

INDEX

Acquisition of Land (Assessment of Bupa Ireland Ltd v. The Health Compensation) Act, Ireland Insurance Authority, 112 (1919), 215-17, 220-21 burdens. See distribution of collective action to recover. See chose in action burdens administrative law, fairness standards in, 130 Alexander, Gregory, 26-29, 86, 95-96, 108, 121-22, 184-86, 223, 238, 252 An Blascaod Mór Teoranta v. Commissioners for Public Works, 158-59 Anglo-Irish Trade War, 57-58 Anglo-Irish Treaty, 52 anti-redistribution positions, fairness standards and, 143-44, 146, 148-49, 155 appropriate burdens, 140-41, 147-58 arbitrariness, unjust attack standard and, 138 Attorney General v. Southern Industrial Trust, 64-65 autonomy human flourishing and, 184 progressive property theory and, 24 - 25as plural value, 40-41 security of possession and, 166 Baron, Jane B., 26 Barros, Benjamin, 39-40 bills of attainder, 158-61 Blake v. The Attorney General, 65

appropriate, 140-41, 147-58 inappropriate, 141-47 Cahill, Edward, 60 Catholic Church, Irish Constitution influenced by through Papal Encyclicals, 60-61 private ownership in, 60-61 Central Dublin Development Association v. The Attorney General, 78-79 chose in action, 94, 128 commercial goodwill, 89 common good. See exigencies of common good common law traditions compulsory acquisition, 167-68 compulsory purchase, 167-68 in pre-independence Ireland, 48 property rights under, 5 community interests, security of possession and, 188-94 clearings and, 189-90 eminent domain and, impact of, 190-91 individual interests and, 189-90 isolated takings and, 189-90 compensation law, in Ireland, 198-99 corrective justice as focus in, 212-21, make-whole compensation through, 212-13 total loss compensation, 215-19

Boudreaux, Paul, 180

bundle of rights metaphor, 78-84

Bray, Zachary, 26

Bright, Susan, 26



INDEX 299

Constitution of the Irish Free State

damages, 199 distributive justice in, 204-12, 227 doctrinal roots of, 204-7 existing use value, 214 fairness standards and, 222-26 governance rules in, 232 human flourishing and, 222-26 liberal views of, 198-99, 233 make-whole compensation in, 206 affirmation of, 217-18 corrective justice through, 212-13 market value contexts, impact of, 219 - 21in discrete regulatory systems, 219 - 20presumptive entitlement and, 213 - 15potential liability rule in, 231 presumptive liability rule in, 231 progressive property theory and, regulatory takings in, 222-23 proportionality principle and, 229 - 30reciprocity of advantage and, 227-29 social democrat views of, 198-99, social justice principles and, 204 assessment of, 211-12 in Dreher v. Irish Land Commission, 204-11, in ESB v. Gormley, 207-9 property rights and, 226-30 compulsory acquisition, 167-68, constitutionality of, 174-77 economic development and, 177-79 land redistribution and, 172-74 urban regeneration and, 174-77 compulsory purchase, 167-68 conceptual severance, 85 in constitutional property law, 203 Constitution, U.S. due process clause, 164 equal protection clause, 164 Takings Clause, 166

(Saorstát Éireann) (1922) drafts of, 59 Irish Constitution as replacement for, 15 social justice in, 52-57 constitutional damages, 16-17, 199 constitutional property law, in Ireland, communitarian elements of, 237, 240 complexity critique of, 245-49 conceptual severance in, 203 democratic decision-making and, 249-55 human flourishing and, 242-43 identity in, 261-65 information property theory and, 245-46 intuition in, 255-58 liberal elements of, 237 limitational approach to, 238, 240-42, 255 localism in, 255-58 marginality in, 261-65 public/private divide and, 249-55 social obligation norms and, 250, unjust attacks standard and, 246-47 vulnerability in, 261-65 constitutional property rights, 4. See also standards of review balance of, 109-10 Central Dublin Development Association v. The Attorney General, 78-79 Cox v. Ireland, 90 Fitzpatrick v. The Criminal Assets Bureau, 81-83 intellectual property rights, 88-89 land grants, 92 mortgage contracts, 87 ownership and, 78-85 bundle of rights metaphor, 78-84 conceptual severance, 85 core concepts of, 81 doctrinal unpredictability, 83-84 property as rights, 83-84, 94, 104 property as things, 83-84, 104



300 INDEX

constitutional property rights (cont.) property baselines for, 85 of shares, 88-89 unbundling of, 85 political conservatism and, 97-99, 101 - 2property mythology and, property actuality compared to, 101 protection strategies for, 77-78, 102 dual, 93-95 for personal rights, 93-95 for property rights, 93-95 reach of, 86-95 realism and, 80 rent review clauses, 98 statutory licences, 90-91 contractual rights, mortgage contracts, corrective justice, 212-21, 227 make-whole compensation through, 212 - 13total loss compensation, 215-19 69-76 Cox v. Ireland, 90 Dagan, Hanoch, 24-26, 40-41, 83-84, 153, 227-30, 254-55 damages, constitutional, 16-17, 199 93-95 Davidson, Nestor, 8-9, 11, 26 Davy, Benjamin, 26 deference, to standards of review, 113 - 21definition of, 113-14 impact analysis for, 116-19 means analysis for, 114-16 objectives analysis for, 114-16 proportionality principle and, 189 118 - 19democratic model, of progressive property theory, 29-31 social and political competence in, 30 deprivations in Irish compensation law, 228–29, law and theory of deprivations, 80 - 81183 - 84Diamond, Michael, 10 34 - 35Directive Principles of Social Policy, 68,

discrete regulatory systems, 219-20 discrimination, unjust attack standard and, 139-61 An Blascaod Mór Teoranta v. Commissioners for Public Works, 158-59 bills of attainder, 158-61 illegitimate discrimination, 158-61 in progressive property theory, $1\overline{3}9 - 40$ distribution of collective burdens, 140-41, 156-57 anti-redistribution positions on, 143-44, 146, 148-49, 155 appropriate burdens, 140-41, 147-58 exemption provisions, 143-46 inappropriate burdens, 141-47 distributive justice, 204-12, 227 doctrinal roots of, 204-7 Dorfman, Avihay, 80-81 double protection, of property rights, Dreher v. Irish Land Commission, 204-11, 215 dual protection strategies, for constitutional property rights, Dyal-Chand, Rashmi, 26 economic development, 177-79 efficiency, in progressive property theory, 33-36 eminent domain, security of possession community interests and, 190-91 purpose constraints for, 180-81, Employment Equality Bill case, 147-49 equal protection clause, in U.S. Constitution, 164 ESB v. Gormley, 207-9 exclusion rights, 168-70 exclusion rules in constitutional property rights, in information property theory, exigencies of common good, 67-69, 119-21, 171-82

71-72, 191, 254



INDEX 301

existing use value, 214
expectations, in progressive property
theory, 33–36
expropriation, 52, 55–56, 167–68, 171,
184–85, 227–28

fairness standards, 130–37. See also unjust attack standard in administrative law, 130 in distribution of collective burdens, 140–41, 156–57 anti-redistribution positions on, 143–44, 146, 148–49, 155 wappropriate burdens, 140–41, 147–58 exemption provisions, 143–46 inappropriate burdens, 141–47 in Employment Equality Bill case, 147–49 harm/benefit distinction and, 149–50 Irish compensation law and,

Irish compensation law and, 222–26
lack of fair procedures, 130–37
analysis of, 130–31
participation rules, 133, 135–37
right to be heard, 131–33
right to challenge adverse
decisions, 134–35
right to notice, 133–34
law of nuisance and, 150–51
in Re Article 26 and Part V of the
Planning and Development Bill,

1999, 147–49 reciprocity of advantage and, 151–54 Rule of Law and, 130

Family Home Protection Act, Ireland, (1976), 126–27

Fennell, Lee Anne, 166

Financial Measures in the Public Interest Act, Ireland (2009), 87–88

Fitzpatrick v. The Criminal Assets Bureau, 81–83 franchise, as property right, 89

freedom, in progressive property theory, 24–25 Freyfogle, Eric, 26

fungible property, 38

general property rights (GR), 73–74 Gerhart, Peter, 31–32, 139–40, 160, 162–63, 256

Germany

private ownership in, 72 security of possession in, 184–85 Gladstone's Act of 1870, Ireland, 49–50 governance rules under Irish compensation law, 232 in progressive property theory,

34–35 GR. See general property rights Gray, Kevin, 2, 25–26, 164–65 'Great Hunger,' 48 maternal insecurity after, 49

harm/benefit distinction, 149-50 Health Bill case, 110-11 standards of review in, overlapping standards of review in, 112-13 Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich, 37–38 Hohfeld, Wesley, 81 Honoré, A. M., 80-81 human flourishing autonomy and, 184 constitutional property law and, 242 - 43Irish compensation law and, 222-26 personal security and, 184 in progressive property theory, 24, 26 - 29pluralistic nature of, 27-29 responsibility and, 184 security of possession and, 184-88 self-determination and, 184

identity, in constitutional property law, 261–65 illegitimate discrimination, 158–61 impact analysis, for standards of review, 116–21 inappropriate burdens, 141–47 Industrial and Provident Societies (Amendment) Act, Ireland (1978), 202–3

self-expression and, 184

theory, 258-61

humility, in progressive property



302 INDEX

Industrial Development Act, Ireland (1986), 178-79information property theory, 2-3 constitutional property law and, 245 - 46exclusion rules in, 34-35 institutional role in, 3 progressive property theory compared to, 34-36 intellectual property rights, as constitutional property rights, 88-89 Irish Constitution (Bunreacht na hÉireann) (1937), property theory and. See also constitutional property rights; security of possession; security of value; standards of review Article 26 reference procedure, 16, 248 Article 40.3.2, 64-69, 95 delimiting principles in, 106 standards of review and, 110 - 11unjust attack standard in, 111 Article 40.5, 187 Article 43, 64-74, 95, 171-72 delimiting principles in, 106, 119-21 standards of review in, 110-11 unjust attack standard in, 111 Article 45, 68, 71–72, 191, 253–54 Attorney General v. Southern Industrial Trust, 64-65 Blake v. The Attorney General, 65 Catholic Church and Papal Encyclicals, 60-61 private ownership influenced by, 60 - 61Constitution of the Irish Free State (1922) replaced by, 15 drafts of, 59 foundational principles of, 12–17 historical perspectives on, 48-63 ideology of, 48-63 land reform, 76 lawmaking under, 15-17 legal structure for, 15–16

natural rights under, 70 Oireachtas and, 15-16, 67-68, 91 constitutional approval by, 62 possessor principle in, 49 property clauses in, functions of, 63 - 74harmonious interpretations of, 65-69 judicial interpretations of, 64-65 social justice and, 65-69 property redistribution under, 76 property rights under, 12-14, 59-60 double protection of, 69-76 general, 73-74 for individuals, 46 special, 73-74 Irish famine. See 'Great Hunger' Irish Free State (Agreement) Act, 52 Irish War of Independence, 52 irrationality, unjust attack standard and, 137-39 justice. See social justice Kavanagh, Aileen, 113-14 Kelo v. City of New London, 165-66 labour Locke on, 42-43 in progressive property theory, 41 - 43Land Acts, Ireland, 50 Land Commission, 48 land reform under, 50-52 land grants, constitutional property rights for, 92 Land Purchase Acts, Ireland, 172-74 land redistribution, compulsory acquisition and, 172-74

Landlord and Tenant (Amendment)

lawmaking, under Irish Constitution

(1937), 15-17

Leo XIII (Pope), 60-61

legal structure for, 15-16

Lee, Brian, 153-54, 212-13, 219

201 law of nuisance, 150–51

Act, Ireland (1971), 137–38,



INDEX 303

liability rules potential, 231 presumptive, 231 for property rights, 197 property rules compared to, 197 security of possession and, 168-69 security of value and, 197 liberal view, of Irish compensation law, 198-99, 233 licences, 90-91 limitational approach, to constitutional property law, 238, 240-42, 255 Local Government (Planning and Development) Act, Ireland (1963), 174-75obsolete areas under, 175 localism, in constitutional property law, 255-58 Locke, John, 43 on labour, 42-43 on private ownership, 42 Lovett, John A., 26 make-whole compensation, 206 corrective justice through, 212-13 legal affirmations of, 217-18 marginality, in constitutional property law, 261-65 market value, in Irish compensation law, 219-21 in discrete regulatory systems, 219-20 presumptive entitlement and, 213-15 maternal insecurity, in Ireland, 49 McCormack, Gerard, 87, 157 McCrudden, Chris, 14 McQuaid, John Charles, 60 means analysis, for standards of review, 114-16 Michelman, Frank, 86, 114, 140 on due process clause, 164 on equal protection clause, 164 mortgage contracts, 87 Mulvaney, Timothy, 24, 33, 122, 191-93, 249, 258-60, 262

National Asset Management Act (NAMA), Ireland (2009), 102, 134, 157–58 eligible assets in, definition of, 157
National Monuments Act, Ireland
(1930), 154–55
natural rights
under Irish Constitution (1937), 70
in progressive property theory,
41–43
Nedelsky, Jennifer, 26, 97–98
new progressive property theory, 27
Norman Conquest, 48
nuisance. See law of nuisance

objectives analysis, for standards of

review, 114–16
Oireachtas, 15–16, 67–68,
91
O'Mahoney, Lorna Fox, 26
ownership. See also constitutional
property rights; property rights
core concepts of, 81
definition of, 1–2
under Irish Constitution (1937),
57–59
private rights to, 46, 60–61
social aspect of, 2–3

Papal Encyclicals, 60-61. See

alsospecific Popes participation rules, property rights and, 133, 135-37 Peñalver, Eduardo, 28-29, 136 pensions, 89-90 personal property chose in action, 94, 128 security of possession, 184-88 purpose constraints and, 181 personal rights, right to earn livelihood, 93 - 94personal security, human flourishing and, 184 personality, in progressive property theory, 36–40 personhood perspective, for progressive property theory, 36–40 Pius XI (Pope), 60-61 planning permission, 92–93 political competence, in progressive property theory, 30



304 INDEX

political conservatism, constitutional Hegel and, 37-38 property rights and, 97-99, human flourishing characteristics of, 101 - 224, 26-29 possession. See also security of pluralistic nature of, 27-29 possession humility in, 258-61 under Irish Constitution (1937), information theory compared to, 48 - 5234-36 in pre-independence Ireland, 48-52 institutional role in, 3 possessor principle, 49 Irish compensation law and, pre-independence Ireland. See also 221 - 32Constitution of the Irish Free regulatory takings in, 222-23 State; Irish Constitution unjust attack standards, 223-24 Anglo-Irish Treaty and, 52 Locke and, 42-43 consolidation of Protestant control marginalized populations in, in, 48 26 - 27English common law in, 48 new, 27 Gladstone's Act of 1870, 49-50 plural values in, 26-27, 33-43 'Great Hunger' in, 48 autonomy, 40-41 maternal insecurity after, 49 economics and, 31-32 Irish Free State (Agreement) Act, 52 efficiency, 33-36 Irish War of Independence, 52 expectations, 33-36 under Land Acts, 50 labour as, 41-43 Land Commission, 48 natural rights, 41-43 land reform under, 50-52 personality, 36-40 after Norman Conquest, 48 personhood perspective, 36-40 possession in, 48-52 property protections, 40 private ownership in, 51-52 purpose constraints in, security of tenant's rights in, 50 possession and, 183-84 presumption against interference with Radin on, 37-39 vested rights, 126-29 personhood perspective, 38-39 Pritchett, Wendell, 189 social inclusion and, 6 production quotas, 91-92 in South Africa, 25 progressive property theory, 2-3, Statement of Progressive Property, 23-44. See also security of 23-24, 29-31 possession aim and purpose of, 31-32 assessment of, 23-27, 43-44 themes of, 33 autonomy in, 24-25 transparency, 33 as plural value, 40-41 theoretical approach to, 20-22 communitarian, 32 transparency in, 258-61 core principles of, 23-24, 35 in U.K., 25-26 unjust attack standard and, 139-40 democratic model of, 29-31 social and political competence in, in U.S., 25-26 writings on, 26 discrimination in, 139-40 property doctrinal analysis in, 6-8 definition of, 1-2 freedom in, 24-25 as rights, 83-84, 94, fungible property and, 38 104 governance rules in, 34–35 as things, 83-84, 104



INDEX 305

property rights. See also constitutional property rights; Irish Constitution in common law jurisdictions, 5 double protection of, 69-76 liability rules for, 197 physical goods as distinct from, 87 property rules, liability rules compared to, 197 property theory. See also progressive property theory doctrinal analysis of, 6-12 benefits of, 8-12 in progressive property theory, foundational principles in, 12-17 information, 2-3 Radin on, 37-39 proportionality principle Irish compensation law and, 229-30 in standards of review, 106-9, 122 - 23application of, 107-8, 116 deferential application of, 118-19 public purpose requirements, 165 public use requirements, 170 Purdy, Jedediah, 24-25, 40, 255 purpose constraints, security of possession and, 171-82 on administrative freedom, 179 in Article 43, 171-72 eminent domain and, justifications for, 180-81, 189 heightened scrutiny for, 179-82 interpretation of, 171 under Land Purchase Acts, 172-74 personal property and, 181 progressive approaches to, 183-94 law and theory of deprivations, tensions in, 183-84 progressive property theory, 183 - 84recognition of, 171-72 weak, 179-82

Radin, Margaret Jane, 37–39, 237 rationality standard, in standards of review, 109–10, 122–23

balance of rights, 109-10 language test, 109 Re Article 26 and Part V of the Planning and Development Bill, 1999, 147-49 realism, constitutional property rights and, 80 reasonableness, security of possession and, 177 reciprocity of advantage, 151-54 Irish compensation law, 227-29 regulatory takings, 222-23 Rent Restrictions Act, Ireland (1960), 137-38, 141-42, 201 Rent Restrictions (Amendment) Act, Ireland (1967), 137-38 rent review clauses, 98 Residential Tenancies and Valuation Act, Ireland (2020), 100 responsibility, human flourishing and, 184 retrospectivity, for constitutional rights, 125 - 30presumption against interference with vested rights, 126-29 Rule of Law and, 125 rules against, application of, 129 - 30right to be heard, 131-33 right to challenge adverse decisions, 134 - 35right to earn livelihood, 93-94 right to keep, 170 right to notice, 133-34 rights. See specific rights Rose, Carol, 97 Rosser, Ezra, 26 Rule of Law fairness standards and, 130 in Irish constitutional law, 125 retrospectivity and, 125

security of possession. See also purpose constraints autonomy of owners and, 166 community interests, 188–94 eminent domain and, impact of, 190–91



306 INDEX

security of possession. (cont.) individual interests and, 189-90 isolated takings and, 189-90 compulsory acquisition, 167-68, constitutionality of, 174-77 economic development and, 177 - 79land redistribution and, 172-74 urban regeneration and, 174-77 compulsory purchase, 167-68 exclusion rights, 168-70 exigencies of common good, 67-69, 119-21, 171-82 human flourishing and, 184-88 judicial reasoning and, 185 Kelo v. City of New London, 165-66 Land Purchase Acts and, 172-74 liability rules and, 168-69 personal property and, 184-88 political participation and, 188-94 property rules and, 168-69 public purpose requirement and, 165 public use requirement and, 170 reasonableness of, 177 right to keep and, 170 social justice principles, 171-82 economic development and, 177 - 79interpretation of, 191 land redistribution, 172-74 urban generation, 174-77 security of value. See also compensation law Central Dublin Development Association v. The Attorney General, 200-3 conceptual severance, 202 deprivation and restriction spectrum, 199-203 liability rules and, 197 unjust attack standards, 199-203 self-determination, human flourishing and, 184 self-expression, human flourishing and, 184 shares, ownership and, 88-89

Singer, Joseph, 29-31, 83, 139-40, 222-23, 257, 259 social competence, in progressive property theory, 30 social democrat view, of Irish compensation law, 198-99, 233 social inclusion, progressive property theory and, 6 social justice in Constitution of the Irish Free State, 52-57 definition of, 67 in drafting of Irish Constitution (1937), 59-60, 62-63fairness standards and, 135-37 Irish compensation law and, 204 assessment of, 211-12 in Dreher v. Irish Land Commission, 204-11, 215 in ESB v. Gormley, 207-9 property rights and, 226-30 judicial interpretation of, 65-69 security of possession and, 171-82 economic development and, 177 - 79land redistribution, 172-74 urban generation, 174-77 social obligation norms, 250, 253 South Africa constitutional property law in, 242 progressive property theory in, 25 special property rights (SR), 73-74 standards of review, for constitutional property rights, 107-11 application of, 113-21 impact analysis for, 116-21 means analysis for, 114-16 objectives analysis for, 114-16 proportionality principle, 107-8, 116 in Article 40.3.2, 110-11 unjust attack standard in, 111 in Article 43, 110-11 delimiting principle in, 119-21 unjust attack standard in, 111 deference to, 113-21 definition of, 113-14 impact analysis for, 116–19



INDEX 307

means analysis for, 114-16 objectives analysis for, 114-16 proportionality principle and, 118 - 19goals and purpose of, 106 in Health Bill case, 110-11 proportionality principle in, 106-9, 122 - 23application of, 107-8, 116 deferential application of, 118-19 rationality standard, 109-10, 122-23 balance of rights, 109-10 Statement of Progressive Property, 23-24, 29-31 aim and purpose of, 31-32 statutory licences, 89-91 takings economic development of, 165-67 regulatory, 222-23 in U.S Constitution, Takings Clause, Takings Law, U.S., 114, 121-22, 140, 179 - 80tenant's rights, in pre-independence Ireland, 50 total loss compensation, 215-19 transparency in progressive property theory, 258-61 progressive property theory and, 33 Two Treatises (Locke), 42-43 U.K. See United Kingdom unbundling of constitutional property rights, 85 Underkuffler, Laura, 4, 41, 130, 188-89, 224-25, 238-39 United Kingdom (U.K.) Anglo-Irish Treaty, 52 Land Acts, 50 progressive property theory in, 25 - 26United States (U.S.)

equal protection clause, 164 Takings Clause, 166 unjust attack standard adequate justification for, 163 analysis of, 161-63 arbitrariness and, 138 constitutional property law and, 246 - 47discrimination and, 139-61 An Blascaod Mór Teoranta v. Commissioners for Public Works, 158-59 bills of attainder, 158-61 doctrinal approach to, 139-40 illegitimate, 158-61 in progressive property theory, 139 - 40Irish compensation law and, 223-24 irrationality and, 137-39 methodological approach to, 124-25 retrospectivity, 125-30 presumption against interference with vested rights, 126-29 Rule of Law and, 125 rules against, application of, 129 - 30in standard of review, 111 unreasonableness, unjust attack standard and, 137-39 urban regeneration, 174–77 U.S. See United States

Valera, Eamon de, 58
value. See progressive property theory;
security of value
van der Walt, A. J., 5, 8, 25–26, 97,
171, 181, 235, 237–38, 249,
261–62
vested rights. See presumption against
interference with vested rights
vulnerability
in constitutional property law,
261–65
security of possession and, 192–94

Waldron, Jeremy, 30, 37, 44, 69–75, 125, 130 weak purpose constraints, 179–82

progressive property theory in, 25-26

Takings Law, 114, 121-22, 140,

due process clause, 164

179 - 80

U.S. Constitution