The Value of Disorder

Despite being central to the development of Saharan regional connectivity, northern Chad has been closed to researchers since the late 1960s and thus remains virtually unknown to scholarship. Based on long-term fieldwork, The Value of Disorder is an original and in-depth account of the area and its Tubu majority inhabitants. Julien Brachet and Judith Scheele examine trans-border connectivity and trade; civil war and rebellion; wealth creation and dispersal; labour and gender relations; and aspirations to moral autonomy in northern Chad from an internal point of view – a point of view that in turn participates in a dynamic process of regional interdependence. Vividly ethnographic, the book gives precedence to local categories of value, while asking broader questions about the nature of non-state regional political organisation, questions that inform current political developments in the Sahara more widely and have the potential to challenge key concepts in Saharan studies and the social sciences.

Julien Brachet is Research Fellow at the Institut de recherche pour le développement (IRD, Research Institute for Development), University of Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne. He is the author of Migrations transsahariennes: vers un désert cosmopolite et morcelé (2009).

African Studies Series

The African Studies series, founded in 1968, is a prestigious series of monographs, general surveys, and textbooks on Africa covering history, political science, anthropology, economics, and ecological and environmental issues. The series seeks to publish work by senior scholars as well as the best new research.

Editorial Board:

David Anderson, The University of Warwick
Catherine Boone, The London School of Economics and Political Science
Carolyn Brown, Rutgers University, New Jersey
Christopher Clapham, University of Cambridge
Michael Gomez, New York University
Richard Roberts, Stanford University, California
David Robinson, Michigan State University
Leonardo A. Villalón, University of Florida

Other titles in the series are listed at the back of the book.
The Value of Disorder

Autonomy, Prosperity, and Plunder in the Chadian Sahara

JULIEN BRACHE
IRD – University of Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne

JUDITH SCHEELE
École des hautes études en sciences sociales (EHESS)
## Contents

- **List of Photographs** page vii
- **List of Maps** ix
- **Acknowledgements** x
- **Glossary** xiii
- **List of Abbreviations** xv

### Introduction
- The Sahara and Its Double 7
- The Lacuna 16
- The Bad Reputation 27
- Alterity Endorsed 32
- Obstacles as Social Facts 39

1. **A Never-Ending Conquest**
   - Settlement and the Making of a Saharan Town 45
   - Regional Disconnections 47
   - The Sanūsiyya 53
   - The French Colonial Conquest 59
   - The Enemy Who Came on Foot 64
   - Colonial State-Building 69
   - Boom and Bust 75
   - Imperial Twilight 80
   - Conclusion 86

2. **Fifty Shades of Khaki**
   - Armed Conflict and Other Entanglements 88
   - The Outbreak of War 91
   - Ongoing Connections 98
   - ‘The Enemy of My Enemy is Your Friend’ 106
   - Suspicions and Departures 114
   - Looking Like a State 120
   - *Plus ça change* . . . 126
   - Conclusion 132
Contents

3 Trouble in the Palm Grove: Labour, Status, Ownership 133
   The 2006 Conflict 135
   The Right Kind of History 140
   Labour and Irrigated Agriculture 148
   Property and Possession 157
   Those Who Leave and Those Who Stay 164
   Conclusion 170

4 Tricks of Trade: Production, Protection, and Predation 172
   Fortunes of War: The First Generation of Faya Traders 175
   The One Exception 184
   Local Production and Decentralised Trade 190
   Libya: Wealth at Your Fingertips 197
   Rent over Risk: Garages and Other Forms of ‘Protection’ 204
   Rent-Seeking through Authority and Force 209
   Conclusion 215

5 Great Ploys and Small Expectations: Accumulation and Dispersal in a Half-World 217
   The Glory of Giving 221
   Raiding and Theft 227
   Kinship and Marriage 234
   The Ties That Bind 242
   Faya as a Half-World 247
   Conclusion 255

6 The State Encompassed: Everyday Disorder, the Aesthetics of Violence, and the Political Imagination 256
   Tubu ‘Anarchy’ 260
   In Praise of Disorder 264
   A Good Fight 269
   Men in Arms 276
   The State Encompassed 283
   Conclusion 290
   Conclusion 293
   Elite Cultures 298
   The Lacuna Revisited 303
   Times, Things, Others 309

References 314

Index 341
## Photographs

1.1 Faya seen from the north  
1.2 Camel caravan in Faya  
1.3 Main street leading to the central market, Faya  
1.4 The archives of the Borkou Prefecture  
1.1 Ruins of the Sanūsī zāwiyā and/or the first French colonial fort in Faya  
1.2 ‘Libyan’ mosque in Faya  
1.3 Faya: central market arcades  
1.4 French-drilled artesian well in the suburbs of Faya  
2.1 Wreck of Libyan tank abandoned near Faya  
3.1 Non-irrigated extensive palm grove near Amoul  
3.2 Irrigated garden with trimmed date palms in Kirdimi  
3.3 Shadūf (manual well with a counterpoise lift) in Kirdimi  
3.4 Date harvest near Tchang Souss (August 2012)  
3.4.1 Ahmad Tuwār’s house, Faya  
3.4.2 Natron mining near Djiddi  
4.1 Advertisement for weekly car sales in Faya  
4.2 Natron mining near Djiddi  
4.3 Garages with stockpiles of flour near Terre Rouge, Faya  
4.4 Trucks waiting at the Chadian customs office in Zouarkê  
5.1 Open air Libyan market in Faya  
5.2 Departure of wedding procession, Faya  
5.3 Wedding celebrations in the outskirts of Faya  
6.1 Crowds waiting for the presidential plane at Faya aerodrome (15/9/2012)
List of Photographs

6.2 Soldiers cruising, Faya 278
6.3 Military parade to celebrate Independence Day in Faya (11/8/2012) 282
C.1 ‘Peace in Chad – this is my battle’: Poster portraying the Chadian President Idriss Déby and his army, displayed in government offices in Faya 298
Maps

I.1 Chad: administrative regions and isohyetal lines
I.2 Faya town centre (2012)
I.3 Sahara: main areas of settlement of Hassāniyya-, Tuareg-, Beri-, and Tubu-speakers
I.4 Empires, sultanates, and trade routes in the mid-nineteenth century
2.1 Borkou-Ennedi-Tibesti (1980s)
3.1 Faya and its suburbs and palm grove
4.1 Main trade routes between Fazzān, Kufra, Waddaï, and N’Djamena
Acknowledgements

This book is based on twelve months of fieldwork in Chad, principally in Faya-Largeau, the main town of Borkou-Ennedi-Tibesti (BET) in the far north of the country. It could not have been written without the hospitality and generosity of the people we met in Faya, who helped us in what to many must have seemed like a fool’s errand. Despite people’s repeated assertions that Faya was a difficult place to live for outsiders, we were treated with great kindness and consideration throughout.

Our first gratitude must go to our hosts in Faya, Moussa Hassan Adiker and Zeynaba and their family, including Zeynaba’s siblings, aunt, uncle, and grandmother. The women of the family opened doors to local sociabilities and family relations, and Moussa Hassan was a calm authority on many things local and national. Adoum Fozari, Faya’s most prominent trader and brilliant story-teller, became a great friend, companion, and interpreter of local affairs, in both Faya and the Chadian capital N’Djamena. Achta, Fatimé, and Khadidja Mahamat Bahr provided a female perspective from the start; Achta’s husband kindly hosted us in Moundou, and her father, Sherfaddine, in Ngoundéré in northern Cameroon. Youssef Mahamat Bahr, Faya’s former prefect, provided invaluable information as we visited him in N’Djamena. The late Idriss Ndélé Moussa Yayami narrated his father’s history, and through it that of Faya, as well as sharing his own childhood memories. Al-Hājj Mūsā Khayrallāh and Adoum Mahamat Yacoub (‘Papa Adoum’), who were then considered to be the oldest living residents of Faya, patiently granted us access to their own memories and historical documents, and their views on Faya’s transformation over the last seventy years.

Ali Mansour (aka Alain Togilbert), Mahamadayn, Smain, and ‘Sultan Maltina’ shared their knowledge of the hardships and pleasures of desert travel, of life in Libya, and of the busy tracks between northern Chad and southern Libya. Haroun Kellé, al-Hājj Sougi
Torna, and Moussa Tidjani Yahia were indefatigable guides to the complexities of local social distinctions and labour relations. Hamid Noheleh Kamadou (‘Commandant Tuka’), Goukouni Hissen, and General Kokoi Toké provided precious insider commentary on rebels, the police, and the army; as did Idriss and Acheikh Toké. The late Tuka, Ali Rozi Ahmat, and Issa ‘DG des impôts’ introduced us to worlds that were physically beyond Faya (Tibesti, Djourab) but highly relevant to it. Ndoumbé and William, among other travellers heading to or coming back from Libya, gave us glimpses of foreign migrants’ perspectives, bringing with them an air of cosmopolitanism. Kébir, from his compound overlooking the rest of town, provided commentary that was as incisive as it was dispassionate. Djimmi was our guide to Dozanga; Emmanuel Kagoubé Ladayé and Béatrice, to Démocratie; Nestor and Aboubakar Zeini, to the ONDR, its archival records, and irrigated perimeter; Moussa, to Kirdimi; and Hassan Bolobo, to Amoul. Hanna very graciously hosted us in Abéché.

We would also like to thank the Borkou Prefect for access to the local archives; and the chefs de cantons Anakazza, Donza, Kamaya, and Mina and their families, especially Ahmat Tidjani and Hassan, for their support and information provided. We are also grateful to the Délégué des Mines, and other ministerial delegates in Faya, who always helped us when they could, often beyond their calls of duty. In N’Djamena, thanks are due to Marc Ortman, more usually known in the BET as Kandamaï, who was always ready to share his extensive knowledge of Tubu language, culture, and politics with us. Thanks are also due to the staff at the national archives in N’Djamena, who granted us access even though the archives had not officially been opened; to the staff at the Centre national d’appui à la recherche (CNAR), who introduced us to the wealth of grey literature at their disposal; to the Cefod and the Centre al-Mouna; and to the University of N’Djamena, our hosts and colleagues. Members of the geography department in particular helped us sort out our paperwork, getting official research and travel permits, while introducing us to aspects of Chadian life that would otherwise have escaped our notice, focused, as we were, on the north of the country. Our particular thanks here go to Ngaressem Goltob Mbaye and Zakinét Dangbet, but also to Pabamé Sougnabé, Passiniring Kedeu, and Robert Madjigoto. And, finally, to Chloé Leconte, who so warmly hosted us during our visits to N’Djamena. We arrived on the same plane, but she never left.
While fieldwork was primarily funded by the Institut de recherche pour le développement (Paris) and All Souls College (Oxford), most of this book was written when we were both at Oxford. We would like to thank our colleagues and students at All Souls College and at Queen Elizabeth House for ongoing exchange and support. Paul Dresch read the manuscript with his usual attention and care at a far too early stage. His patience, insights, and frankness have helped make this a much better book. Ann McDougall also provided invaluable feedback; we take this occasion to thank her for it. Material included in this book was presented in many different venues and to different audiences. Reactions were not always positive, but they were invariably useful; and we thank everybody who, in one way or another, has contributed to this project.

Arabic words are transliterated following the *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, with diacritics omitted. Dazaga and Tedaga words adopt the spelling proposed by Charles Le Cœur (1950) and the Summer Institute of Linguistics.
Glossary

*arba* (Tubu) camel mark
*‘askar* (Arabic) soldier
*aza,* singular *eze* (Tubu) blacksmith and praise-singer
*azúma* (Tubu) fund-raising party
*badía* (Arabic) wilderness
*bilād al-sība* (Arabic) land of dissidence
*bilād al-sūdān* (Arabic) land of the blacks
*boubou* (French) ankle-length shirt for men
*bunduk jāb-ha* (Arabic) ‘brought by the guns’: returnees from Libya
*canton* (French) smallest administrative unit in Chad
*chef de canton* (French) leader and representative of a *canton*
*député* (French) delegate to the Chadian national parliament
*derdé* (Tubu) traditional ‘chief’
*diya* (Arabic) blood money
*Fazzānī* (Arabic) inhabitant of Fazzān in southern Libya
*griot* (French) blacksmith and praise-singer
*haddād* (Arabic) blacksmith
*ikhwān,* singular *akh* (Arabic) brother, member of a Sufi order
*khalīfa* (Arabic) representative, here head of a *zāwiyā*
*koro* measurement for dry goods (dates, cereals)
*métis* (French) child of one European and one African parent
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>mustaghriq al-dhimma</td>
<td>‘forfeited of his own goods’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nawāzil (Arabic)</td>
<td>legal responsa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qādī (Arabic)</td>
<td>judge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>radda (Arabic)</td>
<td>compensation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanūsiyya</td>
<td>Sufi order, primarily based in Libya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>shadāf (Arabic)</td>
<td>well with counterpoise lift</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>shari‘a (Arabic)</td>
<td>Islamic law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sous-préfet (French)</td>
<td>administrator subordinate to the prefect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tirailleur (French)</td>
<td>indigenous soldier in French colonial army</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yele (Tubu)</td>
<td>clan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zakāt (Arabic)</td>
<td>religious tax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zarība, plural zarū‘ib</td>
<td>fortified military or slave-raiding camp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zāwīya, plural zauyāyā</td>
<td>religious stronghold</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abbreviations

AEF          French Equatorial Africa
ANL          Armée nationale de libération
ASECNA       Agence pour la sécurité de la navigation aérienne en Afrique et à Madagascar
BET          Borkou-Ennedi-Tibesti
BNF          Bureau national de fret
CAR          Central African Republic
CCFAN        Conseil de commandement des forces armées du nord
CCMSR        Conseil de commandement militaire pour le salut de la république
CDR          Conseil démocratique révolutionnaire
COM/RM       Commandant de la région militaire
CTT          Coopérative des transporteurs tchadiens
DDS          Direction de la documentation et de la sécurité
ECOWAS       Economic Community of West African States
EFT          Éléments français au Tchad
FACT         Front pour l’alternance et la concorde au Tchad
FAN          Forces armées du Nord
FANT         Forces armées nationales tchadiennes
FAO          Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FAP          Forces armées populaires
FAT          Forces armées tchadiennes
F CFA        Franc de la communauté financière africaine
             (1,000 F CFA = €1.52)
Frolinat     Front de libération nationale du Tchad
List of Abbreviations

GUNT  Gouvernement d’union national de transition
INSEE D  Institut national de la statistique, des Études Économiques et démographiques
IOM  International Organization for Migration
MATUH  Ministère de l’Aménagement du territoire, de l’urbanisme et de l’habitat
MDJT  Mouvement pour la démocratie et la justice au Tchad
MINUSCA  Mission multidimensionnelle Intégrée des Nations unies pour la stabilisation en Centrafrique
MINUSMA  Mission multidimensionnelle intégrée des Nations unies pour la stabilisation au Mali
MISCA  Mission internationale de soutien à la Centrafrique sous conduite africaine
MNJTF  Multinational Joint Task-Force
MPS  Mouvement patriotique du Salut
MRA  Mission pour la réforme administrative
ORCOS  Organisation commune des régions sahariennes
ONC  Office national des céréales
ONDR  Office national de développement rural
ORSTOM  Office de la recherche scientifique et technique outre-mer
PPT  Parti progressiste tchadien
RFI  Radio France internationale
TAT  Tunisienne automobile transport
UFDD  Union des forces pour la démocratie et le développement
UNIR  Union nationale pour l’indépendance et la révolution
WFP  World Food Program