

The Six-Shooter State

American violence is schizophrenic. On the one hand, many Americans support the creation of a powerful bureaucracy of coercion made up of police and military forces that provide public security. At the same time, many of those citizens also demand the private right to protect their own families, homes, and property. This book diagnoses this schizophrenia as a product of a distinctive institutional history in which private forms of violence – vigilantes, private detectives, mercenary gunfighters – emerged in concert with the creation of new public and state forms of violence, such as police departments or the National Guard. This dual public and private face of American violence resulted from the upending of a tradition of republican governance, in which public security had been indistinguishable from private effort, by the nineteenth-century social transformations of the Civil War and the Market Revolution.

JONATHAN OBERT is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Amherst College, where he has taught since 2014. He has published articles on violence, organizational change, and state formation in the United States at *Law & Social Inquiry*, *Perspectives on Politics*, *Studies in American Political Development*, and the *Journal of Policy History*, among others.

The Six-Shooter State

Public and Private Violence in American Politics

JONATHAN OBERT
Amherst College



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-108-45414-8 — The Six-Shooter State
 Jonathan Obert
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108454148

DOI: 10.1017/9781108557740

© Jonathan Obert 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2018

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

NAMES: Obert, Jonathan, author.

TITLE: The six-shooter state : public and private violence
 in American politics / Jonathan Obert.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY :

Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018017124 | ISBN 9781316515143 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781108454148 (paperback)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Violence—Political aspects—United States. |

Vigilantes—United States. | Police—United States. | Firearms ownership—United States.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC HV6432 .024 2018 | DDC 303.60973—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018017124>

ISBN 978-1-316-51514-3 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-45414-8 Paperback

Additional resources for this publication at www.jonathanobert.com

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

*And the fruit of righteousness is sown in peace of them that
make peace.*

— James 3:18

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii
1 Introduction	I
2 Jurisdictional Decoupling as Institutional Change	23
3 Bandits, Elites, and Vigilantes in Antebellum Illinois	63
4 Pinkertons and Police in Antebellum Chicago	99
5 Racist Vigilantism as Reform in Reconstruction Louisiana	138
6 The Violent Careers of American Gunfighters	197
7 Conclusion	238
<i>Index</i>	261

Figures

1	Jurisdictional coupling	<i>page</i> 34
2	Enclosed authority and jurisdictional coupling	70
3	Northern Illinois	74
4	Membership in claims associations and vigilante organizations (1835–1845)	90
5	Mayoral co-affiliations (1835–1868)	110
6	Delegative authority and jurisdictional coupling	112
7	Delegative capacity in select neighborhoods (1855–1856)	119
8	Trends in private security employment in Chicago (1851–1870)	130
9	Selected career trajectories of Chicago violence experts (1850–1870)	135
10	Representative authority and jurisdictional coupling	144
11	White League presence and political intimidation (1874)	183
12	Imperial authority and jurisdictional coupling	204
13	Gunfighting participants (1850–1930)	226
14	Professional gunfighter career types (1850–1930)	230
15	Flow of gunfighters between locales (1850–1930)	232
16	US military battle campaigns against Indian groups (1866–1891)	233
17	Gunfighter social network (1850–1930)	235
18	Ratio of watchmen to police in select cities (1865–1900)	246

Tables

1	Jurisdictional coupling and coercive enforcement in the nineteenth-century United States	<i>page 34</i>
2	Change in coercive enforcement in the nineteenth-century United States	61
3	Network clusters and county membership in Ogle-Lee	86
4	Networks and quasi-legal enforcement	92
5	Location of local violent events in Chicago newspapers (1853–1856)	116
6	Personal networks in select Chicago neighborhoods (1856)	117
7	Private special constable commissions in Chicago (1840–1871)	123
8	Number of private watchmen employed in Chicago firms (1851–1870)	130
9	Links between security institutions in Chicago (1845–1871)	133
10	Career trajectories of important actors (1845–1871)	134
11	Occupations of CCWL members	177
12	Class background of CCWL members	177
13	CCWL employees across different industries	178
14	Class background of Metropolitan Police (1874)	181
15	Race and politics in White League parishes (1874)	182
16	White League meetings and speakers (April–July 1874)	186
17	Lynching in Louisiana (1876–1920)	193
18	Entrepôt towns on the cattle frontier (1865–1890)	219
19	Private detective agencies in select American cities (1870–1900)	245

Acknowledgments

This book has taken many years to complete, and it never would have reached this point without the generosity, support, feedback, and faith of so many people. This project began as a dissertation at the University of Chicago, where I was fortunate to have a wonderful committee of supportive scholars. John Padgett, John Mearsheimer, Dan Slater, and Paul Staniland have given much of their time and their guidance to this project, which proved crucial in those frequent moments where I wondered whether it would ever see the light of day. Paul Staniland organized a writing group early in the process, and his critical insight, along with the creative and sympathetic advice of Sarah Parkinson and Eric Hundman, allowed me to clarify and articulate my theoretical contribution. Dan Slater and John Mearsheimer, in workshops and in meetings, have been helpful in keeping my ideas honest and clear, and were willing to trust the strange directions this project has taken.

John Padgett has not only been the quintessential advisor – helpful, engaged, supportive, patient, and, most of all, intolerant of bad ideas – but has been a source of unparalleled intellectual guidance, support, and sheer inspiration in every dimension of my academic career. His own scholarship is immensely creative and inspiring on its own, but he has also given me an opportunity to learn at the feet of a true master through collaborative work, scholarly exchange, teaching opportunities, frequent advice, and wonderful conversations. This project simply would have been impossible without his help, and I owe him and his wonderful family my deepest and most abiding gratitude.

Other faculty and staff within the Department of Political Science at the University of Chicago also proved instrumental. I would also like to thank Alex Wendt, who helped me begin this process, as well as Bob Pape, Carles Boix, Patchen Markell, Charles Lipson, Charlie Glaser, Bill Sewell, Bernard Silberman, and Lisa Wedeen, who in workshops and other settings provided

memorable and useful feedback on my work. Kathy Anderson has routinely proven her irreplaceability and helpfulness in more ways than I can count.

At Chicago I learned most from my fellow students. My own cohort – in particular, Burak Kadercan, Ian Storey, and Matthias Staisch – included an incredible collection of scholars, who have pushed my work in unpredictable and, for me, highly satisfying directions. Conversations with Ian, Burak, and (especially) Matthias have been the source of many of the best ideas found in this project, and their friendship and brilliance has meant the world to me. Thank you, my friends. Dina Rashad, J. J. McFadden, Jeremy Menchik, Willow Osgood, Marissa Guerrero, Yuna Blajer de la Garza, Keven Ruby, John Schuessler, Jon Caverly, Negeen Pegahi, Chris McIntosh, Michelle Murray, John Stevenson, Takayuki Nishi, Todd Hall, Sarah Johnson, Jade Schiff, Erica Simmons, Morgan Kaplan, Lindsey O'Rourke, Zack Callen, Emily Meierding, David Bholat, Min Hee Go, Brian Fried, Lauren Duquette-Rury, Carolyn Hippolyte, Rose Kelanic, and many others have formed a graduate community of unparalleled inspiration and support. Daragh Grant, in particular, has not only been an invaluable friend but also a continual source of intellectual inspiration, offering incredible feedback, guidance, and a critical eye. Nuno Monteiro, also, has helped immeasurably through his conversations, support, and advice. I am lucky to know both of these scholars.

The Committee on International Relations was also instrumental in providing time and support while completing the early stages of this project. Duncan Snidal and Mark Bradley were incredible directors, while Mimi Smiley, Keisha Yelton-Hunter, Johanna Schloss, Will Gossin-Smith, and E. G. Enbar composed the best staff one could hope for. Instructors in the program – including Michael Reese, Anne Holthoefer, and Qiang Zhou – were always sources of great support and help. In addition to Matthias and Anne, Milena Ang and Diana Kim were wonderful interlocutors, sharing their ideas and passion without reservation. Diana provided important shaping my argument at a key moment, and I treasure her insights and keen historical sensibilities.

I was extremely fortunate in the early days to have a group of fellow scholars to aid in the actual writing of this book – the “Gang of Four” writing group. Chris Haid and Manuel Viedma occasionally and usefully expanded the gang to five, but I must credit Anne Holthoefer, Nick Rush Smith, and Adam Dean with much of what is valuable herein. These three have read and commented on almost every word in this (long) book and have each brought a distinctive voice and a critical eye to its structure, content, and claims. Adam, in particular, has served as one of my most honest and incisive interlocutors, my closest collaborator, and one of my dearest friends. My gratitude to him is without measure.

This book was completed at Amherst College, a wonderfully unique, diverse, and insightful community. The Department of Political Science – Amrita Basu, Kristin Bumiller, Javier Corrales, Tom Dumm, Pavel Machala, Eleonora Mattiacci, Ruxandra Paul, Andrew Poe, Kerry Ratigan, and Austin

Acknowledgments

xv

Sarat – form an unparalleled group of scholars and friends whose intellectual passion and creativity is never less than inspiring. In particular, Javier and Pavel both provided extremely helpful feedback on portions of this book, while Andrew and Austin have been generous with their time, energy, and support. Tom not only read the entire manuscript, but helped me organize a book workshop in the final push, giving incredible feedback and help on every chapter. Theresa Laizier, Steve Laizier, and Donna Simpter have been instrumental, providing administrative and logistical help and good cheer.

The Dean of Faculty's office at Amherst has provided much support for this project as well. In particular, I'd like to thank Catherine Epstein, Greg Call, Jack Cheney, and Janet Tobin. Elsewhere in the College, I want to acknowledge Vanessa Walker, Dwaipayan Sen, Andy Anderson, Ted Melillo, Adi Gordon, Nusrat Chowdhury, Jan Dizard, and Leah Schmalzbauer, as well as Bryn Geffert, Steve Heim, and Dunstan McNutt at Frost Library and Mary Strunk in the Grants Office. Kevin Sweeney not only read the whole manuscript, but pointed me in some very helpful directions. This project also benefited from conversations with members of the Copeland Colloquium on "The Social Life of Guns," hosted by the College in 2016 and 2017; Jennifer Yida Pan, Chad Kautzer, Nathan Shelton, and Alex Young formed an engaged interdisciplinary sounding board for some of the ideas in this book.

I have had the privilege of working with some wonderful students as well as fantastic research assistants during the writing of this book. Elias Schultz, Joshua Cavé, and Daniel Delgado have done a great job reading portions of this manuscript and helping me with data collection. Members of my First Year Seminar classes, in particular, have been sources of inspiration, forcing me to keep my ideas honest and clear.

Henning Hillman, Hans Joas, Dan Carpenter, Elisabeth Clemens, Anthony Chen, Randall Calvert, Richard White, Dorit Geva, Michael Pfeifer, Larry Isaac, Josh Kertzer, Ben Jones, Bear Braumoeller, Nicholas Parrillo, Ilia Murtazashvili, Meyer Kestnbaum, Audrey Latura, Chris Ansell, Paul Frymer, Chris Smith, Sam Mitrani, Justin Gross, Jeffrey Friedman, Kevin Young, and Ezra Zuckerman have each contributed to this project in a variety of ways. I also want to thank the wonderful staffs at Northeastern Illinois University Library, Northern Illinois University Library, the Chicago Historical Society, Indiana University-Bloomington Library, the University of Illinois-Chicago, the Colorado Historical Society, the Newberry Library, the Huntington Library, the New Orleans Public Library, Tulane University Library, the National Archives and Records Administration, Widener Library, Regenstein Library, Boulder Public Library, Denver Public Library, and Louisiana State University Library for their help locating materials. Audiences at the American Political Science Association, Social Science History Association, and Midwest Political Science Association Annual Conferences, as well as Yale University, the Santa Fe Institute and the Radcliffe Institute for Advanced Study, all provided useful feedback on portions of this manuscript.

I would especially like to thank Richard Bensel, Jim Morone, Tom Dumm, and Daragh Grant for participating in a highly stimulating book conference funded by a Faculty Research Award Program Grant from Amherst College; their feedback has proven absolutely critical in helping refine, reframe, and sharpen every word of this project. Christopher Lura, in turn, provided excellent guidance and copyediting for the manuscript, pointing out numerous areas for improvement and refinement. Thank you all so much for your time and help.

At Cambridge University Press, I'd like to thank Robert Dreesen for his support and faith in this project, as Christina Taylor, Joshua Penney, and Jackie Grant. It has been a pleasure to work with such an efficient and incredible team.

My family and friends have also been sources of help throughout an undertaking we all, I'm sure, doubted would ever be completed. Harley Stroh and Joel Rusnock are the best and most patient friends a person could ask for, while my brother, Simon, my sister, Susy, and their wonderful families have helped in more ways than I could ever acknowledge. My grandma, Jean, and my parents, Mike and Peggy, are exemplars of unconditional support and care – I love all of you so much.

Most of all, however, I need to thank Eleonora Mattiacci and our son, Cosmo. Eleonora is not only my partner, colleague, friend, and inspiration, she is my soul. I cannot imagine life without her. I love you both more than anything.

Note: Portions of Chapter 4 and Chapter 6 of this book were previously published in the following journals:

- “The Co-Evolution of Public and Private Policing in Nineteenth Century Chicago.” *Law & Social Inquiry*, (February 2017) <https://doi.org/10.1111/lsi.12285>.
- “The Six-Shooter Marketplace: 19th Century Gunfighting as Violence Expertise.” *Studies in American Political Development*, Vol. 28, No. 1 (April 2014), pp. 49–79.

Abbreviations

AC	<i>Alexandria Caucasian</i>
CDP	<i>Chicago Daily Democratic Press</i>
CP	<i>Chicago City Council Proceedings Files, 1833–1871</i> (Illinois Regional Archives Depository, Northeastern Illinois University)
CTR	<i>Chicago Tribune</i>
CWD	<i>Chicago Weekly Democrat</i>
CWT	<i>Chicago Weekly Times</i>
NDD	<i>New Orleans Daily Delta</i>
NOC	<i>New Orleans Crescent</i>
NOP	<i>New Orleans Daily Times-Picayune</i>
NOR	<i>New Orleans Republican</i>
NOT	<i>New Orleans Times-Democrat</i>
OC	<i>Opelousas Courier</i>