goes beyond the arguments of his earlier work, most importantly The Power of the Machine and Global Magic: Technologies of Appropriation from Rome to Wall Street, in which he showed how the fetishism of commodities and of the technology it has generated have structured human relationships on a global scale to facilitate the maximum exploitation of labour and resources, particularly in the semiperipheries and peripheries of the world economy. This is destroying not only these resources but the global ecosystem. In this work, he has shown how these fetishes are aspects of the development of general-purpose money with its tacit assumption that all values are commensurable. The solution is to recognize that money is an institution, and to institute different forms of money. A detailed solution is offered. Hornborg proposes a new form of money and shows how this could enable people to escape from the global system of exploitation and thereby avert global ecological destruction. He provides instruction on how to institute this money and how it would work. This book is a major advance in the struggle to save civilization from the collapse of the current regime of the global ecosystem."

- Arran Gare, Associate Professor of Philosophy, Swinburne University of Technology, Melbourne; author of Postmodernism and the Environmental Crisis (1995) and Philosophical Foundations of Ecological Civilization: A Manifesto for the Future (2016)



"For those concerned with blunting and reversing the burgeoning challenges to biospheric sustainability inherent in the dynamics of the Anthropocene, Alf Hornborg's deep dive into social theory is a must-read. Through a critique not just of the fields of economics and engineering and their contributions to our dilemma but also of Actor Network Theory, posthumanism, environmental humanities, and ecological Marxism, Hornborg lays the ontological groundwork for his own proposal that focuses on redesigning the human artifact of money as a way out of the crisis of the Anthropocene. Along the way, readers will be treated to Hornborg's engagement with and critique of other scholars debating the Anthropocene, and to his insights on the continuing relevance of Karl Polanyi, the global nature of technology, the flaws in proposals to substitute biofuels for fossil fuels, animism, and the agency (or not) of objects in the 'Human Era.'"

- Robert B. Marks, Professor of History, Whittier College; author of *The Origins of the* Modern World: A Global and Ecological Narrative from the Fifteenth to the Twenty-First Century (2007)

"You may or may not agree with his proposal for 'redesigning money' to achieve community sufficiency, but Alf Hornborg's thesis in *Nature*, *Society*, *and Justice in the Anthropocene* is stimulating and provocative. He argues that while global socio-ecological relations today are organised by 'money' and 'technology', each is simply a fetishised 'cultural artifact'. Economics operates in a sealed-off idealised world with no capacity to engage the thermodynamic materiality of life on Earth. Likewise, people treat technology as 'a given' rather than a creation of a certain socio-historical formation. The book is clearly critical of neoliberal capital, but the author's anthropological experience distances him from some eurocentric assumptions in Marxism. Equally, he has a mixed response to analyses framed by Latour's Actor Network Theory. Hornborg's text speaks to the concerns of environmental economists, students of political economy, activists, and policy advisors, and is a welcome contribution to eco-socialist debates."

- Ariel Salleh, University of Sydney; author of *Ecofeminism as Politics: Nature,* Marx and the Postmodern (1997)

"This book is ecological economics at its best. It explains the links between energy, money and growth and it makes a passionate call for redesigning money."

— Giorgos Kallis,

Professor of Environmental Science and Technology, Autonomous

University of Barcelona; author of *Degrowth* (2018)



"A sweeping and deeply original analysis of how universal money has interpenetrated and mediated the modern coevolution of social and natural worlds. Alf Hornborg critiques the failure of local and regional analyses of technology and trade and takes on global analyses as well. Addressing unconstrained universal money is key to escaping the rush toward greater inequality and human suffering, climate change, and the sixth extinction."

- Richard B. Norgaard, Professor Emeritus of Energy and Resources, University of California, Berkeley; author of *Development Betrayed: The End of Progress and a* Coevolutionary Revisioning of the Future (1994)

"With money, capitalism, Marxism, political ecology, environmental degradation, and justice as anchoring themes, Hornborg ranges widely across many aspects of current anthropology (including its fringes). The book is important reading for scholars of these topics and for all concerned about the future of humanity and the earth. Hornborg proposes that problems of the environment and justice call for a redesign of money for local use only within each nation, existing alongside regular currencies."

- Joseph Tainter, Professor, Department of Environment and Society, Utah State University; author of *The Collapse of Complex Societies* (1988)



In memory of my brother Sten Eirik (1952-2015)

Do not go gentle into that good night. Rage, rage against the dying of the light. Dylan Thomas



Contents

List of Figures	page x11
Acknowledgments	xiii
Introduction	I
1 Rethinking Economy and Technology	19
2 The Anthropocene Challenge to Our Worldview	36
3 Producing and Obscuring Global Injustices	53
4 The Money Game	66
5 Anticipating Degrowth	82
6 The Ontology of Technology	93
7 Energy Technologies as Time-Space Appropriation	114
8 Capitalism, Energy, and the Logic of Money	137
9 Unequal Exchange and Economic Value	151
10 Subjects versus Objects: Artifacts Have Consequences,	
Not Agency	177
11 Anthropocene Confusions: Dithering While the	
Planet Burns	193
12 Animism, Relationism, and the Ontological Turn	208
13 Conclusions and Possibilities	231
Afterword: Confronting Mainstream Notions of Progress	248
References	257
Name Index	275
Subject Index	

xi



Figures

1	Per capita net imports of biophysical resources to the	
	European Union, Japan, and United States in 2007	
	(diagrams compiled by C. Dorninger)	page 21
2	The two-step purification of asymmetric resource flows	
	into illusions of (1) market reciprocity and (2) the	
	technological revelation of (nonsocial) nature	26
3	The geographies of money and technology	60
4	The asymmetric exchange of human time and natural	
	space obscured by world market prices of raw cotton	
	and cotton cloth in 1850	102
5	Asymmetric resource distribution as the underlying but	
	unacknowledged rationale of modern technology	123
6	Industrial technology as capital accumulation:	
	how energy sources obscure social exchange relations	129
7	Indirect land requirements of photovoltaic technology	
	in addition to space occupied by infrastructure	130
8	Net imports of embodied resources to world-system	
	cores in 2007 (data compiled by C. Dorninger)	154
9	The role of the concept of "value" in different schools	
	of thought	171
10	The distinctions between subject and object and	
	between society and nature do not coincide	184
ΙI	Sign use among humans and other animals	185

xii



Acknowledgments

For permission to include revised versions of texts previously published elsewhere, I thank the following journals and publishers:

- 1 "Fetishistic Causation: The 2017 Stirling Lecture," HAU: Journal of Ethnographic Theory 7(3): 89–103 (2017).
- 4 "The Root of All Evil," in *Market versus Society* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2018), edited by Manos Spyridakis, reproduced with permission of Palgrave Macmillan.
- 7 "The Magic of Money and the Illusion of Biofuels," European Physical Journal Plus 132(82): NA (2017).
- 8 "Energy, 'Value' and Fetishism in the Anthropocene," *Capitalism Nature Socialism* 27(4): 61–76 (2016).
- 9 "The Money-Energy-Technology Complex and Ecological Marxism," *Capitalism Nature Socialism*, https://doi.org/10.1080/10455752.2018.1440614 (2018).
- 10 "Artifacts Have Consequences, Not Agency," European Journal of Social Theory 20(1): 95–110 (2017).
- "Dithering While the Planet Burns," *Reviews in Anthropology* 46 (2–3): 61–77 (2017).
- "Convictions, Beliefs, and the Suspension of Disbelief," HAU: Journal of Ethnographic Theory 7(1): 553-558 (2017); "Relationism as Revelation or Prescription?," Interdisciplinary Science Reviews 43(3-4): 253-263 (2018).
- 13 "How to Turn an Ocean Liner," *Journal of Political Ecology* 24 (1): 623–632 (2017).

xiii



xiv

Acknowledgments

I thank Sage Publications for permission to reproduce Figure 3a, published as Map 3 (GDP Density) in J. L. Gallup, J. D. Sachs, and A. D. Mellinger, "Geography and Economic Development," *International Regional Science Review* 22(2): 179–232 (1999). Figure 3b is reproduced courtesy C. Mayhew and R. Simmon, NASA.

At Cambridge University Press I want to thank Joni Adamson, Katherine Barbaro, Christine Dunn, Mark Fox, Edgar Mendez, Beatrice Rehl, Mathew Rohit, and Norman Yoffee for their efforts.

The arguments and ideas in this book have grown out of many years of engaging conversations with a far-flung network of colleagues in anthropology, geography, economics, sociology, history, archaeology, and several other fields. I owe these colleagues a debt that goes back many more years than it has taken me to write this book. For once I will embark on a fairly long list, although I am aware of the risk of forgetting to include people who should be on it.

For inspiration and stimulating discussions on different occasions, I am indebted to Zygmunt Bauman[†], Christophe Bonneuil, Stephen Bunker[†], Brett Clark, Philippe Descola, Paul Durrenberger, Thomas Hylland Eriksen, John Bellamy Foster, Andre Gunder Frank[†], Maurice Godelier, David Graeber, Stephen Gudeman, Torsten Hägerstrand[†], Clive Hamilton, Keith Hart, Dougald Hine, Matt Huber, Tim Ingold, Giorgos Kallis, Keir Martin, Joan Martinez-Alier, Timothy Mitchell, Patrick Neveling, Stephen Nugent[†], Bryan Pfaffenberger, Skip Rappaport[†], Ariel Salleh, Frank Salomon, Sandy Smith-Nonini, Will Steffen, Bron Szerszynski, Joe Tainter, Eduardo Viveiros de Castro, Rick Wilk, and Richard York.

I have also benefitted from much appreciated collaboration and conversations with Miguel Alexiades, Eva Alfredsson, Jan Otto Andersson, Jonas Anshelm, Marco Armiero, Stefania Barca, Karin Bradley, Wim Carton, Gustav Cederlöf, Carole Crumley, Christian Dorninger, Jorge Gómez-Paredes, Kenneth Hermele, Joe Heyman, Jonathan Hill, Christian Isendahl, Anne Jerneck, Andrew Jorgenson, Kilian Jörg, Kristian Kristiansen, Stefano Longo, Tom Love, Mikael Lövgren, Mikael Malmaeus, John McNeill, Felipe Milanez, Janken Myrdal, Gunilla Almered Olsson, Lennart Olsson, Martin Oulu, Timothée Parrique, Susan Paulson, Daniela Peluso, Johannes Persson, Vasna Ramasar, Andreas Roos, Stephanie Rupp, Fernando Santos-Granero, Jonathan Seaquist, Michael Sheridan, Simron Jit Singh, Alevgul Sorman, Sarah Strauss, Paul Trawick, Rikard Hjorth Warlenius, and Norman Yoffee.

For highly valued friendship, encouragement, and dialogue over many years, I want to thank Kaj Århem, Pelle Brandström, Anders Burman, Eric



Acknowledgments

xv

Clark, Gudrun Dahl, Kajsa Ekholm Friedman, Jonathan Friedman, Eva Friman, Pernille Gooch, Thomas Håkansson, Johan Hedrén, Cindy Isenhour, Beppe Karlsson, Mikael Kurkiala, Karl-Johan Lundquist, Andreas Malm, Thomas Malm, and Mats Widgren.

I thank all these friends and colleagues for sharing with me their concerns and struggles. And, as always, I owe more than I can express to my wife Anne-Christine, my children, and my grandchildren.