

## ROBOTICA

In every era of communications technology – whether print, radio, television, or Internet – some form of government censorship follows to regulate the medium and its messages. Today we are seeing the phenomenon of “machine speech” enhanced by the development of sophisticated artificial intelligence. Ronald K. L. Collins and David M. Skover argue that the First Amendment must provide defenses and justifications for covering and protecting robotic expression. It is irrelevant that a robot is not human and cannot have intentions; what matters is that a human experiences robotic speech as meaningful. This is the constitutional recognition of “intentionless free speech” at the interface of the robot and receiver. *Robotica* is the first book to develop the legal arguments for these purposes. Aimed at law and communication scholars, lawyers, and free speech activists, this work explores important new problems and solutions at the interface of law and technology.

RONALD K. L. COLLINS is the Harold S. Shefelman Distinguished Scholar at the University of Washington School of Law.

DAVID M. SKOVER is the Fredric C. Tausend Professor of Constitutional Law at Seattle University School of Law.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-42806-4 — Robotica  
Ronald K. L. Collins , David M. Skover  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# Robotica

SPEECH RIGHTS AND ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE

**RONALD K. L. COLLINS**

University of Washington

**DAVID M. SKOVER**

Seattle University



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-42806-4 — Robotica  
Ronald K. L. Collins , David M. Skover  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.  
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108428064](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108428064)  
DOI: 10.1017/9781108649445

© Ronald K. L. Collins and David M. Skover 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

ISBN 978-1-108-42806-4 Hardback  
ISBN 978-1-108-44871-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy  
of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication  
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>About the Authors</i>	page vii
<i>About the Commentators</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
THE THESIS	1
Prologue: Technology and Communication	3
Part I The Progress and Perils of Communication	6
Part II Robots and Their Receivers	32
Part III The New Norm of Utility	48
Epilogue: From <i>Areopagitica</i> to <i>Robotica</i>	65
THE COMMENTARIES	69
<i>Robotica</i> in Context: An Introduction to the Commentaries Ryan Calo	71
The Age of Sensorship Jane Bambauer	75
Speech In, Speech Out James Grimmelman	85
An Old Libel Lawyer Confronts <i>Robotica</i> ’s Brave New World Bruce E. H. Johnson	94

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-42806-4 — Robotica  
Ronald K. L. Collins , David M. Skover  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

vi	<i>Table of Contents</i>	
	<b>What’s Old Is New Again (and Vice Versa)</b>	100
	Helen Norton	
	<b>REPLY</b>	109
	<b><i>Robotica</i> Refined</b>	111
	Ronald K. L. Collins and David M. Skover	
	<i>Notes</i>	123
	<i>Index</i>	159

## About the Authors

**Ronald K. L. Collins** is the Harold S. Shefelman Scholar at the University of Washington Law School. Before coming to the law school, Collins served as a law clerk to Justice Hans A. Linde on the Oregon Supreme Court, a Supreme Court Fellow under Chief Justice Warren Burger, and a scholar at the Washington, DC, office of the Newseum's First Amendment Center.

Collins has written constitutional briefs that were submitted to the Supreme Court and various other federal and state high courts. In addition to the books that he coauthored with David Skover, he is the editor of *Oliver Wendell Holmes: A Free Speech Reader* (2010) and coauthor with Sam Chaltain of *We Must Not Be Afraid to Be Free* (2011). His last solo book was *Nuanced Absolutism: Floyd Abrams and the First Amendment* (2013). Collins is the book editor of *SCOTUSblog* and writes a weekly blog (First Amendment News), which appears on the *Concurring Opinions* website.

**David M. Skover** is the Fredric C. Tausend Professor of Constitutional Law at Seattle University School of Law. He teaches, writes, and lectures in the fields of federal constitutional law, federal jurisdiction, and mass communications theory and the First Amendment.

Skover graduated from the Woodrow Wilson School of International and Domestic Affairs at Princeton University. He received his law degree from Yale Law School, where he was an editor of the *Yale Law Journal*. Thereafter, he served as a law clerk for Judge Jon O. Newman at the Federal District Court for the District of Connecticut and the US Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit. In addition to the books that he coauthored with Ronald Collins, he is the coauthor with Pierre Schlag of *Tactics of Legal Reasoning* (1986).

Together, Collins and Skover have authored *The Death of Discourse* (1996 and 2005), *The Trials of Lenny Bruce: The Fall & Rise of an American Icon* (2002 and

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-42806-4 — Robotica  
Ronald K. L. Collins , David M. Skover  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

2012), *Mania: The Outraged & Outrageous Lives That Launched a Cultural Revolution* (2013), *On Dissent: Its Meaning in America* (2013), *When Money Speaks: The McCutcheon Decision, Campaign Finance Laws, and the First Amendment* (2014), and *The Judge: 26 Machiavellian Lessons* (2017). They have also coauthored numerous scholarly articles in various journals including the *Harvard Law Review*, *Stanford Law Review*, *Michigan Law Review*, and the *Supreme Court Review*, among other publications. *The Trials of Lenny Bruce* (revised and expanded) and *Mania*, *On Dissent*, *When Money Speaks* and *The Judge* are available in e-book form.



## About the Commentators

**Jane Bambauer** is a Professor of Law at the University of Arizona's James E. Rogers College of Law. Her research assesses the social costs and benefits of Big Data and questions the wisdom of many well-intentioned privacy laws. Her articles have appeared in the *Stanford Law Review*, *Michigan Law Review*, *California Law Review*, and the *Journal of Empirical Legal Studies*. Professor Bambauer's own data-driven research explores biased judgment, legal education, and legal careers. She holds a BS in mathematics from Yale College and a JD from Yale Law School.

**Ryan Calo** is the Lane Powell and D. Wayne Gittinger Associate Professor of Law at the University of Washington. He is a faculty codirector of the University of Washington Tech Policy Lab, a unique, interdisciplinary research unit that spans the School of Law, Information School, and Paul G. Allen School of Computer Science and Engineering. Professor Calo holds courtesy appointments at the University of Washington Information School and the Oregon State University School of Mechanical, Industrial, and Manufacturing Engineering. His research on law and emerging technology appears in leading law reviews (*California Law Review*, *University of Chicago Law Review*, and *Columbia Law Review*) and technical publications (*Nature*, *Artificial Intelligence*) and is frequently referenced by the mainstream media (*New York Times*, *Wall Street Journal*).

**James Grimmelman** is a professor at Cornell Tech and Cornell Law School. His research focuses on how laws regulating software affect freedom, wealth, and power. He helps lawyers and technologists understand each other and writes about digital copyright, search engines, privacy on social networks, online governance, and other topics in computer and Internet law. He is the author or coauthor of *Internet Law: Cases and Problems* (7th edn., 2017) and two other casebooks, multiple amicus briefs, more than forty scholarly articles, and numerous op-eds and essays.

**Bruce E. H. Johnson** is a partner at Davis Wright Tremaine in Seattle, Washington. He is a veteran litigator who represents information industry clients on issues involving media and communications law as well as technology and intellectual property matters. His expertise includes advising on First Amendment law issues, particularly involving commercial speech, commercial transactions, and consumer rights. Mr. Johnson is the author of Washington's Reporter's Shield Law enacted in 2007, and Washington's Uniform Correction or Clarification of Defamation Act enacted in 2013. Mr. Johnson is the coauthor with Steven G. Brody of *Advertising and Commercial Speech: A First Amendment Guide* (2nd edn., 2004).

**Helen Norton** is a professor at the University of Colorado (Boulder) School of Law, where she holds the Ira C. Rothgerber, Jr. Chair in Constitutional Law. Her scholarly and teaching interests include constitutional law, civil rights, and employment discrimination law. She served as leader of President-elect Obama's transition team charged with reviewing the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission in 2008 and is frequently invited to testify before Congress and federal agencies on civil rights law and policy issues. Before entering academia, Professor Norton served as Deputy Assistant Attorney General for Civil Rights at the US Department of Justice and as Director of Legal and Public Policy at the National Partnership for Women & Families. Among other publications, her scholarly writings have appeared in the *Duke Law Journal* and the *Supreme Court Review*; her latest article on artificial intelligence appeared in the *Northwestern University Law Review*.

## Acknowledgments

Each of us has cause to think with deep gratitude of those who have lighted the flame within us.

– Albert Schweitzer

*Robotica* would not have been possible without the efforts of many who fueled our intellectual flames. We gratefully recognize them here.

First and foremost: This book would never have been conceptualized had it not been for Ryan Calo, who through his teaching, writings, and conversations opened our minds to the world of robotics. In time, that led us to think about robotic expression and free speech. In that sense, Ryan's inspiration influenced us as it has many others.

Next is John Berger, our editor at Cambridge University Press, who has always believed in our book projects through the years and who has once again put his support fully behind this work. Our thanks to him and to the entire Cambridge University Press production team.

We also owe a debt of gratitude to our long-time friend, editor, and publisher Alex Lubertozi. We were fortunate to meet him in 2002 when he edited the first edition of *The Trials of Lenny Bruce* at Sourcebooks. Since then, his publishing house, *Top Five Books*, has released the second edition of *The Trials of Lenny Bruce* (2012) and issued *Mania: The Outraged & Outrageous Lives That Launched a Cultural Revolution* (2013) and *When Money Speaks: The McCutcheon Decision, Campaign Finance Laws, and the First Amendment* (2014). Alex's assistance was invaluable for this project, as he designed the ingenious book cover art for *Robotica* and assisted in the production of the manuscript. It's been a wondrous ride with you, Alex!

A full measure of thanks goes, as well, to our reliable research librarians – Kelly Kunsch at Seattle University School of Law and Mary Whisner and her colleagues at the University of Washington Law School.

An early version of Part II of this book was presented at the 2015 Conference on Governance of Emerging Technologies in Scottsdale, Arizona, in May of 2015. Our thanks to the organizers of that conference who selected our paper for presentation and to the conference participants who engaged with our work there.

Last, but certainly not least, a cornucopia of gratitude goes to our commentators – Jane Bambauer, Ryan Calo, James Grimmelman, Bruce Johnson, and Helen Norton. Their challenging observations on our work added immeasurably to the value of this book. By their sifting and weighing, they pushed us to better explain and defend our thesis at higher levels of analysis, and they enabled our readers to see beyond the first-level critiques that might be leveled at *Robotica*.