

### LOTTERIES, KNOWLEDGE, AND RATIONAL BELIEF

We talk and think about our beliefs both in a categorical (yes/no) and in a graded way. How do the two kinds of belief hang together? The most straightforward answer is that we believe something categorically if we believe it to a high enough degree. But this seemingly obvious, near-platitudinous claim is known to give rise to a paradox commonly known as the 'lottery paradox' – at least when it is coupled with some further seeming near-platitudes about belief. How to resolve that paradox has been a matter of intense philosophical debate for over fifty years. This volume offers a collection of newly commissioned essays on the subject, all of which provide compelling reasons for rethinking many of the fundamentals of the debate.

IGOR DOUVEN is a CNRS Research Professor at Paris-Sorbonne University. His essays have appeared in numerous major philosophy and cognitive science journals, and he is the author of *The Epistemology of Indicative Conditionals* (Cambridge, 2016).



# LOTTERIES, KNOWLEDGE, AND RATIONAL BELIEF

Essays on the Lottery Paradox

EDITED BY
IGOR DOUVEN

University of Paris-Sorbonne







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108433051

DOI: 10.1017/9781108379755

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2021 First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data Names: Douven, Igor, editor.

TITLE: Lotteries, knowledge, and rational belief: essays on the lottery paradox / edited by Igor Douven, University of Paris-Sorbonne.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020012388 (print) | LCCN 2020012389 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108421911 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108433051 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108379755 (epub) SUBJECTS: LCSH: Belief and doubt. | Rationalism. | Lotteries–Miscellanea.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC BD215 .1.585 2020 (print) | LCC BD215 (ebook) | DDC 212/.6—dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020012388 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020012389

18BN 978-1-108-42191-1 Hardback 18BN 978-1-108-43305-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## Contents

Lis	t of Contributors	<i>page</i> vii
	troduction r Douven	I
Ι	Rational Belief and Statistical Evidence: Blame, Bias, and the Law  Dana Kay Nelkin	6
2	Knowledge Attributions and Lottery Cases: A Review and New Evidence John Turri	28
3	The Psychological Dimension of the Lottery Paradox Jennifer Nagel	48
4	Three Puzzles about Lotteries  Julia Staffel	74
5	Four Arguments for Denying that Lottery Beliefs Are Justified <i>Martin Smith</i>	95
6	Rethinking the Lottery Paradox: A Dual Processing Perspective Igor Douven and Shira Elqayam	e 110
7	Rational Belief in Lottery- and Preface-Situations: Impossibility Results and Possible Solutions  Gerhard Schurz	y 128
8	Stability and the Lottery Paradox Hannes Leitgeb	147
9	The Lottery, the Preface, and Epistemic Rule Consequentialist Christoph Kelp and Francesco Praolini	m 171

v



vi	Contents	
10	Beliefs, Probabilities, and Their Coherent Correspondence Kevin T. Kelly and Hanti Lin	185
II	The Relation between Degrees of Belief and Binary Beliefs: A General Impossibility Theorem Franz Dietrich and Christian List	223
Bib. Indi	liography	255 269



## Contributors

- Franz Dietrich is a CNRS Research Professor in the Paris School of Economics, University of Paris-Sorbonne
- Igor Douven is a CNRS Research Professor at SND, University of Paris-Sorbonne
- Shira Elqayam is a professor of cognitive psychology in the School of Applied Social Sciences, De Montfort University
- Kevin T. Kelly is a professor of philosophy in the Department of Philosophy, Carnegie Mellon University
- Christoph Kelp is a senior lecturer in the Department of Philosophy, University of Glasgow
- Hannes Leitgeb is an Alexander von Humboldt Professor in the Department of Philosophy, Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich
- Hanti Lin is an assistant professor in the Department of Philosophy, University of California Davis
- Christian List is a professor of philosophy and political science in the Departments of Government and Philosophy, London School of Economics
- Jennifer Nagel is a professor of philosophy in the Department of Philosophy, University of Toronto
- Dana Kay Nelkin is a professor of philosophy in the Department of Philosophy, University of California San Diego
- Francesco Praolini is a PhD student in the Department of Philosophy, University of Cologne



viii

#### List of Contributors

Gerhard Schurz is a professor of philosophy in the Department of Philosophy, Heinrich Heine University, Dusseldorf

Martin Smith is a lecturer in the Department of Philosophy, University of Edinburgh

Julia Staffel is an assistant professor in the Department of Philosophy, University of Colorado

John Turri is Canada Research Chair in Philosophy and Cognitive Science, University of Waterloo