While challenges to authority are generally perceived as destructive to legal order, this original collection of essays, with Magna Carta at its heart, questions this assumption. In a series of chapters concerned with different forms of challenges to legal authority – over time, geographical place, and subject matters both public and private – this volume demonstrates that challenges to authority which seek the recognition of rights actually change the existing legal order rather than destroy it. The chapters further explore how the myth of Magna Carta emerged and its role in the pre-modern world, how challenges to authority formed the basis of the recognition of rights in particular areas within England, and how challenges to authority resulted in the recognition of particular rights in the United States, Canada, Australia, and Germany. This is a uniquely insightful thematic collection which proposes a new view into the processes of legal change.

Catharine Macmillan is Professor of Private Law at the Dickson Poon School of Law, King’s College London.

Charlotte Smith is Associate Professor in Law at the University of Reading.
CHALLENGES TO AUTHORITY AND THE RECOGNITION OF RIGHTS

From Magna Carta to Modernity

Edited by

CATHARINE MACMILLAN
King’s College London

CHARLOTTE SMITH
University of Reading
For Margaret, Henry, Florence and Jack

The Editors would like to thank the contributors for their chapters and the delegates to the British Legal History Conference held at the University of Reading for their enthusiasm. The Editors are grateful to Margaret Polk for her extensive editing efforts.
CONTENTS

List of Contributors   page ix

Introduction   1
CATHARINE MACMILLAN

PART I Magna Carta, Challenges to Authority and the Recognition of Rights in England   17

1 Magna Carta: The Emergence of the Myth   19
SIR JOHN BAKER

2 From Magna Carta to the Abridgements: The Naturalization of Benefit of Clergy   37
MARGARET MCGLYNN

3 How to Get Rid of a King: Lawyering the Revolution of 1399   55
DAVID J. SEIPP

4 Illuminating Magna Carta: Images of Law and Authority in Medieval Statute Books   70
ANTHONY MUSSON

5 Revolution Principles and the Revolution Bench   97
MIKE MACNAIR

PART II Broader Challenges to Authority and the Recognition of Rights in England   117

6 Magna Carta Chapters 4 and 5 and the Origins of Accountability   119
JOSHUA GETZLER

vii
CONTENTS

7 Some Effects of War on the Law in Late Eighteenth- and Early Nineteenth-Century England 142
JAMES OLDHAM

8 The Impact of Tax on the Landscape: Social Expectations and the Built Environment in Nineteenth-Century England 176
CHANTAL STEBBINGS

PART III Magna Carta, Challenges to Authority and the Recognition (and Rejection) of Rights beyond England 203

9 Magna Carta in the German Discourse about English Constitutional Law between the Eighteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries 205
ANDREAS THIER

10 Magna Carta for the World? The Constitutional Protection of Foreign Merchants in the Age of Revolution 223
DANIEL HULSEBOSCH

PATRICIA HAGLER MINTER

12 The Royal Proclamation of 1763 in British Columbia: An Indigenous Magna Carta’s Chequered Canadian Career 269
HAMAR FOSTER

13 Rights and Power in Nineteenth-Century India: Exploring an Unstable Relationship 296
RAYMOND COCKS

14 When ‘Magna Carta Was Suspended’: National Security and the Challenge to Freedom of Speech in Australia, 1914–1919 321
DIANE KIRKBY

Index 344
CONTRIBUTORS

Sir John Baker, University of Cambridge
Raymond Cocks, Keele University
Hamar Foster, University of Victoria
Joshua Getzler, Oxford University
Daniel Hulsebosch, New York University
Diane Kirkby, University of Technology Sydney and La Trobe University
Catharine MacMillan, King’s College London
Mike Macnair, Oxford University
Margaret McGlynn, University of Western Ontario
Patricia Hagler Minter, Western Kentucky University
Anthony Musson, Historic Royal Palaces
James Oldham, Georgetown University
David J. Seipp, Boston University
Chantal Stebbings, University of Exeter
Andreas Thier, University of Zurich