

Management Tools

No organisation is immune from the influence of management tools. Such tools as norms, indicators, ranking, evaluation grids and management control systems have moved outside the managerial and consultancy realm within which they were first developed to reach public administrations and policy-makers, as well as a range of other governmental and non-governmental organisations. Taking management tools out of the practical and utilitarian contexts to which they are often consigned and approaching them from a social analytical perspective, this book gives primacy to these everyday objects that constitute the background of organisational life and remain too often unquestioned. Bringing together developing streams of research from anthropology, political science, social psychology, sociology, accounting, organisation theory and management, Ève Chiapello and Patrick Gilbert offer an unprecedented theoretical synthesis that will help managers, scholars and policy-makers to unpack the functional and dysfunctional roles and effects of management tools within and across organisations.

ÈVE CHIAPELLO is Professor at École des hautes études en sciences sociales (EHESS), Paris, where she holds a chair in the 'Sociology of the transformation of capitalism'. She was previously Professor at the HEC School of Management, Paris. Her previously published works comprise numerous articles and books including: *Artistes versus Managers* (1998), and *Le nouvel esprit du capitalisme* (1999, with Luc Boltanski, translated into nine languages, including English in 2005).

PATRICK GILBERT holds a Ph.D. in Management and graduated in Organizational Psychology. He is Emeritus Professor at the Sorbonne Business School (IAE Paris) and Research Director at the *Mutations Anticipations Innovations* Chair. He is also a member of the board of several scientific societies, such as the Association francophone de Gestion des Ressources Humaines (AGRH) and Association Internationale de Psychologie du Travail de Langue Française (AIPTLF).

Management Tools

A Social Sciences Perspective

ÈVE CHIAPELLO

École des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales, Paris

PATRICK GILBERT

IAE Paris – Sorbonne Business School

In collaboration with

MARION BRIVOT, CARINE CHEMIN-BOUZIR AND
BÉNÉDICTE GRALL



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-45172-7 — Management Tools
Ève Chiapello, Patrick Gilbert
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108451727
DOI: 10.1017/9781108553858

© Ève Chiapello and Patrick Gilbert 2019

This edition is an adapted translation of *Sociologie des outils de gestion: Introduction à l'analyse sociale de l'instrumentation de gestion*, published by La Découverte in 2014 (9782707151452).

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019
First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Chiapello, Ève, author. | Gilbert, Patrick, author.

Title: Management tools : a social sciences perspective / Ève Chiapello, École des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales, Paris, Patrick Gilbert, IAE Paris ; in collaboration with [three others].

Other titles: Sociologie des outils de gestion. English

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, [2019] | "This edition is an adapted translation of *Sociologie des outils de gestion: introduction à l'analyse sociale de l'instrumentation de gestion*, published by La Découverte in 2014."

Identifiers: LCCN 2019007595 | ISBN 9781108428958 (hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9781108451727 (pbk. : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Management—Social aspects. | Organizational sociology.

Classification: LCC HD30.19 C4513 2019 | DDC 302.3/5—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2019007595>

ISBN 978-1-108-42895-8 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-108-45172-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of Figures	<i>page</i> xi
List of Tables	xii
Acknowledgements	xiii
How to Use This Book	xvii
Introduction: Organisations as Worlds of Management Tools	1
PART I THEORETICAL FOUNDATIONS FOR THINKING ABOUT MANAGEMENT INSTRUMENTATION	9
1. Theoretical Foundations: From the Study of Technique to the Analysis of Management Tools	11
Spontaneous Discourse about Technique	12
Denial of Technique, or the Insignificance of the Object	12
Technophile Euphoria	14
Technophobic Reaction, or Technique as a Snare	15
False Debates and Real Impasses	17
The Contributions of Anthropology	18
Considering Technique: The Technological Project	18
Concerning the Study of Technique and Its Tools	21
Some Lessons for the Study of Management Tools	22
Management as an Intangible Technique	24
Management: A Technique Unlike Others	24
The Specificity of Intangible Techniques	25
What Is a Management Tool?	26
A Common-Sense Notion	26
Describing a Management Tool	27
Conclusion	31

vi CONTENTS

2. Traditional Approaches: Management Tools in the History of Organisation Theory	32
Rationalist Theories or Technique as a Solution	33
Management Tools from a Scientific Management Perspective	34
Management Tools and the Rational Systems School	37
Management Tools and the School of Contingency	38
Normative Theories, between Forgetting and Minimising Technique	39
The Pervasiveness of Rational Beliefs	43
The Rational Discourse Prevails Despite the Alternation of Theoretical Orientations	43
The Rational Approach Is Reinforced by the Consultants	47
Going Beyond Classical Approaches	48
The Socio-Technical Approach	49
The Behavioural Theory of Organisations	50
After the 1980s: Renewed Interest for the Instrumentation of Management in French Academia	51
Conclusion	53
 PART II THREE MAJOR TYPES OF SOCIAL SCIENCE APPROACHES	 55
3. Critical Perspectives on Management Tools	59
Thesis 1: Tools Implicated in Relationships of Domination	61
The Tool as an Element of a Social and Economic System	62
The Tool in the Legitimation of Social Hierarchies	64
The Tool as a Lever of Exploitation	65
The Tool as the Result of Power Relations	66
The Tool as a Resource in a Struggle	68
Summary Sheet (Thesis 1)	73
Thesis 2: The Tool as a Technique for Discipline and Government	75
Management Tools as Apparatuses of Knowledge/Power	76

Management Tools as a Disciplinary Technique	77
Management Techniques as a Tool of Government	79
Management Techniques as Technologies of the Self	81
Summary Sheet (Thesis 2)	87
Thesis 3: The Tool Alienates and Dehumanises	91
Clinical Approaches	91
Critique of the Manipulative Project	94
The Critique of Technicism and the Discarding of Subjectivity	96
Summary Sheet (Thesis 3)	98
4. Institutional Perspectives on Management Tools	100
Thesis 4: Management Tools Influenced by Institutional Strategies	102
The Founding Concepts: Field-Level Institutions and Isomorphism	102
From Similarity to Variety: Research between 1990 and 2000	105
The Distinction between Legitimacy, Efficiency and Decoupling	107
Power, Conflict and Institutions	108
Transnationalisation and International Standards	110
Summary Sheet (Thesis 4)	115
Thesis 5: Tools as Investment in Forms	118
The Conventionalist Approach	118
The Sociology of Quantification and Classifications	121
Analytical Perspectives on Management Tools	127
Summary Sheet (Thesis 5)	138
Thesis 6: Technology Is Both Constraining and Enabling	142
Structuration Theory (ST): Some of the Central Concepts	142
The Place of Technology in Processes of Structuration: Two Different Ontologies but Complementary Empirical Results	146
Summary Sheet (Thesis 6)	150

viii CONTENTS

5. Interactional Perspectives on Management Tools	153
Thesis 7: The Tool Is a Human/Non-Human	
Arrangement	155
The Symmetry between Humans and Non-Humans	155
Network and the Translation Process	156
Objects as Human/Non-Human Arrangements and the	
Notion of Performation	157
Understanding the Implementation and Role of the	
Management Tool within an Organisation	158
Summary Sheet (Thesis 7)	166
Thesis 8: The Tool Is Nothing outside the Activity System	169
From Tool to Instrument	169
Individual Activity Mediated	171
Activity and Collective Work	173
Summary Sheet (Thesis 8)	177
Thesis 9: The Tool as a Language Being	179
Written Text as a Management Tool	180
The Management Tool as a Support for Sensemaking	184
The Management Tool as Text	185
Summary Sheet (Thesis 9)	187
Thesis 10: The Effects of the Tool Are Conditioned by What	
Actors Do	189
The Relativisation of the Formal System	190
Change Rather Than Functioning	191
Tool and/or Rules?	192
Summary Sheet (Thesis 10)	195
 PART III SYNTHESIS	 199
6. The Agency of Management Tools	201
A Framework for the Analysis of Management Tools	203
Vocabulary Issues	203
Functions	204
Effects	207

The Epistemic Effects of Tools	208
First-Order Effects Linked to Epistemic Function	208
Effects of Reactivity Linked to the Epistemic Function	214
The Pragmatic Effects of Management Tools	217
The Specific Effects of Tools Linked to Their Pragmatic Function	217
The Effects of Reactivity Linked to the Pragmatic Function of Tools	219
The Political Practices of Management Tools	222
Political Effects That Are Proper to Management Tools	223
Reactivity and the Political Effects of Management Tools	224
Conclusion	225
General Conclusion	227
Studying Management Tools: A Project of Emancipation	227
The Analysis of Management Tools as Counter-Expertise	227
Towards a New Socio-Technical Approach	229
An Approach for a Project	231
Multiply the Angles of Analysis	231
Dialogue between the Grids Themselves	232
Revisiting Older Questions	235
Going beyond the Macro–Micro Distinction	235
Renewing the Theory of Organisations	239
Thinking about the Transformations of Capitalism	241
Management Tools Perspective: A Research Strategy	244
Appendix 1: Cross-Reading the Theses on Some Generic Questions	246
How Did We Get to This Point?	246
What Is the Tool Made of?	247
How Does It Work?	247
How Does It Evolve?	248

X CONTENTS

What Is the Effect?	248
Appendix 2: Studying the Tool in All Its Various States	250
(1) The Circulating Form (the Tool Outside a Specific Situation)	250
Describing the Management Tool as a Technical Object	250
Identify the Conventions, Representations, Models of Judgement and Action, Premises That Are Present in the Tool or That Support Its Purpose	251
Establish the History of the Tool	251
Study the Modes of Circulation	252
(2) The Inscribed Form (the Tool in a Specific Situation)	252
Describe the Organisational Context	252
Identify the Actors in Their Relation to the Tool	252
Reconstitute the History of the Tool in the Organisation	253
Identify the Different Effects of the Tool and/or the Transformations That Accompany It	253
Bibliography	254
Index	283

Figures

5.1	The IAS model: the characteristic triad of instrument-mediated activity situations	<i>page</i> 172
5.2	Basic structure of an activity	174
6.1	Process of interaction involving the tool	206

Tables

2.1	Decision-making techniques according to the types of decisions	<i>page 37</i>
2.2	Correspondence between HRM and structural configurations	40
2.3	Theoretical conceptions of management tools	44
3.1	A selection of publications representative of the domination thesis	69
3.2	A selection of publications representative of the Foucault-inspired thesis	84
3.3	A selection of publications representative of the clinical critique thesis	93
4.1	A selection of representative neo-institutionalist publications	112
4.2	A selection of publications representative of the conventionalist thesis	132
4.3	Research representative of the structurationist thesis	144
5.1	A selection of publications on ANT/sociology of translation	160
5.2	A selection of publications on activity theory	175
5.3	A selection of publications of the discursive approaches	181
5.4	A selection of publications on strategic actor theory	193
6.1	Management tools' agency analysed through unintended effects	208

Acknowledgements

This book owes its origins to a French-language book published in 2013 (Chiapello and Gilbert, 2013). It contains the first two parts (containing five chapters) and conclusion of the French book, slightly amended for the English-language version.¹ Chapter 6, which is new for this edition, presents ideas previously discussed in Chiapello and Gilbert (2016).

The whole is the result of a research and teaching project nourished by the authors' previous work, in the sociology of accounting for one (Berland and Chiapello, 2009; Bourguignon and Chiapello, 2005; Chiapello, 2005, 2007; Chiapello and Desrosières, 2006),² and for the other, in human resources management (Gilbert, 1998a, 1998b) and information systems (Gilbert and Gonzalez, 2000; Gilbert and Leclair, 2004). This work was enriched along the way by countless conversations and discussions.

The event that set us on this journey was the 'Social and behavioural approaches to management tools'³ seminar we set up in 2005 in connection with the Master in Research on Organisations⁴ run jointly by HEC School of Management⁵ and IAE

¹ It does not, however, contain the third part, comprising four case studies written by Corine Eyraud, Bénédicte Grall, Carine Chemin-Bouzir and Céline Baud.

² We should also mention the organisation of the 'First sociology and quantification days' (in collaboration with Alain Desrosières, Carlos Ramirez and Fabrice Bardet) in May 2002, the coordination (with Carlos Ramirez) of a special 'sociology of accounting' issue of *Comptabilité-Contrôle-Audit* in June 2004 (Chiapello and Ramirez, 2004), and the co-editing (with Richard Baker) of an issue of *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal* focusing on the influence of French Theory on accounting research in 2011 (Chiapello and Baker, 2011).

³ Original French title: *Approches sociales et comportementales des outils de gestion*.

⁴ *DEA Organisation appliquée*.

⁵ Ève Chiapello was a Professor at HEC School of Management, Paris until March 2013. Since then she has been a Research Director at EHESS, Paris (*École des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales*; School for the Advanced Studies in Social Sciences).

xiv ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

de Paris.⁶ The discussions contained in Chapter 6 also benefited from Ève Chiapello's 2014–15 EHESS seminar, and bibliographic research conducted by Mehdi Arfaoui (Ph.D. student, EHESS).

Our reflections were stimulated by the work done with junior researchers, particularly Carine Chemin-Bouzir, who prepared her Ph.D. at IAE de Paris, and Marion Brivot, who has a doctorate from HEC. The research work undertaken by Céline Baud, Bénédicte Grall, Luis Cuenca and Nathalie Stempak for their HEC doctoral thesis was also a constant source of considerations about the way management tools are used, and analysis of more general transformations in business organisations and the economic system. Bénédicte Grall also helped us to identify important publications related to certain schools of thought. For five years (2007–12), the Renault-Polytechnique-HEC Chair in Multicultural Management (in collaboration with Eric Godelier of the École Polytechnique) provided another arena for experimentation with our view of the way organisations operate in an international context (Chiapello and Godelier, 2015a, 2015b). Every year, four to six teams of students carried out research comparing management practices in France with Japan, India and Korea.

Further advances came about through our participation in Ph.D. examination panels (especially in sociology, for the theses presented by Pauline Barraud de Lagerie (IEP Paris) and Benjamin Lemoine (École des Mines), and management, for Valérie Michaud (UQAM)), and Research Supervisor qualifications⁷ (especially in management for Annick Bourguignon and Ewan Oiry, and sociology for Valérie Boussard and Corine Eyraud).

There were also many useful encounters and discussions with colleagues: naturally, with colleagues linked to HEC (Hélène Löning, Claire Dambrin) and IAE de Paris (José Allouche, Géraldine Schmidt, Hélène Rainelli) in the course of research or doctoral seminars, but

⁶ *IAE de Paris* is the School of Management of University of Paris 1-La Sorbonne (*Institut d'Administration des Entreprises*).

⁷ *Habilitation à diriger des recherches*.

also with colleagues from other institutions, including Alain Desrosières (INSEE), Valérie Boussard (Université de Paris-Nanterre), Fabian Muniesa (Mines ParisTech), Corine Eyraud (Université de Provence), Dominique Bouteiller (HEC Montreal), François-Xavier de Vaujany and Bernard Colasse (Université de Paris-Dauphine), Yves Cohen (EHESS), Maya Leroy (Agro Paristech), François Pichault (Université de Liège) and Frédérique Pigeyre (Université de Paris-Est). Productive interactions with other colleagues – who are too numerous to name individually – occurred at symposia and conferences (*Association Française de Sociologie*, *Association francophone de Gestion des Ressources Humaines*, *Association Internationale de Psychologie du Travail de Langue Française*), visits to other universities, and debates inside research teams.

This intellectual journey was punctuated by milestones in the form of intermediate publications. Philippe Steiner and François Vatin provided the initial opportunity to provide a first introduction to the sociology of management tools when they invited us to contribute to their book *Traité de sociologie économique* (Chiapello and Gilbert, 2009). An article discussing the clinical critique of management tools, published in *Le travail humain* (Chiapello and Gilbert, 2012), was a chance to test our prototype method for exposing the research theses contributing to social analysis of management tools, and launch the debate.

To bring this work to fruition, we benefited from input from other researchers sharing our interest in studying management tools, who very willingly agreed to write for the book. Bénédicte Grall (lecturer at the Conservatoire National des Arts et Métiers), Marion Brivot (associate professor at Université Laval au Québec) and Carine Chemin-Bouzir (associate professor at Neoma Business School) were all involved in the literature review;⁸ the book would have been the

⁸ Thesis 4 was written by Carine Chemin-Bouzir, thesis 6 was written by Marion Brivot and thesis 7 by Bénédicte Grall. Their signature is found in a footnote at the start of each thesis.

xvi ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

poorer without their contribution. They also agreed to update their parts of the book in preparation for publication of the English-language version.

Finally, we would like to express our very sincere thanks to Jean-Pascal Gond (professor at Cass Business School). We are indebted to him as the first person to express enthusiasm for our plan to adapt the original French book for an English-language readership. He was also instrumental in establishing our initial contacts with Cambridge University Press. The book has been translated thanks to financial support from IAE de Paris and the Anneliese Maier Research Award grant received by Ève Chiapello from the Foundation Alexander Von Humboldt. Yuewu Duan (Ph.D., IAE de Paris), Medhi Arfaoui (Ph.D., EHESS) and Philipp Golka (Post-Doc, University of Hamburg) also took part in reviews of the English version. We extend our warmest gratitude to all these people. However, as the time-honoured expression goes, responsibility for the overall construction of the book and the arguments developed in it remains entirely our own.

This book is especially dedicated to Alain Desrosières, who passed away on 15 February 2013. Our many discussions with him and our reading of his work were a crucial part of the genesis of this book, and he is sadly missed.

How to Use This Book

This book is for anyone who wants a relatively comprehensive exploration of much of the social thinking on management tools. It has been written for people who are interested in the way management tools are influencing individual and group behaviours in organisations.

It can be used in a number of ways, depending on the reader's specialisation, experience and interests. It can be read from beginning to end because it follows an organised sequence. But each chapter, and each of the ten theses in the second part, can also be read separately, as appropriate to the area of literature the reader wants to address. It can be used both as a textbook for a course, and as a reference book that is consulted to inform thinking or analysis.

The book originated in our teaching and research supervision activities, and was initially conceived as a reference manual for doctoral or post-doctoral research, since no book existed that gave an overview of the wide range of management tool-related research going on in a number of management disciplines, and more broadly in the social sciences. The second part provides a digest of the major theoretical streams that are casting light on the question. It contains summary tables describing the object of study, the theses and their contributions. Each thesis is backed up with an extensive bibliography for further reading. We consider these theses complementary, to be called on as and when relevant to the management situations and economic climates encountered. The appendices offer suggestions for successful social science research that takes management tools seriously, and a guide for combining approaches as appropriate to the research questions addressed.

The book can thus be used to construct a Ph.D. or Research Master level course in Management, Sociology or Political Sciences designed to train students in these approaches. After an introductory

xviii HOW TO USE THIS BOOK

session based on Chapters 1 and 2, a certain number of theses from the second part can be selected for closer examination in dedicated sessions. As well as the part of the book presenting the chosen thesis, it is advisable to have the students read some of the key works cited. Chapter 6 and the conclusion are useful for a final summing-up session. For assessment, we recommend asking the students to carry out a study of a management tool.

A similar approach can also be used to construct classes for top-level business schools where 'management tools' are not supposed to be taken for granted, and teaching is informed by cutting-edge research. In such establishments the book can be used as a supplementary resource for MBA, MSc, and Executive MBA teaching. MBA and EMBA module students are always keen to learn about management tools, and this book is an excellent instrument for bringing fundamental social science debates on the potential and limitations of such tools into the classroom. For instance, the book can be given to practitioners/MBA students as a comprehensive guide for analysing a specific tool in their workplace, with the potential to serve as a textbook for an entire module. Business school students who already have some professional experience are often very interested in re-examining familiar management tools under different analysis grids. For this type of student, we recommend focusing work on the ideas from the second part, which they must learn to handle. It is also important to have them work in small groups on real-life case studies chosen by the students themselves, which will require them to collect additional documents, visit businesses and conduct interviews. Our teaching experience suggests that students always love management tools and want to learn about them.

A course of this kind can provide an enjoyable complement to an Organisational Behaviour or Organisation Theory course. Chapter 2 of this book, which reviews organisation theories from the perspective of management tools, provides a good way in to the subject. The book also could be adapted to develop an ad hoc module on tools for specific disciplines, for example HRM tools (e.g., HR planning, job evaluation),

Strategy tools (e.g., Five Forces, PESTEL, BCG Matrix), Sustainability-CSR tools (e.g., GRI, reporting tools, business case and supply-chain analysis tools, norms and standards for implementing sustainability, CSR ratings), accounting and control tools (e.g., performance indicators, accounting standards) or marketing tools (e.g., customer-management tools, segmentation), using the different perspectives to unpack a pre-selected set of tools from the disciplines. In this case, the teacher must take care to select appropriate additional reading.

Finally, outside the academic world, practising professionals who specialise in a functional field (management control, HR management, information systems, operations management, or other fields), working in business or as consultants, can make use of the analysis grids provided for their diagnoses. The third part provides a grid for the systematic study of the effects of any management tool. The methodological complements of the conclusion and the appendices also supply useful resources for conducting an in-depth study.