This work offers a multidisciplinary approach to legal and policy instruments used to prevent and remedy global environmental challenges. It provides a theoretical overview of a variety of instruments, making distinctions between levels of governance (treaties, domestic law) and types of instruments (market-based instruments, regulation, and liability rules), and between government regulation and private or self-regulation. The book’s central focus is an examination of the use of mixes between different types of regulatory and policy instruments and different levels of governance, notably in climate change, marine oil pollution, forestry and fisheries. The authors examine how, in practice, mixes of instruments have often been developed. This book should be read by anyone interested in understanding how interactions between different instruments affect the protection of environmental resources.

**Judith van Erp** is Professor of Public Institutions in the Faculty of Law, Economics and Governance at Utrecht University, the Netherlands, and Designated Research Chair in Utrecht University’s strategic interdisciplinary theme of Institutions for Open Societies.

**Michael Faure** is Academic Director of the Maastricht European Institute for Transnational Legal Research and Professor of Comparative and International Environmental Law at Maastricht University. He is also Academic Director of the Ius Commune Research School and a half-time professor of Comparative Private Law and Economics at the Rotterdam Institute of Law and Economics of Erasmus University.

**André Nollkaemper** is Dean and Professor of Public International Law at the University of Amsterdam. He is also an external legal advisor to the Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands, Member of the Permanent Court of Arbitration, Member of the Institut de Droit International Law, former President of the European Society of International Law and Member of the Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences.

**Niels Philipsen** is Professor of Shifts in Private and Public Regulation at the Erasmus School of Law of Erasmus University Rotterdam, Vice-Director of the METRO research institute and Associate Professor in Law and Economics, Faculty of Law, at Maastricht University. Since November 2017, Philipsen has also been Adjunct Professor of the School of Law and Economics at the China University of Political Science and Law (CUPL) in Beijing.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES ON ENVIRONMENT, ENERGY AND
NATURAL RESOURCES GOVERNANCE

Cambridge Studies on Environment, Energy and Natural Resources Governance publishes foundational monographs of general interest to scholars and practitioners within the broadly defined fields of sustainable development policy, including studies on law, economics, politics, history and policy. These fields currently attract unprecedented interest due to both the urgency of developing policies to address climate change, the energy transition, food security and water availability and, more generally, to the progressive realization of the impact of humans as a geological driver of the state of the Earth, now called the “Anthropocene.”

The general editor of the series is Professor Jorge E. Viñuales, the Harold Samuel Chair of Law and Environmental Policy at the University of Cambridge and the Founder and First Director of the Cambridge Centre for Environment, Energy and Natural Resource Governance (C-EENRG).
Smart Mixes for Transboundary Environmental Harm

Edited by

JUDITH VAN ERP
Utrecht University

MICHAEL FAURE
Maastricht University, Erasmus University Rotterdam

ANDRÉ NOLLKAEMPER
University of Amsterdam

NIELS PHILIPSEN
Erasmus University Rotterdam, Maastricht University
Contents

List of Figures xi
List of Tables xiii
List of Contributors xv
Acknowledgments xvii
List of Abbreviations xix

PART I CONCEPTUAL APPROACHES TO SMART MIXES 1

1 Introduction: The Concept of Smart Mixes for Transboundary Environmental Harm 3
   Judith van Erp, Michael Faure, Jing Liu, Markos Karavias, André Nollkaemper and Niels Philipsen

2 ‘Smart’ Public-Private Complementarities in the Transnational Regulatory and Enforcement Space 25
   Linda Senden

3 Smart Mixes and the Challenge of Complexity: Lessons from Global Climate Governance 49
   Philipp Pattberg and Oscar Widerberg

4 Smart (and Not-So-Smart) Mixes of New Environmental Policy Instruments 69
   Rüdiger Wurzel, Anthony Zito and Andrew Jordan

PART II FISHERIES AND FORESTRY 95

   Richard Barnes
Table of Contents

6 Mixing Regional Fisheries Management and Private Certification
Markos Karavias

7 RFMO-MSC Smart Regulatory Mixes for Transboundary Tuna Fisheries
Agnes Yeeting and Simon R. Bush

8 Smart Mixes in Forest Governance
Jing Liu

9 Governing Forest Supply Chains: Ratcheting up or Squeezing Out?
Constance L. McDermott

10 Public Sector Engagement with Private Governance Programmes: Interactions and Evolutionary Effects in Forest and Fisheries Certification
Lars H. Gulbrandsen

PART III CLIMATE CHANGE AND OIL

11 Smart Mixes, Non-State Governance and Climate Change
Neil Gunningham

12 Private Control of Public Regulation: A Smart Mix? The Case of Greenhouse Gas Emission Reductions in the EU
Marjan Peeters and Mathias N. Müller

13 Smart Mixes of Civil Liability Regimes for Marine Oil Pollution
Michael Faure and Hui Wang

14 Regulatory Mixes in Governance Arrangements in (Offshore) Oil Production: Are They Smart?
Jan P. M. van Tatenhove

PART IV CONCLUDING REMARKS

15 Conclusion: Smart Mixes in Relation to Transboundary Environmental Harm
Judith van Erp, Michael Faure, André Nollkaemper and Niels Philipsen
Figures

3.1 Global climate governance triangle ............................... page 56
3.2 1-mode membership network of institutions ............... 59
3.3 1-mode hyperlink network of 53 institutions ............. 60
3.4 1-mode membership network, 15 institutions with highest degree centrality in black .. 62
3.5 1-mode membership network, 15 institutions with highest betweenness centrality in black . 63
7.1 WCPFC-MSC improvement pathway ......................... 153
7.2 IOTC-MSC improvement pathway .......................... 158
7.3 ICCAT-MSC improvement pathway ......................... 163
13.2 Quantities of oil spilt 7 tonnes and over (rounded to nearest thousand), 1970–2017 (Data from the ITOPF Ltd Oil Tanker Spill Statistics 2017; see www.itopf.com/knowledge-resources/data-statistics/statistics/). 293
13.3 Decline in number of tanker spills versus growth in crude, petroleum and gas loaded (Data from the ITOPF Ltd Oil Tanker Spill Statistics 2017; see www.itopf.com/knowledge-resources/data-statistics/statistics/). 294
### Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Elements of a mix</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>The use of different NEPIs and environmental regulations since the 1970s</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Leaders, followers and laggards</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>An evaluation of FLEGT and REDD+ from the Trading Up and Ecologically Unequal Exchange (EUE) perspectives</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Public–private interaction dynamics: hypotheses, mechanisms and examples</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>Development of available compensation (in SDR)</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>Comparison of liability limits under OPA 90 and the Coast Guard and Maritime Transportation Act of 2006</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contributors

Richard Barnes, Professor, School of Law and Politics, University of Hull, United Kingdom.

Simon R. Bush, Professor and Chair of the Environmental Policy Group, Wageningen University, the Netherlands.

Judith van Erp, Professor of Public Institutions, Utrecht University, the Netherlands.

Michael Faure, Professor of International and Comparative Environmental Law, Maastricht University, and Professor of Private Comparative Law and Economics, Erasmus School of Law, Rotterdam, the Netherlands.

Lars Gulbrandsen, Professor and Deputy Director, Fridtjof Nansen Institute, Oslo, Norway.

Neil Gunningham, Professor, Australian National University, Canberra, Australia.

Andrew Jordan, Professor, Tyndall Centre for Climate Change Research, School of Environmental Sciences, University of East Anglia, United Kingdom.

Markos Karavias, Assistant Professor in International Law, Utrecht University School of Law, the Netherlands.

Jing Liu, Associate Professor, Research Institute of Environmental Law, Wuhan University, China.

Constance L. McDermott, Senior Fellow in Forest Governance and Leader of Ecosystems Governance Group, University of Oxford.

Mathias Müller, PhD Candidate, Maastricht European Institute of Transnational Legal Research, Maastricht University, the Netherlands.
List of contributors

André Nollkaemper, Dean and Professor of Public International Law, Faculty of Law, University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands.

Philipp Pattberg, Professor of Transnational Environmental Governance and Policy, Free University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands.

Marjan Peeters, Professor of Environmental Policy and Law, Maastricht University, the Netherlands.

Niels Philipsen, Professor of Shifts in Private and Public Regulation, Erasmus School of Law, Rotterdam, and Associate Professor in Law and Economics, Maastricht University, the Netherlands.

Linda Senden, Professor of EU Law, Utrecht University, the Netherlands.

Jan van Tatenhove, Professor of Marine Governance and MSP, Department of Planning, IFM – Center for Blue Governance, Aalborg University, Denmark.

Hui Wang, Former PhD Researcher, METRO, Maastricht University, the Netherlands.

Oscar Widerberg, Assistant Professor, Institute for Environmental Studies (IVM), Free University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands.

Rüdiger Wurzel, Professor of Comparative European Politics and Jean Monnet Chair in European Union Studies, University of Hull, United Kingdom.

Agnes Yeeting, Environmental Policy Group, Wageningen University, the Netherlands.

Anthony Zito, Professor of European Public Policy, University of Newcastle, United Kingdom.
Acknowledgments

This book is one of the results of a project subsidised by the Netherlands Royal Academy of Arts and Sciences on smart mixes in relation to transboundary environmental harm. The project was sponsored within the framework of the Academy project “Beyond borders” (Over grenzen). It consisted of a collaboration between the Erasmus School of Law in Rotterdam and the Faculty of Law of the University of Amsterdam, with additional contributions by members of the Faculty of Law of Maastricht University. The project work was largely executed by Dr. Markos Karavias and Dr. Jing Liu (two postdocs financed by the Academy), and supported by an expert team consisting of: Professor Michael Faure (Erasmus University Rotterdam and Maastricht University); Professor André Nollkaemper (University of Amsterdam); Professor Peter Mascini (Erasmus University Rotterdam); Professor Judith van Erp (Utrecht University); Professor Marjan Peeters (Maastricht University); and Professor Niels Philipsen (Erasmus University Rotterdam and Maastricht University).

The project team benefitted from the expertise of an advisory committee consisting of: Jan van den Broek (VNO-NCW); Professor Joyeeta Gupta (University of Amsterdam); Dr. Veerle Heyvaert (London School of Economics); Gerald Kok (Shell); Professor Catherine Redgwell (University of Oxford); Dr. Peter Sand (University of Munich); Professor Jaap Spier (Supreme Court of the Netherlands); Jasper Teulings (Greenpeace International); and Ludo Veuchelen (Erasmus University Rotterdam).

Within the framework of this research project, two workshops were organised: one, on smart mixes in relation to forest and climate governance, was held on 4–5 February 2015, and the other, on smart mixes in relation to fishery and oil pollution governance, was held on 7–8 October 2015; both workshops were held at the Facility of the Netherlands Royal Academy of Arts and Sciences in the Trippenhuis in Amsterdam.
As authors of this book, which largely builds on the mentioned research project, we are grateful to our colleagues, members of the expert team, to the members of the advisory committee, to the participants in the two mentioned workshops and especially to the Netherlands Royal Academy of Arts and Sciences for their invaluable input and support, without which this book could not have been published.

In addition, as editors of this book we are equally grateful to Marianne Breijer who, as project manager, supported the entire research project, and to Martine van Trigt of the University of Amsterdam. We are also grateful to Marina Jodogne (Maastricht University) for invaluable editorial help in harmonising footnotes and references in preparation of the publication of this volume.
Abbreviations

ABNJ  Areas Beyond National Jurisdiction
ACI   Airport Council International
ANSI  American National Standards Institute
Art.  Article
ASL   Asociaciones Sociales de Lugar
ASRC  Arctic Slope Regional Corporation
BASR  Basic Aviation Risk Standard
BAT   Best Available Technology
BCR   Binding Corporate Rules
BMSY  Biomass that would provide Maximum Sustainable Yield
BP    British Petroleum
BS    British Standards
CAB   Certification Assessment Body
CANSO Civil Air Navigation Services Organization
CBD   Convention on Biological Diversity
CBFM  Community-Based Forest Management
CCAMLR Commission for the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources
CDM   Clean Development Mechanism
CDS   Catch Documentation Scheme
CEC   Commission of the European Communities
CEDRE Centre de documentation de recherches et d’expérimentations sur les pollutions accidentelles des eaux
CEN   European Committee for Standardization
CFV   Certificacion Forestall Voluntaria
CGMTA Coast Guard and Maritime Transportation Act
CLC   Civil Liability Convention
List of Abbreviations

CO₂  Carbon Dioxide
COFI  Committee of Fisheries
COLTO  Coalition of Legal Toothfish Operators
COPE  European Compensation Fund for Oil Pollution
CPET  Central Point of Expertise on Timber
CRISTAL  Contract Regarding an Interim Supplement to Tanker Liability
CSA  Canadian Standards Association
CSG  Coal Seam Gas
CSO  Civil Society Organization
CSR  Corporate Social Responsibility
DARRP  Damage Assessment, Remediation and Restoration Program
DGR  Dangerous Goods Regulations
EC  European Commission
EEA  European Environmental Agency
EEZ  Exclusive Economic Zone
EMAS  Environmental Management and Audit Scheme
EMS  Environmental Management Scheme
ENDS  Environmental Data Services
ENGO  Environmental Non-Governmental Organisation
EP  European Parliament
ESO  European Standardisation Organisation
ETS  Emissions Trading Scheme
EU  European Union
EUE  Ecologically Unequal Exchange
EU ETS  European Union Emissions Trading Scheme
EUR  Euro(s)
EUTR  EU Timber Regulation
FAD  Fish Aggregating Device
FAO  Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FLEGT  Forest Law Enforcement, Governance and Trade
FSA  Fisheries Stock Assessment
FSC  Forest Stewardship Council
FSF  Fisheries Survival Fund
FSF  Flight Safety Foundation
GHG  Greenhouse Gas
GSGSSI  Government of South Georgia and South-Sandwich Islands
HCR  Harvest Control Rule
HNA  Hyperlink Network Analysis
HSBC  Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation
IATA  International Air Transport Association
IBAC  International Business Aviation Council
List of Abbreviations

ICAO International Civil Aviation Organization
ICAP Interagency Committee for Aviation Policy
ICCAT International Commission for the Conservation of Atlantic Tunas
IFALPA International Federation of Air Line Pilots' Associations
IGO International Governmental Organization
IMF International Monetary Fund
IMO International Maritime Organization
IO International Organization
IOPC Fund International Oil Pollution Compensation Fund
IOSA IATA Operational Safety Audit
IOTC Indian Ocean Tuna Commission
IRC International Regime Complexes
IS-BAO International Standard for Business Aircraft Operations
ISO International Organisation for Standardisation
ITOPF International Tanker Owners Pollution Federation
ITQ Individual Transferable Quota
ITTO International Tropical Timber Organization
IUU Illegal, Unreported and Unregulated
LEI Lembaga Ekolabel Indonesia
MARPOL International Convention for the Prevention of Pollution from Ships
MSC Marine Stewardship Council
MSC FSG Marine Stewardship Council Fisheries Standard and Guidance
MSPEA Maldives Seafood Processors and Exporters Association
NAO Nenets Autonomous Okrug
NEPI New Environmental Policy Instrument
NGO Non-Governmental Organization
NOAA National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
NOGEPA Netherlands Oil and Gas Exploration and Production Association
NSMD Non-State Market-Driven
ODS Ozone-Depleting Substances
OECD Organization of Economic Co-Operation and Development
OGP Oil and Gas Producers
OJ Official Journal
OPA Oil Pollution Act
OPAGAC Organisation of Associated Producers of Large Tuna Freezer Vessels
OPEGUI Spanish Inshore Producers Organisations from Guipuzcoa
OPESCAAYA Spanish Inshore Producers Organisations from Biscay
OPRC Oil Pollution Preparedness, Response and Cooperation
OSPAR Offshore Industry from the Paris
PEFC Programme for the Endorsement of Forest Certification
## List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PI</td>
<td>Performance Indicator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNA</td>
<td>Parties to the Nauru Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POLMAR</td>
<td>Pollution Maritime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RBM</td>
<td>Rights-Based Measure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REDD+</td>
<td>Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFEERP</td>
<td>Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency Partnership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFMO</td>
<td>Regional Fisheries Management Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFO</td>
<td>Regional Fisheries Body</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAE</td>
<td>Society of Automotive Engineers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAR</td>
<td>Search and Rescue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SARPS</td>
<td>Standards and Recommended Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCRS</td>
<td>Standing Committee on Research and Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDR</td>
<td>Special Drawing Right</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEM</td>
<td>Single European Market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFI</td>
<td>Sustainable Forestry Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SG</td>
<td>Scoring Guidepost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SGSSI</td>
<td>South Georgia and the South Sandwich Islands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO</td>
<td>Social License to Operate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOLAS</td>
<td>International Convention for the Safety of Life at Sea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STCW</td>
<td>Standards of Training, Certification and Watchkeeping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STOPIA</td>
<td>Small Tankers Oil Pollution Indemnification Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAC</td>
<td>Total Allowable Catch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TBGI</td>
<td>Transnational Business Governance Interactions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TCO</td>
<td>Tierras Communitarias de Origen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOPIA</td>
<td>Tanker Oil Pollution Indemnification Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOVALOP</td>
<td>Tanker Owners Voluntary Agreement concerning Liability for Oil Pollution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPAC</td>
<td>Timber Procurement Assessment Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPR</td>
<td>Transnational Private Regulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRCCC</td>
<td>Transnational Regime Complex for Climate Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNFCCC</td>
<td>United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNFSA</td>
<td>United Nations Fish Stocks Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN REDD</td>
<td>United Nations Programme on Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UoA</td>
<td>Unit of Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>United States of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USD</td>
<td>US Dollar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USOAP</td>
<td>Universal Safety Oversight Audit Program</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VMS</td>
<td>Vessel Monitoring System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VPA</td>
<td>Voluntary Partnership Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VPN</td>
<td>Virtual Policy Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCPFC</td>
<td>Western and Central Pacific Fisheries Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCPO</td>
<td>Western and Central Pacific Ocean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Trade Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WWF</td>
<td>World Wide Fund for Nature</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>