GLOBAL FOOD VALUE CHAINS AND COMPETITION LAW

The food industry is a notoriously complex economic sector that has not received the attention it deserves within legal scholarship. Production and distribution of food are complex because of their polycentric character (as producers and distributors operate at the intersection of different public policies) and their dynamic evolution and transformation in the last few decades (from technological and governance perspectives). This volume introduces the global value chain approach as a useful way to analyse competition law and applies it to the operations of food chains and the challenges of their regulation. Together, the chapters not only provide a comprehensive mapping of a vast comparative field, but also shed light on the intricacies of the various policies and legal fields in operation. The book offers a conceptual and theoretical framework for competition authorities, companies and academics, and fills a massive gap in the competition policy literature dealing with global value chains and food.

IOANNIS LIANOS is President of the Hellenic Competition Commission and Professor of Global Competition Law and Policy at the Faculty of Laws, University College London (UCL).

ALEXEY IVANOV is Director of the BRICS Competition Law and Policy Center and the HSE–Skolkovo Institute for Law and Development, and Associate Professor at the Faculty of Law, National Research University Higher School of Economics (NRU HSE).

DENNIS DAVIS, Judge at the High Court of South Africa, served as judge president of the Competition Appeal Court of South Africa for 20 years. He is also an honorary professor in the Department of Commercial Law at the University of Cape Town.
GLOBAL COMPETITION LAW AND ECONOMICS POLICY

This series publishes monographs highlighting the interdisciplinary and multijurisdictional nature of competition law, economics, and policy. Global in coverage, the series should appeal to competition and antitrust specialists working as scholars, practitioners, and judges.

GENERAL EDITORS:

Ioannis Lianos, University College London
Thomas Cheng, University of Hong Kong
Simon Roberts, University of Johannesburg
Maarten Pieter Schinkel, University of Amsterdam
Maurice Stucke, University of Tennessee
Global Food Value Chains and Competition Law

Edited by

IOANNIS LIANOS
Faculty of Laws, University College London

ALEXEY IVANOV
Skolkovo-HSE Institute for Law and Development

DENNIS DAVIS
University of Cape Town School of Law
Contents

List of Authors  page xv

1. Global Food Value Chains: A Conceptual Guide 1

2. Rents, Power and Governance in Global Value Chains 29
   I. Introduction 29
   II. Power, Rent Generation and Rent Appropriation in GVCs 31
   III. Changing Context in the Global Governance of GVCs 34
   IV. The Role of Four Key Stakeholders in the Governance of GVCs 35
      A. The Firm and the Exercise of Governance over GVCs 36
      B. Civil Society and the Exercise of Governance over GVCs 38
      C. The Nation State and the Exercise of Governance over GVCs 39
      D. Supra-National Institutions and the Exercise of Governance over GVCs 41
   V. In Reality, Who Governs GVCs? Three Case Studies 43
      A. The Governance of Product Safety Product Standards in Food GVCs 44
      B. Taxation and the Governance of Rent Appropriation in GVCs 45
      C. Competition law and the Governance of Market Power Rents in GVCs 48
   VI. Conclusions: Who Governs GVCs – A Tentative General Argument 51

3. The Financialization of Land and Agriculture: Mechanisms, Implications and Responses 55
   I. Introduction 55
   II. Financialization of the Food Chain: A Move beyond Speculation 58
   III. The Financialization of Land and Agriculture: Actors, Trends and Drivers 60

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment  www.cambridge.org
IV. Local and Chain-Based Responses against a Transnational Phenomenon

V. Conclusion: Take Finance Seriously and De-Commodify Its Rhetoric

4. Agriculture, End to End

I. Introduction: No Farm Is an Island

II. The Yeoman’s Tale

III. End-to-End Intelligence in Agricultural Supply Chains

A. Ecosystem Services

B. The ‘End-to-End’ Principle

IV. The Treadmill of the Gods

A. Menschendämmerung: Humanity’s Twilight

B. The Seeds of Discontent

C. Peak Glyphosate

D. Transcending the Transgene

V. Signal, Sound and Fury

VI. Agriculture End-to-End and the End of Agrarian Independence

5. New Forms of Financing the Agricultural Sector in Brazil: The Experience of the Soybean Chain

I. Introduction

II. Structural Change in Brazilian Agriculture

A. The Effects of the Brazilian crisis of the 1980s on Rural Credit

B. Consolidation of Brazilian Export-Oriented Soybean Agriculture

III. New Organisational Forms of Brazilian Soybean Chains

IV. Conclusions

6. Economic Concentration and the Food Value Chain: Legal and Economic Perspectives

I. Introduction: The Changing Landscape of the Industry

II. Economic Consolidation Through Merger Activity

III. Economic Concentration and Impact on Prices and Innovation

A. Seeds and Traits

B. Crop Protection

C. Fertilisers

D. Agricultural Machinery

E. Animal Genetic Improvement

F. Food Manufacturing/Processing

G. Retail
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IV. ‘Economic Concentration’ and ‘Consumer Welfare’</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narrowly Defined</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Economic Concentration and Public Policy Concerns</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Conclusions</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The State of American Competition Law with Respect to the Food Chain</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The Dispersed Institutional Structure</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Input Market Issues</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Merger Policy</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Anticompetitive Conduct in Input Markets</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Output Market Issues</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Merger Enforcement</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Limiting the Utility of the Packers and Stockyards Act (‘PSA’)</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to Protect Livestock and Poultry Growers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Farm Cooperatives’ Competitive Conduct</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Other Conduct Issues-Information Sharing</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. The Continuing Issues</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. The Brazilian Food Value Chain and Competition Policy: An Overview of CADE’s Role – Centrality and Inadequacy</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction – The Recent Round of Mergers in the Food Value Chain and the Brazilian Institutional Apparatus</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. CADE: Moving towards International Best Practices, but Far From Protecting Brazilian Interests</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. CADE and the Food Value Chain: The Centrality of the Competition Authority in Shaping Seed-Biotechnology and Fertilizer Markets</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Food Production and Global Value Chains</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. CADE and the Shaping of Food Value Chain Markets in Brazil: Seed-Biotechnology and Fertilizers</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Seed-Biotechnology under the Scrutiny of CADE</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Fertilizers under the Scrutiny of CADE</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. A Body with Centrality in the Food Value Chain, but with No Appropriate Institutional or Cognitive Qualities</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Institutional Challenges of the Food Value Chain to Brazilian Development</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Internal Challenges: Land and Water Concentration and the Production of Economic Complexity</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. External Challenges: The Protectionist US State and the Chinese Entrepreneurial State</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Conclusion</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

9. Competition Concerns in Fertilizer Import-Dependent Countries like India and China: Analysing the Agrium-PotashCorp Merger 209
   I. Introduction 209
   II. Recent History of the Potash Industry and Present Market Outlook 211
   III. The Agrium-Potash Merger: Competition Concerns in China and India 212
      A. Merger Review by MOFCOM and CCI 213
         1. Concentration and Enhancement of Control over the Global Potassium Chloride (KCl) Market 213
         2. Impact on Price Negotiations 214
         3. Order and Conditions 214
      B. Remaining Concerns 215
         1. The Limitations of National Competition Laws to Tackle Export Cartels 215
         2. Rising Concentration in Potash: Indications of a Possible Throwback to the Period of Dominant Export Cartels 218
   IV. The Path Ahead 220

10. Russian Competition Policy Over Value Chains in Agricultural and Food Sectors 223
    I. Introduction 223
    II. Value Chain Governance Considerations in Russian Competition Policy 225
    III. Russian Agricultural and Food Sectors as a Target for Protection and Competition Policy 227
    IV. Enforcement of Competition Law in the Agricultural and Food Sectors: Between Markets and Value Chains 230
    V. Price Remedies on Fertilisers 233
    VI. Trade Law: The Protection of Food Suppliers Vis-à-Vis Grocery Shops 235
    VII. Conclusions 237

11 The Pioneer/Pannar Merger, the Maize Seed Value Chain and Globalisation 240
    I. Introduction 240
    II. Background to Maize Seed Sector 241
    III. The Pioneer/Pannar Merger 245
       A. Introduction 245
       B. The Parties’ Narratives 246
       C. The Institutions of Decision Making 248
          1. The Tribunal 248
          2. The Competition Appeal Court (‘CAC’) 252
    IV. Conclusion 254
   I. Introduction  256
   II. Different Dimensions of Bargaining Power in Competition Law  262
      A. Superior Bargaining Power, Relative Dominant Position and Economic Dependence: Variations on a Theme?  262
      B. Important Challenges  265
         1. Challenges of Measuring Bargaining Power  265
         2. Purchasing Co-operation Agreements and Superior Bargaining Power  270
         3. Abuse of Economic Dependence Provisions  272
         4. Mergers and Effects-Based Analyses Integrating Superior Bargaining Power Generated Unilateral Effects  278
   III. Superior Bargaining Power Outside the (Normal) Competition Law Toolkit  281
      A. Resolving Issues Concerning Superior Bargaining Power through Legislation  281
      B. Opening the Floodgates? Unfair Commercial Practices Resulting from the Competition Law Issue of Superior Bargaining Power  287
      C. Status-Based Protections of Specific Groups from Superior Bargaining Power  293
      D. Dynamic Status-Based Protection Framework in the Food Value Chain  298
   IV. Need for an Overall Theoretical Framework: Concept of Vertical Power  301
      A. Resource Dependence Power: From Neoclassical Market Power to Exclusionary Power  302
      B. Positional Power in a Network  304
      C. Value Chain Level Metric of Vertical Power  307
            a. Detergent Supply Chain  310
            b. Feta Cheese  311
   V. Conclusion  312

13. Efficiency and Fairness: Interdependent Discourses in Supermarket-Supplier Relations  315
   I. The Efficiency Discourse in Supermarket-Supplier Relations  319
   II. The Fairness Discourse in Supermarket-Supplier Relations  323
   III. The Politics in Supermarket-Supplier Relations  329
   IV. Broader Reflections  331
14. China’s Legal Regulation of the Abuse of Market Power by Large Retailers

   I. Introduction: Overview of China’s Large Retailers and Their Market Behavior

   II. The Status of, and Problems in, China’s Legal Regulation Concerning the Abuse of Market Power by Large Retailers

       A. Definitions for Retailer and Supplier
       B. Type of Behaviors Subject to Regulation
       C. Law Enforcement Agencies
       D. Liabilities
       E. Issues

   III. Cases Concerning China’s Legal Regulation of the Abuse of Market Power by Large Retailers

   IV. Recommendations for the Improvement of China’s Legal Regulation of the Abuse of Market Power by Large Retailers

15. Superior Bargaining Power in Russian Contract and Competition Law

   I. Introduction

   II. Superior Bargaining Power in Contract Law

       A. Ruling No. 16 and Article 428
       B. Article 428, Sub-Paragraph 1
       C. Article 428, Sub-Paragraph 2
       D. Article 428, Sub-Paragraph 3

   E. Conclusions: Superior Bargaining Power in Russian Contract Law

   III. Superior Bargaining Power under Russian Competition Law

   IV. Federal Law on Trading Activities: New Instrument to Deal with Superior Bargaining Power

       A. Category 1: ‘Forced Purchase’
       B. Category 2: ‘Forced Provision of Benefits’
       C. Category 3: ‘Imposition of Disadvantages’

   D. Federal Law on Trading Activities

   V. Conclusion


   II. Buying Power, Unfair Trading Practices, and Competition Law: In Search of a Market Failure

   III. EU Competition Law and ‘Other’ Laws at the National Level: A Difficult Relationship
### Contents

IV. Correcting the Market: Prohibited Practices and Minimum Standards of Fairness in the EU Agri-Food Supply Chain 384

V. Correcting the Market: From Subsidies to Competition Law Exemptions 389

VI. Conclusion: Market-Making and Market-Correcting Go Together 394

17. Food Chain Certification and the Social Pluralism of Competition Law 397
   I. Introduction 397
   II. Governance Structures and Blind Spots of Food Value Chains 400
      A. Upholding Complexity: Contract Governance Meets Standard-Setting 401
      B. The Hybrid Role of Standards: Consolidating the Social Autonomy of the Food Chain 404
   III. Certification as Polycontextural Governance 405
      A. Institutional Design of Certification and Accreditation 407
      B. The Politics and Economics of Certification 407
   IV. Competition Law Challenges of Third-Party Certification 409
      A. Holistic Competition Law: Intra-/Inter-Regime Collisions 410
      B. Non-welfarist Rationalities under EU Competition Law 413
         1. Assessing Sustainable Food Labelling under Article 101 TFEU: Product and Discourse Differentiation 413
         2. Unbundling the ‘Private’ in ‘Private Sustainability Governance’ 417
   V. Conclusion 418

18. Hunger Games: Connecting the Right to Food and Competition Law 420
   I. Introduction 420
   II. Understanding the ‘Right to Food’ 431
      A. The Conceptual Framework of the Right to Food 431
      B. The Nature of the Obligations on States to Fulfil the RTF 433
      C. The Enforceability and Justiciability of the RTF 440
   III. Global Food Value Chains from the Perspective of “Interessenjurisprudenz” 445
      A. Understanding the Global Food Value Chain 445
      B. Taking into Account Various Rights and Entitlements 446
         1. Promoting Intellectual Property Rights (‘IPRs’) 446
         2. Preserving Biodiversity and Conserving the Environment for Future Generations 447
         3. Achieving Economic Efficiency and Inclusive Growth 448
IV. Competition Law and the RTF
A. The Conceptual Dimension of a Competition Law Response to RTF
1. The Basic Premise of Competition Law: The Effects of Market Power on Prices and Output
2. Gaps in the Conceptual Toolkit of Competition Law as an Instrument Implementing the RTF: A Practical Example
B. Re-orienting the Focus of Competition Law While Staying within the Mainstream Framework
1. Greater Focus on the Exercise of Buyer Power
2. Extra-Territorial Reach of Competition Law
C. Going Beyond Filling the Gaps: The Recommendations of the UN Special Rapporteur on the RTF for Competition Law
V. Resolving Substantive Conflicts between Competition and RTF Regimes
A. The ‘Spheres’ of RTF and Competition Law: Separate or Integrated?
B. The International Trade-Right to Health Debate: An Illustration of What Is Possible and Implications for the Interaction between the Right to Food and Competition Law
1. The Nexus Between the WTO TRIPS Regime and International Human Rights
2. Zooming in on the TRIPS Agreement: From the Right to Public Health to the Right to Health
3. The Role of Competition Law in Progressively Realising the Right to Health
4. Lessons for the Implementation of the Right to Food
VI. Conclusion
19. Agribiotech Patents in the Food Supply Chain: A US Perspective
I. Introduction
II. The Evolution of Transgenic Seed Protection
III. Patent Exhaustion
A. Intent
B. Post-sale Restrictions
C. International Exhaustion
D. Sales and Licenses
E. Patent Misuse and Antitrust
IV. Trends
V. Conclusion
Contents

   I. Introduction 504
   II. Review of the Economic Literature 506
      A. Competition Policy and Innovation 506
      B. Innovation and Market Structure 508
      C. Innovation and Mergers 514
         1. Moving from Market Structure to Merger 514
         2. Formal Modelling of Merger and Innovation: First Steps 516
         3. The Impact of the Conditions of Merger 520
         4. Ambiguous Results of Empirical Works concerning the Relationship between Mergers and Innovation 521
         5. Determining Points of Concern for Competition Policy: Markets 523
      D. Key Principles Underlying Approaching the Relationship between Mergers and Innovation 524
   III. Main Economic Effects and a Proposed Typology 526
      A. Static Effects 527
      B. Dynamic Effects: Product Markets 529
         1. Mergers without Price Effects 530
            a. Scenario 1: Independent R&D Programmes and No Sharing of Results 530
            b. Scenario 2: Independent R&D Programmes and the Sharing of Results 531
            c. Scenario 3: Integrated R&D Programmes 532
         2. Price Effects 533
      C. Efficiencies 534
         1. Economies of Scale and Complementarities in Innovation Markets 534
         2. Legal Uncertainty and Patent Thickets 535
      D. Horizontal Effects on Innovation Markets 535
      E. Vertical Effects 536
         1. Foreclosure in Innovation Markets 536
         2. Sequential Innovation 536
      F. Linking Effects to Market Structure 537
   IV. Competition Policy Algorithm 542
   V. The Genetically Modified Crops and Seed Industries: Main Features and Past Mergers 543
      A. Product and Industry Characteristics 543
      B. Mergers and the Direction of Innovation 544
      C. Past Mergers 545
      D. Vertical Dimensions 546
      E. BRICS: Special Concerns 548
VI. Empirical Discussion 550
   A. Using Patent Data to Assess Innovation: Methodology and Limitations 550
   B. The Data 551
      1. US Patents 552
      2. ESPACENET 553
         a. The Data 553
         b. Some Preliminary Observations 563
   C. Preliminary Evaluation of Certain Major Mergers 576
VII. Conclusion 578
Appendix 20 A Formal Analysis of the Innovation Effects of a Merger 580
Appendix 20 B Mergers 586

21. The Global Grain Trade: From a Ferrymen Oligopoly to the Sustainable Bridge Solution 590
   I. Introduction 590
   II. The Market Power of Global Ferrymen 594
   III. Financialisation as a Driver for the Accumulation of Market Power 597
   IV. Issue of Concentration 602
   V. Bridging the Gap: Bringing Sustainability to the Global Grain Trade 612
   VI. Conclusion 625

Index 627
List of Authors

Svetlana Avdasheva: Professor of Economics, Higher School of Economics (HSE)
Maksim Baskhatov: Research Director of the International and Comparative Law Research Center, Lecturer at the Civil Law Department of the Moscow State University
Caron Beaton-Wells: Deputy Dean at the Melbourne Business School and a Professorial Fellow at the Melbourne Law School
Bruno Carballa Smichowski: Researcher at the Joint Research Centre of the European Commission
Peter C. Carstensen: Professor of Law Emeritus, University of Wisconsin Law School
James Ming Chen: Justin Smith Morrill Chair in Law, Professor of Law, Michigan State University
Amber Darr: Lecturer in Law, Coventry University; Senior Research Fellow at the Center for Law, Economics & Society (CLES)
Viktoria Daskalova: Assistant Professor of Law, University of Twente
Dennis Davis: Judge of the High Court of South Africa and Judge President of the Competition Appeal Court of South Africa; Professor at the University of Cape Town
Ekaterina V. Galkova: Lecturer, Kutafin Moscow State Law University (MSLA)
Klaas Hendrik Eller: Assistant Professor of European Private Law at the Amsterdam Center for Transformative Private Law (ACT), University of Amsterdam
Tomaso Ferrando: Research Professor, Faculty of Law (Law and Development Research Group) and Institute of Development Policy (IOB), University of Antwerp
Parveer Singh Ghuman: Consumer Unity & Trust Society (CUTS) International
List of Authors

Alexey Ivanov: Director, BRICS Competition Law and Policy Centre, Higher School of Economics (HSE)

Dmitry Katalevsky: Associate Professor, Institute of Business Studies, the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration

Raphael Kaplinksy: Honorary Professor at the Science Policy Research Unit (SPRU), University of Sussex; Emeritus Professor at the Institute of Development Studies and at the Open University

Rodrigo Lanna F. da Silveira: Professor of Economics, UNICAMP (University of Campinas), Brazil

Ioannis Lianos: President, Hellenic Competition Commission; Professor of Global Competition Law and Public Policy, UCL Faculty of Laws

Daryl Lim: Professor of Law and the Director of the Center for Intellectual Property (IP), Information & Privacy Law at the University of Illinois Chicago

Justin Lindeboom: Assistant Professor of European Law, University of Groningen

Claudio Lombardi: Assistant Professor, KIMEP University and Director of the Eurasian Centre for Law, Innovation, and Development

Maxim Markin: Lecturer, Faculty of Social Sciences, School of Sociology, Higher School of Economics (HSE)

Liberty Mncube: Associate Professor of Economics at the School of Economics and Finance of the University at the Witwatersrand; Managing Director at FTI Consulting

Alessandro Octaviani: Professor of Economic Law, University of Sao Paulo

Ujjwal Kumar: Policy Analyst, CUTS International

Mike Morris: Professor, University of Cape Town, Faculty of Commerce, School of Economics, PRISM (Policy Research in International Services and Manufacturing

Pierre Régibeau: Chief Competition Economist of DG Competition, European Commission

Ekaterina Perevoshchikova: Research fellow, Centre for Law, Economics & Society, UCL Faculty of Laws

Katharine E. Rockett: Professor, Department of Economics, University of Essex

Beatriz Saes: Researcher, University of Sao Paulo

Sylvia Saes: Professor, Centre for Organisational Studies, School of Economics, Business and Accounting, University of Sao Paulo

Jo Paul-Taylor: Research Fellow, Melbourne Law School, The University of Melbourne

Wang Xianlin: Professor of Shanghai Jiao Tong University (SJTU); Director of Center for Competition Law and Policy of SJTU