PERSONAL DEBT IN EUROPE

Personal debt remains an important factor in many economic models because it encourages people to finance consumption or the purchase of durable goods. Whether this model is sustainable for individuals or the countries in which they reside is an ongoing question of great complexity and many social and economic implications, not only for the burdened individuals and their countries, but also for the EU as a whole. In *Personal Debt in Europe*, Federico Ferretti and Daniela Vandone examine the ‘dark side’ of personal debt, or over-indebtedness, in social, economic, and legal terms. They employ cross-country consumer-level data to present the latest empirical studies on the problem, analyse these findings to better understand its nature and causes, and discuss the merits of proposed insolvency legislation and harmonisation initiatives in the EU.

Federico Ferretti is Associate Professor in Economic Law and Financial Markets, Department of Sociology and Economic Law, University of Bologna (Italy) and a member of the Financial Services User Group of the European Commission. He is a qualified lawyer of the High Courts of Italy.

Daniela Vandone is Full Professor of Banking and Finance, Department of Economics, Management and Quantitative Methods, University of Milan. Her research interests are in financial markets and institutions, with a focus on the microeconomics of banking, financial regulation, financial decision-making, household finance, personal debt and over-indebtedness.
Personal Debt in Europe

THE EU FINANCIAL MARKET AND CONSUMER INSOLVENCY

FEDERICO FERRETTI
University of Bologna

DANIELA VANDONE
University of Milan
Contents

1 Introduction  page 1

2 Personal Debt in the Economy  11
  2.1 The Demand Side of the Personal Debt Market  11
  2.2 Personal Debt in Europe: Size and Growth of the Market  11
  2.3 Factors Shaping the Evolution of the Personal Debt Market  19
  2.4 The Characteristics of Households Holding Personal Debt  21

3 The Industry of Personal Debt  29
  3.1 The Supply Side of the Personal Debt Market  29
  3.2 Personal Debt Products  30
  3.3 Innovative Solutions  30
  3.4 Principal Players on the Market  33
  3.5 The Economics of Personal Debt  34
  3.6 A Performance Analysis  39

4 From Indebtedness to Over-Indebtedness: Multidimensional Causes and Consequences  51
  4.1 Unmanageable Debt  51
  4.2 Definition of Over-Indebtedness  52
  4.3 Measures of Over-Indebtedness  55
  4.4 Causes of Over-Indebtedness  59
  4.5 An Economic Literature Review on Over-Indebtedness  62
  4.6 An Empirical Investigation into Over-Indebtedness in Europe  66
  4.7 Focus on Consumer Credit  71
  4.8 Behavioural Factors and Over-Indebtedness  71
  4.9 The Relevance of Behavioural Traits in the Effectiveness of Measures to Prevent Over-Indebtedness  76
  4.10 Remarks  85
# Contents

5 EU Policy and Law for the Prevention and Management of Over-Indebtedness 87
5.1 The Competence of the EU vis-à-vis National Competence 87
5.2 Prevention: Credit Laws; Responsible Credit and Creditworthiness Assessment 90
5.3 Responsible Lending, the Responsible Creditor and Private Law 93
5.4 The Consumer Credit Directive 95
5.5 The Mortgage Credit Directive 97
5.6 The Guidelines of the European Banking Authority 104

6 The Role and Function of Solvency Data and Financial Technologies (Fintech and Big Data) 107
6.1 Solvency Data in the Economy 107
6.2 Solvency Data in the Policy and Legal Context 121
6.3 The Legal Form and Functions of Credit Bureaus in the EU 125
6.4 Data Sources 128
6.5 Cross-Border Exchange of Data and the Integration of Credit Markets 136
6.6 Competition in the Credit Information Industry 139
6.7 Big Data and Fintech in the Age of Algorithmic Consumer Finance 141
6.8 Opportunities and Risks of Algorithmic Finance 146
6.9 Anacredit 150

7 Credit Risk Analysis and Creditworthiness in Relation to EU Data Protection Legislation 156
7.1 Data Protection and Its Values 156
7.2 Notice and Legitimate Grounds for Data Processing 159
7.3 Data Subject’s Consent 164
7.4 Automated Decision-Making and Profiling 168
7.5 Reliability and Proportionality of Data to Achieve Policy Objectives 170
7.6 Solvency Data and Big Data as the Gateway of the Economic and Social Life of Consumers 174
7.7 Alternative Data Protection-Friendly Data Analysis: a Semi-Serious Proposal 177

8 The Treatment of Over-Indebtedness: Towards a Harmonisation of Personal Insolvency Law in a Fragmented EU? 180
8.1 Personal Insolvency Legislation in the EU 180
8.2 Consumer Protection and the Role of the European Courts 186
## Contents

8.3 Testing the Sentiment of Expert Stakeholders 192  
8.4 Over-Indebtedness in Context: the Capital Markets Union and Retail Financial Services in the EU 197  
8.5 A Policy and Legal Analysis 199  
8.6 Inconsistencies in the EU Legal Framework 205  
8.7 The Surfacing of EU Principles? 206

9 Conclusions and Scope for Further Research 214  
9.1 Concluding Remarks 214  
9.2 The Way Forward for New Streams of Research 219

Bibliography 225  
Index 245