The First Modern Risk

During the late nineteenth century, many countries across Europe adopted national legislation that required employers to compensate workers injured or killed in accidents at work. These laws suggested that the risk of accidents was inherent to work and not due to individual negligence. By focusing on Britain, Germany and Italy during this time, Julia Moses demonstrates how these laws reflected a major transformation in thinking about the nature of individual responsibility and social risk. The First Modern Risk illuminates the implications of this conceptual revolution for the role of the state in managing problems of everyday life, transforming understandings about both the obligations and rights of individuals. Drawing on a wide array of disciplines including law, history and politics, Moses offers a fascinating transnational view of a pivotal moment in the evolution of the welfare state.

Julia Moses is Senior Lecturer in Modern History at the University of Sheffield, co-founder and co-chair of the Risk, Policy and Law Research Group at Sheffield’s Centre for Medical Humanities, and currently Marie Curie Fellow in Sociology at the Georg-August-Universität Göttingen, Germany. Her previous publications include The Impact of Ideas on Legal Development (with Michael Lobban; 2012) and Marriage, Law and Modernity: Global Histories (2017).
See the Studies in Legal History series website at http://studiesinlegalhistory.org/

Studies in Legal History

EDITORS

Sarah Barringer Gordon, University of Pennsylvania
Holly Brewer, University of Maryland, College Park
Michael Lobban, London School of Economics and Political Science
Reuel Schiller, University of California, Hastings College of the Law

Other books in the series

Cynthia Nicoletti, *Secession on Trial: The Treason Prosecution of Jefferson Davis*
Edward James Kolla, *Sovereignty, International Law, and the French Revolution*
Assaf Likhovski, *Tax Law and Social Norms in Mandatory Palestine and Israel*
Robert W. Gordon, *Taming the Past: Essays on Law and History and History in Law*
Paul Garfinkel, *Criminal Law in Liberal and Fascist Italy*
Michelle A. McKinley, *Fractional Freedoms: Slavery, Intimacy, and Legal Mobilization in Colonial Lima, 1600–1700*
Mitra Sharai, *Law and Identity in Colonial South Asia: Parsi Legal Culture, 1772–1947*
Stefan Jurasinski, *The Old English Penitentials and Anglo-Saxon Law*
Felice Batlan, *Women and Justice for the Poor: A History of Legal Aid, 1863–1945*
Sophia Z. Lee, *The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right*
The First Modern Risk

Workplace Accidents and the Origins of European Social States

JULIA MOSES
University of Sheffield
To my parents, and to H.
Contents

List of Figures
List of Tables
Acknowledgements
List of Abbreviations

Introduction
1 Accidents, Freedom and Modernity in the Nineteenth Century
2 Occupational Risk, Work and the Nation State
3 Spreading Risk, Forging Solidarity
4 Taking Risks and Dismissing Fate
5 Workers, Citizens and the State
6 Risk Societies as ‘People’s Communities’
Conclusion

Appendix
Bibliography
Index
Figures

1 ‘Diagram of Goldsworthy Gurney’s apparatus for ventilating mines’  
   page 46
2 Statistical representation of accidents at work in Britain in 1869–70  
   48
3 Statistical representation of accidents, risk and death in Italy  
   50
4 Statistical representation of workplace accidents in Prussia  
   52
5 ‘Phossy jaw’  
   134
6 *Dermatitis artefacta*, a superficial, self-inflicted injury  
   153
7 Battery for combined continuous and faradic currents, to test muscle activity  
   154
8 Germania watching over a realm of workers (‘A’), supporting their employers (‘U’)  
   209
9 ‘The workmen’s insurance of the German Empire’  
   210
10 ‘Man with disabled right arm with a prehensile hand’  
   240
11 Italian safety image (1922): ‘Don’t trust your eyes to your workmate’  
   252
12 German safety image (1925): ‘Watch out or you’ll get lead poisoning’  
   253
## Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Sequencing of accident laws in relation to other social-security policies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Global spread of accident compensation laws, 1884–1918</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Proportion of workers within the British, German and Italian compensation systems, 1885–1925</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Percentage of economically active population employed in agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Commercial accident insurance premiums</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>page 272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the individuals and institutions that made the research and writing of this book possible. For funding the initial research, I am grateful to the Gates Cambridge Trust; the Overseas Research Studentship Awards Scheme; the German Academic Exchange Service; the Prince Consort and Thirwall Prize Scholarship Scheme at the University of Cambridge; the Faculty of History at the University of Cambridge; and St John’s College, Cambridge. I am especially grateful to my doctoral supervisors, Chris Clark and Martin Daunton, for their enthusiasm for the project and encouragement in seeing it through. My examiners, Peter Baldwin and Pat Thane, played an enormous role in helping me to sharpen the thesis and make it into a book. Not least, the University of Sheffield, and especially my various heads of department, have provided the essential environment in which to complete the manuscript. Michael Lobban has graciously and patiently enabled me to make my book project into a reality, reading multiple drafts and helping to shape the manuscript. I am also grateful to Tim Smith, Larry Frohman, Holger Nehring and the anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press for their comments on earlier drafts. Thanks, too, to my editor at the Press, Debbie Gershenowitz, and to Kris Deusch, as well as my excellent copyeditor, Christopher Feeney, for making the process of publishing this book a pleasure.

Many colleagues, friends and mentors along the way have proved formative for this book. I am deeply indebted to Jose Harris and Abigail Green at Oxford for encouraging me to pursue this research and pointing me in the right direction – even if it was to ‘the other place’. Through their example of inspirational scholarship, I owe Deborah Valenze and Lars Trägårdh at Barnard College thanks for supporting my decision to abandon law and pursue the path of comparative history. Thanks, too, to colleagues around the world who have provided feedback on the project along the way, including Arnd Bauerkmämper, Jürgen Kocka, Hartmut Kaelble, Bernhard Struck and other members of the
Acknowledgements

Collegium for Comparative European History at the Free University, Berlin, where I was a visiting scholar in 2005; my many excellent colleagues at Oxford, and especially at Pembroke and Brasenose Colleges; Paul-André Rosental and Laura Downs at l’École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales (EHESS), where I had the immense privilege of visiting as a guest professor in 2010; Ingrid Gilcher-Holtey, Willibald Steinmetz and Bettina Brandt at the University of Bielefeld Graduate School of History and Sociology, where I enjoyed an international guest lectureship in 2012; Michael Lobban, John Bell, David Ibbetson and the other members of the AHRC-funded European Legal Development Project; Paul-André Rosental, Martin Lengwiler, Bernard Thomann and members of the European Research Council’s Silicosis project; Thomas Le Roux and members of the CNRS/EHESS Industrial Risks and Accidents project; Dan Rodgers, Susan Pedersen, Frank Trentmann and other participants in the Social Policy across Borders conference at Cambridge; participants in the Risk, Social Policy and the State conference at Sheffield, and especially my co-organiser Eve Rosenhaft; colleagues and collaborators in the Political Economy and Welfare Research Network at the Council for European Studies, and especially my co-chairs Matthieu Leimgruber, Marius Busemeyer and Christine Trampusch, and in the Risk, Policy and Law Research Group and at the Centre for Medical Humanities at Sheffield, and especially my co-director Matthias Benzer; and interlocutors at Cambridge, including Simon Szreter, Deborah Thom, Richard Evans, Bonnie Evans, Sian Pooley and Andrew Fearnley.

I am also enormously grateful to the hosts who have generously invited me to present on this research in seminars and conferences over the last many years, including at the University of Cambridge, the University of Oxford, the University of York, the University of Sheffield, King’s College London, the University of Glasgow, Princeton University, the Graduate Institute at Geneva, the University of Groningen, the EHESS, Sciences Po and the University of Paris VII, the Free University in Berlin, the University of Cologne, the University of Bochum, the University of Gothenburg, the University of Stockholm, the New University of Lisbon, the Finnish Institute in Rome and the German Historical Institutes in Rome and in Washington, DC, as well as elsewhere.

Not least, I wish to acknowledge the many institutions and archives that have enabled me to pursue this research. In Britain, I would like to thank the staffs of the Working Class Movement Library in Salford, The National Archives in Kew, the Modern Records Centre at the University of Warwick, the West Yorkshire Archives Service at Wakefield and the Guildhall Archives, as well as Bill Noblett at Cambridge University Library. In Germany, the staffs of the Bundes-Archiv at Lichterfelde West and Hoppegarten and of the Geheimes Staats-Archiv Preußischer Kulturbesitz provided valuable aid and friendly rapport during a lonesome stay in Berlin. In Italy, the staffs of the Archivio centrale dello stato, the historical archives of the Foreign Office and the Archivio di stato in Rome provided helpful advice. The staffs of the historical archives at the Senate and the Chamber of Deputies, in particular,
Acknowledgements

provided valuable assistance and information about the historical functions of each body. I am especially grateful to the staff of the historical archives and library at the Istituto nazionale della previdenza sociale for opening their doors to me and providing such a convivial atmosphere, along with numerous invaluable photocopies. Alberto Lucarelli, Gianpiero Ruspantini and Bernardo Sabetta at the Istituto nazionale per l’assicurazione infortuni sul lavoro went out of their way to allow me access to the closed and uncatalogued holdings there and shared their wealth of knowledge about accident insurance in Italy. Lutz Klinkhammer, Patrick Bernhard and Gerhard Kuck at the German Historical Institute in Rome provided helpful tips about pursuing research in Italy at the beginning of my stay there. I am also indebted to Bodo Nehring and Christopher Dowie for procuring valuable photocopies in Germany. Bodo and Waltraut Nehring provided a home away from home while working in the archives and on the manuscript in Germany, while Pia Schneider and Valerio Ialongo offered me an insider’s view of Rome and much helpful advice about navigating my way through Italian archives.


I dedicate this book to my parents, for their encouragement of intellectual curiosity and sacrifices made for my education, and to H. and F., who have provided me with a secure retreat from a world of risk.
Abbreviations

ACS       Archivio centrale dello stato
A. P. Cam.   Atti parlamentari della Camera dei deputati del regno
A. P. Sen.   Atti parlamentari del Senato del regno
BArch     Bundes-Archiv Berlin
BT         Board of Trade
Ccmi       Central Committee on Mobilisation (Italy)
CdAs       Camera dei deputati, Archivio storico
CNAIL     Cassa nazionale d’assicurazione per gl’infortuni degli operai sul lavoro
DDB       Drucksachen des Deutschen Bundesrates
DDNB      Drucksachen des norddeutschen Bundes
DDR       Drucksachen des Deutschen Reichstags
Div. Ind.  & Comm. Division of Industry and Commerce
FO        Foreign Office
GStAPK    Geheimes Staats-Archiv Preußischer Kulturbesitz
HC        House of Commons
HO        Home Office
ILO       International Labour Organization
Abbreviations

INAIL  Istituto nazionale per l’assicurazione contro gli infortuni sul lavoro
INPS  Istituto nazionale della previdenza sociale
LAB  Ministry of Labour
Maem  Ministry of Arms and Munitions (Italy)
MAIC  Ministry of Agriculture, Industry and Commerce (Italy)
MdaeAs  Historical Archives of the Foreign Office (Italy)
MRC  Modern Records Centre
MT  Ministry of Transport
PCM  Presidenza del consiglio dei ministri
PIN  Ministry of Pensions
PP  Parliamentary Papers (British)
QS  Quellensammlung zur Geschichte der deutschen Sozialpolitik 1867 bis 1914
RECO  Ministry of Reconstruction
RGBl  Reichsgesetzblatt
SBDR  Stenographische Berichte über die Verhandlungen des Deutschen Reichstags
SdrAs  Senato del regno, Archivio storico
SPD  Sozialdemokratische Partei Deutschlands
TNA  The National Archives of the United Kingdom
TUC  Trades Union Congress
UGC  Ufficio del Genio Civile
WCML  Working Class Movement Library