

## The Cambridge Companion to **Legal Positivism**

Legal positivism is one of the fundamental theories of jurisprudence studied in law and related fields around the world. This volume addresses how legal positivism is perceived and makes the case for why it is relevant for contemporary legal theory. *The Cambridge Companion to Legal Positivism* offers thirty-three chapters from leading scholars that provide a comprehensive commentary on the fundamental ideas of legal positivism, its history and major theorists, its connection to normativity and values, its current development and influence, as well as on the criticisms moved against it.

**Torben Spaak** is Professor of Jurisprudence, Department of Law, Stockholm University.

**Patricia Mindus** is Professor in Practical Philosophy, Department of Philosophy, Uppsala University.



### Cambridge Companions to Law

Cambridge Companions to Law offers thought-provoking introductions to different legal disciplines, invaluable to both the student and the scholar. Edited by world-leading academics, each offers a collection of essays which both map out the subject and allow the reader to delve deeper. Critical and enlightening, the Companions library represents legal scholarship at its best.

The Cambridge Companion to European Private Law Edited by Christian Twigg-Flesner

The Cambridge Companion to International Law Edited by James Crawford and Martti Koskenniemi

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Law Edited by Mauro Bussani and Ugo Mattei

The Cambridge Companion to Human Rights Law Edited by Conor Gearty and Costas Douzinas

The Cambridge Companion to Public Law Edited by Mark Elliott and David Feldman

The Cambridge Companion to International Criminal Law Edited by William A. Schabas

The Cambridge Companion to Natural Law Jurisprudence Edited by George Duke and Robert P. George

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Family Law Edited by Shazia Choudhry and Jonathan Herring

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law Edited by Roger Masterman and Robert Schütze

The Cambridge Companion to the First Amendment and Religious Liberty Edited by Michael D. Breidenbach and Owen Anderson

The Cambridge Companion to the Philosophy of Law Edited by John Tasioulas

The Cambridge Companion to Legal Positivism Edited by Torben Spaak and Patricia Mindus



**More Information** 

# The Cambridge Companion to

# Legal Positivism

Edited by

Torben Spaak Stockholm University Patricia Mindus Uppsala University





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108427678

DOI: 10.1017/9781108636377

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Spaak, Torben, editor. | Mindus, Patricia, editor.

Title: The Cambridge companion to legal positivism / edited by Torben Spaak,

Stockholm University; Patricia Mindus, Uppsala University.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Series: Cambridge companions to law | Includes bibliographical references and index

Identifiers: LCCN 2020035123 | ISBN 9781108427678 (hardback) | ISBN

9781108447010 (paperback | ISBN 9781108636377 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Legal positivism. | Jurisprudence. | Law - Philosophy.

Classification: LCC K331 .C353 2021 | DDC 340/.112-dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020035123

ISBN 978-1-108-42767-8 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-44701-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### Contents

	List of Figures	page viii
	List of Contributors	ix
	Acknowledgements	xvii
1	Introduction Torben Spaak and Patricia Mindus	1
	Part I Fundamentals	37
2	Positivism, Realism and Sources of Law Leslie Green	39
3	Normative Legal Positivism Frederick Schauer	61
4	Legal Positivism as a Realist Theory of Law Brian Leiter	79
	Part II History	103
5	The German Tradition of Legal Positivism Stephan Kirste	105
6	The French Tradition of Legal Positivism Michel Troper	133
7	The Italian Tradition of Legal Positivism Riccardo Guastini	152
8	The British Tradition of Legal Positivism Gerald J. Postema	176



### vi Contents

	Part III Central Figures	201
9	Jeremy Bentham and the Origins of Legal Positivism Philip Schofield	203
10	John Austin Michael Lobban	225
11	The Normative Power of the Factual: Georg Jellinek's Phenomenological Theory of Reflective Legal Positivism Jens Kersten	248
12	Hans Kelsen's Non-Reductive Positivism Michael S. Green	272
13	The Legal Positivism of H. L. A. Hart Matthew H. Kramer	301
14	From Savigny to Linguistic Analysis: Legal Positivism through Bobbio's Eyes Pierluigi Chiassoni	325
15	Joseph Raz's Approach to Legal Positivism Brian H. Bix	349
16	Bulygin's Analytical Legal Positivism María Cristina Redondo	371
	Part IV Main Tenets	395
17	Social-Practice Legal Positivism and the Normativity Thesis Stefano Bertea	397
18	Social Facts and Legal Facts: Perils of Hume's Guillotine Tomasz Gizbert-Studnicki	419
19	The Scope of Legal Positivism: Validity or Interpretation? Torben Spaak	443
20	What <i>Is</i> Law and What <i>Counts</i> as Law? The Separation Thesis in Context Andrei Marmor	465
21	The Origins of Inclusive Legal Positivism W. J. Waluchow	487



		Contents	vii
22	Disruptive Implications of Legal Positivism's Social Efficac Thesis Brian Z. Tamanaha	ey 512	
23	The Semantic Thesis in Legal Positivism Michael S. Green	536	
	Part V Normativity and Values	559	
24	Legal Positivism and Meta-Ethics Kevin Toh	561	
25	The Normativity of Law Brian H. Bix	585	
26	An Italian Path to Legal Positivism: Ferrajoli's <i>Garantismo</i> J. J. Moreso	606	
	Part VI Critique	625	
27	Gustav Radbruch's Critique of Legal Positivism Martin Borowski	627	
28	Good Order and Workable Arrangements: Lon Fuller's Critique of Legal Positivism Kenneth Winston	651	
29	Dworkin's Critique of Hart's Positivism Dennis Patterson	675	
30	Tracing Finnis's Criticism of Hart's Internal Point of View: Instability and the 'Point' of Human Action in Law Veronica Rodriguez-Blanco	695	
31	Alexy's Critique of Legal Positivism Jan Sieckmann	720	
32	Mark Greenberg on Legal Positivism Barbara Baum Levenbook	742	
33	Positivism and Totalitarianism David Dyzenhaus	764	
	Index	786	



## **Figures**

1.1	Types of legal positivism	page 14
19.1	Interpretations of the social thesis	451



### **Contributors**

Stefano Bertea is an associate professor at the University of Leicester. In his academic career he has been a Marie Curie research fellow at the University of Edinburgh and at the Goethe University of Frankfurt am Main, a visiting research fellow at the University of Amsterdam and at the Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law in Heidelberg, an Alexander von Humboldt research fellow at the University of Kiel, a senior research fellow at the University of Antwerp and a visiting professor at the University of Catanzaro, at the University of Verona and at the University of Modena and Reggio Emilia.

Brian H. Bix is the Frederick W. Thomas Professor of Law and Philosophy at the University of Minnesota. Previously he taught at King's College London and Quinnipiac University, and held visiting positions at the Georgetown University Law Center and George Washington University Law School. He is a member of the Bar of the States of Minnesota, Massachusetts and Connecticut, and a member of the American Law Institute. He is the author of 17 books and 150 articles in the areas of jurisprudence, contract law and family law.

Martin Borowski is a professor at the Faculty of Law at the Ruprecht-Karls University of Heidelberg where he teaches public law, constitutional theory and legal philosophy. Previously he held a research fellowship of the Humboldt Foundation, based in the United States at the School of Law of Washington University in St. Louis, Missouri, and in the UK at the University of Westminster School of Law, London, and at the Law School of the University of Birmingham.

Pierluigi Chiassoni is a professor of philosophy of law at the University of Genoa and he teaches legal reasoning and legal interpretation for the international Master's programme on global rule of law and constitutional argumentation. He works on general theory of law, history of legal culture, history of analytical jurisprudence, theory of legal interpretation and



### x List of Contributors

argumentation, theory of case-law analysis, theory of the constitutional state and constitutional interpretation, logical forms of judicial reasoning, and theory of human rights. He is co-editor of *Materiali per una storia della cultura giuridica* [*Materials for a History of Legal Culture*] and *Analisi del pensiero giuridico* [*Analysis of Legal Thought*].

David Dyzenhaus is the Albert Abel Chair and a professor of law and philosophy at the University of Toronto. He has taught in South Africa, England, Canada, Singapore, New Zealand, Hungary, Mexico and the United States. He has been the Law Foundation visiting fellow in the Faculty of Law, University of Auckland, the Herbert Smith visiting professor in the Cambridge Law Faculty, the Arthur Goodhart visiting professor in legal science in Cambridge, and he has been a fellow of the Institute for Advanced Study, Berlin. He has been a senior scholar of Pembroke College (Cambridge) and he is a fellow of the Royal Society of Canada.

Tomasz Gizbert-Studnicki is a professor of legal sciences specialising in legal theory and head of the Department of Legal Theory at the Faculty of Law and Administration of the Jagiellonian University. Gizbert-Studnicki is also legal counsel, a co-founder and a senior partner in the SPCG law firm. He is a member of the Legal Commission of the Polish Academy of Learning and he has been a member of the Executive Committee of the International Association of Legal and Social Philosophy. He is the curator of the Association of Law Students' Library of the Jagiellonian University and the supervisor of the Science Club of the Philosophy of Law of TBSP.

Leslie Green has been a fellow at Lincoln and at Balliol Colleges (Oxford) and at Osgoode Hall Law School (Toronto), a visiting fellow at Columbia University, a visiting professor at Berkeley and at the University of Chicago, a regular visiting professor at the University of Texas, a member of the Hauser Global Faculty at NY University School of Law and a professor at the University of Oxford. He is a professor and a distinguished university fellow at Queen's University at Kingston (Canada). He is co-editor of Oxford Studies in the philosophy of law and of the monograph series the *Oxford Library of Legal Philosophy*.

Michael S. Green is the Woodbridge Professor of Law at William and Mary Law School. Previously he taught law at George Mason Law School. He clerked for Judge Richard A. Posner on the US Court of Appeals for the Seventh Circuit and practised law at Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton &



List of Contributors

хi

Garrison in New York City. He has been an assistant professor of philosophy at Tufts University and a visiting lecturer in philosophy at the University of Alabama (Huntsville), Wesleyan University and Yale University. He works on civil procedure, conflict of laws, constitutional law, continental philosophy, federal courts, jurisprudence, philosophy of law, and professional responsibility.

Riccardo Guastini is an emeritus professor of philosophy of law at the University of Genoa and director of the Tarello Institute for the Philosophy of Law in the Department of Jurisprudence of the same university. He is codirector of the journals *Analisi e diritto* [*Analysis and Law*], *Ragion pratica* [*Practical Reason*] and *Materiali per la storia della cultura giuridica* [*Materials for the History of Legal Culture*]. His field of research includes the analysis of normative language, fundamental legal concepts, the structure of legal systems and techniques of argumentation and legal interpretation.

Stefan Kirste is a professor at the University of Salzburg and president of the German section of the International Association of Philosophy of Law and Social Philosophy. He is co-founder and president of the History of Ideas working group in the German section of this association. Among other things he has been a lecturer at the Federal University of Minas Gerais, the Federal University of Rio de Janeiro, the Federal University of Pernambuco, the Federal University of Alagoas, the Pontifical Catholic University of Rio Grande do Sul, the University of Santa Cruz do Sul and the Autonomous University Center of Brazil-UNIBRASIL.

Brian Leiter is the Karl N. Llewellyn Professor of Jurisprudence at the University of Chicago Law School and founder and director of Chicago's Center for Law, Philosophy & Human Values. He taught from 1995 to 2008 at the University of Texas School of Law, where he has been founder and director of the Law and Philosophy Program. He joined the University of Chicago in 2008. He has been a visiting professor at universities in the United States and Europe, including Yale University and Oxford University. He works primarily on legal philosophy and continental philosophy, especially Nietzsche and Marx.

Barbara Baum Levenbook is a professor at North Carolina State University where she teaches philosophy of law, ethics, and social and political philosophy. With a background in philosophy from the University of Arizona, she is the author of a number of articles and book chapters on



### xii List of Contributors

philosophy of law, ethics and more. Levenbook has published her work in journals such as *Philosophy Compass*, *Legal Theory*, *Archiv für Rechts- und Sozialphilosophie* [*Archive for Legal and Social Philosophy*], *Law and Contemporary Problems* and *Ethics*. Among her contribution to the field of philosophy of law, her work on Dworkin deserves particular mention as does her research on the social fact thesis.

Michael Lobban is a professor of legal history at the London School of Economics and Political Science, as of 2013, having previously been a professor of legal history at Queen Mary University (London), since 2003. He works on the concept and practice of the rule of law in the long nineteenth century. He is one of the editors of the American Society for Legal History's book series and he was appointed secretary of the Selden Society at the end of 2015.

Jens Kersten is a professor of public law and administrative science at the Ludwig Maximilians University in Munich. A pupil of Ulrich Battis, he studied law at the Universities of Heidelberg, Leeds in the UK and Bonn in Germany. He has been a member of the Ethics Committee of the Charité in Berlin. He works on building law, spatial planning law, administrative, constitutional and European law, as well as legal sociology and constitutional history.

Matthew Kramer is a professor of legal and political philosophy at the University of Cambridge and a fellow of Churchill College (Cambridge) where he has taught since 1994. He has been the director of the Cambridge Forum for Legal and Political Philosophy since 2000. He has authored many works, mainly in the area of meta-ethics, deontological ethics, legal philosophy, political philosophy and moral philosophy, on questions such as legal positivism, legal objectivity, rights and freedom. Kramer is a fellow of the British Academy.

Andrei Marmor is the Jacob Gould Schurman Professor of Philosophy and Law at Cornell Law School. He has been a professor of philosophy and the Maurice Jones Jr Professor of Law at the University of Southern California. Having obtained his first law and philosophy degrees at the Tel Aviv University in Israel, and a doctorate at Oxford University (UK), he returned to Tel Aviv University, where he taught as a professor of law for ten years, before moving to the United States. His research interests are philosophy of law, moral and social philosophy, political philosophy and philosophy of language.



List of Contributors

xiii

Patricia Mindus is a professor of practical philosophy at Uppsala University and director of the Uppsala Forum for Democracy, Peace and Justice. She has authored four monographs, including an award-winning book on Axel Hägerström, *A Real Mind* (2009), and a bestseller on *European Citizenship After Brexit* (2017). Some of her work is inspired by Scandinavian legal realism and has been translated into Spanish, Portuguese, Slovenian, Chinese and Russian. Mindus is the president of the Swedish IVR association and editor of the Legal Schools of Thought section for the *IVR Encyclopedia of Philosophy of Law*.

J. J. Moreso is a professor of philosophy of law and the former rector of the University Pompeu Fabra in Barcelona. He has taught as a professor of philosophy of law at the Autonomous University of Barcelona, the University of Girona and Pompeu Fabra University in Barcelona. He has been vice-rector of teaching staff and the European Space for Higher Education at Pompeu Fabra University. In October 2010 he was awarded an honorary doctorate from the University of Valparaíso, in Chile, for his career as an academic and jurist. Since 2013, he is the president of AQU Catalunya.

Dennis M. Patterson is the Board of Governors Professor of Law at Rutgers Law School. He has been awarded senior research grants from the Fulbright Commission, Humboldt Stiftung and the American Council of Learned Societies. He has been holder of the Fulbright Distinguished Chair in Law at Trento University. He has been a visiting professor at the universities of Berlin, Vienna, Texas, Georgetown and at the European University Institute in Florence where he has held the chair in legal theory and legal philosophy. He works in the fields of commercial law, trade law and legal philosophy.

Gerald Postema is the Cary C. Boshamer Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. Earlier he served as the Arthur L. Goodhart Distinguished Visiting Professor of Legal Science (Cambridge) and was a fellow of Corpus Christi College (Cambridge). He is a former Guggenheim fellow, Rockefeller fellow (Bellagio), Medlin fellow (National Humanities Center), fellow of the Netherlands Institute for Advanced Studies and visiting fellow at the European University Institute (Florence). He works on legal and political philosophy, and ethics.



### xiv List of Contributors

Cristina Redondo is a professor at the University of Genoa, where she teaches philosophy of law, general theory of law, theories of justice, and techniques of interpretation and argumentation and was previously affiliated with Spanish and Latin American universities. Her research interests include legal and moral theory, argumentation theory and interpretation theory. She is a committee member of the following journals: Revista de Teoría del Derecho de la Universidad de Palermo [Journal of Theory and Law of the University of Palermo] (Argentina), Revista Latinoamericana de Filosofía Política [Latin American Journal of Political Philosophy], Diritto e questioni pubbliche [Law and Public Affairs], Analisi e diritto [Analysis and Law] and Discusiones [Discussions]. She is also a member of the editorial board of the Studies of Analytical Philosophy of Law series.

Veronica Rodriguez-Blanco is the inaugural holder of the chair of moral and political philosophy (jurisprudence) in the School of Law, University of Surrey and a member of the Surrey Centre for Law and Philosophy. Her research is located at the intersection of practical reason, philosophy of action, and law. She draws insights from ancient, medieval and contemporary moral psychology, action theory, private law, legal authority, and normativity. She is co-editor of the journal *Jurisprudence: An International Journal of Legal and Political Thought.* 

Frederick Schauer is the David and Mary Harrison Distinguished Professor of Law at the University of Virginia and Frank Stanton Professor (Emeritus) of the First Amendment at the Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University. He was previously a professor at the University of Michigan and has been a visiting professor at the Columbia Law School, Fischel-Neil Distinguished Visiting Professor at the University of Chicago, Morton Distinguished Visiting Professor at Dartmouth College, a distinguished visiting professor at the University of Toronto, a visiting fellow at the Australian National University, a distinguished visitor at NY University, and the Eastman Professor and a fellow of Balliol College (Oxford).

Philip Schofield is a professor of the history of legal and political thought at the Faculty of Laws of University College London. Director of the Bentham Project and general editor of the *Collected Works of Jeremy Bentham*, he is the chair of the Bentham Seminar, where scholars present new research on Bentham studies. He is the secretary of the International Society for Utilitarian Studies, which organises major international



List of Contributors

χV

conferences. Published by Oxford University Press, his *Utility and Democracy: The Political Thought of Jeremy Bentham* has been awarded the Mackenzie Book Prize by the Political Studies Association.

Jan-Reinard Sieckmann is a professor at the Friedrich-Alexander-University Erlangen-Nürnberg. He was previously a research assistant for Robert Alexy at the University of Kiel and has been long-term lecturer at the University of Buenos Aires and a professor at the universities of Cologne, Freiburg and Bamberg. His main research interests are in the field of legal philosophy, legal theory, argumentation theory, constitutional theory, as well as fundamental and human rights. He has a particular research interest in autonomy.

Torben Spaak is a professor of jurisprudence at the Department of Law, Stockholm University where he is also the vice-dean for education. He has co-edited two *Festschrifts* and is the author of three monographs in jurisprudence, including *A Critical Appraisal of Karl Olivecrona's Legal Philosophy* (Springer, 2014). Spaak has also authored contributions to several collections of essays in legal philosophy and has written a number of articles in journals such as *Analisi e diritto* [*Analysis and Law*], *Archiv für Rechts- und Sozialphilosophie* [*Archive for Legal and Social Philosophy*], *Buffalo Law Review, Ethics, Jurisprudence, Law and Philosophy, Revus, Ratio Juris, Theoria* and *The Theory and Practice of Legislation*. He is also series co-editor of Springer's Law and Philosophy Library and has twice been a visiting professor at the University of Minnesota Law School.

Brian Z. Tamanaha is the John S. Lehmann University Professor at the Washington University School of Law in St. Louis. He has delivered the Kobe Memorial Lecture in Tokyo, the Julius Stone Address in Sydney, the Cotterrell Lecture in London and the Montesquieu Lecture at Tilburg University. He spent a year as a member of the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton. He has been a visiting professor at University of Amsterdam, the European University Institute (Florence), Queen Mary University (London) and Columbia Law School. Four of his books have received awards, including *A General Jurisprudence of Law and Society* (2001), which was awarded the Law and Society prize and another legal theory prize.

Kevin Toh is a senior lecturer in the Faculty of Laws at University College London. Previously an associate professor in the Department of Philosophy



### xvi List of Contributors

at San Francisco State University and an assistant professor in the Department of Philosophy at Indiana University in Bloomington, he is a prolific author in the field of philosophy of law and has also made forays into moral philosophy and constitutional theory. His work in philosophy of law addresses the nature of legal thought, discourse and practice, by exploiting certain theoretical resources from contemporary meta-ethics, aesthetics and philosophy of action.

Michel Troper is an emeritus professor in public law at Paris Nanterre University and also teaches philosophy of law at Sciences Po. He was previously a professor at the University of Rouen. He has been a member of the Institut Universitaire de France, and president and founder of the Société Française de Philosophie Politique et Juridique. He is director of the Centre de théorie et analyse du droit. His field of expertise includes French constitutional law.

W. J. Waluchow is a professor in the McMaster University Department of Philosophy, the Senator William McMaster Chair in Constitutional Studies and an adjunct member of the Graduate Faculty of Osgoode Hall Law School at the University of Toronto. After study at the University of Western Ontario, he joined Oxford University to study philosophy of law under the supervision of Hart. He works on general jurisprudence, philosophy of constitutional law and especially on inclusive legal positivism.

Kenneth Winston is an emeritus lecturer in ethics at the Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University. His work built the school's capacity in comparative international ethics, developing new cases for classroom use and teaching in overseas venues, especially in Asia. He has written extensively on case teaching, professional ethics and legal theory. He has been a fellow of the American Council of Learned Societies, a senior research fellow of the National Endowment for the Humanities and a John Dewey senior fellow. He was selected by the KSG class of 2005 for the Manuel Carballo Award for Excellence in teaching.



## Acknowledgements

The editors would like to thank the Bank of Sweden Tercentenary Foundation, the Justice Edvard Cassel Foundation and the Wenner-Gren Foundation for their generous support, which allowed us to hold conferences at Stockholm University in November 2018 and April 2019, at which the contributors to the present volume presented draft chapters. The editors would also like to thank Astrid Söderbergh Widding, President of Stockholm University, for allowing us to host conference dinners at the Scheffler Palace, also referred to as the Haunted Mansion; and Astrid Söderbergh Widding and Astri Muren, Deputy Vice President of Stockholm University, for giving the welcome addresses. In addition, the editors would like to thank Jessika van der Sluijs, Dean of the Faculty of Law at Stockholm University, and the Knut & Alice Wallenberg Foundation, for financing individual visits to Stockholm and Uppsala, respectively, for contributors who were unable to attend the conferences. The visits to Uppsala were financed by the Wallenberg Foundation within the framework of the CIVIS SUM project, directed by Patricia Mindus as a Wallenberg Academy Fellow (2015-21). Special thanks also to those contributors who stepped in to do an additional chapter when the original authors had to withdraw, to Stanley Paulson for his invaluable help and encouragement in the development of the current project and to Jackie Grant at Cambridge University Press for her patience and support. Finally, the editors would like to thank Cyril Holm for his creativity and hard work in the organisation and running of the conferences and for much else besides, Staffan Westerlund for creating the conference posters and for taking photos during the conferences, and Mahendra Kunhody for creating the index.

