

LAW, LOVE AND FREEDOM

How does one lead a life of law, love and freedom? This inquiry has very deep roots in the Judeo–Christian tradition. Indeed, the divergent answers to this inquiry mark the transition from Judeo to Christian. This book returns to those roots to trace the twists and turns that these ideas have taken as they move from the sacred to the secular. It relates our most important mode of social organization, *law*, to two of our most cherished values, *love* and *freedom*. In this book, Joshua Neoh sketches the moral vision that underlies our modern legal order and traces our secular legal ideas (constitutionalism versus anarchism) to their theological origins (monasticism versus antinomianism). *Law*, *Love and Freedom* brings together a diverse cast of characters, including Paul and Luther, Augustine and Aquinas, monks and Gnostics, and constitutionalists and anarchists. This book is valuable to all lawyers, philosophers, theologians and historians who are interested in law as a humanistic discipline.

Joshua Neoh is a tenured faculty member at the law school of the Australian National University (ANU). He completed his LLB at the ANU, LLM at Yale, and PhD at Cambridge, and held visiting research positions at Harvard and Oxford. He is committed to an interdisciplinary study of law, and he has published in the fields of law and religion, law and literature, law and culture, law and philosophy, and law and the humanities



LAW AND CHRISTIANITY

Series Editor
John Witte, Jr., Emory University

Editorial Board

Nigel Biggar, University of Oxford

Marta Cartabia, Italian Constitutional Court / University of Milano-Bicocca
Sarah Coakley, University of Cambridge
Norman Doe, Cardiff University
Rafael Domingo, Emory University / University of Navarra
Brian Ferme, Marcianum, Venice
Richard W. Garnett, University of Notre Dame
Robert P. George, Princeton University
Mary Ann Glendon, Harvard University
Kent Greenawalt, Columbia University
Robin Griffith-Jones, Temple Church, London / King's College London
Gary S. Hauk, Emory University
R. H. Helmholz, University of Chicago

Mark Hill QC, Inner Temple, London / Cardiff University
Wolfgang Huber, Bishop Emeritus, United Protestant Church of Germany / Universities of
Heidelberg, Berlin, and Stellenbosch

Michael W. McConnell, Stanford University
John McGuckin, Union Theological Seminary
Mark A. Noll, University of Notre Dame
Jeremy Waldron, New York University / University of Oxford
Michael Welker, University of Heidelberg

The Law and Christianity series publishes cutting-edge work on Catholic, Protestant, and Orthodox Christian contributions to public, private, penal, and procedural law and legal theory. The series aims to promote deep Christian reflection by leading scholars on the fundamentals of law and politics, to build further ecumenical legal understanding across Christian denominations, and to link and amplify the diverse and sometimes isolated Christian legal voices and visions at work in the academy. Works collected by the series include groundbreaking monographs, historical and thematic anthologies, and translations by leading scholars around the globe.

Books in the Series

Great Christian Jurists in French History Olivier Descamps and Rafael Domingo Church Law in Modernity: Toward a Theory of Canon Law Between Nature and Culture Judith Hahn

Common Law and Natural Law in America: From the Puritans to the Legal Realists Andrew Forsyth

Care for the World: Laudato Si' and Catholic Social Thought in an Era of Climate Crisis Frank Pasquale

Church, State, and Family: Reconciling Traditional Teachings and Modern Liberties John Witte, Jr



Great Christian Jurists in Spanish History Rafael Domingo and Javier Martinez-Torron Under Caesar's Sword: How Christians Respond to Persecution edited by Daniel Philpott and Timothy Samuel Shah

God and the Illegal Alien Robert W. Heimburger

Christianity and Family Law John Witte, Jr. and Gary S. Hauk

Christianity and Natural Law Norman Doe

Great Christian Jurists in English History Mark Hill, QC and R. H. Helmholz

Agape, Justice, and Law Robert F. Cochran, Jr and Zachary R. Calo

Calvin's Political Theology and the Public Engagement of the Church Matthew J. Tuininga

God and the Secular Legal System Rafael Domingo

How Marriage Became One of the Sacraments Philip Reynolds

Christianity and Freedom (Volume I: Historical Perspectives, Volume II: Contemporary

Perspectives) edited by Timothy Samuel Shah and Allen D. Hertzke

The Western Case for Monogamy Over Polygamy John Witte, Jr.

The Distinctiveness of Religion in American Law Kathleen A. Brady

Pope Benedict XVI's Legal Thought Marta Cartabia and Andrea Simoncini



Law, Love and Freedom

FROM THE SACRED TO THE SECULAR

JOSHUA NEOH

Australian National University, Canberra





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108446624 DOI: 10.1017/9781108564939

© Joshua Neoh 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019 First paperback edition 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-108-42765-4 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-44662-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To my first love.



Contents

Acknowledgments		page x
	Introduction	1
1	Cosmological Beginning, Eschatological End	9
2	Conceptual Bipolarities	42
3	Methodological Turn to Historical Narrative	78
4	Prior Narrative: From Monasticism to Constitutionalism	98
5	Counter Narrative: From Antinomianism to Anarchism	133
6	Value Pluralism and the Search for Coherence	166
	Conclusion	182
Bibliography		190
Index		203



Acknowledgments

The great delight of publication is the ability to thank people in print. I have been waiting to thank Nigel Simmonds and Peter Cane for being such exemplary role models of what a scholar should be. I could only wish to be half the kind of scholars that they are. If there is any intellectual rigor at all in this book, I have learned it all from them. Peter, who was my undergraduate thesis supervisor at the ANU, sent me to Nigel, who became my doctoral thesis supervisor at Cambridge.

It is often difficult to account for academic debts, but the following are easy cases, for the debt is huge. Tony Connolly and Leighton McDonald were my first teachers in jurisprudence at the ANU, where I did my LLB. Robert Burt and Paul Kahn were the first who taught me to see law from a theological perspective at that most lawless of places called the Yale Law School, where I did my LLM. Paul Babie blazed the trail for law and religion in Australia, and I have followed in his trail ever since. I would not have persisted in this field, but for Paul's encouragement, which kept me going.

This book started life as a PhD thesis at Cambridge. I would not have been able to get to Cambridge without the generous financial support of the Cambridge Australia Trust and the institutional support of the ANU Law School, which gave me three years' leave to complete the PhD. Stephen Bottomley and Don Rothwell, who were the Dean and Deputy Dean at that time, believed in me enough to let me go, and for that, I am truly grateful. Sally Wheeler, the current Dean, accepted the return of the prodigal son.

At Cambridge, Matthew Kramer convened the Cambridge Forum for Legal and Political Philosophy, which became my primary academic community. The graduate student community in legal philosophy at Cambridge – John Adenitire, Raffel Fasel, Visa Kurki, Jyr-Jong Lin and Yalan Zhang – made doing legal philosophy fun. Jan Anton van Zanten and Yan Zi Au, despite



Acknowledgments

хi

being nonlawyers and nonphilosophers, were patient enough to sit through countless Gonville & Caius College Formal Dinners, with me going on and on about legal philosophy. Nick McBride and Sean Coyle were the examiners of the thesis. At the viva, they were frank, yet gentle. They kept a cool head, with a warm heart.

Part of the thesis was written at Harvard Law School. At Harvard, Noah Feldman's seminars on Jewish Legal Theory introduced me to a whole new world and a whole new way of thinking about the world. Franz Bauer and Kelly Dhru kept me fed with food for thought, while Keitaro and Hitomi Hamada kept me fed with actual food. While I was at home in Malaysia, the Penang Institute provided me with the most conducive environment imaginable for a scholar to read and write. Ooi Kee Beng, Wong Yee Tuan, Lim Sok Swan, Koay Su Lyn and Pan Yi Chieh were kind enough to welcome me, a stranger, into their midst. In Kuala Lumpur, Kamal Fadzil provided me with a home away from home.

At the ANU, my colleagues continue to be a source of inspiration. As faculty mentors, Des Manderson and Tim Bonyhady taught me, a babe in the woods, the ways of the world, while Alex Bruce and Matthew Zagor taught me the ways of the Lord. Kim Rubenstein gave me a job when I was a student, and then her good counsel when I became her colleague. Dilan Thampapillai saved me, twice, from having to live on the streets. As a research assistant, Joe Dean helped in the preparation of this manuscript with great care and good cheer. As a friend, Ryan Goss proves that a faithful friend is a sturdy shelter.

Finally, I thank John Witte, the General Editor of this series and a pioneer in the field of law and religion, for showing an interest in my work when he was at Harvard for a conference, although I was then a lowly graduate student, which led to a conversation, which led to this book; and John Berger, Silvia Glick, Danielle Menz and Claire Sissen at Cambridge University Press for their excellent editorial teamwork.

I am forever grateful to my parents for the most precious gift: the gift of life.