

New Frontiers of the Capability Approach

For over three decades, the capability approach (CA) proposed and developed by Amartya Sen and Martha Nussbaum has had a distinct impact on development theories and approaches. Going beyond a merely economic conception of development, it engages more widely with its normative aspects. This book explores the new frontiers of the CA and its links to human development in three main areas. First, it delves into the philosophical foundations of the approach, re-examining its links to concepts of common good, collective agency and epistemic diversity. Second, it addresses its 'operational frontier', aiming to give inclusive explanations of some of the most advanced methods available for capability researchers. Third, it discusses the wide range of applications for which this approach can be used, as carried out both by renowned capability scholars and by researchers from different disciplines. This broad interdisciplinary range includes the areas of human and sustainable development, inequalities, labour markets, education, special needs, cities, urban planning, housing, social capital and happiness studies, among others.

FLAVIO COMIM is an associate professor at the University Ramon Llull/IQS in Spain and an affiliated lecturer at the Centre of Development Studies, University of Cambridge. He has been a consultant for UNESCO, UNEP, FAO, WHO and UNDP. He co-edited the books *The Capability Approach: Concepts, Measures and Applications* (Cambridge, 2008), with Mozaffar Qizilbash and Sabina Alkire, and *Capabilities, Gender, Equality* (Cambridge, 2014), with Martha Nussbaum.

SHAILAJA FENNELL is Senior Lecturer in Development Studies at the University of Cambridge. Her previous publications include Rules, Rubrics and Riches: The Interrelations between Legal Reform and International Development (2010) and Gender Education and Equality in a Global Context: Conceptual Frameworks and Policy Perspectives (edited with M. Arnot, 2008).

P. B. ANAND is a reader in environmental economics and public policy at the University of Bradford where he has been teaching since 1998. His previous works include his book *Scarcity*, *Entitlements and the Economics of Water in Developing Countries* (2007) and papers on applying the capability approach to issues related to access to water and sustainability.





More Information

New Frontiers of the Capability Approach

Edited by

FLAVIO COMIM
IQS/Universitat Ramon Llull

SHAILAJA FENNELL University of Cambridge

P. B. ANAND University of Bradford





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108427807

DOI: 10.1017/9781108559881

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Comim, Flavio, editor. | Fennell, Shailaja, 1964- editor. | Anand, P. B., editor. Title: New frontiers of the capability approach / edited by Flavio Comim, Shailaja Fennell, P. B. Anand.

Description: Cambridge, UK; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Large print. | Includes bibliographic references.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018009332 | ISBN 9781108427807 (hardback : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Capabilities approach (Social sciences) | Economic development—Sociological aspects. | Human behavior.

Classification: LCC HD75 .N479 2018 | DDC 330.15/56—dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018009332

ISBN 978-1-108-42780-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Contents

List of Figures

	7 6	1 0
List	of Tables	3
List	of Contributors	xi
Pref	face and Acknowledgements	xiv
1	Introduction FLAVIO COMIM, SHAILAJA FENNELL AND P. B. ANAND	1
2	On Sen on the Capability of Capabilities: The Story of a Not-For-Profit Enterprise GAY MEEKS	12
	Part I The Need for New Foundations	
3	Capabilities and the Common Good JONATHAN WARNER	53
4	Measuring the Meta-Capability of Agency: A Theoretical Basis for Creating a Responsibility Indicator MATHIAS NEBEL AND MA. TERESA HERRERA RENDÓN NEB	82
5	Equal Liberty, Reflective Equilibrium and Education: Defending Rawls from Sen's Criticisms CAROLINE SOUZA AND GABRIEL GOLDMEIER	116
6	On Epistemic Diversity, Ontologies and Assumptions in Capability Approaches JOSH PLATZKY MILLER	139
7	Collective Agency Capability: How Capabilities Can Emerge in a Social Moment RAZIA SHARIFF	153

V

page viii



V1	Con	tents
	Part II The Operationalisation Frontier	
8	Sen's Capability Approach, Social Choice Theory and the Use of Rankings FLAVIO COMIM	179
9	Selecting Capabilities for Development: <i>An Evaluation</i> of <i>Proposed Methods</i> MORTEN F. BYSKOV	198
10	From Resources to Functioning: Rethinking and Measuring Conversion Rates ENRICA CHIAPPERO, PAOLA SALARDI AND FRANCESCO SCERVINI	232
11	Demystifying the Use of Simultaneous Equation Models for Operationalising the Capability Approach JAYA KRISHNAKUMAR AND RICARDO NOGALES	246
	Part III The Application Frontier	
12	Human Development in India: Comparing Sen and his Competitors DES GASPER	273
13	Sustainable Human Development Measurement Issues: A New Proposal MARIO BIGGERI AND VINCENZO MAURO	314
14	Inequality and Capabilities: A Multidimensional Empirical Exploration in Chile MACARENA ORCHARD AND MARTINA YOPO	329
15	Living Wages in International Supply Chains and the Capability Approach: <i>Towards a Conceptual Framework</i> STEPHANIE SCHRAGE AND KRISTIN HUBER	351
16	For a Happy Human Development TADASHI HIRAI	384
17	Capability of Capabilities and Aspirations of the Middle Classes in India	411



Con	ttents	vii
18	The Value of Individual and Community Social Resources PAUL ANAND AND IRIS MANTOVANI	436
	Part IV The Housing and Urban Frontier	
19	Tracking the Transition From 'Basic Needs' to 'Capabilities' for Human-Centred Development: <i>The Role of Housing in Urban Inclusion</i> SHAILAJA FENNELL, JAIME ROYO-OLID AND MATTHEW BARAC	475
20	Building Regulations through the Capability Lens: A Safer and Inclusive Built Environment? PRACHI ACHARYA	505
21	Cities and the Capability Approach P. B. ANAND	519
	Part V The Education Frontier	
22	Formal Education, Well-Being and Aspirations: A Capability-Based Analysis on High School Pupils from France ROBIN VOS AND JÉRÔME BALLET	549
23	Other People's Adaptations: Teaching Children with Special Educational Needs to Adapt and to Aspire CRISTINA DEVECCHI AND MICHAEL WATTS	571
24	Expanding Children's Capabilities at the Writers' Workshop HELENA KIFF	597
25	Education, Capabilities and Sustainable Development CAROLINE SAROJINI HART	617
Aut	hor Index	643
Sub	ject Index	652



Figures

7.1	Instrumental freedom changes needed for collective	
	agency capability to emerge	166
8.1	From non-comparability to full-comparability	187
11.1	The capability approach in a diagrammatic form	257
14.1	Histogram of the General Capabilities Index	340
15.1	Anker and Anker's living wage calculation methodology	
	for ISEAL	357
15.2	The role of work and remuneration in the model	
	of the capability approach	362
15.3	The systemic dimension of too low wages in the	
	international garment industry - challenges on	
	three levels	367
15.4	A model to compare and analyse accountability	
	standards	370
15.5	A framework to compare and analyse living wage	
	approaches	374
	NMC capability expansion	424
	NMC Doxa, habitus and the upward aspiration spiral	425
	Key relationships of power	482
19.2	Left: Social anthropologist Margot Ehrlich consults	
	tsunami victim about life and housing preferences.	
	Right: Architect Tiago Vier informs and collects choices	
	of end users about different choices of house types	484
19.3	Incremental post-tsunami houses by Architecture &	
	Dévéloppement in Tamil Nadu, India	489
19.4	Capabilities informed hypothetical design guidelines	
	for bonded-labourers low-cost housing in Alang Ship	
	breaking yards, Gujarat, India	494
19.5	Collage of conventional vs incremental low-cost houses	
	in Gujarat	495

viii



List of Figures		ix
19.6	Woman sitting in semi-public verandah in Ahmedabad,	
17.0	India	498
20.1	Capabilities framework for building standards	513
	Urbanisation and living longer? (a) Change in life	
	expectancy 1961–2011, (b) Cities and long life	531
21.2	Urbanisation but not living longer? (a) Urban population	
	as per cent total: 1961 to 2011 in countries where life	
	expectancy did not change much, (b) Countries where life	
	expectancy in 2011 is almost the same as 1961	532
21.3	Social gradient in Bradford's mortality rates?	533
21.4	Urbanisation and urban poverty: (a) Guinea and	
	Honduras, (b) Ethiopia and Paraguay (c) Ecuador,	
	Malawi, Thailand and Kazakhstan	536
21.5	Urbanisation and gender inequality in wage employment	
	(a) in 2000 and (b) in 2010	540
21.6	Urbanisation and proportion of people living in slums	
	2014	541
22.1	Frequency of response per modality in module 3:	
	value and quality of education	559
22.2	Frequency of response per modality in module 4:	
	well-being in school	560
22.3	Frequency of response per modality in module 5:	
	aspirations, with regard to education	561
25.1	Multi-stage process of converting commodities and	
	capitals to capabilities and functionings	624
25.2	Illustration of the trade-off between an individual's	
	capabilities and functionings and those of others	635



Tables

9.1	Overview of methods for the selection of capabilities	
	and functionings proposed within the human development	
	and capability literature	202
12.1	Word choices in Narendra Modi's speeches	301
12.2	Sen and Drèze in comparison to five other analyses of	
	India. Patterns of attention and lack of attention to	
	topics in human development	307
13.1	HDI components and new dimensions and proxy variable	
	normalized for selected countries, year 2005	323
13.2	A comparison between arithmetic mean, geometric	
	mean and MHDI	323
14.1	List of 11 capabilities	335
14.2	Means of the 11 capabilities indexes in the population	
	and their distribution according to sex, age and	
	socioeconomic status	338
14.3	Means of the General Capabilities Index by gender,	
	age and socioeconomic status	341
14.4	Capabilities quintile ratio of the General Capabilities	
	Index and the 11 capabilities indexes	343
14.5	F statistics of Capabilities' Indexes and wellbeing	
	measurements in the different clusters structures	345
14.6	Means of Capabilities' Indexes and wellbeing in the	
	structure of four clusters	346
14.7	Distribution of the clusters according to sex, age and	
	socioeconomic status	348
17.1	NMC aspiration-agency-capability mapping	426
17.2	Selected SDGs, agency, instrumental and constitutive	
	freedoms	429
18.1	Measures of experienced utility	445
18 2	Measures of social resources	447

X



List of Tables		xi
18.3	Determinants of life satisfaction	450
18.4	Happiness equations: Instrumental variables	456
18.5	Experience-based methods of valuation in the literature	457
18.6	Happiness equations: linear specification	462
18.7	Happiness equations: diminishing marginal utility	464
18.8	Happiness and social resources in the US and UK	466
19.1	Housing capabilities identified by the Equalities	
	Commission, UK	492
22.1	Distribution of modalities per variable in the	
	hierarchical cluster analysis groups	564
25.1	Extract from SDG 4, UN, 2015, pp. 17/35	619



Contributors

Prachi Acharya, University of Cambridge

P. B. Anand, University of Bradford

Paul Anand, Open University

Jérôme Ballet, University of Bordeaux and GREThA

Matthew Barac, London Metropolitan University

Mario Biggeri, University of Florence

Morten F. Byskov, University of Warwick

Enrica Chiappero, University of Pavia and CRHED University of Free State

Flavio Comim, IQS/Universitat Ramon Llull and University of Cambridge

Cristina Devecchi, University of Northampton

Shailaja Fennell, University of Cambridge

Des Gasper, International Institute of Social Studies (The Hague), Erasmus University Rotterdam, Netherlands

Gabriel Goldmeier, UCL Institute of Education

Caroline Sarojini Hart, University of Sheffield

Ma. Teresa Herrera Rendón Nebel, Universidad Popular Autonoma del Estado de Puebla

Tadashi Hirai, University of Cambridge

Kristin Huber, Universität

Helena Kiff, University of East Anglia

xii



List of Contributors

xiii

Jaya Krishnakumar, University of Geneva

Iris Mantovani, London Economics

Vincenzo Mauro, University of Pisa

Gay Meeks, University of Cambridge

Josh Platzky Miller, University of Cambridge

Mathias Nebel, Universidad Popular Autonoma del Estado de Puebla

Ricardo Nogales, University of Oxford and Universidad Privada Boliviana

Macarena Orchard, University of Nottingham

Jaime Royo-Olid, University of Cambridge

Paola Salardi, University of Toronto

Francesco Scervini, University of Pavia

Stephanie Schrage, Universität Hamburg

Razia Shariff, Canterbury Christ Church University

Caroline Souza, University of Cambridge

Meera Tiwari, University of East London

Robin Vos, University of Bordeaux and GREThA

Jonathan Warner, Quest University Canada

Michael Watts, Education Consultant

Martina Yopo, University of Cambridge



Preface and Acknowledgements

This book is a result of the first Cambridge Capability Conference (CCC) held in June 2016. It is a testimony to the vitality of the approach to tackle emerging human development challenges. This conference was the start of a new phase of capability conferences in Cambridge. From the early Cambridge and Pavia Capability Conferences in the first half of the 2000s and the creation of the Human Development and Capability Association, the literature on the capability approach (CA) has seen a prolific expansion. While the impressive intellectual stature of the founding figures of the CA, Amartya Sen and Martha Nussbaum, has been a decisive factor in the multi-dimensional and interdisciplinary expansion of the approach, it is important to acknowledge that much of the proliferation has also been due to the development of a large community of capability scholars spread all over the world.

Cambridge, both the University and the city, is home to many people working on the CA and has been an integral part of this history. It has provided a vibrant and stimulating environment for the delivery of lectures, convening of conferences, writing of PhD theses and undertaking of research on human development from a capability perspective. In fact, one of the best-kept Cambridge secrets is that for more than thirty-five years, the University has benefited from lectures on the CA offered by Gay Meeks. Gentle and reserved, she does not like to talk about her own achievements, a rare virtue nowadays, some might say. Yet, she is extremely influential not only due to the elegance of her writing, but also because of her generosity in lecturing to generations of students. It is not an exaggeration to suggest that many of us would not have learnt to understand and value the CA if we had not had the opportunity to sit in on her authoritative and stimulating lectures.

This book is first and foremost a record of our gratitude and admiration for Meeks who was invited to be the first keynote speaker of this conference series where we try to recreate the intellectually challenging

xiv



Preface and Acknowledgements

XV

environment of her lectures and the intimate intellectual atmosphere of the early Capability Conferences.

Meeks started her academic life getting a first in her BA at 'the other place' (the University of Oxford) in philosophy, politics and economics in 1971, followed by her PhD at the University of Edinburgh in 1975. During her PhD days she worked as a tutor in philosophy at the University of Glasgow. When she finished, she became an ESRC postdoctoral fellow at the Faculty of Economics and a Calouste Gulbenkian research fellow at Lucy Cavendish College in Cambridge. From 1978 to 1980 she was a lecturer in economics for St Anne's College, Oxford (yes, that college of Michael Sandel's 50p story!), a junior dean and joint warden of St Anne's-Balliol Graduate Centre. From 1985 to 1994 she was a fellow and director of studies in economics for Robinson College, in Cambridge. That overlapped with her appointment as a research associate from 1984 to 2001 at the Department of Applied Economics, Cambridge. During the twenty-two years, from 1986 to 2008, she was an affiliated lecturer at the Faculty of Economics in Cambridge. In 2001, she resumed her fellowship at Robinson College that continued until 2009. Since 2001, she has been appointed senior research associate, first in the Faculty of Economics, now in POLIS.

For so many of us, Meeks was the lecturer of an intriguing and challenging paper called 'Philosophical Issues in Economics'. This paper was given as part of the MPhil in economics until 2008 and from then on in the MPhil in development studies in Cambridge. This paper introduced the CA and provided a critical view of normative economics, a different kind of development based on principles broader than utilitarianism can offer, at least in its narrower forms.

The paper has also been an exemplar in academic excellence: from her meticulous notes, usually revised and amended, Meeks would not simply offer the key concepts to understand complex methodological debates, but also provide an impressive list of scholars who had already discussed the topics, accompanied by questions through which her students could develop their own thinking. If one felt intimidated by reading the 'giants' of economics and philosophy, Meeks would offer sets of tailored questions that would induce and empower her students to think critically about core issues for the understanding of economics as a moral science. This is not a minor achievement. One did not simply read Sen's 'Rational Fools'. One was invited to think about it. One was also invited to consider others' arguments and



xvi

Preface and Acknowledgements

points of view (the mark of a good essay!), never forgetting, of course, as she would repeat two to three times during the academic year, that 'Sen was the hero' of the paper.

One would 'learn by doing' that in order to be a good academic one would have to confront opposing views, stimulating values of tolerance and sympathy in the training of future generations of lecturers and professionals in other fields. But that was only half of the story: Meeks has always been an extremely gentle and kind teacher, offering generous office hours for seeing students, who would bring their ideas, hypotheses, misunderstandings and, yes, delusions (not always in comprehensible English) to her and receive kind and wise ministering.

We are delighted to be able to express our gratitude to Dr Meeks, as well as to all other participants of our first CCC and to the Centre of Development Studies in Cambridge that provided an interdisciplinary home for this forum. Our thanks also go to Doreen Woolfrey, because without her help the conference would not have been possible. We are also very grateful to our editor, Phil Good, who believed in this project when it was only an incipient idea.