

THE COUNCIL OF NICAEA

Every Sunday, Christians all over the world recite the Nicene Creed as a confession of faith. While most do not know the details of the controversy that led to its composition, they are aware that the Council of Nicaea was a critical moment in the history of Christianity. For scholars, the Council has long been a subject of multi-disciplinary interest and continues to fascinate and inspire research. As we approach the 1,700th anniversary of the Council, *The Cambridge Companion to the Council of Nicaea* provides an opportunity to revisit and reflect on old discussions, propose new approaches and interpretative frameworks, and ultimately revitalize a conversation that remains as important now as it was in the fourth century. The volume offers fifteen original studies by scholars who each examine an aspect of the Council. Informed by interdisciplinary approaches, the essays demonstrate its profound legacy with fresh, sometimes provocative, but always intellectually rich ideas.

Young Richard Kim is Associate Professor in the Department of Classics and Mediterranean Studies and the Department of History at the University of Illinois at Chicago. He is the author of *Epiphanius of Cyprus: Imagining an Orthodox World* (2015), which won the North American Patristics Society Best First Book Prize (2016).





CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS TO RELIGION

This is a series of companions to major topics and key figures in theology and religious studies. Each volume contains specially commissioned chapters by international scholars, which provide an accessible and stimulating introduction to the subject for new readers and non-specialists.

Other Titles in the Series

APOSTOLIC FATHERS Edited by Michael F. Bird and Scott Harrower

AMERICAN CATHOLICISM Edited by Margaret M. McGuinness and Thomas F. Rzeznick

AMERICAN ISLAM Edited by Juliane Hammer and Omid Safi

AMERICAN JUDAISM Edited by Dana Evan Kaplan

AMERICAN METHODISM Edited by Jason E. Vickers

ANCIENT MEDITERRANEAN RELIGIONS Edited by Barbette Stanley Spaeth

APOCALYPTIC LITERATURE Edited by Colin McAllister

AUGUSTINE'S CITY OF GOD Edited by David Vincent Meconi

AUGUSTINE'S "CONFESSIONS" Edited by Tarmo Toom

KARL BARTH Edited by John Webster

THE BIBLE, 2nd edition, Edited by Bruce Chilton

THE BIBLE AND LITERATURE Edited by Calum Carmichael

BIBLICAL INTERPRETATION Edited by John Barton

BLACK THEOLOGY Edited by Dwight N. Hopkins and Edward P. Antonio

DIETRICH BONHOEFFER Edited by John de Gruchy

JOHN CALVIN Edited by Donald K. McKim

CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE Edited by Colin Gunton

CHRISTIAN ETHICS Edited by Robin Gill

CHRISTIAN MYSTICISM Edited by Amy Hollywood and Patricia Z. Beckman

CHRISTIAN PHILOSOPHICAL THEOLOGY Edited by Charles Taliaferro and Chad V. Meister

CHRISTIAN POLITICAL THEOLOGY Edited by Craig Hovey and Elizabeth Phillips

THE CISTERIAN ORDER Edited by Mette Birkedal Bruun

CLASSICAL ISLAMIC THEOLOGY Edited by Tim Winter

JONATHAN EDWARDS Edited by Stephen J. Stein

EVANGELICAL THEOLOGY Edited by Timothy Larsen and Daniel J. Treier

FEMINIST THEOLOGY Edited by Susan Frank Parsons

FRANCIS OF ASSISI Edited by Michael J. P. Robson

THE GOSPELS Edited by Stephen C. Barton

THE GOSPELS, SECOND EDITION Edited by Stephen C. Barton and Todd Brewer

THE HEBREW BIBLE/OLD TESTAMENT Edited by Stephen B. Chapman and Marvin A. Sweeney

HEBREW BIBLE AND ETHICS Edited by C. L. Crouch

THE JESUITS Edited by Thomas Worcester





THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO

THE COUNCIL OF NICAEA

Edited by

Young Richard Kim University of Illinois at Chicago





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108427746

DOI: 10.1017/9781108613200

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Kim, Young Richard, 1976-editor.

TITLE: The Cambridge companion to the Council of Nicaea / edited by Young Richard Kim, "The University of Illinois at Chicago".

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Series: Cambridge companions to religion | Includes bibliographical references and index.

 ${\tt IDENTIFIERS: LCCN~2020035128~(print)~|~LCCN~2020035129~(ebook)~|}$

ISBN 9781108427746 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108448116 (paperback) |

ISBN 9781108613200 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Council of Nicaea (1st: 325: Nicaea, Turkey)

CLASSIFICATION: LCC BR210 .C35 2021 (print) | LCC BR210 (ebook) | DDC 262/.5-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020035128

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020035129

ISBN 978-1-108-42774-6 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-44811-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> For Ewan and Rhys 여호와를 경외하는 것이 지혜의 근본이요 거룩하신 자를 아는 것이 명철이니라 Prov. 9:10





Contents

List of Figures page xi List of Contributors xii Acknowledgements xiv List of Abbreviations xvi

 Introduction I YOUNG RICHARD KIM

Part I: Contexts 17

- Imperial Fathers and Their Sons: Licinius, Constantine, and the Council of Nicaea 19
 RAYMOND VAN DAM
- 3. Arius and Arianism: The Origins of the Alexandrian Controversy 43
 REBECCA LYMAN

Part II: The Council 63

- Hosting the Council in Nicaea: Material Needs and Solutions 65
 INE JACOBS
- 5. Reconstructing the Council of Nicaea 90 DAVID M. GWYNN
- 6. The Elephant in the Room: Constantine at the Council III H. A. DRAKE

Part III: Outcomes 133

- 7. The Creed 135 MARK J. EDWARDS
- 8. The Twenty Canons of the Council of Nicaea 158
 ANDREAS WECKWERTH

ix



x Contents

- The Council of Nicaea and the Celebration of the Christian Pasch 177
 DANIEL P. MCCARTHY
- Narrating the Council: Eusebius on Nicaea 202
 AARON P. JOHNSON

Part IV: The Aftermath 223

- II. The Reception of Nicaea and Homoousios to 360 225 SARA PARVIS
- The Emergence of the Pro-Nicene Alliance 256
 MARK DELCOGLIANO
- 13. Apollinarius and the Nicene Homoousion 282 KELLEY MCCARTHY SPOERL
- 14. The Council of Ariminum (359) and the Rise of the Neo-Nicenes 305D. H. WILLIAMS

Part V: The Long Reception 325

- 15. The Legacy of the Council of Nicaea in the Orthodox Tradition: The Principle of Unchangeability and the Hermeneutic of Continuity 327 PAUL L. GAVRILYUK
- 16. Catholic Reception of the Council of Nicaea 347 GEOFFREY D. DUNN

Appendices 368

Appendix 1: The Signatories 368

IAN MLADJOV

Appendix 2: Letter of the Synod of Nicaea

to the Egyptians 376

Bibliography 378

Index 416



Figures

- I.I From The Da Vinci Code (© 2006 Columbia Pictures Industries Inc.). All Rights Reserved. Courtesy of Columbia Pictures page 2
- 4.1 Plan of Roman Nicaea, from Foss 1996a, Fig. 1 © Holy Cross Orthodox Press). Used with permission 66
- 4.2 Aerial view of Nicaea [GoogleEarth, accessed October 1,2018]. Used under the terms of fair usage as per the rightsholders terms and conditions 67
- 4.3 The Galerian complex at Thessaloniki (reconstruction) (© Ephorate of Antiquities of Thessaloniki City). Used with permission 81
- 4.4 The so-called throne room in Trier (Wikimedia Commons, author: Pudelek (Marcin Szala)) 83
- 4.5 The Octagon in the Galerian complex at Thessaloniki (axonometric section, graphic reconstruction)
 (© Ephorate of Antiquities of Thessaloniki City). Used with permission 85
- Appendix 1.1 Select Bishoprics Represented at Nicaea, 325 (map by Ian Mladjov). Used with permission 375



Contributors

Mark DelCogliano is Associate Professor, Theology Department, University of St. Thomas (Minnesota, USA).

H. A. Drake is Research Professor, Department of History, University of California Santa Barbara (California, USA).

Geoffrey D. Dunn is a Fellow of the Australian Humanities Academy, Associate Professor, John Paul II Catholic University of Lublin (Poland), and Research Associate, University of Pretoria (South Africa).

Mark J. Edwards is Professor of Early Christian Studies, Faculty of Theology and Religion, Oxford University (UK).

Paul L. Gavrilyuk is Aquinas Chair in Theology and Philosophy, Theology Department, University of St. Thomas (Minnesota, USA).

David M. Gwynn is Reader in Ancient and Late Antique History, Department of History, Royal Holloway University of London (UK).

Ine Jacobs is Stavros Niarchos Foundation Associate Professor of Byzantine Archaeology and Visual Culture, The Ioannou Center for Classical and Byzantine Studies, Oxford University (UK).

Aaron P. Johnson is Associate Professor of Classics and Humanities, Lee University (Tennessee, USA).

Young Richard Kim is Associate Professor in the Department of Classics and Mediterranean Studies and the Department of History at the University of Illinois at Chicago.

Rebecca Lyman is Samuel Garrett Professor Emerita of Church History, The Church Divinity School of the Pacific (California, USA).

Daniel P. Mc Carthy is Fellow Emeritus and former Senior Lecturer, Department of Computer Science, Trinity College Dublin (Ireland).

Sara Parvis is Senior Lecturer, School of Divinity, University of Edinburgh (UK).

Kelley McCarthy Spoerl is Professor, Theology Department, Saint Anselm College (New Hampshire, USA).

xii



List of Contributors

xiii

Raymond Van Dam is Professor Emeritus, Department of History, University of Michigan (Michigan, USA).

Andreas Weckwerth is Professor of Ancient Church History and Patristics at the Catholic University of Eichstätt (Germany).

D. H. Williams is Professor of Religion in Patristics and Historical Theology, Department of Religion, Baylor University (Texas, USA).



Acknowledgements

Oddly enough, the first step in the production of this volume, an invitation from Beatrice Rehl at Cambridge University Press to become the editor, came in the autumn of 2016, on a day when I was waylaid by a sudden case of vertigo and recovering in an emergency room bed. The journey since then, of course, has been dizzying to say the least. All bad puns aside, I will say that how I had envisioned the volume, and how it ended up, of course, are very different. For one, I deeply regret that I was ultimately unsuccessful in recruiting more diverse scholars – especially persons of color - to contribute to this collection of essays. As we approach the 1,700th year since the Council of Nicaea, I can only hope that in the next centennial anniversary we will see another Cambridge Companion with as diverse a team of writers as I hope that the humanistic disciplines will actually be with its teaching and research practitioners. This of course in no way reflects negatively at all on the authors contained herein; they are, in a word, stellar. I am deeply grateful to each of them, without whose willingness to work with me, patience, good humor, insights, expertise, and superb writing, this volume would not exist. Ultimately, as the editor, any infelicities with respect to format, typographical errata, and more seriously, gaps in the actual content, are entirely my responsibility. If I had free rein, this volume would have had double the number of essays, covering many other interesting subjects and exploring several different trajectories, but there are wordcount limits, unforeseeable circumstances, and in the end editorial decisions that shall in the end remain unknown to you, the reader. Still, I am proud of this volume, and I am hopeful that it will generate further inquiry and continue an ongoing conversation about the Council of Nicaea and its lasting legacy.

This project began when I was on faculty at Calvin College (now University), and I am grateful for the support of colleagues and friends I received there, and it continued through my time at the Onassis Foundation, to which I am equally thankful. I want to offer particular

xiv



Acknowledgements

XV

thanks to Anthony Papadimitriou for the life-changing opportunity. I am fortunate to have a position as a Research Affiliate at the Institute for the Study of the Ancient World with NYU's superb research resources, which contributed greatly to the groundwork for this volume. Finally, I have found my professional home at the University of Illinois at Chicago, and I wish to thank in particular Dean Astrida Orle Tantillo for trusting me to lead the department of Classics and Mediterranean Studies. I also want to express my appreciation for my colleagues in the School of Literatures, Cultural Studies and Linguistics, my home department and my other department, History, and my students, who already in a short time have inspired and challenged me as a teacher and mentor.

In addition to Beatrice Rehl, I would also like to recognize and thank the team, past and present, at Cambridge University Press, whose members helped and guided me at various points along the publication process: Shalini Bisa, Eilidh Burrett, Becca Grainger, Edgar Mendez, Caroline Morley, and Victoria Parrin. I am also grateful to Akash Datchinamurthy at Integra Software Services. Finally, I must thank Nigel Hope, who copyedited the entire volume with precision, proficiency, and professionalism.

Our academic endeavors in many ways seem of lesser significance in light of the challenges we face today – inequality, violence, racism, authoritarianism, climate change, amid other forms of injustice. Still, I believe they contribute to the record of our shared human experience, and I maintain the conviction that the sum total of our efforts can meaningfully cultivate mutual understanding and humility. The quality of what we do while immersed in our books, articles, and critical editions, pounding away at our keyboards, is of course profoundly shaped by what we do away from them, and more importantly, with whom. Friends and family remind us that we are so much more than what we produce. My wife Betty is a boundless source of inspiration, and there simply are not enough words to communicate my gratitude to her. I dedicate this scholarly effort to our beloved sons, Ewan and Rhys, and I will do all that I can to pass on to them a world that I pray is at least a little more than today on its way to healing and restoration. *S.D.G.*



Abbreviations

Ancient Sources

In the footnotes, whenever possible I have edited all contributions to follow generally the orthographic and abbreviation conventions (with modifications) of Lampe 1961 for Greek authors and titles of primary sources and Blaise and Chirat 1954 for Latin authors and sources. For ancient authors not in Lampe, I have adopted those of Liddell and Scott 1996 and Glare 1968.

Ambrose of Milan	Ambr.
Epistulae	Ep.
Apollinarius of Laodicea	Apoll.
De fide et incarnatione	De fid. inc.
De unione corporis et divinitatis	De unione

Christi

Kata Meros PistisKMPCanones ApostolorumCan. App.AthanasiusAth.

Apologia ad Constantium Apol. Const. Apologia (secunda) contra Arianos Apol. sec. De decretis Nicaenae synodi De decr. De sent. Dion. De sententia Dionysii De synodis Arimini et Seleuciae De syn. Epistula ad Afros episcopos Ep. Afr. Epistula ad Epictetum Ep. Epict. Epistula festivalis Ep. fest.

Orationes tres adversus Arianos Ar. Tomus ad Antiochenos Tom.

xvi



List of Abbreviations

xvii

(cont.)

Augustine Aug.

De Trinitate De Trin.

Basil of Caesarea Bas.

Contra Eunomium Eun.

Epistulae Ep.

Collectio Avellana Coll. Avell.

Collectio Avellana
Cyril of Alexandria
Cyr.

Epistulae
Epiphanius
Panarion
Eusebius of Caesarea
Contra Marcellum
De ecclesiastica theologia
Cyr.

Epp.
Epp.
Epiph.
Pan.
Eusebius of Caesarea
Eus.
Marcell.
De ecc. th.

De vita Constantini VC
Epistula ad Caesarienses Ep. Caes.
Epistula ad Euphrationem Ep. Euphrat.

Historia ecclesiasticaHEPraeparatio EvangelicaPEEustathius of AntiochEust.FragmentaFr.

Gregory of Nazianzus

Epistulae

Orationes

Orat.

Hilary of Poitiers

Collectanea antiariana Parisina

De synodis

Fragmenta Historica

Gr. Naz.

Ep.

Orat.

Hilar.

Crap.

Desp.

CAP

De syn.

FH

Aux.

Pamph.

Liber contra Auxentium Mediolanensem

Lactantius Lact.

De mortibus persecutorum DMP

Leontius of Byzantium Leont.

Adversus fraudes Apolloniaristarum Apoll.

Origen Or.

Commentarii in Johannem Jo.

Contra Celsum Cels.

De principiis De princ.

Pamphilus



> xviii List of Abbreviations (cont.) Apologia Origenis Ap. Orig. Panegyrici latini Paneg. lat. Phil. Philostorgius HEHistoria ecclesiastica Phoebadius of Agen Phoeb. Liber contra Arrianos Ar. Socrates Socr. Historia ecclesiastica HESozomen Soz Historia ecclesiastica HESulp. Sev. Sulpicius Severus Chronicorum libri duo Chron. Tertullian Tert.

> > Prax.

Thdt.

HE

Modern Sources

Aduersus Praxean

Historia ecclesiastica

Theodoret

ACO	Acta Conciliorum Oecumenicorum
CCSG	Corpus Christianorum Series Graeca
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum Series Latina

CH Church History

CSEL Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum

Dok. Hanns Christof Brennecke, Uta Heil, Annette von
Stockhausen, and Angelika Wintjes, eds. 2007.

Athanasius Werke: Dokumente zur Geschichte des

Athanasius Werke: Dokumente zur Geschichte des arianischen Streites. Vol. 3, pt. 1. Lieferung 3: Bis zur

Ekthesis Makrostichos. Berlin: De Gruyter

Hanns Christof Brennecke, Annette von Stockhausen, Christian Müller, Uta Heil, and Angelika Wintjes, eds. 2014. Athanasius Werke: Dokumente zur Geschichte des arianischen Streites. Vol. 3, pt. 1. Lieferung 4: Bis zur Synode von Alexandrien 362. Berlin: De Gruyter

DOP Dumbarton Oaks Papers
FC The Fathers of the Church

GCS Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten

drei Jahrhunderte



List of Abbreviations

xix

GRBS Greek, Roman, and Byzantine Studies

HTR Harvard Theological Review

JAEMA Journal of the Australian Early Medieval Association

JECS Journal of Early Christian Studies
JEH Journal of Ecclesiastical History

JLA Journal of Late Antiquity
JRS Journal of Roman Studies
JTS Journal of Theological Studies

Lampe 1961 Lampe, G. W. H. 1961. A Patristic Greek Lexicon.

Oxford: Oxford University Press.

LCL Loeb Classical Library

NBA Nuova Biblioteca Agostiniana

NPNF A Select Library of Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers

PG Patrologia Graeca PL Patrologia Latina

PLRE Prosopography of the Later Roman Empire
RAC Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum

RHE Revue d'historie ecclésiastique

SC Sources chrétiennes StPatr Studia Patristica

TTH Translated Texts for Historians

Urk. Hans-Georg Opitz, ed. 1934. Athanasius Werke III. 1,

Lieferung 1–2: Urkunden zur Geschichte des arianischen Streites, 318–328. Berlin: De Gruyter

VC Vigiliae Christianae

ZAC Zeitschrift für antikes Christentum ZKG Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte

