

# THE CAMBRIDGE HISTORY OF ANCIENT CHRISTIANITY

The first three hundred years of the Common Era witnessed critical developments that would become foundational for Christianity itself, as well as for the societies and later history that emerged thereafter. The concept of "ancient Christianity," however, along with the content that the category represents, has raised much debate. This is, in part, because within this category lie multiple forms of devotion to Jesus Christ, multiple phenomena, and multiple permutations in the formative period of Christian history. Within those multiples lie numerous contests, as varieties of Christian identity laid claim to authority and authenticity in different ways. *The Cambridge History of Ancient Christianity* addresses these contested areas with both nuance and clarity by reviewing, synthesizing, and critically engaging recent scholarly developments. The twenty-seven thematic chapters, specially commissioned for this volume from an international team of scholars, also offer constructive ways forward for future research.

BRUCE W. LONGENECKER is Professor of Christian Origins and W. W. Melton Chair of Religion at Baylor University. His recent books include *In Stone and Story: Early Christianity in the Roman World* (Baker Academic, 2020), and *Greco-Roman Associations, Deities, and Early Christianity* (Baylor University Press, 2022).

DAVID E. WILHITE is Professor of Historical Theology at the George W. Truett Theological Seminary of Baylor University. His recent books include Ancient African Christianity (Routledge, 2017), Ireneus and Paul (co-edited with Todd D. Still; Bloomsbury/T&T Clark, 2020), The Apologists and Paul (co-edited with Todd D. Still; Bloomsbury/T&T Clark, forthcoming 2024), and Israel's LORD: YHWH as Two Powers in Second Temple Literature (with Adam Winn; Fortress Press, forthcoming 2024).



# THE CAMBRIDGE HISTORY OF ANCIENT CHRISTIANITY

Edited by

BRUCE W. LONGENECKER

Baylor University, Texas

DAVID E. WILHITE Baylor University, Texas







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108427395

DOI: 10.1017/9781108620420

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

 $\label{lem:condition} A\ catalogue\ record\ for\ this\ publication\ is\ available\ from\ the\ British\ Library$ 

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

NAMES: Longenecker, Bruce W., editor. | Wilhite, David E., editor.

TITLE: The Cambridge history of ancient Christianity / edited by Bruce W. Longenecker,
Baylor University, Texas, David E. Wilhite, Baylor University, Texas.

DESCRIPTION: First edition. | Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY, USA: Cambridge
University Press, 2024. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2022052598 (print) | LCCN 2022052599 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108427395
(hardback) | ISBN 9781108446143 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108620420 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Church history—Primitive and early church, ca. 30-600. |

Christianity—Historiography.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC BR160.A1 C36 2024 (print) | LCC BR160.A1 (ebook) |

DDC 270.2—DC23/eng/20230320

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022052598

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022052599

ISBN 978-I-108-42739-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## Contents

List of Figures page ix

Notes on the Contributors x

Editors' Preface xiii

BRUCE W. LONGENECKER AND DAVID E. WILHITE

# PART I CONTESTED CONTEXTS

- I · The History of Ancient Christian History 3
- 2 · The Present and Future of Ancient Christian History 32
  DAVID E. WILHITE
- 3 · Depicting the Other in Early Christian Polemic: Christian Rhetoric and Identity in the Early Heresiologists 57
  RICHARD FLOWER
- 4 · Why Did People Become Christians in the Pre-Constantinian World?

  Reframing the Question 80

  ÉRIC REBILLARD

# PART II CONTESTED FIGURES

5 · Remembering Jesus in Earliest Christianity: The What and How of Socially Framed Memory 109 BENJAMIN LEE SUTTON AND ANTHONY LE DONNE

V



#### Contents

- 6 · Remembering Jesus in the Second and Third Centuries CE 130

  ANDREW GREGORY
  - 7 · Paul and His Diverse Champions 154
    BENJAMIN L. WHITE
  - 8 · Peter and His Diverse Champions 175
    TOBIAS NICKLAS

## PART III CONTESTED HERITAGE

- 9 · Jews and Christians in Pagan Antiquity: From the First through the
  Third Centuries 199
  CHRISTINE SHEPARDSON AND PAULA FREDRIKSEN
  - 10 · The Marcionite Option 228
  - II · The Gnostic Options: Routes Back to God 250
  - 12 · Early Christian Involvement in Classical Education, Literature, and Philosophy 276 JOSEF LÖSSL
  - 13 · Scriptures and Interpretations in Early Christian History 298
    PETER W. MARTENS

# PART IV CONTESTED CULTURES

- 14 · Early Christians and Their Socioeconomic Contexts 325

  JAMES R. HARRISON
  - 15 · Early Christians and Roman Imperial Ideology 347

    ADAM WINN



#### Contents

- 16 · Martyrdom between Fiction and Memory 372

  DAVID L. EASTMAN
- 17 · The Emergence(s) of Christian Material Culture(s) 396 Eric c. Smith
- 18 · Manuscripts and the Making of the New Testament 419
  TOMMY WASSERMAN

# PART V CONTESTED BELIEFS

- 19 · Contesting Creator and Creation 445

  PAUL M. BLOWERS
  - 20 · The Trinity in the Making 466

    JENNIFER STRAWBRIDGE
- 21 · Resurrection, Transformation, and Deification 491

  M. DAVID LITWA
  - 22 · The Eucharist in the First Three Centuries 514

    DANIEL CARDÓ
- 23 · Office, and Appointment to Office, in Early Christian Circles 536

  ALISTAIR C. STEWART

## PART VI CONTESTED BODIES

- 24 · Masculinity, Femininity, and Sexuality: The Construct of Self-Control in
  Early Christianity 561
  SUSAN E. HYLEN
  - 25 · Christian Slavery in Theology and Practice: Its Relation to God, Sin, and Justice 586

    ILARIA L. E. RAMELLI

vii



#### Contents

26 · Wealth, Almsgiving, and Poverty 613
HELEN RHEE

27 · Power, Authority, the Living, and the Dead 633 ROBIN M. JENSEN

Index of Ancient Sources 659
Index of Modern Authors 688



# **Figures**

27.I	Funerary banquet with baskets of bread. From G. Wilpert,	
	Roma sotterranea: Le pitture delle catacombe romane (Rome:	
	Desclée Lefebure and C., 1903), 21, tav. 15.	page 636
27.2	St. Petronilla leading Veneranda into Paradise, Catacomb of	
	Domitilla, Rome. From G. Wilpert, Roma sotterranea: Le pitture	:
	delle catacombe romane (Rome: Desclée Lefebure and C., 1903),	
	219, tav. 213.	648
27.3	Fourth-century cemetery Chapel of Bishop Alexander	
	(with tombs of his predecessor bishops), Tipasa (Algeria).	
	Photo: Author.	650
27.4	Reconstruction (drawing) of the Basilica of Saints Peter and	
	Marcellinus, via Casilina, Rome (with the adjoining mausoleur	n
	of Helena). Photo credit: Agefotostock, America, from	
	De Agostini Editore Collection.	652
27 5	Mausoleum of Helena Rome c 220 Photo: Author	652



# List of Contributors

PAUL M. BLOWERS is Dean E. Walker Professor Church History, Emmanuel Christian Seminary at Milligan University, TN, USA.

DANIEL CARDÓ is Assistant Professor and holds the Pope Benedict XVI Chair of Liturgical Studies at St. John Vianney Theological Seminary, Denver, CO, USA.

DAVID L. EASTMAN is Joseph Glenn Sherrill Chair of Bible at the McCallie School, Chattanooga, TN, USA, and Adjunct Research Fellow at the University of Regensburg, Germany.

RICHARD FLOWER is Associate Professor in Classics and Late Antiquity at the University of Exeter, UK.

PAULA FREDRIKSEN is the Aurelio Professor of Scripture Emerita at Boston University, MA, USA, and Distinguished Visiting Professor of Comparative Religion at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel.

ANDREW GREGORY is Chaplain and Fellow of University College, Oxford, UK.

James R. Harrison is Professor of Biblical Studies and Research Director with the Sydney College of Divinity, Australia.

SUSAN E. HYLEN is Associate Professor of New Testament at Candler School of Theology, Emory University, Atlanta, GA, USA.

ROBIN M. JENSEN is the Patrick O'Brien Professor of Theology at the University of Notre Dame, IN, USA, where she holds concurrent appointments in Art History and Classics.

ANTHONY LE DONNE is Professor of New Testament at United Theological Seminary, Dayton, OH, USA.

 ${\tt JUDITH~M.~LIEU}$  is Lady Margaret's Professor of Divinity Emerita at the University of Cambridge, and Fellow of Robinson College, Cambridge, UK.



#### List of Contributors

M. DAVID LITWA is New Testament Abstractor at Boston College, Chestnut Hill, MA, USA.

BRUCE W. LONGENECKER is the W.W. Melton Chair of Christian Origins at Baylor University and Professor of New Testament in Baylor's Department of Religion, Waco, TX, USA.

JOSEF LÖSSL is Professor of Religion and Theology (Early Christianity and Late Antiquity) at the School of History, Archaeology and Religion, Cardiff University, Wales, UK.

PETER W. MARTENS is Professor of Early Christianity in the Department of Theological Studies at Saint Louis University, MO, USA.

TOBIAS NICKLAS is Professor of New Testament and Director of the Centre for Advanced Studies "Beyond Canon" at the University of Regensburg, Germany, and Research associate at the University of the Free State, Bloemfontein, South Africa.

PHEME PERKINS is the Joseph Professor of Catholic Spirituality in the Theology Department of Boston College, Chestnut Hill, MA, USA.

ILARIA L. E. RAMELLI, is Professor of Theology and Senior Fellow and Member of Durham University, UK; Sacred Heart University, Fairfield, CT; Angelicum, Rome, Italy; KU Leuven, Belgium; Max Weber Center, Erfurt, Germany; and Cambridge University, UK.

ÉRIC REBILLARD is the Avalon Foundation Professor in the Humanities and Professor in the Departments of Classics and History at Cornell University, Ithaca, NY, USA.

HELEN RHEE is Professor of Church History in the Religious Studies Department at Westmont College, Santa Barbara, CA, USA.

CHRISTINE SHEPARDSON is Lindsay Young Professor and Department Head of Religious Studies at the University of Tennessee, Knoxville, USA.

ERIC C. SMITH is Assistant Professor of Early Christianity and Contemporary Christian Practices at the Iliff School of Theology in Denver, CO, USA.

ALISTAIR C. STEWART is Senior Lecturer in Biblical Studies at Codrington College, Barbados.

JENNIFER STRAWBRIDGE is Associate Professor in New Testament Studies at the University of Oxford and G.B. Caird Fellow in Theology at Mansfield College, Oxford, UK.

BENJAMIN LEE SUTTON is an independent scholar who received his Ph.D. from Ridley College, Melbourne, Australia.

TOMMY WASSERMAN is Professor of Biblical Studies at Ansgar University College, Kristiansand, Norway.



## List of Contributors

BENJAMIN L. WHITE is Associate Professor of Religion at Clemson University, SC, USA.

DAVID E. WILHITE is Professor of Historical Theology at George W. Truett Theological Seminary of Baylor University, Waco, TX, USA.

ADAM WINN is Associate Professor in the College of Christian Studies at the University of Mary Hardin-Baylor, Belton, TX, USA.



# Editors' Preface

The historian David Olusoga notes, "civilisation is slippery; the word has multiple and contested meanings." Much the same could be said of the term "ancient Christianity." This heuristic term is slippery because within it lie multiple forms of devotion to Jesus Christ, multiple phenomena, multiple permutations in the formative period of Christian history. Within those multiples lie contests, as varieties of Christian identity laid claim to authority and authenticity in different ways.

The contributions to this volume focus largely, but not exclusively, on Christianity in the pre-Constantinian era. In that era, Christ-devotion was getting a variety of footholds within the Greco-Roman world, prior to Constantine's legalization of Christ-devotion, which itself helped to unify his diverse empire. The imperial decision of 313 proclaimed tolerance toward Christianity, and Constantine followed that by assembling the First Council of Nicaea in 325, which produced the Creed of Nicaea. Consequently, by the second quarter of the fourth century, Christianity was in a much different place socially and politically than it had been in the first decade of that century, and those differences are inexplicable apart from Constantine. The contributors to this volume are mindful of this shift in context, and deal with it in different ways, depending on the topics they discuss. The inauguration of the Constantinian era is more consequential in some instances than in others. It functions within this volume more as a "milestone" along the way than a "border wall." While each essay in this volume foregrounds pre-Constantinian data, it is within the author's own judgment to determine the extent to which discussion of that data should overshoot the arrival of the Constantinian period.

xiii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> David Olusoga, "Civilization Revisited," *The Guardian*, 3 February 2018.



#### Editors' Preface

The contents of this volume discuss select issues around which productive conversations about nascent Christianity have emerged in recent years. There is more to be said about ancient Christianity than the topics covered here, but issues engaged within this volume are ones that have drawn particular attention in the past two decades or so.

The four essays in the introductory section ("Contested Contexts") set the stage for the volume. They focus on issues of diversity and uniformity within Christian discourse and practice, the rhetoric used by Christians regarding others beyond their number, and the extent to which Constantine can be used (and overused) to help explain the development of, and certain developments within, ancient Christianity.

The second section of the volume ("Contested Figures") contains four probes into the reception history of three key figures: Jesus Christ and the apostles Paul and Peter. These essays consider the nature of the data in a variety of sources, illustrating the contests whereby Christians aligned these figures along different trajectories of Christian identity.

Ancient articulations about Christian identity were frequently tugged this way and that owing to convictions about Judaism, the Marcionite program, and gnosticizing tendencies. How was the heritage of Christian identity to be conceptualized in relation to these robust forms of influence? Moreover, how was Christianity related to (or to be seen in relation to) the currents of education, literature, and philosophy of the classical world? Further, how was Christian identity to be fashioned in relation to the canonization and interpretation of Scripture? The essays in Part III ("Contested Heritage") engage these issues.

A fourth section ("Contested Cultures") examines the placement and posture of ancient Christianity in relation to certain cultural settings and influences. How was Christian identity configured in relation to social forces within urban contexts of the Roman world? In relation to cultic devotion toward the Roman emperor and his family? How are we to assess the stories and experiences of Christian martyrdom? What does the material record tell us about Christ-devotion in this early period? In what ways do we see Christ-devotion entering the material record? And if Christianity was a "bookish" culture, how was its own identity preserved within manuscripts of its own heritage?

Early Christian theologians deliberated on matters they considered to be of pressing interest – theological matters concerning creation, the triune character of God, and resurrection, and ecclesiastical matters concerning



### Editors' Preface

the observance of the Eucharist and the various church offices. The essays in the fifth section of the volume ("Contested Beliefs") consider those disputed issues that Christians leaned into with a keen sense of urgency.

A final section ("Contested Bodies") explores issues pertaining to embodied life in early Christian perspectives. To what extent were genders of masculinity and femininity, as well as sexuality itself, socially constructed phenomena within early Christian discourse? How did Christian theological discourses navigate the social phenomenon of slavery? Or the incongruities of poverty and wealth? And to what extent did Christians have connections to other Christians who had died – either to assist the deceased in their postmortem existence or to be assisted by them? And how did Christians commemorate the deceased and understand their corporate gatherings at the grave sites of the deceased?

As someone should once have said, "A thankless heart is the playground of the devil." There are enough devils in our dangerous world, so the thankfulness of the editors embraces the whole of this volume. A huge debt of thanks is owed to each of the authors within this volume. They were invited to participate in this project in the days prior to COVID-19 and produced their contributions despite the setbacks that came with the pandemic. From them we have learned much, and we are thankful for our associations with them. We also thank Beatrice Rehl at Cambridge University Press for overseeing the project. Eric Brewer, while undertaking his own graduate studies program in early Christianity, resourced the project enormously - not least as its early copy-editor and indexer. His eagle eye and tireless efforts have been mainstays of the volume's progress. Bobby Martinez, Mandi Becker, and Solomon Svehla also provided valuable editorial work and helped ensure that the project came to completion. It is not an exaggeration to say that this volume would not exist without the excellent work of these four graduate assistants. And of course we would be remiss if we did not thank our families for humoring us in our fascination for the study of ancient Christianity.