

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO

THE SCOTTISH ENLIGHTENMENT

The second edition of this *Companion* presents a philosophical perspective on an eighteenth-century phenomenon that has had a profound influence on Western culture. A distinguished team of contributors examines the writings of David Hume, Adam Smith, Thomas Reid, Adam Ferguson and other Scottish thinkers. Their subjects range across philosophy, natural theology, economics, anthropology, natural science, and law and the arts, and in addition, they relate the Scottish Enlightenment to its historical context and assess its impact and legacy. The result is a comprehensive and accessible volume that illuminates the richness, the intellectual variety and the underlying unity of this important movement. This volume contains five entirely new chapters on morality, the human mind, aesthetics, sentimentalism and political economy, and eleven other chapters have been significantly revised and updated. The book will be of interest to a wide range of readers in philosophy, theology, literature and the history of ideas.

ALEXANDER BROADIE is Honorary Professorial Research Fellow at the University of Glasgow. His books include *The Circle of John Mair: Logic and Logicians in Pre-Reformation Scotland* (1985), *The Shadow of Scotus: Philosophy and Faith in Pre-Reformation Scotland* (1995), *A History of Scottish Philosophy* (2010), *The Scottish Enlightenment: The Historical Age of the Historical Nation* (2011) and (as editor) *Studies in Seventeenth-Century Scottish Philosophers and Their Philosophy* (2017).

CRAIG SMITH is the Adam Smith Senior Lecturer in the Scottish Enlightenment in the School of Social and Political Sciences at the University of Glasgow. He is the author of *Adam Smith's Political Philosophy: The Invisible Hand and Spontaneous Order* (2006) and *Adam Ferguson and the Idea of Civil Society: Moral Science in the Scottish Enlightenment* (2019), and he is a co-editor of *The Oxford Handbook of Adam Smith* (2013).

OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF CAMBRIDGE
 COMPANIONS

- ABELARD *Edited by* JEFFREY E. BROWER *and* KEVIN GUILFOY
 ADORNO *Edited by* THOMAS HUHN
 ANCIENT ETHICS *Edited by* CHRISTOPHER BOBONICH
 ANCIENT SCEPTICISM *Edited by* RICHARD BETT
 ANSELM *Edited by* BRIAN DAVIES *and* BRIAN LEFTOW
 AQUINAS *Edited by* NORMAN KREZMANN *and* ELEONORE STUMP
 ARABIC PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* PETER ADAMSON *and* RICHARD C. TAYLOR
 HANNAH ARENDT *Edited by* DANA VILLA
 ARISTOTLE *Edited by* JONATHAN BARNES
 ARISTOTLE'S 'POLITICS' *Edited by* MARGUERITE DESLAURIERS *and* PAUL DESTRIÉE
 ATHEISM *Edited by* MICHAEL MARTIN
 AUGUSTINE 2nd edition *Edited by* DAVID MECONI *and* ELEONORE STUMP
 BACON *Edited by* MARKKU PELTONEN
 BERKELEY *Edited by* KENNETH P. WINKLER
 BOETHIUS *Edited by* JOHN MARENBO
 BRENTANO *Edited by* DALE JACQUETTE
 CARNAP *Edited by* MICHAEL FRIEDMAN *and* RICHARD CREATH
 THE COMMUNIST MANIFESTO *Edited by* TERRELL CARVER *and* JAMES FARR
 CONSTANT *Edited by* HELENA ROSENBLATT
 CRITICAL THEORY *Edited by* FRED RUSH
 DARWIN 2nd edition *Edited by* JONATHAN HODGE *and* GREGORY RADICK
 SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR *Edited by* CLAUDIA CARD
 DELEUZE *Edited by* DANIEL W. SMITH *and* HENRY SOMERS-HALL
 DESCARTES *Edited by* JOHN COTTINGHAM
 DESCARTES' 'MEDITATIONS' *Edited by* DAVID CUNNING
 DEWEY *Edited by* MOLLY COCHRAN
 DUNS SCOTUS *Edited by* THOMAS WILLIAMS
 EARLY GREEK PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* A. A. LONG
 EARLY MODERN PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* DONALD RUTHERFORD
 EPICUREANISM *Edited by* JAMES WARREN
 EXISTENTIALISM *Edited by* STEVEN CROWELL
 FEMINISM IN PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* MIRANDA FRICKER *and* JENNIFER HORNSBY
 FICHTE *Edited by* DAVID JAMES *and* GUENTER ZOELLER
 FOUCAULT 2nd edition *Edited by* GARY GUTTING

Continued at the back of the book

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-43078-4 — The Cambridge Companion to the Scottish Enlightenment
Edited by Alexander Broadie, Craig Smith
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

The Cambridge Companion to
**THE SCOTTISH
ENLIGHTENMENT**

SECOND EDITION

Edited by
Alexander Broadie
University of Glasgow

Craig Smith
University of Glasgow



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-43078-4 — The Cambridge Companion to the Scottish Enlightenment
Edited by Alexander Broadie, Craig Smith
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108430784

DOI: 10.1017/9781108355063

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Broadie, Alexander, editor. | Smith, Craig, 1977– editor.

Title: The Cambridge companion to the Scottish Enlightenment / edited by Alexander Broadie, University of Glasgow; Craig Smith, University of Glasgow.

Description: Second edition. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2019. |

Series: Cambridge companions | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019010635 | ISBN 9781108420709

Subjects: LCSH: Philosophy, Scottish – 18th century. | Enlightenment – Scotland. | Scotland – Intellectual life – 18th century.

Classification: LCC B1402.E55 C36 2019 | DDC 001.09411/09033–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2019010635>

ISBN 978-1-108-42070-9 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-43078-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

| | |
|---|-----------------|
| List of Contributors | <i>page</i> vii |
| Acknowledgements | xi |
| Chronology of Events Relating to the Scottish Enlightenment | xii |
| Introduction | 1 |
| ALEXANDER BROADIE | |
| 1 Several Contexts of the Scottish Enlightenment | 9 |
| ROGER L. EMERSON AND MARK G. SPENCER | |
| 2 Religion and Rational Theology | 33 |
| M. A. STEWART | |
| 3 The Human Mind and Its Powers | 60 |
| JACQUELINE TAYLOR | |
| 4 Anthropology: The 'Original' of Human Nature | 74 |
| AARON GARRETT | |
| 5 Science in the Scottish Enlightenment | 90 |
| PAUL WOOD | |
| 6 Scepticism and Common Sense | 113 |
| HEINER F. KLEMMER | |
| 7 Moral Sense Theories and Other Sentimentalist Accounts of the Foundations of Morals | 131 |
| CHRISTEL FRICKE | |
| 8 The Political Theory of the Scottish Enlightenment | 151 |
| FANIA OZ-SALZBERGER | |

vi CONTENTS

| | | |
|----|---|-----|
| 9 | Political Economy | 177 |
| | CRAIG SMITH | |
| 10 | Natural Jurisprudence and the Theory of Justice | 195 |
| | KNUD HAAKONSSON | |
| 11 | Legal Theory in the Scottish Enlightenment | 213 |
| | JOHN W. CAIRNS | |
| 12 | Sociality and Socialisation | 234 |
| | CHRISTOPHER J. BERRY | |
| 13 | Historiography | 248 |
| | MURRAY G. H. PITTOCK | |
| 14 | Art and Aesthetic Theory | 271 |
| | CATHERINE LABIO | |
| 15 | Literature and Sentimentalism | 289 |
| | DEIDRE DAWSON | |
| 16 | The Impact on America: Scottish Philosophy and the American Founding | 313 |
| | SAMUEL FLEISCHACKER | |
| 17 | The Nineteenth-Century Aftermath | 334 |
| | GORDON GRAHAM | |
| | Select Bibliography | 348 |
| | Index | 357 |

Contributors

Christopher J. Berry is Professor Emeritus of Political Theory and Honorary Professorial Research Fellow at the University of Glasgow. His most recent publications are *Essays on Hume, Smith and the Scottish Enlightenment* (2018) and *A Very Short Introduction to Adam Smith* (2018).

Alexander Broadie is Honorary Professorial Research Fellow at the University of Glasgow. His books include *The Circle of John Mair: Logic and Logicians in Pre-Reformation Scotland* (1985), *The Shadow of Scotus: Philosophy and Faith in Pre-Reformation Scotland* (1995), *A History of Scottish Philosophy* (2010), *The Scottish Enlightenment: The Historical Age of the Historical Nation* (2011) and (as editor) *Studies in Seventeenth-Century Scottish Philosophers and Their Philosophy* (2017).

John W. Cairns is Professor of Civil Law at the University of Edinburgh. His research has mainly focused on the history of Scots law (particularly legal literature, legal education and the legal profession in the eighteenth century), slavery and the law (particularly in the eighteenth century) and the legal history of Louisiana and Quebec.

Deidre Dawson was Professor of Language and Culture at Michigan State University. She is co-editor of *Scotland and France in the Enlightenment* (2004) with Pierre Morère and of a critical edition of the Marquise de Condorcet's critique of Adam Smith's moral philosophy, *Les Lettres sur la sympathie (1798) de Sophie de Grouchy: philosophie morale et réforme sociale* (2010) with Marc-André Bernier.

Roger L. Emerson is Professor Emeritus of History at the University of Western Ontario. He is the author of *Professors, Patronage and Politics: The Aberdeen Universities in the Eighteenth Century*

viii LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

(1992) and *An Enlightened Duke: The Life of Archibald Campbell (1692–1761), Earl of Ilay, 3rd Duke of Argyll* (2013).

Samuel Fleischacker is LAS Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at the University of Illinois in Chicago. He is the author of nine books, including *A Third Concept of Liberty: Judgment and Freedom in Kant and Adam Smith* (1999), *On Adam Smith's 'Wealth of Nations': A Philosophical Companion* (2004) and *Being Me Being You: Adam Smith and Empathy* (2019).

Christel Fricke is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Oslo. Volumes she has recently edited include 'Nature, Culture, Gods, and Reason: Exploring Evaluative and Normative Constraints on Right Action in a Historical and Comparative Perspective' (special issue of the *Journal of Value Inquiry*, 2015), *Intersubjectivity and Objectivity in Adam Smith and Edmund Husserl* (2012), *The Ethics of Forgiveness* (2011) and *Adam Smith and the Conditions of a Moral Society* (2011).

Aaron Garrett teaches at Boston University. He is the editor of *The Routledge Companion to Eighteenth Century Philosophy* (2014); co-editor, with James Harris, of *Scottish Philosophy in the Eighteenth Century* (2015); and author of *Berkeley's Three Dialogues: A Reader's Guide* (2008) and *Meaning in Spinoza's Method* (2008).

Gordon Graham is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy and the Arts at Princeton Theological Seminary and was formerly Regius Professor of Moral Philosophy at the University of Aberdeen. He is editor of *Scottish Philosophy in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries* (2015) and has published extensively on topics related to the Scottish philosophical tradition.

Knud Haakonssen is Professor of Intellectual History, St. Andrews and Long-Term Fellow at the Max Weber Centre, Erfurt. He edited *The Cambridge History of Eighteenth-Century Philosophy* (Cambridge, 2005) and *The Cambridge Companion to Adam Smith* (Cambridge, 2005). He is general editor of The Edinburgh Edition of Thomas Reid.

Heiner F. Klemme is Professor of the History of Philosophy at the University of Halle-Wittenberg. His publications include *Kants Philosophie des Subjekts* (1996), *Immanuel Kant* (2004), *David Hume zur Einführung* (2006) and *Kants 'Grundlegung zur Metaphysik der Sitten': Ein systematischer Kommentar* (2017). He is co-editor of *The Bloomsbury Dictionary of Eighteenth Century German Philosophers* (2016) and many other books and editions.

Catherine Labio is Associate Professor of English at the University of Colorado Boulder. She is the author of *Origins and the Enlightenment: Aesthetic Epistemology from Descartes to Kant* (2004) and the co-editor of *The Great Mirror of Folly: Finance, Culture, and the Crash of 1720* (2013).

Fania Oz-Salzberger is Professor of History at the Faculty of Law, University of Haifa, where she also heads the Posen Forum for the History of Political Thought, and Director of Paideia, the European Institute for Jewish Studies in Stockholm. Her books include *Translating the Enlightenment: Scottish Civic Discourse in Eighteenth-Century Germany* (1995) and *Jews and Words* (2012), co-authored with Amos Oz. She has published numerous articles on the history of ideas, particularly on the Scottish Enlightenment.

Murray G. H. Pittock, FRSE, is Bradley Professor of English Literature at the University of Glasgow. His recent publications include *Material Culture and Sedition* (2013) and *Culloden* (2016). His *Enlightenment in a Smart City: Edinburgh's Civic Development 1660–1750* is forthcoming.

Craig Smith is the Adam Smith Senior Lecturer in the Scottish Enlightenment in the School of Social and Political Sciences at the University of Glasgow. He is the author of *Adam Smith's Political Philosophy: The Invisible Hand and Spontaneous Order* (2006) and *Adam Ferguson and the Idea of Civil Society: Moral Science in the Scottish Enlightenment* (2019), and he is a co-editor of *The Oxford Handbook of Adam Smith* (2013).

X LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Mark G. Spencer is Professor of History at Brock University. He is the author of *David Hume and Eighteenth-Century America* (2005) and editor of a dozen volumes, including *Hume's Reception in Early America: Expanded Edition* (2017), *The Bloomsbury Encyclopedia of the American Enlightenment* (2015) and *David Hume: Historical Thinker, Historical Writer* (2013).

M. A. Stewart is Honorary Research Professor in the History of Philosophy at the Universities of Lancaster and Aberdeen and is Senior Research Fellow of Harris Manchester College, Oxford. He edited *Studies in the Philosophy of the Scottish Enlightenment* (1990), co-edited *Hume and Hume's Connexions* (1994) and has published also on Locke and on philosophy in the dissenting tradition.

Jacqueline Taylor is Professor of Philosophy at the University of San Francisco. She is the author of *Reflecting Subjects: Passion, Sympathy, and Society in Hume's Philosophy* (2015) and co-editor, with David Fate Norton, of *The Cambridge Companion to Hume*, 2nd edition (Cambridge, 2009). Her edited volume *Reading Hume on the Principles of Morals* is forthcoming.

Paul Wood is Professor Emeritus in the Department of History, University of Victoria, Canada. He has published widely on the natural and human sciences in the Scottish Enlightenment and has edited or co-edited four volumes in the Edinburgh Edition of Thomas Reid.

Acknowledgements

The editors would like to thank the returning contributors for agreeing to update, and in many cases substantially re-write, their contributions to the original edition of this *Companion*. They also wish to thank the new contributors whose chapters have further extended the range of material covered by the *Companion*.

Thanks are due to Cambridge University Press, in particular, to Hilary Gaskin, who provided invaluable guidance on the production of a second edition, and to Sophie Taylor, for guiding the project through to publication.

Chronology of Events Relating to the Scottish Enlightenment

- 1681 Viscount Stair's *The Institutions of the Laws of Scotland* (rev. edn. 1691)
 Royal College of Physicians chartered by Charles II
- 1684–1758 Allan Ramsay (poet)
- 1685–9 Reign of James VII and II
- 1687 Sir Isaac Newton's *Mathematical Principles of Natural Philosophy* (the *Principia*)
- 1689 William and Mary ascended the throne
- 1689 Advocates' Library opened
- 1690 John Locke's *Essay Concerning Human Understanding*
- 1694–1746 Francis Hutcheson
- 1695–1768 John Erskine of Carnock
- 1696–1782 Henry Home, raised to the Bench as Lord Kames in 1752
- 1698–1746 Colin MacLaurin
- 1698–1748 George Turnbull
- 1702–14 Reign of Queen Anne
- 1704 Death of John Locke
 Sir Isaac Newton's *Opticks*
- 1707 Treaty of Union of England and Scotland
- 1710–96 Thomas Reid
- 1710 Bishop Berkeley's *Principles of Human Knowledge*
 Hutcheson matriculated at Glasgow
- 1710–90 William Cullen
- 1711–76 David Hume
- 1711 Lord Shaftesbury's *Characteristicks of Men, Manners, Opinions, Times*
 First year of Joseph Addison and Richard Steele's *Spectator*

- 1713–84 Allan Ramsay (painter)
 1713–80 Sir James Steuart
 1714–27 Reign of George I
 1714 Bernard Mandeville's *Fable of the Bees*
 1715 Jacobite Rising
 1718 Carmichael's commentary on Pufendorf's *De officio hominis et civis*
 1718–1800 Hugh Blair
 1719–96 George Campbell
 1721–93 William Robertson
 1721–71 Tobias Smollett
 1722 Reid enters Marischal College, Aberdeen
 1723–90 Adam Smith
 1723–1816 Adam Ferguson
 1723 Hume enters Edinburgh University
 1725 Hutcheson's *An Inquiry into the Original of Our Ideas of Beauty and Virtue*
 MacLaurin elected Professor of Mathematics at Edinburgh
 1725–6 Hutcheson's *Reflections upon Laughter and Remarks upon the Fable of the Bees*
 1726–97 James Hutton
 1728 Hutcheson's *Essay on the Nature and Conduct of the Passions, with Illustrations on the Moral Sense*
 1729 Death of Gershom Carmichael, Professor of Moral Philosophy at Glasgow
 Hutcheson appointed Professor at Glasgow, becoming Professor of Moral Philosophy in 1730
 1728–99 Joseph Black
 1735–1801 John Millar
 1736–1819 James Watt
 1736/8–96 James Macpherson
 1737 Foundation of Philosophical Society of Edinburgh
 1739–40 Hume's *A Treatise of Human Nature*

xiv CHRONOLOGY

- 1739–1805 John Robison
- 1740 George Turnbull's *Treatise on Ancient Painting and Principles of Moral and Christian Philosophy*
- 1740–95 William Smellie
- 1740–95 James Boswell
- 1743–86 Gilbert Stuart
- 1745–46 Jacobite Rising under Charles Edward Stuart
- 1747 William Cullen appointed Professor of Chemistry at Glasgow
- 1748 Hume's *Philosophical Essays Concerning Human Understanding* (later titled *An Enquiry Concerning Human Understanding*)
 Colin MacLaurin's *Account of Sir Isaac Newton's Philosophical Discoveries*
 Reid's 'Essay on Quantity' in *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London*
 Charles-Louis Montesquieu's *L'Esprit des Loix*
- 1749 First volume of comte de Buffon's *Histoire Naturelle*
- 1750–74 Robert Fergusson
- 1751 Adam Smith appointed Professor of Logic and Rhetoric at Glasgow, becoming Professor of Moral Philosophy in 1752
 Reid appointed regent at King's College, Aberdeen
 Hume's *An Enquiry Concerning the Principles of Morals*
- 1752–7 Hume Keeper of the Advocates' Library, Edinburgh
- 1752 Foundation of Glasgow Literary Society
- 1753–1828 Dugald Stewart
- 1754–62 Hume's *History of England*
- 1754–1835 Sir John Sinclair
- 1754 Foundation of Select Society
- 1755 Hutcheson's *A System of Moral Philosophy*
- 1757 Hume's *The Natural History of Religion*
- 1758 Founding of the Aberdeen Philosophical Society, the 'Wise Club'

- 1759 Adam Smith's *The Theory of Moral Sentiments*
 William Robertson's *History of Scotland*
- 1759–96 Robert Burns
- 1761 John Millar appointed Professor of Civil Law at Glasgow
 Jean-Jacques Rousseau's *Du Contrat social*
- 1762 George Campbell's *Dissertation on Miracles*
 Hugh Blair appointed first Regius Professor of Rhetoric
 and Belles Lettres at Edinburgh
- 1764 Thomas Reid's *Inquiry into the Human Mind on the
 Principles of Common Sense*
 Reid appointed Professor of Moral Philosophy at Glasgow
 Adam Ferguson appointed Professor of Pneumatics and
 Moral Philosophy at Edinburgh
- 1767 Adam Ferguson's *An Essay on the History of Civil
 Society*
 Sir James Steuart's *Principles of Political Oeconomy*
- 1768–71 First edition of *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, edited by
 William Smellie
- 1771 John Millar's *The Origin of the Distinction of Ranks*
 (republished with extensive revision in 1779)
- 1771–1832 Sir Walter Scott
- 1773 *An Institute of the Law of Scotland* by John Erskine of
 Carnock
- 1774 Lord Kames's *Sketches of the History of Man*
- 1776 Adam Smith's *The Wealth of Nations*
 George Campbell's *Philosophy of Rhetoric*
 American Declaration of Independence
- 1779 Hume's *Dialogues Concerning Natural Religion*
- 1780 James Dunbar's *Essays on the History of Mankind*
- 1781 Immanuel Kant's *Critique of Pure Reason*
- 1783 Founding of the Royal Society of Edinburgh
- 1785 Reid's *Essays on the Intellectual Powers of Man*
 Dugald Stewart appointed Professor of Moral Philosophy
 at Edinburgh

xvi CHRONOLOGY

- 1787 The 'Kilmarnock' edition of Robert Burns
- 1788 Reid's *Essays on the Active Powers of the Human Mind*
Immanuel Kant's *Critique of Practical Reason*
- 1789 French Revolution
- 1790 William Smellie's *Philosophy of Natural History*, vols. 1
and 2, 1799
- 1791–99 John Sinclair's *Statistical Account of Scotland*
- 1792 Adam Ferguson's *Principles of Moral and Political
Science*
- 1795 James Hutton's *Theory of the Earth with Proofs and
Illustrations*
Adam Smith's *Essays on Philosophical Subjects*