### APPROACHES TO LUCRETIUS

Both in antiquity and ever since the Renaissance Lucretius' *De Rerum Natura* has been admired – and condemned – for its startling poetry, its evangelical faith in materialist causation, and its seductive advocacy of the Epicurean good life. *Approaches to Lucretius* assembles an international team of classicists and philosophers to take stock of a range of critical approaches to which this influential poem has given rise and which in turn have shaped its interpretation, including textual criticism, the text's strategies for engaging the reader with its author and his message, the 'atomology' that posits a correlation of the letters of the poem with the atoms of the universe, the literary and philosophical intertexts that mediate the poem, and the political and ideological questions that it raises. Thirteen essays take up a variety of positions within these traditions of interpretation, innovating within them and advancing beyond them in new directions.

DONNCHA O'ROURKE is Lecturer in Classics at the University of Edinburgh. He is author of *Propertius and the Virgilian Sensibility* (Cambridge, forthcoming) and co-editor of *Didactic Poetry of Greece*, *Rome and Beyond: Knowledge, Power, Tradition* (Swansea, 2019).

# APPROACHES TO LUCRETIUS

Traditions and Innovations in Reading the De Rerum Natura

> EDITED BY DONNCHA O'ROURKE University of Edinburgh



#### **CAMBRIDGE** UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108433105 DOI: 10.1017/9781108379854

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

> First published 2020 First paperback edition 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data NAMES: O'Rourke, Donncha, editor. TITLE: Approaches to Lucretius : Traditions and innovations in reading the de rerum natura / edited by Donncha O'Rourke. DESCRIPTION: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index. IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019060030 (print) | LCCN 2019060031 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108421966 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108433105 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108379854 (ebook) SUBJECTS: LCSH: Lucretius Carus, Titus. De rerum natura. CLASSIFICATION: LCC PA6484 .A67 2020 (print) | LCC PA6484 (ebook) | DDC 187–DC23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019060031

> ISBN 978-1-108-42196-6 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-43310-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-43310-5 — Approaches to Lucretius Edited by Donncha O'Rourke Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

Contents

List of Figures Notes on Contributors Preface List of Abbreviations		<i>page</i> vii viii xi xii		
Ap	Introduction Approaching Lucretius <i>Donncha O'Rourke</i>			
PART I THE TEXT				
I	Critical Responses to the Most Difficult Textual Problem in Lucretius <i>David Butterfield</i>	19		
PA	RT II LUCRETIUS AND HIS READERS			
2	Reading the 'Implied Author' in Lucretius' De Rerum Natura Nora Goldschmidt	43		
3	Common Ground in Lucretius' <i>De Rerum Natura Barnaby Taylor</i>	59		
4	Coming to Know Epicurus' Truth: Distributed Cognition in Lucretius' <i>De Rerum Natura</i> <i>Fabio Tutrone</i>	80		
PART III THE WORD AND THE WORLD				
5	Infinity, Enclosure and False Closure in Lucretius' <i>De Rerum Natura</i> <i>Donncha O'Rourke</i>	103		

vi	Table of Contents		
6	Lucretian Echoes: Sound as Metaphor for Literary Allusion in <i>De Rerum Natura</i> 4.549–94 <i>Jason Nethercut</i>	124	
7	Saussure's <i>cahiers</i> and Lucretius' <i>elementa</i> : A Reconsideration of the Letters–Atoms Analogy <i>Wilson H. Shearin</i>	140	
PAR	T IV LITERARY AND PHILOSOPHICAL SOURCES		
8	Arguing over Text(s): Master-Texts vs. Intertexts in the Criticism of Lucretius <i>A. D. Morrison</i>	157	
9	Lucretius and the Philosophical Use of Literary Persuasion <i>Tim O'Keefe</i>	177	
10	The Rising and Setting Soul in Lucretius, <i>De Rerum Natura</i> 3 <i>Emma Gee</i>	195	
PAR	T V WORLDVIEWS		
II	Was Memmius a Good King? <i>Joseph Farrell</i>	219	
12	A Tribute to a Hero: Marx's Interpretation of Epicurus in his Dissertation <i>Elizabeth Asmis</i>	241	
13	Plato and Lucretius on the Theoretical Subject <i>Duncan F. Kennedy</i>	259	
Works Cited 2.			
	Index Locorum		
Inde	Index Rerum 32		

## Figures

I	The Basic Material is Not the Word But the Letter, Nathan Coley	
	(2018). University of Edinburgh Art Collections (EU5617),	
	© Studio Nathan Coley. Reproduced with the permission of	
	the University of Edinburgh Art Collections. page	16
2	Leiden University Libraries, Voss. Lat. F 30 (Codex Oblongus):	
	2 <sup>r</sup> (detail showing <i>DRN</i> 1.42–6). Reproduced with the	
	permission of Leiden University Libraries.	38
3	Leiden University Libraries, Voss. Lat. F 30 (Codex Oblongus):	
	$45^{v}$ (detail showing <i>DRN</i> 2.644–51). Reproduced with the	
	permission of Leiden University Libraries.	38

### Notes on Contributors

- ELIZABETH ASMIS, Professor of Classics at the University of Chicago, is author of *Epicurus' Scientific Method* (Ithaca, 1984). She has written extensively on ancient Greek and Roman philosophy and aesthetics, with special attention to developments after Aristotle. She is currently working on Epicurean social philosophy and the reception of Greek philosophy in the Roman period and later.
- DAVID BUTTERFIELD is Senior Lecturer in Classics at the University of Cambridge and Fellow and Director of Studies in Classics at Queens' College. He is the author of *The Early Textual History of Lucretius*' De Rerum Natura (Cambridge, 2013) and the editor of *A. E. Housman: Classical Scholar* (London, 2009) and *Varro Varius: The Polymath of the Roman World* (Cambridge, 2015). He has published numerous articles, mainly on textual criticism, codicology and the history of scholarship, and is currently preparing a new Oxford Classical Text of Lucretius.
- JOSEPH FARRELL is Professor of Classical Studies and M. Mark and Esther K. Watkins Professor in the Humanities at the University of Pennsylvania. His books include *Vergil's* Georgics and the Traditions of Ancient Epic (Oxford, 1991), Latin Language and Latin Culture (Cambridge, 2001) and Juno's Aeneid: Narrative, Metapoetics, Dissent (Princeton, forthcoming).
- EMMA GEE was educated at the Universities of Sydney and Cambridge, and has worked at the Universities of Exeter, Sydney and St Andrews. She is currently an independent scholar in the Classics, academic tutor, and student and teacher of Ashtanga yoga. Her research interests include ancient astronomy and its reception, and the ancient afterlife. Her latest book, *Mapping the Afterlife from Homer to Dante*, is forthcoming (Oxford, 2020).

viii

#### Notes on Contributors

- NORA GOLDSCHMIDT is Associate Professor of Classics and Ancient History at Durham University. Her publications include *Shaggy Crowns: Ennius' Annales and Virgil's Aeneid* (Oxford, 2013), *Afterlives of the Roman Poets: Biofiction and the Reception of Latin Poetry* (Cambridge, 2019) and (with Barbara Graziosi) *Tombs of the Ancient Poets: Between Literary Reception and Material Culture* (Oxford, 2018).
- DUNCAN F. KENNEDY is Emeritus Professor of Latin Literature and the Theory of Criticism at the University of Bristol. He is the author of *The Arts of Love: Five Studies in the Discourse of Roman Love Elegy* (Cambridge, 1992), *Rethinking Reality: Lucretius and the Textualization of Nature* (Ann Arbor, 2002) and *Antiquity and the Meanings of Time: A Philosophy of Ancient and Modern Literature* (London, 2013), as well as numerous articles that explore the interpretation of classical literature. He is currently writing a series of essays on the emergence of metaphysical thinking.
- A. D. MORRISON is Professor of Greek at the University of Manchester, where he has taught since 2001. His books include *The Narrator in Archaic Greek and Hellenistic Poetry* (Cambridge, 2007), *Apollonius Rhodius, Herodotus and Historiography* (Cambridge, 2020) and (as coeditor) *Lucretius: Poetry, Philosophy, Science* (Oxford, 2013). He edited *Classical Quarterly* between 2013 and 2018. Current projects include a commentary on Callimachus for the Cambridge Greek and Latin Classics series, a *G&R* New Survey on Hellenistic poetry and co-directing the AHRC project on Ancient Letter Collections (2016–21).
- JASON NETHERCUT is Assistant Professor of Classics at the University of South Florida. His publications and ongoing research focus on Lucretius and his position in literary history, and on the relationship between poetry and philosophy in the *De Rerum Natura*. His book, Ennius Noster: *Lucretius and the* Annales, is forthcoming with Oxford University Press.
- TIM O'KEEFE is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Georgia State University. He has published extensively on Epicureanism, including two books *Epicurus on Freedom* (Cambridge, 2005) and *Epicureanism* (London, 2009) and articles on topics such as the Epicureans on the mind-body relation, freedom of action, sensible qualities, friendship, justice and death. His interests range broadly, and he has also published on the Pyrrhonian sceptics, the Cyrenaics and Aristotle's cosmology.

х

Notes on Contributors

- DONNCHA O'ROURKE is Lecturer in Classics at the University of Edinburgh. His doctoral career at Trinity College Dublin was followed by a British Academy Postdoctoral Fellowship at Corpus Christi College, Oxford. He is the author of *Propertius and the Virgilian Sensibility* (Cambridge, forthcoming) and of articles on various aspects of Augustan poetry, especially elegy. His other editorial projects include (with Lilah Grace Canevaro) *Didactic Poetry of Greece, Rome and Beyond: Knowledge, Power, Tradition* (Swansea, 2019) and (with Isabelle Torrance) *Classics and Irish Politics, 1916–2016* (Oxford, 2020).
- WILSON H. SHEARIN is Associate Professor of Classics at the University of Miami. He is author of *The Language of Atoms* (Oxford, 2015) and coeditor of *Dynamic Reading* (Oxford, 2012). Currently, he is writing on Lucretius and Lucan and completing editorial work on *The Oxford Handbook of Roman Philosophy*.
- BARNABY TAYLOR is Fellow and Tutor in Classics at Exeter College, Oxford, and Associate Professor of Classics at the University of Oxford. His interests include Lucretius, Cicero and Varro.
- FABIO TUTRONE is a Research and Teaching Fellow in Latin literature at the University of Palermo. His research focuses on the history of Roman literature, science and philosophy, with special regard to Lucretius, Seneca and the Latin reception of Greek thought. He has particular interest in literary topics of cognitive and anthropological relevance. His publications include *Filosofi e animali in Roma antica: Modelli di animalità e umanità in Lucrezio e Seneca* (Pisa, 2012).

Preface

This volume has its origin – albeit now somewhat remotely – in a conference on 'Lucretius in Theory' held at the University of Edinburgh in late 2013. That event, of which *Approaches to Lucretius* is the end-product, took place in connection with the editor's tenure of a British Academy Postdoctoral Fellowship, and was made possible by generous funding from that source. Also to be gratefully acknowledged is the additional support towards the material costs of the conference received from the School of History, Classics and Archaeology at the University of Edinburgh, the Classical Association and the Institute of Classical Studies.

A number of individuals are to be warmly thanked for their contributions to that initial endeavour or for their input since: Gordon Campbell; Monica Gale; Fiachra Mac Góráin; Damien Nelis; Alessandro Schiesaro; Simon Trépanier; Pamela Zinn. Two anonymous readers appointed by the Press provided valuable expertise at a formative stage and again on presentation of a full set of chapters. Michael Sharp and his team at Cambridge University Press have been responsive and understanding guides; Yassar Arafat, Lesley Hay and Bethany Johnson saw the volume through production with meticulous care. Finally and emphatically, the contributors have given generously of their time over the life-cycle of this project, and have been Epicureans in their forbearance during its long gestation.

## Abbreviations

Abbreviations for ancient authors and texts generally follow the conventions of the fourth edition of the *Oxford Classical Dictionary* (eds. S. Hornblower, A. Spawforth and E. Eidinow; Oxford, 2012). Journal titles are abbreviated according to the conventions of *L'Année Philologique*. The following standard abbreviations are also used:

Arrighetti	Arrighetti, G. (1973) <i>Epicuro: Opere</i> . Turin.
CWI	Marx, K., and Engels, F. (1975) Collected Works Vol. I: Karl
	Marx: 1835–43. New York.
DK	Diels, H., and Kranz, W. (eds.) (1951) Die Fragmente der
	Vorsokratiker (4 vols.). Berlin.
KD	Epicurus, <i>Kuriai Doxai</i> (= Diogenes Laertius 10.139–54).
MEGA	Marx, K., and Engels, F. (1975) Karl Marx, Friedrich Engels
	<i>Gesamtausgabe</i> . Berlin.
MEW	Marx, K., and Engels, F. (1968) Werke. Ergänzungsband
	Part I: Schriften, Manuskripte, Briefe bis 1844. Berlin.
MRR	Broughton, T. R. S. (1951–2) <i>The Magistrates of the Roman</i>
	<i>Republic</i> (2 vols.). Cleveland; (1986) Vol. 3. Supplement.
	Atlanta.
RAC	Klauser, T., et al. (eds.) (1941–2000) <i>Reallexikon für Antike</i>
	und Christentum: Sachwörterbuch zur Auseinandersetzung des
2.2	Christentums mit der antiken Welt. 23 vols. Stuttgart.
RE	Pauly, A., Wissowa, G., et al. (eds.) (1839–1980) Paulys
	Real-Encyclopädie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft. 24
D 1	vols., 19 vols., and supplement (15 vols.). Stuttgart.
Roscher	Roscher, W. H. (1884–1937) Ausführliches Lexikon der
	griechischen und römischen Mythologie. 6 vols. and
TT	supplement. Leipzig.
Usener	Usener, H. (1887) <i>Epicurea</i> . Leipzig. (Reprinted with
	Italian translation and notes by I. Ramelli: Milan, 2002.)