

EQUITY AND LAW

The fusion of law and equity in common law systems was a crucial moment in the development of modern law. Common law and equity were historically the two principal sources of rules and remedies in the judge-made law of England, and this bifurcated system travelled to other countries whose legal systems were derived from the English legal system. The division of law and equity – their fission – was a pivotal legal development and is a feature of most common law systems. The fusion of the common law and equity has brought about major structural, institutional and juridical changes within the common law tradition. In this volume, leading scholars undertake historical, comparative, doctrinal and theoretical analysis that aims to shed light on the ways in which law and equity have fused, and the ways in which they have remained distinct even in a ‘post-fusion’ world.

John C. P. Goldberg is the Carter Professor of General Jurisprudence at the Harvard Law School in Harvard University.

Henry E. Smith is the Fessenden Professor of Law and Director of the Project on the Foundations of Private Law at the Harvard Law School in Harvard University.

P. G. Turner is a University Senior Lecturer and a Fellow of St Catharine’s College in the University of Cambridge.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-43175-0 — Equity and Law

Edited by John C. P. Goldberg, Henry E. Smith, P. G. Turner

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

Equity and Law

FUSION AND FISSION

Edited by

JOHN C. P. GOLDBERG

Harvard Law School

HENRY E. SMITH

Harvard Law School

P. G. TURNER

University of Cambridge



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-43175-0 — Equity and Law
Edited by John C. P. Goldberg, Henry E. Smith, P. G. Turner
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108431750

DOI: 10.1017/9781108367820

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

First paperback edition 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

NAMES: Goldberg, John C. P., 1961-, editor. | Smith, Henry E., editor. |

Turner, P. G. (Peter G.), editor.

TITLE: Equity and law : fusion and fission / Edited by John C. P. Goldberg, Harvard Law School, Massachusetts, Henry E. Smith, Harvard Law School, Massachusetts, Peter G. Turner, University of Cambridge.

DESCRIPTION: New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019004231 | ISBN 9781108421317 (hardback : alk. paper) |

ISBN 9781108431750 (pbk. : alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Equity. | Equity pleading and procedure.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC K247 .E64 2019 | DDC 346/.004-dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2019004231>

ISBN 978-1-108-42131-7 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-43175-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxiii
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	xxxix
1 Fusion and Theories of Equity in Common Law Systems	1
<i>P. G. Turner</i>	
PART I LEGAL SYSTEMS AND LEGAL INSTITUTIONS	29
2 Equity: Notes on the American Reception	31
<i>Samuel L. Bray</i>	
3 The Union of Law and Equity: The United States, 1800–1938	46
<i>Kellen Funk</i>	
4 What Did the Makers of the Judicature Acts Understand by ‘Fusion’?	70
<i>Michael Lobban</i>	
5 At the Crossroads of Fusion: British North America/Canada, 1750–2000	97
<i>Philip Girard</i>	

6	Fusion–Fission–Fusion: Pre-Judicature Equity Jurisdiction in New South Wales, 1824–1972	118
	<i>Mark Leeming</i>	
7	Fusion without Fission: Equity and the Judicature Acts in Colonial Victoria	144
	<i>James McComish</i>	
8	Are Equity and Law in Scotland Fused, Separate or Intertwined?	179
	<i>Daniel J. Carr</i>	
	PART II FUSION AND FISSION IN DOCTRINE AND PRACTICE	201
9	Equity and the Common Counts: The Development of the Action for Money Had and Received	203
	<i>Ben Kremer</i>	
10	Mistake and Unfairness in Contract Law	229
	<i>Stephen Waddams</i>	
11	<i>Lex Sequitur Equitatem</i>: Fusion and the Penalty Doctrine	254
	<i>P. G. Turner</i>	
12	Rediscovering the Equitable Origins of Discovery: The ‘Blending’ of Law and Equity Prior to Fusion	280
	<i>Patricia I. McMahon</i>	
	PART III FUNCTIONAL, ANALYTICAL AND THEORETICAL VIEWS	307
13	Wrongful Fusion: Equity and Tort	309
	<i>John C. P. Goldberg and Henry E. Smith</i>	
14	Avoiding Anarchy? <i>Common Law v. Equity</i> and <i>Maitland v. Hohfeld</i>	331
	<i>Ben McFarlane</i>	
15	Equity and the Modern Mind	353
	<i>Emily Sherwin</i>	

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-43175-0 — Equity and Law

Edited by John C. P. Goldberg, Henry E. Smith, P. G. Turner

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

	<i>Contents</i>	vii
16	An Argument for Limited Fission <i>Matthew Harding</i>	374
17	‘Single Nature’s Double Name’: The Unity of Law and Equity? <i>Dennis Klinck</i>	394
	<i>Index</i>	421

Figures

7.1	W. F. E. Liardet, <i>The Opening of the Supreme Court</i> (State Library of Victoria)	page 147
7.2	Mr Justice Molesworth, Alfred Martin Ebsworth, Melbourne (State Library of Victoria)	150
7.3	The Lamont Will case in the equity court, <i>Illustrated Australian News</i> , 1881 (State Library of Victoria)	159
7.4	The Supreme Court sitting in equity, <i>Melbourne Punch</i> , 1856 (National Library of Australia)	160
7.5	Equity bills filed by year, 1841–70	161
7.6	Equity suits per 100,000 persons, 1851–70	161
7.7	Injunctions – percentage of bills	162
7.8	Specific performance – percentage of bills	162
7.9	Partnership proceedings – percentage of bills	163
7.10	Administration suits – percentage of bills	163
7.11	Trusts – percentage of bills	164
7.12	Mortgages – percentage of bills	164
7.13	Receivers – percentage of bills	165
7.14	‘The New Judicature Act’, <i>Melbourne Punch</i> , 1884 (National Library of Australia)	171

Table

5.1	Mortgage foreclosures in late twentieth-century Nova Scotia and New York State	<i>page</i> 114
-----	---	-----------------

Contributors

Samuel L. Bray is a Professor of the University of Notre Dame Law School.

Daniel J. Carr is a Senior Lecturer in Private Law of the Edinburgh Law School in the University of Edinburgh.

Kellen Funk is an Associate Professor of the Columbia Law School of Columbia University in the city of New York.

Philip Girard is a Professor of the Osgoode Hall Law School in York University, Toronto.

John C. P. Goldberg is the Carter Professor of General Jurisprudence at Harvard Law School in Harvard University.

Matthew Harding is a Professor of the Law School of the University of Melbourne.

Dennis Klinck is a Professor Emeritus of the Faculty of Law of McGill University.

Ben Kremer is a Barrister of the State of New South Wales who practises in Sydney.

Mark Leeming is a Judge of Appeal of the Supreme Court of New South Wales and the Challis Lecturer in Equity in the University of Sydney.

Michael Lobban is a Professor of Legal History of the Department of Law of the London School of Economics.

James McComish is a Barrister of the State of Victoria who practises in Melbourne and is a Fellow of the Law School of the University of Melbourne.

Ben McFarlane is a Professor of Law of the Faculty of Laws of University College, London.

Patricia I. McMahon is a Lawyer of the Province of Ontario who practises in Toronto.

Emily Sherwin is the Frank B. Ingersoll Professor of Law at Cornell Law School in Cornell University.

Henry E. Smith is the Fessenden Professor of Law and the Director of the Project on the Foundations of Private Law at Harvard Law School in Harvard University.

P. G. Turner is a University Senior Lecturer and a Fellow of St Catharine's College in the University of Cambridge.

Stephen Waddams is a University Professor and the Goodman/Schipper Professor of the Faculty of Law of the University of Toronto.

Acknowledgements

Ten of the seventeen chapters of this book began life as papers prepared for a seminar held in St Catharine's College, Cambridge, in 2016; the other seven were specially commissioned afterwards. The seminar was hosted jointly by the Project on the Foundations of Private Law, which operates from the Harvard Law School, and the Centre for Private Law in the University of Cambridge. The editors are grateful for the financial support provided by the Project and the Centre, as well as the various forms of support provided by St Catharine's College and by the University of Cambridge through the Faculty of Law and a grant from the Cambridge Humanities Research Grant Scheme.

Ms Kim Hughes commissioned the book, and was succeeded in that role by Mr Tom Randall as the manuscript advanced. They judiciously accommodated and guided the editors, who express their thanks. The assistance of Ms Trina Malone in the checking of references in many chapters, and applying the house style, was substantial and is gratefully acknowledged.