CONTENTS

Preface v
Table of cases xvii
Table of statutes xxxiii
Acknowledgements xlv

1 Introduction 1

1.1 Introduction 1

1.2 What is evidence? 2

1.2.1 Evidence law 3

1.2.2 Principles versus rules 3

1.3 Background to the Act 4

1.3.1 Structure of the Act 5

1.3.2 Practical effect of the Act 5

1.4 Preliminary concepts 6

1.4.1 Criminal versus civil proceedings 6

1.4.2 Order of court proceedings 8

1.4.3 Functions of judge and jury 9

1.4.4 Burden and standard of proof: sections 140–2 10

1.4.5 Burden of proof 10

1.4.6 Standard of proof 10

1.4.7 A Victorian variation 12

1.4.8 Judicial notice: sections 143–5 14

1.4.9 Formal admissions: section 184 15

1.4.10 Preliminary questions – the voir dire: section 189 16

1.4.11 Waiver: section 190 17

1.4.12 Judicial directions and leave: section 192 18

1.4.13 Advance rulings and findings: section 192A 19

1.4.14 Appeals 19

1.5 Types and forms of evidence 20

Key points 21

Key terms and definitions 21

Further reading 22
2 Adducing evidence 23

2.1 Introduction 24

2.2 Calling a witness 24

2.3 Presumption of competence and compellability: section 12 25

2.4 Competence: section 13 26

2.4.1 Children and witnesses who are cognitively impaired 29

2.4.2 Alternative arrangements for giving evidence 32

2.5 Compellability 36

2.5.1 Defendant: section 17 36

2.5.2 Defendant’s family: section 18 37

2.5.2 Exclusion of s 18 42

2.6 Oaths and affirmations: sections 21 and 23–4 42

2.7 Questioning of witnesses 45

2.7.1 Parties and the judge: sections 26–9 45

2.7.2 Counsel 46

2.8 Examination-in-chief 46

2.8.1 Prohibition of leading questions 46

2.8.2 Reviving memory: sections 32–5 48

2.8.2 In court 48

2.8.2 Police officers 51

2.8.2 Out of court 53

2.8.3 Unfavourable witnesses: section 38 54

2.9 Cross-examination 66

2.9.1 Leading questions: section 42 67

2.9.2 Improper or disallowable questions: section 41 68

2.9.2 Northern Territory and Victoria: improper questioning and vulnerable witnesses 69

2.9.3 The rule against prior consistent statements 75

2.9.4 Exceptions to the rule against prior consistent statements: section 108(3) 76

2.9.5 Prior inconsistent statements: sections 43–5 77

2.9.6 The rule in Browne v Dunn 79

2.10 Re-examination: section 39 81

2.10.1 Rebuttal and reopening 81

2.10.1 Civil cases 82

2.10.1 Criminal cases 82

2.11 Documents and adducing documents: section 48 83

Key points 85

Key terms and definitions 87
## Relevance

### 3 Relevance

#### 3.1 Introduction

#### 3.2 Different types of relevance

- **3.2.1** Directly relevant evidence
- **3.2.2** Indirectly relevant evidence

#### 3.3 Defining relevance

- **3.3.1** The common law
- **3.3.2** The Act: sections 55–6
- **3.3.3** Judicial discretions: sections 135–7

#### 3.4 Provisional evidence: sections 57–8

- **Key points**
- **Key terms and definitions**
- **Further reading**

## Hearsay

### 4 Hearsay

#### 4.1 Introduction

#### 4.2 The common law

- **4.2.1** Express and implied assertions
- **4.2.2** Non-hearsay purpose at common law

#### 4.3 The Act: section 59

- **4.3.1** Representation
- **4.3.2** Previous representation
- **4.3.3** Asserted fact
- **4.3.4** Made by a person
- **4.3.5** Intended to assert

#### 4.4 Hearsay purpose

- **4.4.1** Non-hearsay purpose: section 60

#### 4.5 Exceptions to the hearsay rule

- **4.5.1** Competency: section 61
- **4.5.2** First-hand hearsay: section 62
- **4.5.3** Civil proceedings – maker of the statement is not available: section 63
- **4.5.4** Civil proceedings – maker of the statement is available: section 64

---

Further reading 88
Practice problem 89

3 Relevance 90

- **3.1** Introduction 90
- **3.2** Different types of relevance 91
  - **3.2.1** Directly relevant evidence 91
  - **3.2.2** Indirectly relevant evidence 91
- **3.3** Defining relevance 100
  - **3.3.1** The common law 100
  - Legal relevance 100
  - **3.3.2** The Act: sections 55–6 102
    - Logical relevance 102
  - **3.3.3** Judicial discretions: sections 135–7 103
- **3.4** Provisional evidence: sections 57–8 112
  - **Key points** 113
  - **Key terms and definitions** 114
  - **Further reading** 114
  - **Practice problems** 114

4 Hearsay 116

- **4.1** Introduction 117
- **4.2** The common law 118
  - **4.2.1** Express and implied assertions 118
  - **4.2.2** Non-hearsay purpose at common law 120
- **4.3** The Act: section 59 121
  - **4.3.1** Representation 122
  - **4.3.2** Previous representation 122
  - **4.3.3** Asserted fact 123
  - **4.3.4** Made by a person 123
  - **4.3.5** Intended to assert 123
- **4.4** Hearsay purpose 126
  - **4.4.1** Non-hearsay purpose: section 60 131
- **4.5** Exceptions to the hearsay rule 136
  - **4.5.1** Competency: section 61 136
  - **4.5.2** First-hand hearsay: section 62 137
  - **4.5.3** Civil proceedings – maker of the statement is not available: section 63 138
  - **4.5.4** Civil proceedings – maker of the statement is available: section 64 139
4.5.5 Criminal proceedings – maker of the statement is not available:

section 65

Made under a duty: section 65(2)(a) 140

Made when or shortly after . . . unlikely that the
representation is a fabrication: section 65(2)(b) 140

Highly probable that the representation is reliable:
section 65(2)(c) 143

Against the interests of the person: section 65(2)(d) 146

Previous representation adduced by a defendant:
section 65(8) 154

Evidence of a previous representation about a matter . . .
adduced by a defendant: section 65(9) 157

4.5.6 Criminal proceedings – maker of the statement is available:

section 66 157

4.6 Contemporaneous mental and physical states 167

4.6.1 The common law 167

Statements of intention 168

State of mind 168

Emotional state of mind 168

Knowledge 169

4.6.2 The Act: section 66A 169

4.7 Business records: section 69 170

4.7.1 Tags, labels and writing: section 70 176

4.7.2 Electronic communications: section 71 177

Key points 178

Key terms and definitions 178

Further reading 179

Practice problems 179

5 Opinion 181

5.1 Introduction 181

5.2 Defining opinion evidence 182

5.3 The opinion rule: section 76 184

5.4 Exception – dual relevance: section 77 186

5.5 Exception – lay opinions: section 78 187

5.6 Exception – expert opinions: section 79 191

5.6.1 Basis rule 194

5.6.2 Expert opinion basis and hearsay 197

5.6.3 Procedural issues 198

5.7 Other admissible opinions 199
5.8 Scope of application – ultimate issue and common knowledge:
   section 80 200

Key points 201
Key terms and definitions 202
Further reading 202
Practice problems 202

6 Admissions 204

6.1 Introduction 205

6.2 What is an admission? 205
   6.2.1 Exception to the hearsay and opinion rules: section 81 206
   6.2.2 Personal knowledge: section 82 207
   6.2.3 No application against third parties without consent:
       section 83 208

6.3 Admissions and confessions made in police custody 209
   6.3.1 Electronic recording 209
   6.3.2 In the course of official questioning 217

6.4 Voluntariness and reliability of admissions 218
   6.4.1 The common law 218
   6.4.2 The Act 219
       Violent, oppressive, inhuman or degrading conduct: section 84 219
       Reliability of admissions: section 85 220
       Exclusion of records of oral questioning: section 86 234
       Authority to make statements: section 87 234
       Proving admissions: section 88 236

6.5 Statements and conduct that amount to admissions 236
   6.5.1 Implied admissions made in civil proceedings 237
   6.5.2 Implied admissions made in criminal proceedings
       Pre-trial silence: section 89 238
       Silence at trial: section 20 241
       Jury directions in Victoria 242

6.6 Discretions to exclude admissions 244
   6.6.1 The unfairness discretion: section 90 245
   6.6.2 The case of Haddara 254

Key points 256
Key terms and definitions 256
Further reading 257
Practice problems 258
# Tendency and coincidence

## 7.1 Introduction

## 7.2 When the rules do not apply

### 7.2.1 Non-application: section 94

- Evidence of credibility of witness
- Bail or sentencing
- Fact in issue

### 7.2.2 Use of evidence for other purposes: section 95

### 7.2.3 Use of evidence to prove good character

## 7.3 Formal requirements: sections 97–100

### 7.3.1 Purpose

- Tendency and/or coincidence purpose
- Tendency reasoning in civil cases
- Tendency reasoning in criminal cases
- Coincidence reasoning in civil cases
- Coincidence reasoning in criminal cases

### 7.3.2 Notice

### 7.3.3 Significant probative value

#### A. How is ‘significant probative value’ assessed?

#### B. Should the court assume the truthfulness and reliability of the evidence?

## 7.4 Further restrictions in criminal cases: section 101

### 7.4.1 Probative value versus prejudicial effect

### 7.4.2 Collusion, concoction or contamination

### 7.4.3 Prejudicial effect

## 7.5 Competing with other inferences

## 7.6 Judicial directions

### 7.6.1 Jury directions in Victoria

## Key points

## Key terms and definitions

## Further reading

## Practice problems

---

# Credibility

## 8.1 Introduction

## 8.2 The collateral nature of credibility evidence

## 8.3 What is credibility evidence?

### 8.3.1 Current definition: section 101A

### 8.3.2 Redefining credibility evidence under the Act

## 8.4 The credibility rule: section 102
### 8.5 Exceptions to the credibility rule

#### 8.5.1 Evidence adduced in cross-examination: section 103

#### 8.5.2 Evidence adduced in cross-examination of an accused: section 104

#### 8.5.3 Evidence in rebuttal of denials: section 106

#### 8.5.4 Evidence to re-establish credibility: section 108

#### 8.5.5 Expert opinion on a witness’s credibility: section 108C

### 8.6 Credibility of non-witnesses

#### 8.6.1 Evidence about a person who has made a previous representation: section 108A

#### 8.6.2 Previous representations of an accused: section 108B

### 9 Character

#### 9.1 Introduction

#### 9.2 The common law and character

#### 9.3 Credibility and character in the Act

#### 9.4 Character evidence: section 110

##### 9.4.1 Evidence of good character and judicial directions

##### 9.4.2 Character in a particular respect

#### 9.5 Rebuttal of evidence of good character

##### 9.5.1 Evidence about character of co-accused: section 111

##### 9.5.2 Leave to cross-examine about character of accused or co-accused: section 112

### 10 Identification evidence

#### 10.1 Introduction

#### 10.2 Defining identification evidence

##### 10.2.1 Types of identification evidence

1. Visual identification and picture identification
2. In-court identification
3. Out-of-court identification
4. Formal identification procedures
10.3 The common law and identification parades 391
10.4 Visual identification evidence: section 114 394
  10.4.1 Exclusion 396
  10.4.2 The ‘reasonableness’ condition 396
10.5 Picture identification evidence: section 115 399
  10.5.1 Pictures of people in police custody 400
  10.5.2 Exclusion 401
  10.5.3 Warnings 401
      Unreliability 401
10.6 Special caution: section 116 401
  10.6.1 Jury directions in Victoria 403
10.7 The displacement effect 404
  10.7.1 The role of section 137 406
Key points 409
Key terms and definitions 409
Further reading 409
Practice problem 410

11 Privileges 411
11.1 Introduction 412
11.2 Client legal privilege 413
  11.2.1 The common law 414
  11.2.2 Definitions: section 117
      ‘Lawyer’ 417
      ‘Client’ 422
      ‘Employee or agent’ 422
      Confidentiality 423
  11.2.3 Dominant purpose test 424
  11.2.4 Legal advice privilege: section 118
      ‘Communication’ and ‘document’ 428
      Copy documents 429
  11.2.5 Litigation privilege: sections 119–20 430
  11.2.6 Invoking client legal privilege 431
  11.2.7 General loss of privilege: section 121 432
  11.2.8 Waiver: section 122 433
  11.2.9 Other causes of loss of privilege: sections 123–6 437
11.3 Professional confidential privilege: section 126B 438
  11.3.1 Medical communications 439
11.4 Sexual assault communications privilege: sections 126H and 127B 441
11.5 Journalist privilege: section 126K 444
11.6 Religious confessions: section 127 446
11.7 Privilege against self-incrimination
  11.7.1 The common law 446
  11.7.2 The Act: sections 128–128A 449

11.8 Judicial reasons: section 129 453

11.9 Public interest immunity
  11.9.1 The common law 454
  Class claims and contents claims 454
  11.9.2 The Act: section 130 463
  11.9.3 Matters of state
    Security, defence or international relations of Australia 465
    Investigation and prosecution 465
    Proper functioning of government 465
    Interest in disclosure 466
    Factors to take into account 466

11.10 Settlement negotiations 466
  11.10.1 The common law 466
  11.10.2 The Act: section 131 472

11.11 Pre-trial, trial and non-judicial proceedings: section 131A 474

11.12 General procedural issues
  Key points 477
  Key terms and definitions 478
  Further reading 479
  Practice problem 479

12 Discretionary and mandatory exclusions 480

12.1 Introduction 481

12.2 General discretion to exclude evidence: section 135
  12.2.1 ‘Unfairly prejudicial’ 483
  12.2.2 ‘Misleading or confusing’ 483
  12.2.3 ‘Undue waste of time’ 484

12.3 General discretion to limit the use of evidence: section 136 485

12.4 Mandatory exclusion of evidence in criminal proceedings:
  section 137
  12.4.1 ‘Probative value’ 487
  12.4.2 ‘Unfair prejudice’
    Procedural unfairness 501

12.5 Discretion to exclude improperly or illegally obtained evidence
  12.5.1 The common law 501
  12.5.2 The Act 509
12.6 Corroboration

12.6.1 The common law

12.6.2 The Act: section 164

12.7 Unreliable evidence

12.7.1 Warning in relation to unreliable evidence: section 165

12.7.2 Warnings in relation to children’s evidence: section 165A

12.7.3 Delay in prosecution: section 165B

Key points

Key terms and definitions

Further reading

Practice problem

13 Facilitation of proof and ancillary matters

13.1 Introduction

13.2 Facilitation of proof

13.2.1 The common law

13.2.2 General: sections 146–52

13.2.3 Matters of official record: sections 153–9

13.2.4 Post and communications: sections 160–3

13.3 Ancillary provisions

13.3.1 Requests: sections 166–9

13.3.2 Affidavits: sections 170–3

13.3.3 Foreign law: sections 174–6

13.3.4 Procedures for proving other matters: sections 177–81

13.4 Miscellaneous matters

Key points

Key terms and definitions

Further reading

Practice problem

14 Putting it all together

Suggested answers to practice problems

Index