

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page ix</i>
1 Some Philosophy of Probability, Statistics, and Forensic Science	1
1.1 The Kolmogorov Axioms of Probability	1
1.2 The Frequentistic Interpretation	4
1.3 The Inadequacy of Relative Frequencies in the Legal and Forensic Context	7
1.4 Epistemic Probability	9
1.5 Problems and Anomalies	14
1.6 An Example: DNA Profiles	18
1.7 Statistics	21
1.8 Forensic Science	25
1.9 Summary and Conclusions	27
1.10 Bibliographical Notes	29
2 Evidence and the Likelihood Ratio	30
2.1 From Evidence to Likelihood Ratio	30
2.2 Further Examples of Likelihood Ratios	35
2.3 The Likelihood Ratio Meets Necessary Requirements	42
2.4 The Distribution of the Likelihood Ratio	46
2.5 Summary and Conclusions	59
2.6 Bibliographical Notes	60
3 The Uncertainty of the Likelihood Ratio	61
3.1 The Nature of the Likelihood Ratio	61
3.2 A Concrete Example	66
3.3 The Posterior Likelihood Ratio Distribution	71
3.4 Examples of Posterior Likelihood Ratio Distributions	75

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
	3.5 Summary and Conclusions	81
	3.6 Bibliographical Notes	82
4	Forensic Identification	83
	4.1 The Classical Case	84
	4.2 The Effect of a Search	87
	4.3 Uncertainty About p	90
	4.4 The Existence of Subpopulations	94
	4.5 Some Examples and Special Cases	97
	4.6 Which Likelihood Ratio?	102
	4.7 Uncertainty or Measurement Error of the Evidence	104
	4.8 Summary and Conclusions	106
	4.9 Bibliographical Notes	108
5	The Bayesian Framework in Legal Cases	109
	5.1 The Link Hammer Case	109
	5.2 Examples of Combination of Evidence	112
	5.3 The Sally Clark Case	115
	5.4 The Death of the Linesman	119
	5.5 The Lucia de Berk Case	120
	5.6 The Case of the Information Telephone	128
	5.7 Two Burglary Cases	134
	5.8 Summary and Conclusions	137
	5.9 Bibliographical Notes	138
6	Bayesian Networks	139
	6.1 The Basics	139
	6.2 Conditional Independence	145
	6.3 Some Examples of Bayesian Networks	149
	6.4 Modeling Competing Arguments with a Bayesian Network	156
	6.5 Bayesian Network Selection	163
	6.6 Summary and Conclusions	167
	6.7 Bibliographical Notes	168
7	DNA	169
	7.1 Forensic DNA Profiling	169
	7.2 Population Frequencies Versus Profile Probabilities	171
	7.3 Uncertainty About Allele Frequencies: The Dirichlet Distribution	175
	7.4 Match Probabilities	181
	7.5 Population Genetics and the θ -Correction	183

Contents

vii

7.6	Kinship	190
7.7	Summary and Conclusions	205
7.8	Bibliographical Notes	206
8	Statistical Modeling and DNA Mixture Evaluation	207
8.1	Mixture Likelihood Ratios	207
8.2	The Concept of a Contributor	218
8.3	Analogies Between Mixtures and Kinship Evaluations	222
8.4	Models for Mixture Likelihoods	230
8.5	The Top-down Approach	235
8.6	Maximum Likelihood Versus Integration	248
8.7	Summary and Conclusions	252
8.8	Bibliographical Notes	253
9	<i>p</i>-Values of Likelihood Ratios	254
9.1	<i>p</i> -Values of Likelihood Ratios	254
9.2	<i>p</i> -Values May Change if the Distribution of Unobserved Possibilities Changes	256
9.3	<i>p</i> -Values are Ambiguous	260
9.4	<i>p</i> -Values May Appear to Support the Wrong Hypothesis	262
9.5	Error Rates and the Prosecutor's Fallacy	264
9.6	Consequences for Casework	266
9.7	More Problems with Evidential Interpretations of <i>p</i> -Values	272
9.8	Summary and Conclusions	280
9.9	Bibliographical Notes	282
10	From Evidence to Decision	283
10.1	Neyman–Pearson Theory	284
10.2	Applications	295
10.3	Bayesian Decision Theory	301
10.4	Evidence and Decision in a Legal Context	305
10.5	Summary and Conclusions	308
10.6	Bibliographical Notes	309
11	The Interpretation of DNA Database Matches	310
11.1	The Database Controversy	310
11.2	Mathematical Modeling and the Basic Formula	314
11.3	Evaluation of the Probabilities in Particular Cases	319
11.4	Which Likelihood Ratio?	323
11.5	Only a Unique Match is Known	326
11.6	An Intermediate Situation	327

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
11.7	A Further Analysis of the Controversies	329
11.8	Analogies with Example 2.2.1	338
11.9	Summary and Conclusions	339
11.10	Bibliographical Notes	341
12	Familial Searching	342
12.1	Probabilistic Assessments for Familial Searching	344
12.2	Search Strategies	348
12.3	Strategy Performance	353
12.4	Search Strategies and the Neyman–Pearson Lemma	360
12.5	Summary and Conclusions	362
12.6	Bibliographical Notes	363
13	Belief Functions and their Applications	364
13.1	The Basics of Belief Functions	364
13.2	Conditional Belief	372
13.3	The Island Problems with Belief Functions	376
13.4	Parental Identification	381
13.5	Finding Persons with Special Features	388
13.6	The Legal Practice with Belief Functions	392
13.7	A Philosophical Back-up of Belief Functions	395
13.8	Summary and Conclusions	400
13.9	Bibliographical Notes	401
14	Recommendation Reports	403
14.1	<i>ENFSI Guideline for Evaluative Reporting in Forensic Science</i>	404
14.2	The PCAST Report to the President	408
14.3	<i>Twelve Guiding Principles and Recommendations</i>	412
14.4	DNA Commission of the International Society for Forensic Genetics	416
14.5	The SWGDAM Interpretation Guidelines	420
14.6	A Guideline for Validation	425
14.7	Summary and Conclusions	429
14.8	Bibliographical Notes	430
	<i>References</i>	431
	<i>Index</i>	440