

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42868-2 — Patents on Life
Edited by Thomas C. Berg, Roman Cholij, Simon Ravenscroft
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

PATENTS ON LIFE

This volume brings a unique collection of legal, religious, ethical, and political perspectives to bear on debates concerning biotechnology patents, or ‘patents on life’. The ever-increasing importance of biotechnologies has generated continual questions about how intellectual property law should treat such technologies, especially those raising ethical or social-justice concerns. Even after many years and court decisions, important contested issues remain concerning ownership of and rewards from biotechnology – from human genetic material to genetically engineered plants – and regarding the scope of moral or social-justice limitations on patents or licensing practices. This book explores a range of related issues, including questions concerning morality and patentability, biotechnology and human dignity, and what constitutes fair rewards from genetic resources. It features high-level international, interfaith, and cross-disciplinary contributions from experts in law, religion, and ethics, including academics and practitioners, placing religious and secular perspectives into dialogue to examine the full implications of patenting life.

Thomas C. Berg is James L. Oberstar Professor of Law and Public Policy at the University of St. Thomas School of Law. He is a leading scholar of Church–State relations and a leader in exploring the intersection of intellectual property, religion, and social ethics.

Roman Cholij is Research Associate at the Von Hügel Institute for Critical Catholic Inquiry, St Edmund’s College, University of Cambridge and a Chartered Trade Mark Attorney. He has written two books, several book chapters, and numerous articles on various aspects of law and of theology.

Simon Ravenscroft is the Arts Outreach Fellow at Magdalene College, and a Research Associate of the Von Hügel Institute for Critical Catholic Inquiry at St Edmund’s College, University of Cambridge. He has published on a range of topics across the fields of theology, philosophy, and social theory.

Patents on Life

RELIGIOUS, MORAL, AND SOCIAL JUSTICE ASPECTS OF
BIOTECHNOLOGY AND INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY

Edited by

THOMAS C. BERG

University of St. Thomas (Minnesota) School of Law

ROMAN CHOLIJ

St. Edmund's College, University of Cambridge

SIMON RAVENSCROFT

Magdalene College, University of Cambridge



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42868-2 — Patents on Life
Edited by Thomas C. Berg, Roman Cholij, Simon Ravenscroft
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108428682

DOI: 10.1017/9781108659802

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-42868-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>Prefatory Note and Acknowledgements</i>	xi
OPENING	1
1 An Introduction to Religious and Political Discourse on Life Patents	3
Roman Cholij	
I LIFE PATENTS, LAW, AND MORALITY	23
2 Morality, Religion, and Patents	25
Kathleen Liddell and Simon Ravenscroft	
3 Religious and Moral Grounds for Patent-Eligible Subject Matter Exclusions	38
Joshua D. Sarnoff	
4 Life-Form Patents: Proceedings in the European Patent Office and the Role of Non-commercial Parties	59
Christopher Rennie-Smith	
II RELIGIOUS PERSPECTIVES ON LIFE PATENTS	83
5 Intellectual Property Rights and the Fundamental Right to the Commons in the Light of Catholic Social Teaching	85
Monsignor Osvaldo Neves de Almeida	

6	Human Rights and Life Patents: Lessons from the Church's Social Teaching and Engagement in the United States Stephen M. Colecchi	100
7	Intellectual Property and Genetic Sequences: A Jewish Law Perspective Michael J. Broyde and Steven S. Weiner	113
8	Intellectual Property, Islamic Values, and the Patenting of Genes Mohammed El Said	133
9	Christian Libertarianism and the Curious Lack of Religious Objections to the Patenting of Life Forms in the United States Paul J. Heald	152
10	From <i>Chakrabarty</i> to <i>Myriad</i> and Beyond: Catholic Contributions to the Gene Patenting Debate Paul J. Wojda	165
	III SOCIAL JUSTICE AND POLITICAL ASPECTS	185
11	"Thou Shalt Not Steal": The Morality of Compulsory Licensing of Pharmaceutical Patents Margo A. Bagley	187
12	Genetic Resources and Patents: In Search of Ethical Solutions to Global IP Discord Roman Cholij	209
13	Patents for Life: Toward an Ethical Use of Patents on Plant Innovations Michael A. Kock	227
14	Germline Modification of Human Embryos, Patents and the Limits of Markets: Rethinking Equality, Human Diversity and the Question of Innovation Funding Katerina Sideri	240

Contents

vii

15	Patent Governance, Ethics and Democracy: How Transparency and Accountability Norms Are Challenged by Patents on Stem Cells, Gametes and Genome Editing (CRISPR) in Europe Ingrid Schneider	263
	CLOSING	289
16	Life Patents, Religion, and Justice: A Summary of Themes Thomas C. Berg	291
	<i>Index</i>	307

Contributors

Margo A. Bagley is Asa Griggs Candler Professor of Law, Emory University School of Law, and Hardy Cross Dillard Professor of Law, University of Virginia School of Law. Among her recent publications is the chapter ‘Towering Wave or Tempest in a Teapot? Synthetic Biology, Access & Benefit Sharing, and Economic Development’, in Susy Frankel and Daniel Gervais, eds., *Intellectual Property on the Internet and the Connection with Human and Economic Development* (Victoria University Press, 2017).

Thomas C. Berg is James Oberstar Professor of Law and Public Policy, University of St. Thomas School of Law (Minnesota). He is the author of, among other works, ‘Intellectual Property and the Preferential Option for the Poor’, *Journal of Catholic Social Thought* 5 (Winter 2008): 193–233.

Michael J. Broyde is Professor of Law at Emory University and Projects Director of its Center for the Study of Law and Religion. He and Steven Weiner have been studying and writing on matters of Jewish law together for forty years; their most recent article together was ‘Understanding Rights in Context: Freedom of Contract or Freedom from Contract?’, *Journal of the Beth Din of America* 1 (Spring 2012): 48–65.

Roman Cholij is a Research Associate of the Von Hügel Institute for Critical Catholic Inquiry at St Edmund’s College, University of Cambridge, and a chartered trade mark attorney. Among his publications in the fields of theology and law is ‘IP in Christian Law’, *Intellectual Property Quarterly* 3 (2012): 137–148.

Stephen M. Colecchi, D.Min., served as the Director of the Office of International Justice and Peace of the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops from 2004 to 2018. Among his various publications, he is author of the book *In the Footsteps of Jesus: Resource Manual on Catholic Social Teaching* (United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, 2005).

Paul J. Heald is the Richard W. and Marie L. Corman Research Professor at the University of Illinois. His other publications on patenting life forms include ‘Veggie Tales: Pernicious Myths about Patents, Innovation, and Crop Diversity

in the Twentieth Century’, *Illinois Law Review* (2012): 1051–1102 (with Susannah Chapman).

Michael A. Kock is founder of *dr. kock consulting*, an IP and strategy consulting service, and was from 2007 to 2017 Head of Intellectual Property for Syngenta Crop Protection AG. His recent publications on plant IP issues include (with Floris Ten Have), ‘The “International Licensing Platform – Vegetables”: A Prototype of a Patent Clearing House in the Life Science Industry’, *Journal of Intellectual Property Law and Practice* (2016).

Kathleen Liddell is the Herschel Smith Lecturer of Intellectual Property Law and Director of the Centre for Law, Medicine and Life Sciences at the University of Cambridge. She is the author of *The Limits of Consent* (Oxford University Press, 2009).

Monsignor Osvaldo Neves de Almeida, an expert in international public law, was an official of the Secretariat of State of the Holy See, with wide-ranging responsibilities from 1992 until his retirement in 2017. He is currently based in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, where he continues to be an advisor to the Secretariat of State. He is a priest of the Prelature of Opus Dei.

Simon Ravenscroft is the Arts Outreach Fellow at Magdalene College and a Research Associate of the Von Hügel Institute for Critical Catholic Inquiry at St Edmund’s College, University of Cambridge. His publications include ‘Charité, amour et don dans l’oeuvre d’Ivan Illich’, in *Ivan Illich, l’alchimiste des possibles*, Martin Fortier and Thierry Paquot, eds. (Lemieux Editeur, 2016): 165–211.

Christopher Rennie-Smith is a European patent consultant, and former chairman of a Board of Appeal and member of the Enlarged Board of Appeal at the European Patent Office.

Mohammed El Said, PhD, is Professor in International Trade and Intellectual Property Law, Lancashire Law School, University of Central Lancashire. His recent publications include ‘TRIPS-Plus, Public Health and Performance-Based Rewards Schemes Options and Supplements for Policy Formation in Developing and Least Developed Countries’, *American University International Law Review* 31 (2016): 373–444.

Joshua D. Sarnoff is a professor of law at DePaul University College of Law and a faculty member in and former director of the Center for Intellectual Property Law and Information Technology (CIPLIT). He is the author of, among other works, ‘Patent Eligible Inventions after *Bilski*: History and Theory’, *Hastings Law Journal* 63 (December 2011): 53–125.

Ingrid Schneider is Professor of Political Science in the Centre for Ethics in Information Technologies at the Department of Informatics, and in the Centre for Bio-Governance, at the Universität Hamburg, Germany. Her most recent publication is *The Politics of Big Data: Big Data – Big Brother?*, edited with Ann Rudinow Saetnan and Nicola Green (Routledge, 2018).

Katerina Sideri is Marie Curie Individual Fellow based at the University of Ghent. Her most recent book is *Bioproperty, Biomedicine and Deliberative Governance: Patents as Discourse on Life* (Routledge, 2014).

Steven S. Weiner is Deputy General Counsel, Intellectual Property for SRI International, an independent not-for-profit research institute, and a part-time lecturer at the University of Pennsylvania's Wharton School. He and Michael Broyde have been studying and writing on matters of Jewish law together for forty years; their most recent article together was 'Understanding Rights in Context: Freedom of Contract or Freedom from Contract?', *Journal of the Beth Din of America* 1 (Spring 2012): 48–65.

Paul J. Wojda is Associate Professor of Theology, University of St. Thomas (Minnesota), and author of, among other things, 'Adoration, Veneration, Plastination: Theo-Liturgical Reflections', in T. Christine Jespersen, Alicita Rodriquez, and Joseph Starr, eds., *The Anatomy of Body Worlds: Critical Essays on the Plastinated Cadavers of Gunther von Hagens* (McFarland & Company, 2009): 211–27.

Prefatory Note and Acknowledgements

The information in this book is generally current through early 2019, except for short discussions of selected subsequent developments at the conclusions of Chapter 1 and Chapter 16.

* * *

The editors collectively wish to thank the institutions that sponsored or funded this book project and the Patents on Life conference (Cambridge, November 2015) that gave birth to it:

- The Von Hügel Institute for Critical Catholic Inquiry (VHI), at St Edmund's College, Cambridge, and especially John Loughlin, Philip McCosker, Lidia Ripamonti, and Alban McCoy, for hosting the conference and supporting the project in numerous other ways.
- The Terrence J. Murphy Institute for Catholic Thought, Law, and Public Policy at the University of St. Thomas, and especially Elizabeth Schiltz, Seanne Harris, and William Junker, for generous financial and logistical support.
- Porticus UK, with special thanks to Jane Leek, who made Porticus's funding possible.

Thomas Berg adds his thanks to Roman and Simon; to his St. Thomas Law colleagues Megan McNevin, research librarian, and Henry Bishop, administrative assistant, for manuscript preparation; to Deans Robert Vischer and Joel Nichols for institutional support; to Audrey Chapman, Ruth Okediji, David Opperbeck, and Frank Pasquale, who provided inspiration for several of the ideas in the project; to St. Thomas law students Gina Bugliosi, Nick Davis, and Thomas Wheeler, for research assistance; and to his wife, Maureen Kane Berg, for her many varieties of support.

Roman Cholij would like to thank in particular Professor John Loughlin, former director of the VHI, for his support, encouragement, and good judgement that led to the success of the Patents on Life conference. To the speakers and contributors of the conference and, of course, to all the authors of this work, a special debt is owed for sharing the fruits of their research, knowledge, and wisdom. Special thanks also to

his colleague Simon Ravenscroft, for his excellent professionalism and dedication to the VHI Patents on Life project from its earliest days; and finally, but not least, to his wife, Louise, for her contributions to the patents conference and constant support throughout the project.

For their vision and good humour, Simon Ravenscroft would like to thank Tom and Roman; for the Murphy Research Fellowship that funded his involvement in a good chunk of this project, personal thanks to the Terrence J. Murphy Institute; and for conviviality, collegiality, and other more profound forms of support during the period in which this book was compiled, he is grateful to James Pearson; Christian Coppa; Ragnar Misje Bergem; Deborah, Massimo, Luca, and Isabella Di Martino; his parents, Tim and Karen Ravenscroft; and above all to Ruth Jackson.

Roman and Simon would like to offer special thanks to Tom for his considerable efforts in compiling the manuscript, but also for his exceptional dedication, professionalism, and heroic patience in many matters besides that have led to this book seeing the light of day.