

CHAUCER'S SCRIBES

The 2004 announcement that Chaucer's scribe had been discovered resulted in a paradigm shift in medieval studies. Adam Pynkhurst dominated the classroom, became a fictional character, and led to suggestions that this identification should prompt the abandonment of our understanding of the development of London English and acceptance that the clerks of the Guildhall were promoting vernacular literature as part of a concerted political program. In this meticulously researched study, Lawrence Warner challenges the narratives and conclusions of recent scholarship. In place of the accepted story, Warner provides a fresh, more nuanced one in which many more scribes, anonymous ones, worked in conditions we are only beginning to understand. Bringing to light new information – not least, hundreds of documents in the hand of one of the most important fifteenth-century scribes of Chaucer and Langland – this book represents an important intervention in the field of Middle English studies.

LAWRENCE WARNER is Reader in Medieval English at King's College London. His previous publications include *The Myth of "Piers Plowman"* (Cambridge University Press, 2014), which won the English Association's 2016 Beatrice White Prize for outstanding scholarly work in the field of English Literature before 1590, and *The Lost History of "Piers Plowman"* (2011), which received an Honorable Mention for the Society for Textual Scholarship's 2013 Richard J. Finneran Award.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN MEDIEVAL LITERATURE

General Editor

Alastair Minnis, *Yale University*

Editorial Board

Zygmunt G. Barański, *University of Cambridge*
 Christopher C. Baswell, *Barnard College and Columbia University*
 Mary Carruthers, *New York University*
 Rita Copeland, *University of Pennsylvania*
 Roberta Frank, *Yale University*
 Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, *Fordham University*

This series of critical books seeks to cover the whole area of literature written in the major medieval languages – the main European vernaculars, and medieval Latin and Greek – during the period c.1100–1500. Its chief aim is to publish and stimulate fresh scholarship and criticism on medieval literature, special emphasis being placed on understanding major works of poetry, prose, and drama in relation to the contemporary culture and learning which fostered them.

Recent Titles in the Series

Lee Manion *Narrating the Crusades: Loss and Recovery in Medieval and Early Modern English Literature*
 Daniel Wakelin *Scribal Correction and Literary Craft: English Manuscripts 1375–1510*
 Jon Whitman (ed.) *Romance and History: Imagining Time from the Medieval to the Early Modern Period*
 Virginie Greene *Logical Fictions in Medieval Literature and Philosophy*
 Michael Johnston and Michael Van Dussen (eds.) *The Medieval Manuscript Book: Cultural Approaches*
 Tim William Machan (ed.) *Imagining Medieval English: Language Structures and Theories, 500–1500*
 Eric Weiskott *English Alliterative Verse: Poetic Tradition and Literary History*
 Sarah Elliott Novacich *Shaping the Archive in Late Medieval England: History, Poetry, and Performance*
 Geoffrey Russom *The Evolution of Verse Structure in Old and Middle English Poetry: From the Earliest Alliterative Poems to Iambic Pentameter*
 Ian Cornelius *Reconstructing Alliterative Verse: The Pursuit of a Medieval Meter*
 Sara Harris *The Linguistic Past in Twelfth-Century Britain*
 Erik Kwakkel and Rodney Thomson (eds.) *The European Book in the Twelfth Century*
 Irina Dumitrescu *The Experience of Education in Anglo-Saxon Literature*
 Jonas Wellendorf *Gods and Humans in Medieval Scandinavia: Retying the Bonds*
 Thomas A. Prendergast and Jessica Rosenfeld (eds.) *Chaucer and the Subversion of Form*
 Katie L. Walter *Middle English Mouths*
 Lawrence Warner *Chaucer's Scribes*

A complete list of titles in the series can be found at the end of the volume.

CHAUCER'S SCRIBES

London Textual Production, 1384–1432

LAWRENCE WARNER

King's College London



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108444996
DOI: 10.1017/9781108673433

© Lawrence Warner 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018
First paperback edition 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-108-42627-5 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-108-44499-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For Sebastian and Eloise with love

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> x
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
Introduction: The Pynkhurst Phenomenon	i
1 Adam	13
2 The Pynkhurst Canon	30
3 Pynkhurst's London English and the Dilemma of Copy-Text	52
4 Looking for the Scribe of Huntington Hm 114	72
5 The Guildhall Clerks	96
6 Hoccleve's Hengwrt, Hoccleve's Holographs	115
Conclusion: Where is Adam Pynkhurst?	134
<i>Notes</i>	143
<i>Works Cited</i>	197
<i>Index</i>	217

Figures

1	Scriveners Company Common Paper, Adam Pynkhurst's confirmation. London Metropolitan Archives, City of London: CLC/L/SC/A/005/MS05370 (Worshipful Company of Scriveners' collection), p. 56, top two-thirds. Dimensions of main text: approx. 165 (height, incl. ascenders) × 135–40 (length) mm. Reproduced by the kind permission of the Worshipful Company of Scriveners	page 31
2	John Organ's accounts, Mercers' Company Wardens' Account Book, hand of Adam Pynkhurst. London, The Mercers' Company, Wardens' Account Book, 1344, 1347 to 1464, fols. 10v top, 7v bottom. Full-length lines measure approx. 170 mm. Reproduced by kind permission of The Mercers' Company	37
3	Final folio of <i>Piers Plowman</i> (W), hand of Adam Pynkhurst. Cambridge, Trinity College MS B.15.17, fol. 130v. Dimensions: 290 × 190 mm (text space 230 × 140 mm). Reproduced by kind permission of the Master and Fellows of Trinity College, Cambridge	40
4	The Hengwrt <i>Canterbury Tales</i> (Hg), main text, hand of Scribe B (Hand A of Hg); replacement half lines in final ten lines, Hand D of Hg, identified by Simon Horobin as Hoccleve. Aberystwyth, National Library of Wales MS Peniarth 392D, fol. 74r, bottom. Reproduced by kind permission of the National Library of Wales	41
5	Charter on behalf of John of Northampton (1393), hand of Adam Pynkhurst. © The British Library Board. Additional Charter 40542. Measurements of area shown 120 × 260 mm. Reproduced by kind permission of The British Library.	45
6	Letters patent, hand of Robert Muskham. Kew, The National Archives, E 40/5267. Dimensions of text shown approx. 105 × 165 mm.	49

	<i>Figures</i>	xi
7	Spellings of diagnostic terms containing y , gh , and yogh in Hg, El, and W	56
8	More obvious differences between Types II and III London English (chart by M. L. Samuels)	60
9	Diagnostic terms in three texts Horobin and Mooney attribute to Scribe B	62
10	Petition of the Folk of Mercerye, identified by Linne Mooney as hand of Scribe B (= Pynkhurst). Dimensions of text shown 45 × 170 mm. Kew, The National Archives, SC 8/20/997	64
11	<i>Troilus and Criseyde</i> (Harley 3943), hand of Hm 114 scribe. © The British Library Board. Dimensions of each stanza: 35 × 80–85 mm. MS Harley 3943, fol. 9v (excerpt). Reproduced by kind permission of The British Library	83
12	Documents from the London Guildhall and the Goldsmiths' Company, 1397–1432, hand of Hm 114 scribe. Excerpts from London Metropolitan Archives, City of London, (a) CLA/024/01/02/038, Plea and Memoranda Roll 38 (Mayor's Court, City of London collection; former ref. A37), membr. 5v, dimensions of text shown 70 × 160 mm; (b) same, .../040, Roll 40 (former ref. A39), membr. 11r, dimensions of text shown 60 × 240 mm, both reproduced by kind permission of the London Metropolitan Archives; (c) London, Goldsmiths' Company, Register of Deeds, fol. 135r, dimensions of main text shown 100 mm (incl. final line) × 190 mm, reproduced by kind permission of The Goldsmiths' Company	85
13	<i>Troilus and Criseyde</i> (Harley 3943), Hand 4. © The British Library Board. MS Harley 3943, fol. 93r. Dimensions: 260 × 135 mm (text space: 205 × 90 mm). Reproduced by kind permission of The British Library	87
14	Goldsmiths' Company, Register of Deeds, perhaps Hand 4 of Harley 3943. London, Goldsmiths' Company, Register of Deeds, fol. 269v: top eighteen lines (out of fifty). Dimensions of ruled area shown 115 × 190 mm. Reproduced by kind permission of The Goldsmiths' Company	88
15	<i>Canterbury Tales</i> (Harley 7334), main hand, Scribe D; "Jhon Marcant" and vase in later hand. © The British Library Board. MS Harley 7334, fol. 180r (excerpt).	

xii	<i>Figures</i>	
	Dimensions: 355 × 245 mm (text space: 225 × 135 mm). Reproduced by kind permission of The British Library	99
16	London Guildhall entries, hand of John Carpenter. Excerpts from London Metropolitan Archives, City of London, (a) City of London, COL/AD/01/009 (Corporation of London collection), Letter Book I, fol. 212r, dimensions 75 (from top of P) × 180 mm; (b) CLA/024/01/02/050 (Mayor's Court, City of London collection), Plea and Memoranda Roll 50 (former ref. A49), membr. 1r, Q 38 mm tall, rest of term 55 mm long; (c) COL/CS/01/012 (City of London collection), <i>Liber Albus</i> , fol. 1v, entire term 115 mm long, minims 22 mm tall. Reproduced by kind permission of the London Metropolitan Archives	109
17	Passage on Guildhall clerks' roles, <i>Liber Albus</i> , hand of John Carpenter. COL/CS/01/012 (City of London collection), <i>Liber Albus</i> , fol. 17v (excerpt). Dimensions of text shown 155 × 145 mm. Reproduced by kind permission of the London Metropolitan Archives	110
18	The Trinity Gower (Trinity R.3.2), hand of Scribe E, Thomas Hoccleve. Cambridge, Trinity College MS R.3.2, fol. 83v, left column bottom. Dimensions of text shown 95 × 75 (bottom line) mm. Reproduced by kind permission of the Master and Fellows of Trinity College Cambridge	118
19	<i>Regiment of Princes</i> (Royal 17 D.xviii), identified by Linne Mooney as Hoccleve holograph. © The British Library Board, Royal MS 17 D.xviii, fol. 90r, top half. Dimensions of each stanza 45 × 100 mm. Reproduced by kind permission of The British Library	119
20	Précis of stemma of <i>Regiment of Princes</i> manuscripts, established by Marcia Smith Marzec	121
21	Petition on Chaucer's behalf, 1385, identified by Simon Horobin as hand of Scribe B (= Pynkhurst). Top half dimensions 15 (incl. third line) × 115 mm; bottom half 10 × 115 mm. Kew, The National Archives, C/81/1394 (excerpts)	136

Acknowledgments

Jane Roberts was there both at the beginning of the Pynkhurst phenomenon in 2004 and at the beginning of this book almost a decade later. I am deeply grateful for her advice, friendship, wit, and eventually for her careful reading of the entire manuscript for the press, resulting in a lengthy report that enabled me to improve it substantially, as did the other, anonymous report. I have benefited greatly from Tony Edwards's wise counsel over the years. Sheila Lindenbaum shared her profound knowledge of London textual production of this era, and prompted me to consult the Plea and Memoranda Rolls, which led directly to Chapters 4 and 5. My first visit to the Goldsmiths' Hall turned into an enlightening tutorial by Lisa Jefferson on the production of the Goldsmiths' Register, which enabled me to write Chapter 4, on an early draft of which she then commented extensively.

Julia Crick invited me to present some of my early findings at the London Manuscripts Seminar in December 2014, leading to fruitful discussion with her, Jane, and Pamela Robinson. Rivkah Zim read the entire manuscript and saved me from many errors. Simon Horobin, Michael Johnston, Kathleen Kennedy, Wendy Scase, and Sebastian Sobiecki read portions of this book in draft, as did Ralph Hanna and anon. as reviewers of the *SAC* essay from which it grew. Alex Gillespie's lively comments on an open Facebook discussion about Pynkhurst prompted me to think harder. Thanks to the wonderful community of medievalists of the English Department at King's College London: Josh Davies, Carl Kears, Clare Lees, and especially Sarah Salih for conversation on all things Middle English and for her editorial acumen. Also, to Yasmin Ibrahim for sharing her discoveries regarding John Carpenter and for her infectious passion for the world of the Guildhall clerks, and to Mami Kanno, Charlotte Knight, and Charlotte Rudman. Many shared advice on metrics, paleography, and bibliography: Stephen Barney, Julia Boffey, Cristina Maria Cervone, Megan Cook, Lisa Cooper, Colleen Curran, Orietta Da Rold, Matthew Fisher, Bruce Holsinger, Andy Kelly, Elon Lang, Rebecca McNamara,

Jenni Nuttall, Stephen Partridge, Noelle Phillips, Andrew Prescott, Jacob Thaisen, Claire Waters, and Eric Weiskott. The kind generosity of the scholars here mentioned implies neither endorsement of my arguments nor responsibility for any of this book's errors, which are mine alone.

This book would not exist without the expertise of the librarians and archivists of London: Eleni Bide, Librarian, and Sophia Tobin, Assistant Librarian of the Worshipful Company of Goldsmiths, who also provided professional-quality images gratis; Jane Ruddell, Archivist and Company Historian of the Mercers' Company; the London Metropolitan Archives, especially Louisa Macdonald and Jeremy Smith; the Guildhall Library, especially Peter Ross, Principal Librarian; Senate House Library, University of London, especially Tansy Barton, Research Librarian: Manuscript and Book Studies; Trinity College, Cambridge, especially Sandy Paul, Sub-Librarian; and the staffs of the British Library, the Haringey Archive Service, and the National Archives.

Portions of Chapters 2, 3, and 6 have been revised from "Scribes, Misattributed: Hoccleve and Pinkhurst," *Studies in the Age of Chaucer* 37 (2015): 55–100, edited by Sarah Salih, and are reproduced here by kind permission of the New Chaucer Society. I am grateful to Kim Richardson and Gail Welsh for copy-editing and preparing proofs respectively, and to Tim Mason and Sarah Lambert of Cambridge University Press. Alastair Minnis, General Editor of this series, read the entire manuscript and offered helpful suggestions for improvement. Finally, the readership of this and many other books in literary studies owes an enormous debt to Linda Bree, whom we wish the happiest in her retirement from her position as Senior Executive Publisher and Head of Humanities at Cambridge University Press.

My deepest love and affection for Genevieve as always, and for this book's dedicatees, our children Sebastian and Eloise.

Abbreviations

BL	London, British Library
<i>ChauR</i>	<i>Chaucer Review</i>
EETS	Early English Text Society
<i>JEBS</i>	<i>Journal of the Early Book Society for the Study of Manuscripts and Printed History</i>
<i>LALME</i>	<i>Linguistic Atlas of Late Mediaeval English</i> . Eds. Angus McIntosh, M. L. Samuels, and Michael Benskin, with the assistance of Margaret Laing and Keith Williamson, 4 vols. Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press, 1986
LMA	London Metropolitan Archives
<i>MÆ</i>	<i>Medium Ævum</i>
<i>MED</i>	<i>Middle English Dictionary</i> . Eds. Hans Kurath et al. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1952–2001. http://quod.lib.umich.edu/m/med
<i>NM</i>	<i>Neuphilologische Mitteilungen</i>
<i>ODNB</i>	<i>Oxford Dictionary of National Biography</i>
<i>OED</i>	<i>Oxford English Dictionary</i>
<i>PMLA</i>	<i>Publications of the Modern Language Association</i>
<i>RES</i>	<i>Review of English Studies</i>
<i>SAC</i>	<i>Studies in the Age of Chaucer</i>
<i>SB</i>	<i>Studies in Bibliography</i>
<i>TLS</i>	<i>Times Literary Supplement</i>
<i>YLS</i>	<i>Yearbook of Langland Studies</i>